Ethics and the Global Financial Crisis

In this topical book, Boudewijn de Bruin examines the ethical 'blind spots' that lay at the heart of the global financial crisis. He argues that the most important moral problem in finance is not the 'greed is good' culture, but rather the epistemic shortcomings of bankers, clients, rating agencies and regulators. Drawing on insights from economics, psychology and philosophy, De Bruin develops a novel theory of epistemic virtue and applies it to racist and sexist lending practices, subprime mortgages, CEO hubris, the Madoff scandal, professionalism in accountancy and regulatory outsourcing of epistemic responsibility. With its multidisciplinary reach, *Ethics and the Global Financial Crisis* will appeal to scholars working in philosophy, business ethics, economics, psychology and the sociology of finance. The many concrete examples and case studies mean that this book will also prove useful to policymakers and regulators.

BOUDEWIJN DE BRUIN is Professor of Financial Ethics at the University of Groningen, The Netherlands. He is a consultant with the financial services industry, has taught in various executive MBA programmes across the world and is a regular contributor to the media. He runs a large project on Trusting Banks, with Alex Oliver (University of Cambridge) and financed by the Dutch Research Council (NWO), which draws together philosophers, social scientists, policymakers and finance professionals.

Business, Value Creation, and Society

Series editors

R. Edward Freeman, University of Virginia Jeremy Moon, Copenhagen Business School Mette Morsing, Copenhagen Business School

The purpose of this innovative series is to examine, from an international standpoint, the interaction of business and capitalism with society. In the twenty-first century it is more important than ever that business and capitalism come to be seen as social institutions that have a great impact on the welfare of human society around the world. Issues such as globalization, environmentalism, information technology, the triumph of liberalism, corporate governance and business ethics all have the potential to have major effects on our current models of the corporation and the methods by which value is created, distributed and sustained among all stakeholders – customers, suppliers, employees, communities, and financiers.

Published titles:

Fort Business, Integrity, and Peace Gomez and Korine Entrepreneurs and Democracy Crane, Matten and Moon Corporations and Citizenship Painter-Morland Business Ethics as Practice Yaziji and Doh NGOs and Corporations Rivera Business and Public Policy Sachs and Rühli Stakeholders Matter Mansell Capitalism, Corporations and the Social Contract Hemingway Corporate Social Entrepreneurship Hartman Virtue in Business

Forthcoming titles:

de Bakker and den Hond Organizing for Corporate Social Responsibility Griffin Managing Corporate Impacts Knudsen and Moon Visible Hands Nyberg and Wright Corporate Politics and Climate Change

Ethics and the Global Financial Crisis

Why Incompetence is Worse than Greed

BOUDEWIJN DE BRUIN University of Groningen



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107028913

© Boudewijn de Bruin 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Bruin, Boudewijn de, 1974– Ethics and the global financial crisis : why incompetence is worse than greed / Boudewijn de Bruin. pages cm. – (Business, value creation, and society) ISBN 978-1-107-02891-3 (hardback) 1. Financial crises – Moral and ethical aspects. 2. Finance – Moral and ethical aspects. 3. Business ethics. 4. Global Financial Crisis, 2008–2009 – Moral and ethical aspects. I. Title. HB3722.B78 2015 174'.4–dc23

ISBN 978-1-107-02891-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

for Katja

> *jezelf een vraag stellen daarmee begint verzet* Remco Campert, 'Verzet begint niet met grote woorden'

