The Orchestral Revolution

*The Orchestral Revolution* explores the changing listening culture of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Delving into Enlightenment philosophy, the nature of instruments, compositional practices, and reception history, this book describes the birth of a new form of attention to sonority and uncovers the intimate relationship between the development of modern musical aesthetics and the emergence of orchestration. By focusing upon Joseph Haydn's innovative strategies of orchestration and tracing their reception and influence, Emily I. Dolan shows that the consolidation of the modern orchestra radically altered how people listened to and thought about the expressive capacity of instruments. The orchestra transformed from a mere gathering of instruments into an ideal community full of diverse, nuanced, and expressive characters. In addressing this key moment in the history of music, Dolan demonstrates the importance of the materiality of sound in the formation of the modern musical artwork.

**Emily Dolan** is an associate professor of music at the University of Pennsylvania, where she has taught since 2006. She is a specialist in the musical culture of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries and her research focuses on the history of orchestration, instrumentality, and aesthetics, exploring the intersections between music, science, and technology. She has published articles in *Current Musicology, Eighteenth-Century Music, Studia musicologica, Popular Music, Opera Quarterly*, and *19th-Century Music*. Dolan has been a member of the Penn Humanities Forum and was a fellow at the Radcliffe Institute for Advanced Study in 2009–10.
The Orchestral Revolution

Haydn and the Technologies of Timbre

EMILY I. DOLAN
To my mother and the memory of my father, for everything.
Contents

List of figures [page viii]
List of musical examples [ix]
Acknowledgements [xi]

Introduction: instruments and aesthetics [1]
1 Lessons at the ocular harpsichord [23]
2 The idea of timbre [53]
3 Haydn, orchestration, and re-orchestration [90]
4 The republic of sound [136]
5 The real museum of musical works [180]
6 Abuses of the orchestra [211]
Epilogue: orchestral alchemy [258]

Bibliography [265]
Index [286]
Figures

0.1 The Philadelphia Orchestra's "Access" screens (2007) [2]
1.1 Newton's color wheel from his *Opticks* (1704) [25]
1.2 Nineteenth-century *piano de chats* from the journal *La nature* (1883) [29]
1.3 Polycarpe Poncet’s taste scale from his *Chimie du goût et de l’odorat* (1755) [37]
2.1 Benjamin Franklin’s glass harmonica [62]
3.1 Orchestral graph of Haydn, Symphony No. 99 in E-flat major, movement I, mm. 19–31 [108]
3.2 Orchestral graph of Haydn, Symphony No. 101 in D major, movement I, mm. 23–40 [108]
3.3 Orchestral graph of Haydn, Symphony No. 104 in D major, movement I, mm. 17–35 [109]
3.4 Orchestral graph of Haydn, Symphony No. 100 in G major, “Military,” movement I, mm. 24–42 [109]
3.5 Orchestral graphs of the slow movements from Haydn, Symphonies Nos. 88, 94, 100, and 101 [121]
3.6 Orchestral graphs of the slow movements from Mozart, Symphonies Nos. 38, 39, 40, and 41 [123]
5.1 Johann Georg Strasser’s mechanical orchestra (1793–1801):
(a) in Strasser’s lottery announcement in 1801 and
(b) in the State Hermitage Museum, St. Petersburg [181]
5.2 Thomas Anton Kunz’s orchestrion (1798–99) [188]
5.3 Franz Leppich’s panmelodicon (1811) [189]
5.4 Joseph Gurk’s panharmonicon (1810) [192]
5.5 1784 Handel Festival in Westminster Abbey [197]
6.1 “Un concert à mitrailles” (“A Machine Gun Concert”):
a concert of Hector Berlioz, by Grandville, published in *L’Illustration* (1845) [220]
6.2 Title page of Jaque Vanderbouzzen’s *Deux trios en differents stiles* (1792) [222]
7.1 Mälzel’s panharmonicon in an undated photograph [259]
Musical examples

