ANGELS AND THE ORDER OF HEAVEN IN MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE ITALY

From earliest times, angels have been seen as instruments of salvation and retribution, agents of revelation, and harbingers of hope. In effect, angels are situated at the intersections of diverse belief structures and philosophical systems. In this book, Meredith J. Gill examines the role of angels in medieval and Renaissance conceptions of heaven. She considers the character of Renaissance angelology as distinct from the medieval theological traditions that informed it and from which it emerged. Tracing the iconography of angels in text and in visual form, she also uncovers the philosophical underpinnings of medieval and Renaissance definitions of angels and their nature. From Dante through Pico della Mirandola, from the images of angels depicted by Fra Angelico to those painted by Raphael and his followers, angels, Gill argues, are the touchstones and markers of the era's intellectual self-understanding, and its classical revival, theological doctrines, and artistic imagination.

Meredith J. Gill is Professor of Italian Renaissance Art in the Department of Art History and Archaeology at the University of Maryland, College Park. She is the author of *Augustine in the Italian Renaissance: Art and Philosophy from Petrarch to Michelangelo* (Cambridge University Press, 2005) and coeditor, with Karla Pollmann, of *Augustine Beyond the Book: Intermediality, Transmediality and Reception*. Among her other publications are articles in *Renaissance Quarterly*, *Storia dell’Arte*, and *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* and essays in *Rethinking the High Renaissance: The Culture of the Visual Arts in Early Sixteenth-Century Rome*, *The Possessions of a Cardinal: Politics, Piety, and Art, 1450–1700*, *The Renaissance World*, and *Rome* (Cambridge University Press, 2005). She has been a Fellow at Villa I Tatti (The Harvard University Center for Italian Renaissance Studies) and the National Humanities Center and the recipient of a fellowship from the National Endowment for the Humanities.
For Eric Denker
## CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Illustrations</th>
<th>page vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Pure Act: Medieval Angelology and Dante's Angels</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dante and the Scholastics</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Divine Comedy</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Wings: Celestial Visions in the Later Middle Ages and Renaissance</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Nine Orders: Padua, Riofreddo, and Rome</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Assumption and Coronation of the Virgin</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Communion of the Blessed and the Beatific Vision</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Bodies and Voices: Annunciation and Heavenly Harmonies</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ave Maria</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“A Sound of Tumult Like the Sounds of a Host”:</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Music of Angels</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Contemplation: Angelic Witness and Empathy</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Bread of Angels</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobias and the Angel</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raphael Transfigured</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ILLUSTRATIONS

1 Fra Angelico, *Annunciation* (fresco) (1442–1443) (Museo di San Marco, Florence)  page 16
2 Bernardo Daddi, *The Temptation of St. Thomas Aquinas* (oil on panel) (Gemäldegalerie, Staatliche Museen, Berlin)  30
3 Giovanni di Paolo, *The Primum Mobile: Beatrice Continues Her Explanation of the Relationship Between the Universe and the Angels, Paradiso 29* (Yates-Thompson 36) (fol. 181)  44
6 Sandro Botticelli, *The Proud* (*Purgatorio 12*) (silverpoint) (Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen, Berlin)  49
7 Sandro Botticelli, *The Primum Mobile* (*Paradiso 28*) (silverpoint) (Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen, Berlin)  50
8 Sandro Botticelli, *The Primum Mobile* (*Paradiso 29*) (silverpoint) (Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen, Berlin)  51
9 Sandro Botticelli, *Saturn* (*Paradiso 21*) (silverpoint) (Kupferstichkabinett, Staatliche Museen, Berlin)  51
10 Giovanni Britto (attrib.), *Paradiso 31, 4* (print), *Dante/Con tusele, argomenti, & allegorie, & riformato, riuscuto, & ridotto alla sua uera lettura, per Francesco Sansovino fiorentino*  53
List of Illustrations

