CONSEQUENTIAL COURTS

In the early twenty-first century, courts have become versatile actors in the governance of many constitutional democracies, and judges play a variety of roles in politics and policy making. Assembling papers penned by an array of academic specialists on high courts around the world, and presented during a year-long Andrew W. Mellon Foundation John E. Sawyer Seminar at the University of California, Berkeley, this volume maps the roles in governance that courts are undertaking and the ways in which they have come to matter in the political life of their nations. It offers empirically rich accounts of dramatic judicial actions in the Americas, the Middle East, Europe, and Asia, exploring the political conditions and judicial strategies that have fostered those assertions of power, and evaluating when and how courts’ performance of new roles have been politically consequential. By focusing on the content and consequences of judicial power, the book advances a new agenda for the comparative study of courts.

Diana Kapiszewski is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Irvine. She is the author of High Courts and Economic Governance in Argentina and Brazil, which draws on her PhD dissertation, winner of the American Political Science Association’s Edward S. Corwin Award for Best Dissertation in Public Law, and is also coauthoring Field Research in Political Science, the discipline’s first book-length treatment of fieldwork. Her articles have appeared in Perspectives on Politics, PS: Political Science and Politics, Law & Society Review, Law and Social Inquiry, and Latin American Politics and Society.

Gordon Silverstein is Assistant Dean for Graduate Programs at Yale Law School, where he is helping develop and implement a PhD in Law degree program, as well as administering the Law School’s other graduate programs, including the LLM, JSD, and MSL degree programs. Silverstein is the author of Imbalance of Powers: Constitutional Interpretation and the Making of American Foreign Policy and Law’s Allure: How Law Shapes, Constrains, Saves, and Kills Politics, which was awarded the 2009 C. Herman Pritchett Award for the best book published in the field of law and courts that year. Silverstein has also published work on comparative constitutionalism, with a focus on Singapore, Hong Kong, and Europe.

Robert A. Kagan is Professor Emeritus of Political Science and Law at the University of California, Berkeley. He is the author of numerous works on regulatory enforcement and compliance and on the relationships between political structures, legal systems, and courts, including Regulatory Justice: Implementing a Wage-Price Freeze; Going by the Book: The Problem of Regulatory Unreasonableness; Adversarial Legalism: The American Way of Law; and Shades of Green: Business, Regulation, and Environment. He is a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences and recipient of the Law and Society Association’s Harry Kalven Prize for distinguished sociolegal scholarship and its Stanton Wheeler Award for teaching and mentorship, as well as a Lifetime Achievement Award from the Law and Courts Section of the American Political Science Association. He has served as coeditor of Regulation & Governance and as director of the Center for the Study of Law and Society at UC Berkeley.
Comparative constitutional law is an intellectually vibrant field that encompasses an increasingly broad array of approaches and methodologies. This series collects analytically innovative and empirically grounded work from scholars of comparative constitutionalism across academic disciplines. Books in the series include theoretically informed studies of single constitutional jurisdictions, comparative studies of constitutional law and institutions, and edited collections of original essays that respond to challenging theoretical and empirical questions in the field.

Volumes in the Series:

*Comparative Constitutional Design* edited by Tom Ginsburg (2012)

Consequential Courts

JUDICIAL ROLES IN GLOBAL PERSPECTIVE

Edited by

DIANA KAPISZEWSKI
University of California, Irvine

GORDON SILVERSTEIN
Yale Law School

ROBERT A. KAGAN
University of California, Berkeley

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
   k3367.c65 2013
   347'.012--dc23 2012037620

isbn 978-1-107-02653-7 (hardback) – isbn 978-1-107-69374-6 (paperback)

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of urls for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
Contents