3.1 Haydn, Symphony No. 8 in G major, “Le soir,” movement I, mm. 1–23 [94]
3.2 Haydn, Symphony No. 22 in E-flat major, movement I, mm. 1–10 [95]
3.3 Haydn, Symphony No. 102 in B-flat major, movement I, mm. 22–30 [101]
3.4 Haydn, Symphony No. 102 in B-flat major, movement I, mm. 184–99 [102]
3.5 Haydn, Symphony No. 98 in B-flat major, movement I, mm. 16–35 [106]
3.6 Haydn, Symphony No. 100 in G major, “Military,” movement I, mm. 24–31 [110]
3.7 Haydn, Symphony No. 100 in G major, “Military,” movement I, mm. 32–39 [111]
3.8 Haydn, Symphony No. 85 in B-flat major, “La reine,” movement I, mm. 12–34 [114]
3.9 Haydn, Symphony No. 85 in B-flat major, “La reine,” movement I, mm. 212–23 [116]
3.10 Haydn, Symphony No. 103 in E-flat major, “Drumroll,” movement IV, mm. 1–24 [118]
3.11 Haydn, Symphony No. 103 in E-flat major, “Drumroll,” movement IV, mm. 45–60 [119]
3.12 Haydn, Symphony No. 96 in D major, movement II, mm. 1–9 [124]
3.13 Haydn, Symphony No. 96 in D major, movement II, mm. 34–38 [126]
3.14 Haydn, Concerto for two lire organizzate in G major (Hob. VIIh:3), movement II, mm. 9–18 [131]
3.15 Haydn, Symphony No. 100 in G major, “Military,” movement II, mm. 8–18 [133]
4.1 Rebel, Les éléments, “Le cahos,” mm. 1–10 [139]
4.2 Haydn, The Creation, “The Representation of Chaos,” mm. 1–26 [141]
List of musical examples

4.3 Haydn, The Creation, “The Representation of Chaos,” mm. 27–39 [145]
4.5 Haydn, The Creation, No. 1: recitative (Raphael) with chorus, “Im Amfange schuf Gott,” mm. 81–89 [149]
4.6 Haydn, Symphony No. 98 in B-flat major, movement IV, mm. 364–76 [152]
4.8 Haydn, The Seasons, No. 8: chorus with soloists, “O wie lieblich ist der Anblick der Gefilde jetzt!,” mm. 112–22 [173]
6.1 Rossini, L’italiana in Algeri, Act I finale, mm. 447–71 [235]
6.2 Rossini, L’italiana in Algeri, Sinfonia, mm. 1–8 [240]
6.3 Rossini, Mosè in Egitto, No. 1: Introduzione, mm. 1–6 [241]
6.4 Rossini, Mosè in Egitto, Nos. 3–4: Invocazione e Quintetto, mm. 17–42 [242]
Acknowledgements

While I was working on this book, I read a number of witty, deft, and elegant acknowledgements. In some of my more distractible moments, I contemplated the clever lines I would weave into my own: a sly historical reference, a charming analogy or two, maybe a poetic observation about the act of writing. Now that the project is complete and I am actually faced with writing this, I find myself humbled by the number of people who have contributed to this project; the only way forward is one that is artless.

This book’s origins lie in my doctoral dissertation. My chair Neal Zaslaw and my committee members Richard Leppert, Annette Richards, and James Webster helped nurture this project in its infant stages; what follows has been shaped by their guidance, the lively seminars they offered, and their close engagement with my work while I was at Cornell and afterwards.

Over the past few years, many people have generously read this material when it was in varying states of completion. I thank Mark Butler, Joy Calico, Suzie Clark, Peter Galison, Dana Gooley, Jeffery Kallberg, Eugene Narmour, Roger Parker, Alex Rehding, Inge van Rij, and Russ Rymer for the time they took with my work. I am especially grateful to Ellen Lockhart, who read and painstakingly commented on the entire manuscript. I owe an enormous debt of gratitude to Nicholas Mathew: this project reflects countless conversations, close readings, and collaborations we have had over the past nearly dozen years of our friendship. If Skype keeps records of conversations, then floating out in cyberspace are hours upon hours of our discussions about matters musicological.