12 Vittore Carpaccio, St. Augustine in His Study (canvas) (1502), Scuola di San Giorgio degli Schiavoni, Venice 63
13 Guariento di Arpo, Angel with a Soul (panel) (82 × 58 cm) (Musei Civici, Padua) 67
14 Guariento di Arpo, Angel with a Lily and Two Kneeling Figures (Virtue) (panel) (80 × 57 cm) (Musei Civici, Padua) 70
15 Guariento di Arpo, Angel Enthroned with Scepter and Orb (Throne) (panel) (90 × 57 cm) (Musei Civici, Padua) 71
16 Domination (detail from Dome of the Angels), Baptistry, San Marco, Venice 73
17 Antoniazzo Romano, Miracles of St. Michael and Nine Orders of Angels (detail) (fresco) (1464–1468), Chapel of Sant’Eugenio, SS. Apostoli, Rome 79
18 Jacobello del Fiore, Coronation of the Virgin (panel) (1438) (283 × 303 cm) (Gallerie dell’Accademia, Venice) 84
19 Fra Angelico, Coronation of the Virgin (for San Domenico, Fiesole) (panel) (c. 1431) (Louvre) 93
20 Fra Angelico, Coronation of the Virgin (fresco) (c. 1440–1441) (Museo di San Marco, Florence) 94
21 Fra Angelico, Last Judgment (panel) (c. 1450) (103 × 65 cm: central panel) (Gemäldegalerie, Staatliche Museen, Berlin) 96
22 Raphael, Disputà (Theology) (fresco) (c. 1510), Stanza della Segnatura, Vatican 97
23 Michelangelo, Last Judgment (fresco) (1536–1541), Sistine Chapel, Vatican 98
24 Piero della Francesca, Annunciation (fresco) (1452–1466), San Francesco, Arezzo 104
25 Fra Angelico, Annunciation, Detail of letter “R” (Missal 558, fol. 33v) (after 1417) (Museo di San Marco, Florence) 105
26 Alessio Baldovinetti, Annunciation (panel) (1447) (Uffizi) 106
27 Filippino Lippi, Annunciante Angel (tondo) (1483–1484) (Museo Civico, San Gimignano) 109
28 Filippino Lippi, Annunciante Virgin (tondo) (1483–1484) (Museo Civico, San Gimignano) 110
29 Bicci di Lorenzo, Annunciattion (tempera and gold leaf on panel) (c. 1431) (The Walters Art Museum) 113
30 Luca della Robbia, Cantoria (marble) (1431/2–1438) (Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Florence) 117
31 Sandro Botticelli, Mystic Nativity (tempera on canvas) (c. 1500) (National Gallery of Art, London) 118
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Medium/Date/Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Zanobi Machiavelli</td>
<td>Coronation of the Virgin (for Santa Croce, Pisa) (panel) (1474) (Musée des Beaux-Arts, Dijon)</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Paolo Veneziano</td>
<td>Coronation of the Virgin (panel) (Gallerie dell’Accademia, Venice)</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Master of the St. Lucy Legend</td>
<td>Assumption of the Virgin (oil on panel) (c. 1485–1500) (National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC)</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Melozzo da Forlì</td>
<td>Angel (from SS. Apostoli, Rome) (fresco) (Pinacoteca Vaticana, Vatican Museums)</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Orazio Samacchini</td>
<td>Madonna and Child in a Glory of Music-Making Angels with the Magdalene and St. Petronius (oil on canvas) (Saltram House, Plympton, Devon)</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Piero della Francesca</td>
<td>The Dream of Constantine (fresco) (1452–1566), San Francesco, Arezzo</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>Andrea Mantegna</td>
<td>Man of Sorrows with a Seraph and Cherub (panel) (c. 1485–1490) (Statens Museum for Kunst/ National Gallery of Denmark)</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>Michelangelo</td>
<td>Pietà (chalk) (c. 1538) (Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum, Boston)</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Boëtius à Bolswert</td>
<td>Divine Love Covering the Eyes of the Soul to Protect Her From Temptation (print) (from Hermann Hugo, Pia Desiderata, 1624)</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Boëtius à Bolswert</td>
<td>Anima Dissolving Under the Fiery Breath of Divine Love (print) (from Hermann Hugo, Pia Desiderata, 1624)</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Agostino Veneziano</td>
<td>Pietà (engraving) (after Andrea del Sarto, Puccini Pietà [1516]) (Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York)</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Rosso Fiorentino</td>
<td>Assumption (fresco) (1513–1514), SS. Annunziata, Florence</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Rosso Fiorentino</td>
<td>Virgin and Child Enthroned with SS. John the Baptist, Anthony Abbott, Stephen, and Jerome (originally in Ognissanti) (oil on panel) (1518) (Uffizi)</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Rosso Fiorentino</td>
<td>Virgin and Child with SS. John the Baptist and Elizabeth and Two Angels (oil on panel) (c. 1518–1521) (Los Angeles County Museum of Art)</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Andrea del Sarto</td>
<td>Tobias Altarpiece (panel) (1512) (Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna)</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Francesco Botticini</td>
<td>Three Archangels with Tobias (panel) (c. 1470) (Uffizi)</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Piero and Antonio Pollaiuolo</td>
<td>Tobias and the Angel (panel) (1460) (Galleria Sabauda, Turin)</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Illustrations

