American Labor and Economic Citizenship

Once viewed as a distinct era characterized by intense bigotry, nostalgia for simpler times, and a revulsion against active government, the 1920s have been rediscovered by historians in recent decades as a time when Herbert Hoover and his allies worked to significantly reform economic policy. In *American Labor and Economic Citizenship*, Mark Hendrickson both augments and amends this view by studying the origins and development of New Era policy expertise and knowledge. Policy-oriented social scientists in government, trade union, academic, and nonprofit agencies showed how methods for achieving stable economic growth through increased productivity could both defang the dreaded business cycle and defuse the pattern of hostile class relations that Gilded Age depressions had helped to set as an American system of industrial relations. Linked by emerging institutions such as the Social Science Research Council, the National Urban League, and the Women’s Bureau, social investigators attacked rampant sexual and racial discrimination, often justified by fallacious biological arguments, that denied female and minority workers full economic citizenship in the workplace and the polity. These scholars demonstrated that these practices not only limited productivity and undercut expanded consumption, but also belied the claims for fairness that must buttress policy visions in a democracy.

Mark Hendrickson is an assistant professor of history at the University of California, San Diego.
American Labor and Economic Citizenship

New Capitalism from World War I to the Great Depression

MARK HENDRICKSON
University of California, San Diego
For Mary O. Furner
Contents

List of Illustrations and Table  page ix
Acknowledgments  xi
Abbreviations  xv

Introduction  1

   Postwar Labor Unrest and the Arrival of Herbert Hoover  39
   Confronting and Defining Waste in Industry  42
   A Public Concern: The Workday in the Steel Industry  47
   Wages, Hours, and “a Feeling of Partnership”: The NBER Celebrates the Worker-Consumer  64
   Conclusion  75

2. Wages and the Public Interest: Economists and the Wage Question in the New Era  78
   Measuring Wages in the Postwar Era  91
   Wages as a Public Concern  94
   Prosperity and Wage Justice: The Post-1922 Real Wage Increase  104
   Conclusion  108

   The AFL’s Search for a New Mission  116
   The Rise of the Labor Research Bureau  119
   More than Just More: A New Wage Policy for Organized Labor  124
   Labor’s New Friends  129
   The AFL as a Watchdog for Economic Stability  134
## Contents

Open the Books: The LBI's Examination of Profits ........................................ 139
“Assuming Responsibility for Service:” The B&O Experiment ..................... 141
Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 151

4. A New Capitalism?: Interrogating Employers’ Efforts to Cultivate a “Feeling of Partnership” in Industry
   Interrogating New Capitalism: The RSF Studies ........................................ 154
   The Filene Department Store and Dutchess Bleachery Investigations .......... 162
   The Rockefeller Plan in the Coal and Steel Industry ................................. 171
   Conclusion: A New Capitalism? .................................................................. 178

5. Gender Research as Labor Activism: The Women’s Bureau in the New Era
   Empowering Expertise: The Creation of the Women’s Bureau ................. 180
   Redefining Women Workers as Breadwinners .......................................... 188
   Labor Inquiry as Activism through Gendered and Race Knowledge .......... 194
   Advocating Labor Standards Before and After Adkins ............................ 197
   Conclusion .................................................................................................... 204

6. The New “Negro Problem” ......................................................................... 216
   An Intractable Condition ............................................................................. 219
   Celebration and Concern: First Steps at Making Sense of the Migration .... 222
   The Rise and Fall of the Division of Negro Economics ............................. 229
   The Red Summer and the Emergence of Charles S. Johnson ..................... 239
   Conclusion .................................................................................................... 246

7. Promising Problems: Working toward a Reconstructed Understanding of the African American and Mexican Worker
   Framing the Postwar Immigration Debate ................................................. 249
   Reconstructing the Public Perception of the Negro Problem ....................... 253
   Considering the Relative Position of the Negro and Mexican Worker ........ 267
   Remaking the Public Image of the Mexican Problem ................................. 279
   Conclusion .................................................................................................... 284
   Conclusion .................................................................................................... 292
   Index ............................................................................................................. 307

Archival Sources and Abbreviations ............................................................... 307

© in this web service Cambridge University Press
www.cambridge.org
# Illustrations and Table