Contents

Foreword by R. Edward Freeman	
Acknowledgements	xiii
Introduction Trust and trustworthiness Moral decision making and moral intensity Motivation or competence? Epistemic virtues Warning and outline	1 3 5 7 11 15
 Financial ethics: virtues in the market Friedman's argument Corporate responsibility Shareholders Job requirements A theory of the firm Hierarchy of command Corporate law A company's goals The economics of banking An argument for liberty Politics Arguments Epistemic preconditions for liberty Responsibility Criticism Summary 	23 24 25 25 27 28 28 29 31 33 35 37 38 39 40 42 44
 Epistemic ethics: virtues of the mind Instrumental epistemic value Intellectualism and psychology Intrinsic or instrumental value? Motivation and enablement Courage Generosity 	45 47 48 50 51 52 53

vii

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02891-3 - Ethics and the Global Financial Crisis: Why Incompetence is Worse than Greed Boudewijn De Bruin Frontmatter More information

vii	i	Contents
	Epistemic actions	54
	Doxastic voluntarism	55
	Investigation	56
	Doxastic stance	56
	Justification	57
	Epistemic virtues	60
	Courageous soldiers and evil demons	61
	First improvement	63
	Second improvement	64
	Courageous villains	67
	Summary	69
3	Internalizing virtues: the clients	71
	Love	75
	Avoiding elitism	76
	Financial planning	77
	Courage	79
	Justice	80
	Tax advice and functional food	81
	Epistemic injustice	82
	Temperance	83
	Efficiency	84
	Online investing	85
	Humility	86
	CEO hubris	87
	Long-Term Capital Management	88 89
	Talking about retirement	89 90
	The meaning of guarantee	90 91
	Minding your audience Summary	92
4	Case study I: primes and subprimes	94
	Costly and complex contracts	95
	Behavioural biases	97
	Epistemic injustice	98
	Love	100
5	Incorporating virtue: the banks	106
	Corporate entities	107
	Plural subjects and a puzzle	108
	Corporate internal decision structures	110
	Structures, functions, cultures and sanctions	112

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02891-3 - Ethics and the Global Financial Crisis: Why Incompetence is Worse than Greed Boudewijn De Bruin Frontmatter More information

Contents		ix
	Back to the puzzle	114
	Matching virtues to functions	116
	Board roles	117
	Virtues of overconfidence	118
	Organizational support for virtue	122
	Structure	124
	Culture	126
	Sanctions	127
	Organizational remedies against vice	129
	Macro-level remedies	130
	Micro-level remedies	132
	Summary	137
6	Case study II: nerds and quants	140
	Split strikes and Ponzi schemes	141
	Uncovering the fraud	143
	Volatility and diversification	144
	Epistemic virtue	147
7	Communicating virtues: the raters	152
	Other-regarding epistemic virtues	155
	Generosity	159
	First difference from non-epistemic virtue	159
	Second difference from non-epistemic virtue	160
	Credit ratings	164
	Credit risk: asserting creditworthiness	165
	Monitoring: directing management	166
	Stamps of approval: directing investors	166 169
	Compromising epistemic virtue Love	169
		172
	Justice Temperance	174
	Courage	175
	Generosity	176
	Testimony	178
	Outsourcing epistemic responsibility	181
	Summary	182
8	Case study III: scores and accounts	184
	Professional accountants	185
	Joint epistemic agents	188
	Codes of conduct	190

X	Contents
Expectation gap Accounting options	193 194
Conclusion	198
Glossary	202
References	205
Index	222

Foreword

Professor De Bruin has written an important book. For all of the thousands of pages written on the recent global financial crisis, there is very little solid ethical analysis of the underlying causes and concepts. He makes a critical distinction between the motivation of financial actors and their competence, then argues that most of the analysis of the crisis has been about motivation. In particular, many have called into question the very idea of capitalism as seeking to maximize profits for shareholders. While De Bruin admits that motivation is an important idea, he traces much of the difficulty to incompetence on the part of multiple stakeholders, who have no real motivation to learn about how the basic ideas in finance actually work.

This book breaks important theoretical and practical ground. On the theory front, De Bruin argues that the traditional separation of ethics and epistemology needs to come to an end. His ideas of 'epistemic virtue and vice' are an important addition to our way of thinking about business and ethics. He draws on some cutting-edge philosophers who are working out the view that 'knowledge is virtuously formed true belief'. He goes on to show that this theory can give us a novel interpretation of phenomena like the global financial crisis and the recent work in behavioural economics.

