Different Faces of Attachment

Cultural Variations on a Universal Human Need

Attachment between an infant and his or her parents is a major topic within developmental psychology. An increasing number of psychologists, evolutionary biologists, and anthropologists are articulating their doubts that attachment theory in its present form is applicable worldwide, without, however, denying that the development of attachment is a universal need. This book brings together leading scholars from psychology, anthropology, and related fields to reformulate attachment theory in order to fit the cultural realities of our world. Contributions are based on empirical research and observation in a variety of cultural contexts. They are complemented by careful evaluation and deconstruction of many of the underlying premises and assumptions of attachment theory and of conventional research on the role of infant–parent attachment in human development. The book creates a contextual cultural understanding of attachment that will provide the basis for a groundbreaking reconceptualization of attachment theory.

HILTRUD OTTO is a postdoctoral member of the Martin Buber Society of Fellows in the Humanities at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel.

HEIDI KELLER is Professor of Culture and Development in the Faculty of Human Sciences at the University of Osnabrück.

Different Faces of Attachment

Cultural Variations on a Universal Human Need

Edited by Hiltrud Otto and Heidi Keller



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107027749

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Different faces of attachment: cultural variations on a universal human need / edited by Hiltrud Otto and Heidi Keller. pages cm Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-02774-9 (hardback) 1. Attachment behavior 2. Attachment behavior – Cross-cultural studies. 3. Attachment behavior in children – Cross-cultural studies. 4. Child psychology – Cross-cultural studies. I. Otto, Hiltrud, 1977– II. Keller, Heidi, 1945– BF575.A86D54 2014 155.9'2 – dc23 2014007617

ISBN 978-1-107-02774-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

	List of figures List of tables List of contributors Foreword MICHAEL E. LAMB	page vii ix x xvi
	Introduction: understanding relationships – what we would need to know to conceptualize attachment as the cultural solution of a universal developmental task HEIDI KELLER	1
Part I	Attachment as an adaptation: evolutionary, cultural, and historical perspectives	
1	Family relations among cooperative breeders: challenges and offerings to attachment theory from evolutionary anthropology JOHANNES JOHOW AND ECKART VOLAND	27
2	Attachment theory as cultural ideology ROBERT A. LEVINE	50
3	"Babies aren't persons": a survey of delayed personhood DAVID F. LANCY	66
Part II	Multiple attachments: allomothering, stranger anxiety, and intimacy	
4	Maternal and allomaternal responsiveness: the significance of cooperative caregiving in attachment theory COURTNEY L. MEEHAN AND SEAN HAWKS	113
		v

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press	
978-1-107-02774-9 - Different Faces of Attachment: Cultural Variations on a Universa	al
Human Need	
Edited by Hiltrud Otto and Heidi Keller	
Frontmatter	
More information	

vi	Contents	
5	Bonding and belonging beyond WEIRD worlds: rethinking attachment theory on the basis of cross-cultural anthropological data BIRGITT RÖTTGER-RÖSSLER	141
6	Concentric circles of attachment among the Pirahã: a brief survey DANIEL L. EVERETT	169
7	Is it time to detach from attachment theory? Perspectives from the West African rain forest ALMA GOTTLIEB	187
8	Don't show your emotions! Emotion regulation and attachment in the Cameroonian Nso HILTRUD OTTO	215
9	Family life as <i>bricolage</i> – reflections on intimacy and attachment in <i>Death Without Weeping</i> NANCY SCHEPER-HUGHES	230
Part II	I Looking into the future and implications for policy development	
10	The socialization of trust: plural caregiving and diverse pathways in human development across cultures THOMAS S. WEISNER	263
11	The precursors of attachment security: behavioral systems and culture VIVIAN J. CARLSON AND ROBIN L. HARWOOD	278
Part I	V Conclusion	
12	Epilogue: the future of attachment HEIDI KELLER AND HILTRUD OTTO	307
	Index	313