49 Sandro Botticelli, The Trinity with Mary Magdalene, St. John the Baptist, Tobias and Raphael (tempera on panel) (1491–1493) (Courtauld Institute Galleries, London) 181

50 Cima da Conegliano, The Nativity with SS. Helen and Catherine of Alexandria, Archangel Raphael and Tobias (oil on panel), Santa Maria dei Carmini, Venice 184

51 Anonymous, Old Tobit Burying a Jew in Nineveh (panel) (1550) (Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna) 185

52 Anonymous, Tobias Threatened by a Fish (panel) (1550) (Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna) 185

53 Raphael, Madonna of the Fish (oil on canvas, transferred from panel) (c. 1512–1514) (Museo del Prado, Madrid) 192

54 Raphael, Transfiguration (oil on panel) (1518–1520) (Pinacoteca Vaticana, Vatican Museums) 194

55 Fra Bartolomeo, Mystic Marriage of St. Catherine (Pala Pitti) (oil on panel) (1512) (Galleria Palatina, Palazzo Pitti, Florence) 198

56 Raphael, Liberation of St. Peter (fresco) (1514), Stanza d’Eliodoro, Vatican 201

57 Raphael, Expulsion of Heliodorus (detail) (fresco) (1511–1512), Stanza d’Eliodoro, Vatican 201

58 Correggio (Antonio Allegri), Assumption of the Virgin (detail) (fresco) (1526–1530), Duomo, Parma 202

59 Limbourg Brothers, Fall of the Rebel Angels, Très Riches Heures (MS. 65, fol. 64v) (illumination on vellum) (c. 1416) (Musée Condé, Chantilly) 212


61 Pieter Bruegel the Elder, The Fall of the Rebel Angels (oil on oak) (1562) (Musée d’Art Ancien, Musée Royale des Beaux-Arts, Brussels) 214

62 Hieronymus Bosch, Apocalypse by Fire or Fall of the Rebel Angels (obverse) (oil on panel) (1500–1504) (Museum Boijmans Van Beuningen, Rotterdam) 215

63 Hieronymus Bosch, Fall of the Rebel Angels (detail from Garden of Eden, left shutter of Last Judgment altarpiece) (oil on panel) (1505–1508) (Gemäldegalerie der Akademie der bildenden Künste, Vienna) 217
List of Illustrations

64 Master of the Rebel Angels (Simone Martini?), Fall of the Rebel Angels (detail) (panel transferred to canvas) (1340s) (Louvre) 220
65 Jacopo Bertoja, Fall of the Rebel Angels (detail) (fresco), Sala degli Angeli, Villa Farnese, Caprarola 225
66 Federico Zuccari, Apotheosis of the Artist (fresco) (c. 1598), Palazzo Zuccari, Rome 236

Plates

Plates follow page xvi.