De Bruin speaks to multiple audiences in this book. First of all scholars in the fields of business and society and business ethics will easily begin to see how the rich conceptual apparatus of epistemic virtues has application to a broad range of issues. Scholars in management theory and finance will also be interested in the analysis of how theory can work better. In addition they will gain insight into the basic relationships in finance understood in terms of epistemic virtues and values. But De Bruin also speaks to policymakers. If the main cause of the Great Recession was incompetence, the implications for policy are profound.

This book represents an important step in the project of rewriting the story of business so that we come to see business and value creation as

xii

Foreword

firmly enmeshed in society. By taking on one of the most powerful ways of thinking about business, finance theory and institutions, De Bruin advances the cause that is behind this series, *Business, Value Creation, and Society.* The very purpose of the series is to stimulate new thinking about value creation and trade, and their role in the world of the twentyfirst century. We need new scholarship that builds on what we know, yet offers the alternative of a world of hope, freedom and human flourishing. Boudewijn de Bruin has given us such a book.

> R. Edward Freeman University Professor University of Virginia Charlottesville, Virginia, USA

Acknowledgements

I should like to thank Rob Alessie, Alrik Baltus, Ron Beadle, John Boatright, Tony Booth, Matthew Braham, Ian Carter, Rutger Claassen, Julian Clarke, Wilfred Dolfsma, Wim Dubbink, Luciano Floridi, Joan Fontrodona, Martin van Hees, Frank Hindriks, Richard Holton, Jacques Jacobs, Sue Jaffer, Ronald Jeurissen, Marc Kramer, Matthew Kramer, Luc Van Liedekerke, Christoph Lütge, Marco Meyer, Seamus Miller, Nick Morris, Laetitia Mulder, Alex Oliver, Martin O'Neill, Onora O'Neill, Christoph Prainsack, Jan-Willem van der Rijt, Jan-Willem Romeijn, Tom Simpson, Alejo Sison, Max Torres, Kees van Veen, David Vines, and my research assistants Arthur Constandse and Sjoerd Norden. I have also learnt a lot from the many stimulating and thoughtful comments I have received from audiences in Amsterdam, Antwerp, Barcelona, Cambridge, Delft, Doorn, Dublin, Groningen, Hamburg, Louvain, Madrid, Nyenrode, Oxford, Paris, Pavia, Rotterdam, Tilburg and Wassenaar.

I should also like to thank Paula Parish and Claire Wood for their kind help at various stages of the writing process.

The last bits of the book were written while spending time in the Faculty of Philosophy of the University of Cambridge, and I am very grateful to the dean, Tim Crane, for his generous hospitality, and to Alex Oliver for inspiring joint work on our project on trust and finance. I thank Clare Hall for providing a pleasant and collegial atmosphere for research.

I gratefully acknowledge generous financial support from the Dutch Research Council (NWO) for project 360–320–10 Trusting Banks, in which the universities of Groningen and Cambridge cooperate. This book is among the first of its outputs.

I acknowledge permission obtained from Damon for reusing 'Epistemische deugden en de wereldwijde financiële crisis', *Filosofie en Praktijk*, 34, 4 (Winter 2013), 5–13, ISSN 0167–2444; from Springer for reusing 'Epistemic virtues in business', *Journal of Business Ethics*, 113,

xiii

xiv

Acknowledgements

4 (2013), 583–95, ISSN 0167-4544; from Springer for reusing 'Epistemically virtuous risk management: financial due diligence and uncovering the Madoff fraud', in Christoph Luetge and Johanna Jauernig (eds.), *Business ethics and risk management*, Ethical Economy, 43 (2014), pp. 27–42, ISBN 978-94-007-7440-7; and from the Philosophy Documentation Center for reusing 'Epistemic integrity in accounting: accountants as justifiers in joint epistemic agents', *Business and Professional Ethics Journal*, 32, 1/2 (Spring 2013), 109–30, ISSN 0227-2027.