Figures

1.1	Proportion of studies showing a positive effect of kin on offspring survival (reproduced from Sear and Mace, 2008, Table 3).	page 31
1.2	Panel A gives violin plots (a combination of box plot and kernel density distribution plot) for interbirth intervals (IBIs) following the birth of a girl or a boy, separated for families where the paternal grandmother (PGM) is	
	present, where both grandmothers are absent, or where the maternal grandmother (MGM) is present. Panel B	
	presents asymptotic tests with 95% confidence intervals	
	(see Coeurjolly et al., 2009) to show differences in	
	log-transformed IBI values. Reprinted with permission	
	from Elsevier from Johow et al. (2011).	37
5.1	Grandparent-infant dyad during everyday life in	
	Makassar villages.	148
5.2	Makassar children.	163
6.1	Pirahã mother breast-feeding a peccary.	177
7.1	Often the baby is attached to someone else who is	
	designated as a babysitter (len kuli).	197
7.2	A lucky new mother commandeers the babysitting	
	services of a relative.	198
7.3	It is common to see girls as young as 7 or 8 years carrying	
	a baby on their back.	199
7.4	To attract a wide pool of potential babysitters, mothers typically spend an hour or more every morning grooming	
	their babies to make them look beautiful.	200
7.5	A mother's long, daily routine of beautifying her baby	200
1.5	begins with an enema, includes a bath of both skin and	
	jewelry, and ends with the application of makeup, jewelry,	
	and often powder or oil on the very elaborately adorned	
	infant.	200

vii

viii List of figures

7.6	Most Beng babies are passed quite often from one back to	
	another on any given day.	201
7.7	Most Beng babies of all ages allowed me to hold them	
	with no qualms, even if the mother left the baby's view.	203
7.8	Mothers of "clingy" children consider themselves	
	unfortunate. How will they get their work done?	204
7.9	In Beng villages, life is normally lived outside.	206
7.10	Beng women have sole responsibility for chopping and	
	hauling firewood, fetching water, hand-washing the	
	laundry for a large family, and doing the vast majority of	
	food preparation, often while pregnant or breast-feeding.	208
7.11	It is hard to imagine a woman performing all her	
	demanding work on her own while caring for several small	
	children (including a baby and a toddler).	209

Tables

4.1	Summary statistics for focal mothers and children	page 122
4.2	Infant attachment behaviors and descriptions	122
4.3	Categories of attachment figures to whom infants	
	displayed attachment behaviors	124
4.4	Principal-components analysis loadings for caregiver	
	responses to attachment behaviors	125
4.5	Correlation between others' and mothers' responses to	
	attachment behaviors	128
4.6	Multiple linear regression models showing relationship	
	between allomaternal caregiving style and child behavior	
	following mother-child separations	130
4.7	Multiple linear regression models showing relationship	
	between allomaternal caregiving style and child	
	developmental outcomes	130

Contributors

- VIVIAN J. CARLSON, Ph.D., is an Associate Professor (tenured) of Human Development and Family Studies in the School of Graduate and Professional Studies at the University of Saint Joseph, West Hartford, Connecticut. She has served as Chair of the Department of Human Development and Family Studies since 2007. Dr. Carlson is also a developmental psychologist and a professional in special education who brings over thirty years of home-based early intervention experience to her research and teaching career. She completed her Ph.D. in Family Studies at the University of Connecticut. Her publications and presentations focus on the interface of culture and development and its impact on parenting, attachment, aggression among girls, and bullying among young urban children. Her research has challenged the cultural biases inherent in definitions of optimal parenting in attachment theory, and has provided concrete examples and applications of cultural knowledge for professionals from fields as diverse as early intervention, special education, marriage and family therapy, and law enforcement. Her current work includes an ethnographic study of women from urban, resource-poor backgrounds in Guyana, South America, and the USA who become transformative leaders in their communities. Dr. Carlson also works among the indigenous peoples of the interior rain forests and savannahs of Guyana, providing services for people with disabilities during biannual visits.
- DANIEL L. EVERETT is Dean of Arts and Sciences at Bentley University in Waltham, Massachusetts. He has published more than 100 articles and 11 books on linguistics and Amazonian languages and has received many grants for his research in the Brazilian Amazon. A film about his life and work, *The Grammar of Happiness*, was released worldwide in 2012. He is currently writing "Dark Matter of the Mind: How Unseen Forces Shape Our Words and World" for the University of Chicago Press.