I Fra Angelico, Coronation of the Virgin (panel) (1434–1435) (Uffizi)
II Fra Angelico, Annunciation (tempera on panel) (1433–1434) (Museo Diocesano, Cortona)
III Giovanni di Paolo, The Primum Mobile: Beatrice Explains the Relationship Between the Heavens and the Orders of Angels, Paradiso 28 (c. 1445) (Yates-Thompson 36, fol. 180)
IV Masolino da Panicale, Assumption of the Virgin (Santa Maria Maggiore Altarpiece) (panel) (1420s) (Museo Nazionale di Capodimonte, Naples)
VI Francesco Botticini, Assumption of the Virgin (panel) (c. 1475–1476) (National Gallery of Art, London)
VII Guariento di Arpo, Abraham’s Meeting with Three Angels and the Sacrifice of Isaac (fresco), Carrara Palace, Padua
VIII Guariento di Arpo, Angel Weighing Souls and Combatting a Demon (panel) (Musei Civici, Padua)
IX Guariento di Arpo, Armed Angel with Shield and Lance (Principality) (panel) (Musei Civici, Padua)
X Guariento di Arpo, Group of Ten Seated Angels with Batons Ornamented with Lilies and Orbs (Dominations) (panel) (Musei Civici, Padua)
XI Guariento di Arpo, Group of Armed Angels (panel) (Musei Civici, Padua)
XII Jacopo Tintoretto, Paradise (detail) (canvas) (1588–1595), Sala del Gran Consiglio, Palazzo Ducale, Venice
XIII Arcangelo di Cola da Camerino, God Enthroned Among the Orders of Angels (fresco), Oratory of SS. Annunziata, Riofreddo
XIV Antoniazzo Romano, Nine Orders of Angels (detail) (fresco) (1464–1468), Chapel of Sant’Eugenia, SS. Apostoli, Rome
List of Illustrations

XV Antonio Vivarini and Giovanni d’Alemanegra, *Coronation of the Virgin* (panel) (1444), San Pantalon, Venice

XVI Filippino Lippi, *Coronation of the Virgin* (panel) (c. 1475) (Samuel H. Kress Collection, National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC)

XVII Fra Angelico, *Last Judgment* (panel) (1431) (Museo di San Marco, Florence)

XVIII Sandro Botticelli, *Annunciation* (Cestello Annunciation) (panel) (1489–1490) (Uffizi)

XIX Simone Martini (with Lippo Memmi), *Annunciation and the Two Saints* (panel) (1333) (Uffizi)

XX Neri di Bicci, *Coronation* (tempera and gold leaf on panel) (1470–1475) (The Walters Art Museum)


XXII Geertgen tot Sint Jans, *Virgin and Child* (panel) (1480s) (Museum Boijmans Van Beuningen, Rotterdam)

XXIII Filippino Lippi, *Assumption of the Virgin and Annunciation* (fresco) (1489–1491), Carafa Chapel, Santa Maria sopra Minerva, Rome

XXIV Orazio Samacchini, *Viol Player* (red and black pencil) (Foundation Custodia, Collection Frits Lugt, Inv. 5832)

XXV Rosso Fiorentino, *Dead Christ with Angels* (oil on panel) (c. 1524–1527) (Charles Potter Kling Fund, 58.527, Museum of Fine Arts, Boston)

XXVI Rosso Fiorentino, *Angel Playing a Lute* (oil on panel) (1520s) (Uffizi)


XXVIII Cima da Conegliano, *Archangel Raphael with Tobias Between SS. Nicholas and James Major* (oil on panel, transferred to canvas) (originally in Santa Maria della Misericordia) (Gallerie dell’Accademia, Venice)

XXIX Giovanni Girolamo Savoldo, *Tobias and the Angel* (oil on canvas) (1522–1525) (Galleria Borghese, Rome)

XXX Lambert Sustris, *Tobias and the Angel on Their Travels* (oil on canvas) (c. 1560s?) (Kunsthistorisches Museum, Vienna)

XXXI Domenico Beccafumi, *Fall of the Rebel Angels* (oil on wood) (c. 1524) (Pinacoteca Nazionale di Siena)

XXXII Domenico Beccafumi, *Fall of the Rebel Angels* (oil on wood) (c. 1528), San Niccolò al Carmine, Siena
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book has its origins in my study of the Late Antique Church Father, Augustine (354–430 C.E.), whose ideas about angels, their substance, and their nature were often novel and certainly far-reaching. As I began this project, angels rushed in, to invert Alexander Pope's famous statement, for I found that I was by no means alone in turning to the subject of the spirit worlds of the past. Augustine’s perspective remains central to my understanding of these worlds, as it must to our understanding of the religious cultures of the West.

