

INDEX

armed conflicts 75 active cyber defences 257 Additional Protocols to Geneva international Conventions categorizations of 79-82 criteria for existence of 79-84 Additional Protocol II type conflicts 90 - 1and neutrality 15 on criminal responsibility of and sovereign immunity 25 commanders and superiors see also non-international armed 92 conflicts on perfidy 180-1 and neutrality 248-9 on precautions in attack 164 thresholds for existence of 82-3 reprisals forbidden under Additional see also law of armed conflict Protocol I 152-3 armed forces on threshold for non-international conscription/enlisting of children prohibited in 218-20 conflicts 86 aerial blockades 196 involvement not required for cyber warfare used for enforcement existence of armed conflict 83 irregular 97 of 200-1 aggregation of incidents, amounting to law enforcement agencies/ armed attacks 56 paramilitary groups incorporated into 100-1 aircraft, nationality of 23 targetability and combatant airspace, international 21 cvber infrastructure in 21-2 immunity of members of AMW manual (air and missile warfare) 96-102, 116 7, 9 armed groups see organized armed groups; virtual armed groups anticipatory self-defence 63-6 archives, diplomatic, protection in Articles on State Responsibility (ILC) armed conflict of 25-6, 233-4 on countermeasures permissible for armed attacks injured States 36-41 cyber operations qualifying as 17 on retroactive attribution of and self-defence rights 54–62 wrongful acts to States 34 anticipatory 63-6 on State responsibility for wrongful collective 67-8 acts by non-State actors 32 attacks 7 objects of 113-18 indiscriminate 125, 156-9 see also targeting rules of law of armed conflict precautions in 164-5, 176-80, 224 and use of force 45-7, 52, 55 cancellations/suspensions of see also cyber attacks attacks 172-3



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02443-4 - Tallinn Manual on the International Law Applicable to Cyber Warfare:
Prepared by the International Group of Experts at the Invitation of the NATO Cooperative
Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence
Michael N. Schmitt
Index
More information

INDEX

attacks (cont.) ownership of 23 choice of targets duty 170-2 rights of coastal States over 17-18 constant care duty 165-7, 173 rules on seizure and destruction of, means and methods of warfare in occupation 247 choice 168-70 camouflage, permissibility of 185 and proportionality 170 cancellations of attacks 172-3 verification of targets duty 167-8 capabilities warnings duty 173-6 cvber 53 see also armed attacks; cyber attacks nuclear, of Iran, cyber operations attribution of wrongful acts to States directed against (Stuxnet, 2010) 58, 83–4, 170, 262 29 - 31and governmental authority 31 capture, legitimacy of perfidious acts and non-State actor cyber operations leading to 180-1 32-3, 35Caroline incident 63-4 and organs of State concept 31 censorship in armed conflict, legitimacy retroactive 34 of 221-2 children in armed conflict, protection authority, governmental, and organs of of 218-20 State 31 in occupation 241 civilian morale, targeting decline of 133 belligerent nexus criterion for direct participation in civilian objects 125-34 hostilities 120 feigning status of 183 not present in activities on neutral military use of 128-9 territory 254 assessment of 137-40 belligerent reprisals 41, 149-52 intentions to 129 belligerent rights, exercise of 249-50 segregation of civilian and military use 177-8 on neutral territory and obligations of neutral States see also dual-use objects 252-4 natural environment as 232 prohibition of 251-2 precautions in attack principles remedies against failure to stop applied to 165-8 254-5 proximity to military objectives prohibited against neutral 179 infrastructure 250 proportionality principle in attacks bleed-over effects, and self-defence on 159-64 rights 57 targeting rules applicable to 110, blockades 124-5 cyber 195-8, 201 civilians in armed conflict naval/aerial, cyber warfare used for determination of status of 114-15 enforcement of 200-1 feigning status of 183 booby traps, cyber 146-8 occupation 240-2 botnets 33, 257 protection of objects indispensable to breaches of international law survival of 225-7 see violations, of reprisals against 152-3 international law starvation of, as methods of warfare 148-9, 226 targeting rules applicable to 110, cables, submarine and neutrality 250-1 113 - 14