х

List of contributors

xi

- ALMA GOTTLIEB is Professor of Anthropology, African Studies, Global Studies, and Gender and Women's Studies at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. She has also taught and held research appointments at Princeton University, the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales (Paris), the Katholieke University of Leuven, the Instituto Superior da Ciências Sociais e Políticais (Lisbon), and other institutions. Her teaching and research specializations include infants and children, feminism, religion, humanistic anthropology, and ethnographic writing. She has conducted fieldwork in Ivory Coast and, more recently, with Cape Verdeans on and off the islands (in Europe and the USA). She has authored or edited eight books, including The Afterlife Is Where We Come From: The Culture of Infancy in West Africa (University of Chicago Press, 2004) and A World of Babies: Imagined Childcare Guides for Seven Societies (Cambridge University Press, 2010) (with Judy DeLoache), and with her husband, the author Philip Graham, she has written two memoirs of their life with the Beng, Parallel Worlds: An Anthropologist and a Writer Encounter Africa (University of Chicago Press, 1993) and Braided Worlds (University of Chicago Press, 2012). Her work has been supported by the Guggenheim Foundation, the Social Science Research Council, the US National Endowment for the Humanities, and other agencies.
- ROBIN L. HARWOOD, Ph.D., is a Health Scientist in the Division of Research in the Office of Epidemiology and Research (OER), the Maternal and Child Health Bureau (MCHB), and the Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA). She is the federal liaison and project officer for the Home Visiting Research Network, and project officer for the MCHB Home Visiting Research Grants, an investigator-initiated program. In addition to home visiting, Robin's portfolio also includes research grants and networks from the Combating Autism Act Initiative, and the MCHB Research Program. Prior to joining the federal government, she was an Associate Professor (tenured) in the School of Family Studies at the University of Connecticut. During her years in academia, she was Principal Investigator for two separate National Institute of Child Health and Human Development (NICHD) grants examining culture, attachment, and parenting beliefs among mothers in Puerto Rico, Germany, and the USA. She has published numerous articles in peer-reviewed journals, as well as two books on child development, culture, and attachment. She received her Ph.D. from Yale University.
- SEAN HAWKS is a Ph.D. student in cultural anthropology at Washington State University. He is interested in attachment theory from a

xii List of contributors

human behavioral ecology perspective. He is interested in the worldviews and relationships with neighboring groups of hunter-gatherers, and he uses both evolutionary and cultural theory to describe and explain the nature of these relationships.

- JOHANNES JOHOW is a postdoctoral research fellow at the Institute of Philosophy, Justus Liebig University of Giessen, Germany. His research focuses on life-history theory and cooperative breeding in humans.
- HEIDI KELLER is a Professor at the University of Osnabrück, Germany, and director of the research unit "Culture, Learning and Development" at the Lower Saxony Institute of Early Childhood Education and Development. She directs a multicultural research program of developmental pathways across infancy and childhood. She has been a visiting professor at, among other institutions, the NICHD (Washington, DC), the University of California, Los Angeles; the Universidad de Costa Rica, San José; and the MS University of Baroda, Vadodara, India. She was president of the International Association for Cross-Cultural Psychology from 2008 to 2010.
- MICHAEL E. LAMB, Ph.D., is Professor and the Head of the Department of Social and Developmental Psychology at the University of Cambridge, UK. In 2003 Lamb was the recipient of the 2003–2004 James McKeen Cattell Fellow Award from the Association for Psychological Science. Lamb researches early family relationships, childcare, developmental science, and related public policy. This work has focused on divorce, child custody, child maltreatment, and the effects of childcare on children's social and emotional development. Lamb was the head of the section on social and emotional development of the NICHD in Washington, DC, for seventeen years.
- DAVID F. LANCY, Emeritus Professor of Anthropology at Utah State University, earned degrees from Yale and the University of Pittsburgh. He has done fieldwork in Liberia, Papua New Guinea, Trinidad (Fulbright Fellowship), Sweden (Fulbright Fellowship), and the USA. His research interests include the study of cultural influences on children's literacy, ethnographic research methods, and the anthropology of childhood. He is the author of *The Anthropology of Childhood: Cherubs, Chattel, Changelings* (Cambridge University Press, 2008), and *Playing on the Mother-Ground: Cultural Routines for Children's Development* (Guilford Press, 1996), and is coeditor of *The Anthropology of Learning in Childhood* (Cambridge University Press, 2008).