## Illustrations

1. “O. K. Choir of Researchers”  
   - Page 121
2. Baltimore and Ohio Cartoon  
   - Page 149
3. Russell Sage Foundation Cartoon  
   - Page 177

## Table

1. Were African American Women Underrepresented in WB Reports Relative to their Presence in Industry?  
   - Page 204
I have incurred many intellectual, professional, and personal debts during the research and writing of this book. It is a pleasure to have this space to acknowledge those who have contributed to this project. I dedicate the book to Mary Furner, who directed the dissertation on which this book is based. When I measure myself as a scholar, teacher, and mentor, Mary is the standard. As she does with all of her students, I know Mary devoted an incredible amount of time and energy to my development, and for that I am grateful. A career in academia can be a winding one, and Mary has offered friendship, guidance, and encouragement every step of the way.

The University of California, Santa Barbara, provided a stunning setting in which to study history and a wealth of friends and colleagues who contributed to this work and to my appreciation of the craft of history. Alice O’Connor served on the dissertation committee and has provided guidance in many forms and at many times over the years. The same holds true for Nelson Lichtenstein, who provided invaluable insights that improved the dissertation and the book. John Majewski, Elliot Brownlee, Anne Peterson, Maeve Devoy, Randy Bergstrom, Stephen Weatherford, Eileen Boris, Josh Ashenmiller, John Baranski, Jay Carlander, Sarah Case, Carl Harris, David Torres-Rouffe, and Ken Mouré all contributed in important ways to my intellectual development. Richard Sullivan provided friendship, support, intellectual stimulation, and occasional diversions from the hard work of research and writing.

Roland Guyotte, Bert Ahern, Bart Finzel, Don Thompson, and the late Dimitra Giannuli all served as friends, teachers, and mentors in the early years of my intellectual development. Over the past several years, many friends and colleagues have generously offered helpful guidance on
Acknowledgments

various aspects of the book. I am particularly grateful to Ruth Alexander, Michael Bernstein, Christopher Capozzola, Nayan Shah, Natalia Molina, Nancy Kwak, David Gutiérrez, David Roediger, Todd Henry, May Fu, Andrew Morris, and Casey Walsh. Samara Paysse and Laura Holiday provided editorial assistance at various stages in the book’s development.

At Cambridge University Press, Eric Crahan and Debbie Gershenowitz provided guidance and helpful advice throughout the process. The comments of two anonymous readers for Cambridge helped me to sharpen my argument and the book’s claims. I am grateful to the University of Chicago Press for permission to draw on my chapter “Steering the State: Government, Nongovernmental Organizations, and the Making of Labor Knowledge in the 1920s,” published in Doug Guthrie and Elisabeth Clemens, Politics and Partnerships: Associations and Nonprofit Organizations in American Governance © 2010 by The University of Chicago, and to Cambridge University Press and the Journal of Policy History for permission to draw on my article “Gender Research as Labor Activism: The Women’s Bureau in the New Era.”

A number of generous fellowships provided perhaps the most precious resource available to historians: time to research and write. In the early stages of the project, the Social Science Research Council (SSRC) dissertation fellowship on philanthropy and the nonprofit sector provided not only a year to work, but also introduced me to an interdisciplinary group of scholars who shaped the project in its early stages. I am particularly grateful to David Hammack and Elisabeth S. Clemens, who provided helpful comments on early drafts of my work at a dissertation workshop in 2002 for SSRC fellows in Montreal and at the SSRC Capstone Conference on Philanthropy and the Nonprofit Sector in Florence. Clemens and Doug Guthrie’s comments on early drafts of an article helped shape both the article and the larger book project. Dissertation fellowships from Aspen Institute and the Institute for Labor and Employment provided an additional two glorious academic years to continue working on the dissertation. At University of California, San Diego, a course reduction in my first year, combined with support for travel to a number of archives, allowed me to conduct much of the research and writing that went into Chapter 7 of the book. The Gertrude and Theodore Debs Memorial Fellowship at Indiana State University gave me the opportunity to begin my graduate training. While at Indiana State, I benefited greatly from Richard Schneirov’s friendship and guidance. Having Jason Martinek as friend and classmate at Indiana State University made the experience all the more enjoyable and intellectually stimulating.
Acknowledgments

Conducting research often involves travel, and timely and crucial support came from a number of sources. In the dissertation phase, travel grants from the Rockefeller Archive Center, Smith College, the All-University of California Economic History Group, and the University of California, Santa Barbara, department of history made a number of trips to archives on the East Coast possible. An appointment with the University of California Washington Center in Washington, DC, provided me with the time to complete a significant portion of the research for the book. More recently, travel support from the Hellman Foundation; the University of California, San Diego, Arts and Humanities Initiative; and the University of California, San Diego, department of history allowed me to finish the research for the book.

