VIRTUES AND VICES IN POSITIVE PSYCHOLOGY

Positive psychology is one of the biggest growth industries in the discipline of psychology. At the present time, the sub-field of ‘positive education’ seems poised to take the world of education and teacher training by storm. In this first book-length philosophical study of positive psychology, Professor Kristján Kristjánsson subjects positive psychology’s recent inroads into virtue theory and virtue education to sustained conceptual and moral scrutiny. Professor Kristjánsson’s interdisciplinary perspective constructively integrates insights, evidence and considerations from social science and philosophy in a way easily accessible to the general reader. He offers an extended critique of positive psychology generally and ‘positive education’ in particular, exploring the philosophical assumptions, underpinnings and implications of these academic trends in detail. This provocative book will excite anyone interested in cutting-edge research on positive psychology and on the virtues that lie at the intersection of psychology, philosophy of mind, moral philosophy, education and daily life.

Kristján Kristjánsson received his PhD in moral philosophy from the University of St Andrews, Scotland. He has taught at the University of Akureyri, Iceland, and at the University of Iceland as a professor of philosophy of education. Kristjánsson has recently been appointed professor of character education and virtue ethics at the University of Birmingham and deputy director of the Jubilee Centre for Character and Values. He has been a visiting fellow at Cornell University, University of Konstanz, St Edmund’s College (Cambridge University) and Institute of Education (University of London). Kristjánsson has written six books in English (three published by Cambridge University Press) and three in Icelandic. He has published numerous articles on topics in moral philosophy, moral psychology, emotion theory and moral education in international journals in philosophy, psychology and education. He is a member of the International Society for Research on Emotions and a member of the editorial board of the Journal of Moral Education. In 2011 he was awarded the Ása Guðmundsdóttir Wright Award, the most prestigious scholarly award given in Iceland across the sciences and humanities.
Virtues and Vices in Positive Psychology

A Philosophical Critique

KRISTJÁN KRISTJÁNSSON

University of Birmingham

University of Iceland
To my colleague Erla, who keeps enlightening me on positive psychology; to my friends Teruko and Martin, who have helped me and my family make Cambridge our second home; and to Nora and Hlér for all the rest.
Contents

Acknowledgements   page ix

1 The Personal, Psychological, Philosophical, Educational and Historical Contexts of Positive Psychology 1
  1.1. The Personal Context 1
  1.2. The Psychological Context 11
  1.3. The Philosophical Context 16
  1.4. The Educational Context 21
  1.5. The Historical Context 24

2 Happiness and the Virtues 33
  2.1. Three Accounts of Happiness 33
  2.2. Positive Psychologists on Happiness 48
  2.3. Measuring Happiness 54
  2.4. Positive Psychology’s Virtue Project 60
  2.5. An Individualist Bias in Positive Psychology? 64

3 Personality and the Virtues 68
  3.1. Positive Psychology on Moral Character versus Personality 68
  3.2. Personality and the Five-Factor Model (‘The Big Five’) 70
  3.3. The Five-Factor Model: Empirical Evidence and Some Initial Criticisms 74
  3.4. The Five-Factor Model, Morality and Selfhood 79
  3.5. Lessons for Positive Psychologists 83

4 Moral Ontology and the Virtues 86
  4.1. The Positive Psychologists’ Dilemma 86
  4.2. Moral Realism, Anti-Realism and Hume’s Two Laws 89
  4.3. Social Scientific Manifestations of Hume’s Laws 93
  4.4. Objections to Hume’s Laws 98
  4.5. Lessons for Positive Psychologists 107
5 Moral Motivation and the Virtues 110
5.1. The Allure of Motivational Internalism 110
5.2. Motivational Internalism-Externalism and Aristotelian Naturalism 112
5.3. The Internalism-Externalism Debate 115
5.4. Enter Aristotle 121
5.5. Lessons for Positive Psychologists 128

6 Situations and the Virtues 131
6.1. A Lacuna in the Positive Psychology Literature 131
6.2. The Dispositionism-Situationism Debate in Philosophy 134
6.3. The Dispositionism-Situationism Debate in Psychology 138
6.4. What Is There in a Situation? 141
6.5. Lessons for Positive Psychologists 149

7 Conflicts, Practical Wisdom and the Virtues 151
7.1. Recurring Aristotelian Criticisms of Positive Psychology’s Virtue Theory 151
7.2. Aristotelian Phronesis 156
7.3. The Special Problem of Emotional Ambivalence 160
7.4. Moral Optimality, Proportionality and the Virtues 167
7.5. Lessons for Positive Psychologists 170

8 Positive Experiences and the Virtues 173
8.1. The Notion of ‘Positive Emotions’ 173
8.2. Flow 177
8.3. Pleasant Emotions and the Broaden-and-Build Thesis 181
8.4. A Test Case: Classroom Emotions 186
8.5. Lessons for Positive Psychologists 191

9 Education and the Virtues 194
9.1. The Nuts and Bolts of Virtue Education, VIA-Style 194
9.2. The Paradox(es) of Virtue Education 202
9.3. Resiliency and Mindfulness 205
9.4. Harsh Criticisms of Positive Education 211
9.5. Lessons for and from Positive Education 214

10 Concluding Remarks 218
10.1. The Personal Context 218
10.2. The Psychological Context 220
10.3. The Philosophical Context 222
10.4. The Educational Context 225
10.5. The Historical Context 228

References 231
Index 249
I started working on material for this book when I was a visiting Fellow at the Institute of Education, University of London, in the spring semester of 2009 – although I did not know then that it would be a book specifically about positive psychology! I completed work on the manuscript during another stint as a visiting Fellow at the Institute in the spring semester of 2012. I thank Professor Paul Standish, who was my host both times, and his colleagues at the Institute, especially Judith Suissa and Ruth Cigman, for stimulating discussions. I also thank the Cambridge University Library for giving me access to its unsurpassed collection of books and journals.

I am grateful to my colleague Erla Kristjánsdóttir for introducing me to the world of positive psychology and for giving me access to her personal library, which betters that of many university institutions. I am indebted to Blaine Fowers, Clark Chinn, Jon Webber, Sigurður J. Grétarsson, Ólafur Páll Jónsson, Logi Gunnarsson and Svend Brinkmann for helpful comments and conversations, and to Eranda Jayawickreme, Robert C. Roberts, Christian Miller, Jules Evans, Daniel C. Russell, Dan Haybron and Anna Alexandrova for giving me access to their (then) unpublished material. I also thank my postgraduate students in life-skills classes, 2009–11, for their intellectual stimulation.

My Cambridge University Press editors, Adina Berk and Eve Mayer, and their reviewers deserve thanks for being unreservedly supportive of the project from its very inception, and Nina Lee Colwill has been careful as always in bringing my written English up to scratch. I am grateful to Rebecca Cudby for helping me prepare the Index. I have received helpful feedback from audiences at University of Bern, University of Iceland, University of Cardiff, Institute of Education (University of London), Radboud University, University of Birmingham, Faculty of Education at Cambridge University, the London Philosophy Club, the 2010 PESGB Conference in Oxford, the AME 2011 Conference in Nanjing (China), the 2012 APNME Conference
in Chia-yi (Taiwan) and at three universities in Taiwan (National Chung Cheng University, National Taiwan Normal University and Taipei Municipal University of Education). Last but not least, my heartiest thanks go, as always, to my wife, Nora, and my son, Hlér, for their emotional support.