List of contributors

xiii

- ROBERT A. LEVINE is Roy E. Larsen Professor of Education and Human Development, Emeritus, Harvard University. He is an anthropologist who has devoted a long career to the cross-cultural study of parenting and child development, carrying out research in Africa, Asia, and Latin America with his wife Sarah LeVine. Their book (with Beatrice Schnell-Anzola, Meredith Rowe, and Emily Dexter), *Literacy and Mothering: How Women's Schooling Changes the Lives of the World's Children* (Oxford University Press, 2012), won the Eleanor E. Maccoby Book Award in Developmental Psychology of the American Psychological Association in 2013. His other books include *Anthropology and Child Development: A Cross-Cultural Reader* (Wiley-Blackwell, 2008) and *Child Care and Culture: Lessons from Africa* (Cambridge University Press, 1994).
- COURTNEY L. MEEHAN is a faculty member in the Department of Anthropology at Washington State University. She is a human behavioral ecologist whose research focuses on early childhood environment and children's physical, social, and emotional development. Currently, she is the principal investigator on a longitudinal project, funded by the US National Science Foundation, on the effects of cooperative breeding on child development, maternal reproduction, and family health. She conducts her research in the Central African Republic among a forager population and several farming populations.
- HILTRUD OTTO is a postdoctoral member of the Martin Buber Society of Fellows in the Humanities at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel. She is an early childhood scholar specializing in early socioemotional development, as well as culture and attachment. For her research on the development of attachment relationships among Cameroonian Nso children and their caregivers, she received her Ph.D. in 2009 from the University of Osnabrück, Germany, where she was a research associate at the Department of Culture and Development and a scientific staff member of the Lower Saxony Institute of Early Development and Learning. Dr. Otto is a junior investigator in the research project, "Development of Relationships During Infancy: Risk and Protective Factors in Minority and Majority Families in Germany and Israel" (supported by the State of Lower Saxony, Hannover, Germany), and she participates in various national and international research projects promoting context-informed research and training for children in need.
- BIRGITT RÖTTGER-RÖSSLER is Professor of Social and Cultural Anthropology at the Freie Universität Berlin. She is head of the focus group "Anthropology of Emotions" at the faculty of Political and Social

xiv List of contributors

Sciences and acts as associate director of the cluster of excellence "Languages of Emotion" at the Freie Universität Berlin. She studied cultural and social anthropology, Romance studies, and Malay languages and literatures, as well as European ethnology, at the universities of Göttingen, Zurich, Cologne, and Bonn. In recent years her research has focused on the emotions, primarily dealing with the cultural modeling of emotions in Southeast Asian societies. She has conducted long-term fieldwork in Indonesia. Her current projects deal with the socialization of emotions in cross-cultural comparison, with the connection of emotion and memory as well as with conflicting "feeling rules" in the context of migration.