INDEX 265

distinction principle 110-12 government employees 118 proportionality principle 159-64, see also direct participation in hostilities; precautions in attack close access operations 257 cloud computing 78, 257 coastal States, rights over submarine cables 17-18 coercion economic and political 46 necessary element of intervention 44 - 5collateral damage 109, 159-61 excessive 161, 223-4 obligation to minimize 168-70 uncertainty about 163 collective punishments, prohibition of 234 - 6collective security 72 collective self-defence 67-8 collectives, informal groups acting as 90 combatant immunity 95-102 for cyber operations participants 98 for levées en masse participants 102 - 3for organized armed group members 97-8, 116-17 for spies 195 see also targeting rules of law of armed conflict; unprivileged belligerency commanders, criminal responsibility of Commander's Handbook (United States) 8-9, 130-1 communications, diplomatic, protection in armed conflict of 25-6, 233-4 compliance with international law, and sovereign immunity 24-5 with UN Security Council resolutions, obligations to 255-6

Computer Emergency Response Teams (CERTs) 31-2, 258 computer network exploitation (CNE) 193 computers, computer systems, computer networks 258 camouflage of 185 medical, protection in armed conflict of 206-10 qualifying as weapons 100 of UN, protection in armed conflict of 210-13 see also cyber infrastructure concurrent jurisdiction, of several States over cyber operations confidence 182 confiscation of property, in occupation 245 - 7conscription of children into armed forces, prohibition of 218-20 consensus, on Tallinn Manual Rules 6 consent, of States to conduct cyber operations on its territory 17 consequences of cyber operations 56-7 foreseeable 181, 250 immediacy of 49 measurability of 50 violent 106-8 constant care duty 165-7, 173 constructive knowledge of cyber operations 28, 253 continental shelves, rights over submarine cables in 17-18 continuous combat function 116-17 Corfu Channel case (United Kingdom v. Albania, ICJ) 26 corporations, determination of nationality of 23 correspondence, of detained persons in armed conflict, protection of 216 - 17countermeasures 36-7 cyber 38 permissibility of 17, 29



266 INDEX

criminal responsibility dams, dykes and nuclear electrical of commanders and superiors 91-4 generating stations 223-5 overall control test for 32-3 distinction principle 110-12 criteria dual-use objects 135-6 for armed attacks 55 lawful objects of attack 115-18 for cyber operations qualifying as use medical computers, networks and of force 48-52 data 206-10 for direct participation in hostilities medical and religious personnel, 119 - 20medical units and transports for existence of international armed 204-5, 208-10 military objectives 128 conflict 79-84 for military objectives 127-9 natural environment 231-3 cross-border activities objects indispensable to survival of in non-international armed conflict civilian population 225–7 86 UN personnel, installations, in self-defence 60-1 materiel, units and vehicles cultural property, targeting rules 210 - 13applicable to 152, 228-30 with terror purposes 122-4 customary international law see also cyber operations, as armed on combatant immunity 96 attacks; cyber warfare on intervention 44 cyber blockades 195-8, 201 on State responsibility 29 cyber booby traps 146-8 and Tallinn Manual Rules 6-9 cyber capability 53 on use of force 43-4 cyber countermeasures 38 cyber attacks 17, 76, 106-10 cyber defences active 257 espionage acts amounting to 195 indiscriminate 156-8 passive 261 originators of cyber espionage 50, 192-5 cyber infrastructure 15, 142, 258 identification of 110 legitimacy of concealment of 183, camouflage of 185 189 - 90control by States/parties to a conflict over 26-9, 178 precautions in 164-5, 176-80, 224 cancellations/suspensions of as immovable or movable State property 245-6 attacks 172-3 choice of targets duty 170-2 and jurisdiction of States 18-21 flag States and States of constant care duty 165-7, 173 means and methods of warfare registration 21-3 choice 168-70 as military objective 133-4 and proportionality 170 neutral 248-9, 252-3 verification of targets duty 167-8 protection of 250 warnings duty 173-6 as object indispensable to survival of proportionality in 136, 159-64, 170 civilian population 227 spill-over effects in neutral territory obligations of Occupying Powers to of 250 restore and maintain targeting rules applicable to 105 242 - 3civilian objects 110, 124-5 and State sovereignty 15-18 civilians 113-14 cultural property 228-30 for cyber attacks 183