Contributors

Introduction

Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan

1. EXPANDING JUDICIAL ROLES IN NEW OR RESTORED DEMOCRACIES

1. The Politics of Courts in Democratization: Four Junctures in Asia
   Tom Ginsburg
   45

   Alexei Trochev
   67

3. Constitutional Authority and Judicial Pragmatism: Politics and Law in the Evolution of South Africa’s Constitutional Court
   Heinz Klug
   93

4. Distributing Political Power: The Constitutional Tribunal in Post-Authoritarian Chile
   Druscilla L. Scribner
   114

5. The Transformation of the Mexican Supreme Court into an Arena for Political Contestation
   Mónica Castillejos-Aragón
   138
Contents

II. EXPANDING JUDICIAL ROLES IN ESTABLISHED DEMOCRACIES

6. Courts Enforcing Political Accountability: The Role of Criminal Justice in Italy
   Carlo Guarnieri
   163

7. The Dutch Hoge Raad: Judicial Roles Played, Lost, and Not Played
   Nick Huls
   181

8. A Consequential Court: The U.S. Supreme Court in the Twentieth Century
   Robert A. Kagan
   199

9. Judicial Constitution Making in a Divided Society: The Israeli Case
   Amnon Reichman
   233

10. Public Interest Litigation and the Transformation of the Supreme Court of India
    Manoj Mate
    262

11. The Judicial Dynamics of the French and European Fundamental Rights Revolution
    Mitchel de S.-O.-l’E. Lasser
    289

12. Constitutional Courts as Bulwarks of Secularism
    Ran Hirschl
    311

III. FOUR “PROVOCATIONS”

13. Why the Legal Complex is Integral to Theories of Consequential Courts
    Terence C. Halliday
    337

14. Judicial Power: Getting it and Keeping it
    John Ferejohn
    349

15. Constitutional Politics in the Active Voice
    Mark A. Graber
    363
Contents

16. The Mighty Problem Continues 380
    Martin Shapiro

Conclusion: Of Judicial Ships and Winds of Change 398
    Diana Kapiszewski, Gordon Silverstein, and Robert A. Kagan

Index 413
Contributors

Mónica Castillejos-Aragón is Assistant Professor of Law at the Centro de Investigación y Docencia Económicas (CIDE) (Mexico).

John Ferejohn is Samuel Tilden Professor of Law, New York University School of Law.

Tom Ginsburg is Leo Spitz Professor of International Law, University of Chicago Law School, and Research Professor, American Bar Foundation.

Mark A. Graber is Associate Dean for Research and Faculty Development and Professor of Law, University of Maryland, College Park.

Carlo Guarnieri is Professor of Political Science, University of Bologna (Italy).

Terence C. Halliday is Research Professor, American Bar Foundation; Co-Director, Center on Law and Globalization, American Bar Foundation and University of Illinois College of Law; Adjunct Professor of Sociology, Northwestern University; and Adjunct Professor, School of Regulation, Justice and Diplomacy, Australian National University.

Ran Hirschl is Canada Research Chair and Professor of Political Science and Law, University of Toronto.

Nick Huls is Vice Rector for Academic Affairs and Research at the Institute of Legal Practice and Development in Nyanza (Rwanda).

Heinz Klug is Evjue-Bascom Professor of Law, University of Wisconsin Law School; and Honorary Senior Research Associate in the School of Law, University of the Witwatersrand (South Africa).

Mitchel de S.-O.-l’E. Lasser is Jack G. Clarke Professor of Law and Director of Graduate Studies, Cornell Law School.
Contributors

Manoj Mate is Assistant Professor of Law, Whittier Law School, and Assistant Professor of Political Science (by courtesy), Whittier College.

Amnon Reichman is Professor of Law, University of Haifa (Israel).

Druscilla L. Scribner is Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Wisconsin, Oshkosh.

Martin Shapiro is James W. and Isabel Coffroth Professor of Law (Emeritus), Berkeley Law, University of California.

Alexei Trochev is Associate Professor, School of Humanities and Social Sciences, Nazarbayev University (Kazakhstan).