- NANCY SCHEPER-HUGHES is Professor of Medical Anthropology at the University of California, Berkeley, where she directs the doctoral program, "Critical Studies in Medicine, Science, and the Body." Scheper-Hughes' long-term work examines the violence of everyday life from a radical existentialist and politically engaged perspective. She has conducted research on, has written on, and has been politically engaged in topics ranging from AIDS and human rights in Cuba; death squads and the extermination of street children in Brazil; and the Catholic Church, clerical celibacy, and child sex abuse, to the repatriation of the brain of a famous Yahi Indian, Ishi (kept as a specimen in the Smithsonian Institution) to the Pit River people of northern California. Her most recent research is a multisited, ethnographic study of the global traffic in human organs, a shocking new triangular slave trade in which the poor are taken to distant cities by criminal syndicates and coerced into selling their organs for illegal transplants. Her next book, The Ends of the Body: The Global Traffic in Organs, is to be published by Farrar, Straus, and Giroux. She is cofounder and Director of Organs Watch, a medical human-rights project, and she is currently an adviser to the World Health Organization (Geneva) on issues related to global organ transplantation. Scheper-Hughes has lectured internationally and has been a research professor in residence at the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales in Paris in 1993.
- ECKART VOLAND is a Professor of the Philosophy of Biology at the Institute of Philosophy, Justus Liebig University of Giessen, Germany. He is mainly interested in human reproductive ecology, life-history theory, evolutionary ethics, and philosophy of mind.
- THOMAS S. WEISNER, Ph.D., is Professor of Anthropology in the Departments of Psychiatry (Semel Institute, Center for Culture and Health) and Anthropology at the University of California, Los Angeles.

List of contributors

xv

His research and teaching interests are in culture and human development; medical, psychological, and cultural studies of families and children at risk; mixed methods, and evidence-informed policy. He has done fieldwork with the Abaluyia of Kenya, native Hawaiians, countercultural US families, US families with children with disabilities, and US poor working families. He is the author or editor of *Higher Ground: New Hope for the Working Poor and Their Children* (with Greg Duncan and Aletha Huston) (Russell Sage Foundation, 2007); *Making It Work: Low-Wage Employment, Family Life and Child Development* (with Hiro Yoshikawa and Edward Lowe) (Russell Sage Foundation, 2006); *Discovering Successful Pathways in Children's Development: New Methods in the Study of Childhood and Family Life* (University of Chicago Press, 2005); and African Families and the Crisis of Social Change (with Candice Bradley and Phil Kilbride) (Greenwood, 1997).

Foreword

Attachment theory developed amidst the talented group of psychologists and clinicians who surrounded John Bowlby in London between the publication of his memorable report on maternal deprivation for the World Health Organization (Maternal Care and Mental Health) in 1951 (a more popular version was published by Pelican as Child Care and the Growth of Love in 1953) and the publication of his article on "The Nature of the Child's Tie to His Mother" in 1958. As subsequently elaborated in the trilogy Bowlby published between 1969 and 1980, attachment theory represented a synthesis of the available clinical evidence, sensitive observations of young children experiencing stressful separations, and comparative experimental research by scientists such as Harry Harlow, a psychologist, and Robert Hinde, a behavioral biologist, all viewed in the context of the integrative control systems theory then emerging. The tremendous power of that synthesis has been demonstrated conclusively over the course of the ensuing decades as attachment theory has come to be recognized as the most coherent and predictively useful theory describing human developmental processes.

The enduring success of attachment theory is surely attributable not only to its scientific coherence but also to its timeliness and cultural resonance, although proponents of attachment theory have long preferred to claim it as a purely scientific theory with implications for policy (e.g., on early childcare) and practice (with an emphasis on maternal responsibility and responsiveness) rather than as an ideologically compatible framework for understanding early development. A traumatic half-century of war and devastation had precipitated widespread doubts and questions about the essence of human nature by the time Bowlby began creating attachment theory. Bowlby's theory provided comforting reassurance that human babies were biologically designed to thrive when assured of the continued availability and responsiveness of their mothers, and this emphasis on maternal love and exclusive domesticity strongly complemented a widespread desire to reclaim a "traditional" way of life, with mothers focused on caring for their children and fathers focused

xvi

Foreword

xvii

on economic activity, rebuilding the shattered economies and societies around them. There is little doubt that the widespread embrace of attachment theory in Western developmental psychology was attributable, at least in part, to its resonance with cultural values then in ascendance. Less remarked upon is the extent to which the theory itself was surely created under the influence of clear cultural values and ideology as well.