INDEX 267

from another State, and State responsibility 36 governmental, and State responsibility 34-5 and territorial jurisdiction 19 cyber operations 1-2, 15, 76, 258 as armed attacks 17 and self-defence rights 54-62 anticipatory 63-6 collective 67-8 see also cyber attacks combatant status for persons engaged in 98 criminal 101-2 diplomatic, protection of 234 harmful, prevention of 27-9 jurisdiction of States over 18-26 and jus ad bellum 42 threat or use of force 17, 42-5 law of armed conflict applicable to 3, 75 - 8blockades 195-8, 200-1 civilian status presumption collective punishments 234-6 combatant immunity/unprivileged belligerency 101-3 conscription/enlistment of children 218-20 constant care duty 165-7, 173 criminal responsibility of commanders and superiors 91 - 4detained persons 214-18 espionage 50, 192-5 journalists 220-2 levée en masse 103 mercenaries 103-4 non-interference with humanitarian assistance 236 - 8non-international armed conflicts participation in hostilities 95, 120 - 2perfidy 180-4 precautions in attack see cyber attacks, precautions in

protective emblems, prohibition on improper use of 185-92 ruses 184-5 see also cyber attacks, targeting rules applicable to law of neutrality applicable to 78, 248 - 9and compliance with UN Security Council resolutions 255-6 obligations of neutral States 252-4 operations in neutral territory 251 - 2protection of neutral cyber infrastructure 250 remedies against enemy's unlawful activities on neutral territory 254 - 5law of occupation applicable to 239 - 40confiscation/requisition of property 245-7 Occupying Powers allowed to ensure its security 244-5 protection of civilians 240–2 public order and safety ensured in 242 - 4non-forceful measures against threats to peace 70 by non-State actors 18, 54 and attribution of wrongful acts to States 32-3, 35 and operational zones 202 remedial 28 and responsibility of States 15, 29-34 countermeasure permissible 36-41 governmental infrastructure use infrastructure used of another State 36 as self-defence acts 68 and sovereignty of States 15-18 and use/threats of force 43, 45-53 prohibited use/threats 17, 42-5 cyber security 2, 4, 13 cyber warfare international law applicable to 3, 13 US policies on 2–3

means and methods of 140-2



268 IND	EX
cyber warfare (cont.)	definitions
booby traps 146-8	blockades 195
indiscriminate 144-6, 156-9	booby traps 146-7
precautions in choice of 168-70	botnets 257
reprisals 149–53	civilian objects 125-34
starvation of civilians 148-9, 226	civilians 104, 113
to enforce naval/aerial blockades	cloud computing 257
200-1	computers, computer networks
unnecessary suffering 143-4	and computer systems
weapons reviews 153-6	258
see also cyber attacks	countermeasures 36-7
cyber weapons 100, 141-2	cultural property 228
transmission across neutral territory	cyber attacks 106-10
of 252	cyber espionage 193
uncontrollable chains of events	cyber infrastructure 258
created by 145-6	cyber operations 258
cyber zones 199–200	cyberspace 258
cyberspace 258	data 258
armed conflicts in 84	high seas 21
hostile use of 13	humanitarian assistance 237
jurisdiction in 19	international airspace 21
neutrality in 249	Internet 260
sovereignty over 18	malware/malicious logic 260
ζ ,	mercenaries 104
damage	military objectives 125-34
causation of, and wrongful acts 30	natural environment 231-2
caused by cyber attacks 108-9	occupation 239
collateral 109, 159-61	outer space 21
excessive 161, 223-4	perfidy 180–1
obligation to minimize 168-70	social networks 261
uncertainty about 163	software 261
see also harm	spoofing 261
dams, cyber attacks on, duty of care for	State jurisdiction 18
223-5	State sovereignty 16
data 258	delayed effects, and direct participation
attacks on	in hostilities 121
harm caused by 107-9	Denial of Service (DoS) 259
as military objective 127	destruction
determination of residence of 19	of property, and perfidy 182-3
dual-use of, targetability of 136-7,	wanton 232
206	detained persons in armed conflict, law
medical	of armed conflict applicable
identification of 207-8	to 213–14, 216–18
protection in armed conflict of	digital cultural property 229-30
206-8	diplomatic archives and
loss of 208-10	communications, protection
as property 245	in armed conflict of 25-6,
transit of, in armed conflict 78	233-4