While in the archives, I benefited from the assistance of archivists and librarians at the National Archives at College Park, Rockefeller Archive Center, Library of Congress, George Meany Archives, Howard University, Catholic University of America, Sophia Smith Collection at Smith College, Department of Labor, Department of Commerce, Bancroft Library, Herbert Hoover Presidential Library, and Wisconsin Historical Society. Librarians at the University of California, Santa Barbara; Colorado State University; and the University of California, San Diego, provided valuable assistance in finding and retrieving any number of important research materials.

Our home, friends, and family have always provided the most consistent source of joy and support. Most of the writing for the book took place at our dining room table, which was convenient for me, but it meant that Juanita shared her home with mountains of documents and a frequently distracted husband. Juanita’s support, love, and patience make it easy to imagine a lifetime together. We have moved from one coast to the other more than once and welcomed into our family two wonderful children, Jack and Kate. Jack’s anticipated arrival spurred me to finish the first draft of the dissertation; after he arrived, progress slowed, but his birth and Kate’s three years later enriched our family beyond any accounting. My parents, Connie and Jerry Hendrickson, taught me the value of hard work, family, and education. Ruth Hendrickson, my sister, has always been one of my biggest supporters and has spearheaded the effort to ensure that I don’t take myself too seriously. I am grateful too for the support of our broader extended family, whose contributions and talents run the gamut from introducing me to the work of Herbert Marcuse to the finer points of carbles, cabinet making, and carpentry. When in search of sustained periods of relaxation and reflection, we have always returned to Lake Superior and our many friends in Michigan’s copper country. My thanks to all.
Abbreviations

FREQUENTLY CITED JOURNALS AND PERIODICALS

AER  American Economic Review
AF  American Federationist
AFL:WNS  American Federation of Labor Weekly News Service
AHR  American Historical Review
ALLR  American Labor Legislation Review
FFW  Facts for Workers
IMJ  International Molders’ Journal
JAH  Journal of American History
JASA  Journal of the American Statistical Association
JEWO  Journal of Electrical Workers and Operators
JPE  Journal of Political Economy
JPR  The Journal of Personnel Research
LA  Labor Age
LEJ  Locomotive Engineers Journal
MLR  Monthly Labor Review
MMJ  Machinists Monthly Journal
NCSW  Proceedings of the National Conference of Social Work
NR  New Republic
NYT  New York Times
PSQ  Political Science Quarterly
QJE  Quarterly Journal of Economics
RC  Railway Clerk
UMWJ  United Mine Workers Journal

xv
### Abbreviations

#### Institutions and Organizations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFL</td>
<td>American Federation of Labor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOC</td>
<td>Bureau of the Census</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFIC</td>
<td>Colorado Fuel and Iron Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DNE</td>
<td>Division of Negro Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOL</td>
<td>Department of Labor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCA</td>
<td>Filene Co-operative Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAM</td>
<td>International Association of Machinists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSRM</td>
<td>Laura Spellman Rockefeller Memorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAACP</td>
<td>National Association for the Advancement of Colored People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NBER</td>
<td>National Bureau of Economic Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCSW</td>
<td>National Conference of Social Work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NICB</td>
<td>National Industrial Conference Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUL</td>
<td>National Urban League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWP</td>
<td>National Women’s Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RSF</td>
<td>Russell Sage Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSRC</td>
<td>Social Science Research Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USES</td>
<td>United States Employment Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>Women’s Bureau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WIS</td>
<td>Women in Industry Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTUL</td>
<td>Women’s Trade Union League</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YMCA</td>
<td>Young Men’s Christian Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YWCA</td>
<td>Young Women’s Christian Association</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>