The contributors to Otto and Keller's remarkable anthology have no doubt about the important role played by values and practices in shaping beliefs, practices, and early child-parent relationships. Writing in both German and English over the last 30 years, Keller (e.g., Keller, 2007; Keller, Miranda, and Gauda, 1984; Keller, Poortinga, and Schoelmerich, 2002) has argued and demonstrated that different cultural groups view infancy, parenthood, and developmental processes in distinctive ways and that these often profound differences shape infant-parent interactions and relationships significantly, thereby raising searching questions about many of the assumptions and conclusions held dear by attachment theorists and developmental scientists. Now, in this volume, Keller and her coeditor, Hiltrud Otto, are joined by a phalanx of distinguished psychologists and anthropologists who have conducted research in diverse cultures and settings designed to document the central importance of ecological variations in understanding the role, or possible roles, of infant-parent relationships in development. The case they offer is challenging and compelling, strengthened by the impressive way in which empirical research and observation in a variety of cultural contexts is complemented by careful evaluation and deconstruction of many of the underlying premises and assumptions of attachment theory and of conventional research on the role of infant-parent (though often only infant-mother) attachment in human development. Collectively, these scholars have constructed a remarkable argument for the central importance of the cultural context when striving to understand the place of attachment in human development. Their examination and critique of attachment theory is thus much more comprehensive and provocative than much earlier evaluations of the empirical foundations of attachment theory written by my colleagues and me (e.g., Lamb, Thompson, Gardner et al., 1985).

Specifically, the contributors to *Different Faces of Attachment* address, in sequence, the extent to which attachment theory is as well grounded in evolutionary theory as Bowlby believed, cultural differences in the perception of close child–parent relationships, differences in the early experiences and processes of relationship formation in differently organized societies, and descriptive accounts of parent–child interaction in several quite distinctive socioecological contexts. It ends with two chapters by culturally sensitive scholars who have long pondered the role of

xviii Foreword

culture in shaping social relationships, and a concluding chapter written by the editors.

Different Faces of Attachment is a unique collection, rich in insights and provocative ideas. It should be required reading for all developmental scientists and theorists, as well as for practitioners with responsibility for translating the fruits of research (often conducted in a rather narrow and unrepresentative cultural context) into practical guidelines to be followed in other, quite different cultural settings. At a time when there is increasing focus on the extreme fragility and vulnerability of infants and young children, there is a special need for scholars to recognize not only the remarkable resilience of young humans, but also our species' incredible adaptability to diverse sociocultural demands and contexts. Different Faces of Attachment offers a compelling argument for humility and for recognition of the rather unusual circumstances to which attachment theory has been responsive.

> MICHAEL E. LAMB Cambridge University, UK

References

- Bowlby, J. (1951). *Maternal care and mental health*. Geneva: World Health Organization.
 - (1953). Child care and the growth of love. London: Pelican Books.
 - (1958). The nature of the child's tie to his mother. International Journal of Psycho-Analysis, 39, 350-73.
 - (1969). Attachment. London: Hogarth.
 - (1980). Loss. London: Hogarth.
- Keller, H. (2007). Cultures of infancy. Mahwah NJ: Erlbaum.
- Keller, H., Miranda, D., and Gauda, G. (1984). The naïve theory of the infant and some maternal attitudes: a two-country study. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 15, 165–79.
- Keller, H., Poortinga, Y. H., and Schoelmerich, A. (Eds.) (2002). *Between culture and biology*. Cambridge University Press.
- Lamb, M. E., Thompson, R. A., Gardner, W. P., and Charnov, E. L. (1985). Infant-mother attachment: the origins and developmental significance of individual differences in strange situation behaviour. Hillsdale, NJ: Erlbaum.