I have shared portions of these chapters with diverse audiences, beginning with a presentation in fall 2007 at the Center for Renaissance and Baroque Studies at the University of Maryland, my home institution. At the invitation of Paul V. Murphy, I gave a lecture at the Institute for Catholic Studies at John Carroll University on Augustine, his heaven, and angels, and at Indiana University, Bloomington, I had the opportunity to speak to members of the Program in Renaissance Studies, thanks to the kindness of Constance Furey. At Princeton University, for the Renaissance and Early Modern Colloquium, I first probed the subject of Lucifer and the fallen angels, a topic that I later pursued as a Fellow of the Yale Initiative for the Study of Material and Religious Cultures of Religion. The Yale Initiative underwrote my visit to Siena in fall 2011. I owe Sally M. Promey, codirector of the Initiative, a special debt of thanks for suggesting that I also speak about my angels for the Colloquium of the Institute of Sacred Music of the Yale Divinity School.
At the annual meeting of the Renaissance Society of America in 2009, W. David Myers, Steven F. Ostrow, and Blake Wilson presented inspiring papers in our session on “Angels: Harmonies, Bodies, and Intelligences in Early Modern Europe.” More recently, at the conference “Reading Comparatively: Theories, Practices, Communities,” hosted by the Center for Literary and Comparative Studies and the School of Languages, Literatures, and Cultures at the University of Maryland, I explored my hypotheses on angelic language and the Annunciation.

An award from the University of Maryland’s General Research Board permitted me a semester’s leave of writing and a Samuel H. Kress Fellowship in Renaissance Art History from the Renaissance Society of America funded my research in Rome, Riofreddo, and Venice. I am profoundly grateful for a Lila Acheson Wallace–Reader’s Digest Publications Subsidy from Villa I Tatti (The Harvard University Center for Italian Renaissance Studies), which made possible the publication of an extensive list of illustrations, including the color reproductions.

It is in the nature of angels, whose appeal is universal, that friends, colleagues, and students have offered a wealth of references, often along with a welcome leavening of humor. Among these are Paul Barolsky, Franco and Maria Ferrari, Kenneth Gouwens, W. David Myers, William L. Pressly, Karen Schneider, and Marjorie S. Venit. My students, among them Sarah Cadagin, Steven J. Cody, and Nicole Riesenberger, have offered enthusiastic and thoughtful insights. My colleague and friend from my days at Villa I Tatti, Victor Coelho, illuminated the meaning of Rosso’s lute-playing angel in the artist’s famous painted fragment. On a memorable morning in Rome, William E. Wallace led us to SS. Apostoli where we looked at the Nine Orders in Cardinal Bessarion’s newly reopened funerary chapel. Above all, I owe a very special debt of thanks to Paul Barolsky and William L. Pressly, both of whom read the completed manuscript as well as versions in between, offering encouragement and advice that were more valuable than they can imagine. Paul Barolsky has always been an especially inspiriting interlocutor; in this, I have been exceptionally blessed. Once again, my far-seeing guide at Cambridge University Press, Beatrice Rehl, along with Assistant Editor Anastasia Graf, looked after my manuscript from beginning to end. My parents, Margaret and Peter Gill, who introduced me to Fra Angelico at San Marco at a very young age, have my love and appreciation.
This book is dedicated to Eric Denker, who never tires of noticing angels. Eric gave me Billy Collins’s collection of poems, *Questions About Angels* (Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1991/1999). The medieval theologians whom Collins gently critiques turn out to have been quite curious after all about subjects other than “the little dance floor on the head of a pin.” This book is also dedicated to the memory of these indefatigable angelologists and their peers in the arts who, with at least as much imagination, also worried about the clothes of angels, the impact of angels’ words, and their breathtaking bodily transformations.