After I arrived at the University of Pennsylvania, this project took off in unexpected directions, influenced and inspired by my interactions with my colleagues. I want particularly to thank Larry Bernstein for our many conversations about Haydn, Eugene Narmour, whose shared interest in orchestration led to us organizing a lively symposium on the subject in the fall of 2010, and Emma Dillon, who offered wisdom and support at every stage of writing this, helping me tame what at times seemed utterly untamable. These pages are shaped by the conversations that unfolded around the seminar table and I thank the many graduate students I had
the pleasure of working with, especially Suzanne Bratt, Neil Crimes, Roger Grant, Lauren Jennings, Deirdre Loughridge, Thomas Paterson, and Emily Zazulia. Students also directly helped with this project: Abigail Fine worked as my terrific undergraduate research assistant in the summer of 2009; Neil Crimes heroically helped me prepare the final manuscript, editing the text and, with Tony Solitto, engraving the musical examples.

This book benefitted from my time in interdisciplinary environments. To John Tresch, my friend and colleague, I owe special thanks; this project was enriched by the seminar we co-taught on musical and scientific instruments in spring 2008 and by our subsequent collaborative projects. Peter Struck and Wendy Steiner provided a stimulating year at the Penn Humanities Forum 2008–09, and I thank them as well as my colleagues who made that year so enjoyable, especially Paroma Chatterjee, Sam Breene, and Kathy Lubey.

In 2009–10, I was fortunate to spend a year at the Radcliffe Institute for Advanced Study at Harvard. The director, Judith Vichniac, made sure this environment was both conducive to productivity as well as stimulating and lively; the espresso machine in the institute’s kitchen is responsible for large swaths of this book. This book contains traces of the conversations, both formal and informal, I had with my fellow fellows. While there, I worked with a team of terrific undergraduate research assistants: David Miller, Gabrielle Lochard, and Christopher Fruge.

I thank Rachel Ollivier, David Rosen, and Adelheid Voskuhl for their help with translations, John Pollack in the Rare Books and Manuscript Library at Penn for his help in tracking down and scanning materials, and Tim Ribchester for sharing his experiences about working with the Philadelphia Orchestra. I am grateful to Mikhail Gouriev, curator at the Hermitage State Museum in St. Petersburg, and Jan Jaap Haspels at the Nationaal Museum van Speelklok tot Pierement in Utrecht for the time and help they gave me with their collections.

I received several grants that supported my research at different stages. In 2005, I was awarded an Alvin H. Johnson AMS 50 Dissertation Fellowship from the American Musicological Society; while at Penn, I received a generous University Research Foundation Grant and a SAS Research Opportunity Grant. The publication of this book was also supported by a subvention from the AMS 75 PAYS Endowment of the American Musicological Society, funded in part by the National Endowment for the Humanities and the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.

It has been a pleasure to work with Vicki Cooper, Fleur Jones, and Jodie Hodgson at Cambridge University Press, and I am very grateful to them.
for everything they’ve done, and to Caryl Clark and my anonymous reviewer for reading the manuscript so closely. I also thank Fiona Little, sincerely and deeply, for her patience and exactitude during the copy editing process. Allen Crawford (Plankton Art Co.) created the marvelous image for the cover.


My family I thank for their patience and for bearing with me: my sister Elizabeth, my brother Sean, my brother-in-law Charles, my sister-in-law Iryna, and my nieces and nephews, Lucy, James, Christopher, Emma, and John. I thank my friends for their encouragement: Les and Laura Baird, Allen and Susan Crawford, Emma Dillon, Peter Galison, Yotam Haber, Gillian Haro, Gary Moulsdale, Rachel Ollivier, Katie Peterson, Ravit Reichman, Sezi Seskir, Pep Vicente, Adelheid Voskuhl, and Ted Weesner. I owe loving thanks to Alex Csiszar; we met as I entered the final stages of writing this book and he cheered me to the finish line. I look forward to our future shared adventures.

I dedicate this book to my mother, Rosemarie, whose love, unflagging support, and enthusiasm has been constant, and to the memory of my father, John, whose wisdom still guides me.