direct participation in hostilities 95-6,	prohibition on improper use of
104–6, 118–22	185–92
by journalists 222	enemies
and presumption of civilian status	acts harmful to 208-9
115	indicators of, prohibition on
directness criterion for determination	improper use of 188–91
of use of force 49	enforcement
distinction principle 110-12	actions by international
distinctive sign/emblem requirements	organizations 69–72
for combatant status 99-100	of blockades 200-1
for cultural property 230	of law, agencies in armed forces
for medical transports and units	100-1
206-8	equipment
domestic law	diplomatic, protection of 234
criminal cyber operations in 101-2	journalistic, protection of 222
obligations of Occupying Powers for	medical
maintaining of 243	identification of 206-8
doubt, threshold of, for presumption	protection of 204-6, 208-10
of civilian status 114–15	military
drafting of Tallinn Manual 10-11	rules on use when gaining control
dual-use objects	of 190-1
segregation of military and civilian	State responsibility for use of 35
use in 177–8	of UN, protection of 210-13
targetability of 134-7, 206	espionage
due care threshold 28	cyber 50, 192-5
duration, of direct participation in	and perfidy 183
hostilities 121	State responsibility for 30
dykes, cyber attacks on, duty of care	essential interests, necessity defences
for 223–5	based on 40
	Estonia, cyber operations directed
economic coercion 46	against (2007) 40-1, 57-8, 82
economic objects, war-sustaining,	Estonian jurisdiction over 20
targetability of 130-1	law of armed conflict not applicable
effective contribution to military action	to 75
130, 137–40	exceptions, to State sovereignty 16
effectiveness	excessiveness, of collateral damage 161,
of control	223-4
over cyber operations by	expression, freedoms of, Occupying
commanders/superiors 93-4	Powers imposing limitations
tests 32, 92–3	on 243
of cyber blockades 197-8	extraterritorial jurisdiction 20
of warnings 174–5	over cyber operations 20
effects see consequences	
emblems	flag States, jurisdiction over
distinctive	cyber infrastructure by
for cultural property 230	21-3
for medical transports and units	flags, warships carrying neutral or
206-8	enemy 191



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02443-4 - Tallinn Manual on the International Law Applicable to Cyber Warfare:
Prepared by the International Group of Experts at the Invitation of the NATO Cooperative
Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence
Michael N. Schmitt
Index
More information

INDEX

infrastructure devoted force prohibited use of 42 exclusively to 24 for countermeasures 37-8 governmental authority, and organs of cyber operations as 17, 42-5 State 31 use/threats of governmental cyber infrastructure, and armed attacks 45-7, 52, 55 State responsibility for cyber operations as 43, 45-53 operations launched from UN Security Council authorizations for 69-71 Hague Conventions on the Laws and see also jus ad bellum foreseeable consequences of attacks/ Customs of War on Land cyber attacks 181, 250 (1907)Convention IV 77 freedoms of expression, Occupying Powers imposing limitations Regulations 8-9, 242-3, 246-7 Convention V 251-2 on 243 Hague Cultural Property Convention functionality, interference with, as (1954) 228-30 damage caused by cyber attacks 108-9 harm caused by attacks on data 107-9 thresholds of 56, 107, 113 Gabčikovo-Nagymoros case (Hungary v. Slovakia, ICJ) see also damage 38 - 9harmful cyber operations/attacks, Galić case (ICTY) 163 prevention of 27–9 Geneva Conventions (1949) 8-9 high seas 21 on criteria for existence of cyber infrastructure on 21–2 international/ hors de combat status 116 non-international armed hostile acts see belligerent rights conflict 79, 84-6 hostilities on obligations to prosecute war armed conflict in absence of 84 crimes 91-2 participation in 95 Genocide case (Bosnia and Herzegovina see also direct participation in v. Serbia and Montenegro, hostilities ICJ) 32-3, 80 requirement for existence of armed geo-coordinates, tracking of, and conflict 82-3 territorial jurisdiction 19 human rights law geographical limitations and limitations on freedoms on blockades 197 of expression in occupation on cyber operations in armed conflict 78-9 and restricted access to Internet 17 on non-international armed humanitarian assistance operations

conflicts 78-9, 85-6

against (2008 conflict with

Georgia, cyber operations directed

Russia) 20, 75–6 government employees, civilian,

targetability of 118

immunity for cyber

government purposes, sovereign

non-interference with 236-8

210 - 13

protection of those involved in

ICC (International Criminal Court)

Statute, on criminal

and superiors 93, 94

responsibility of commanders



INDEX 271

ICJ (International Court of Justice) Advisory Opinions, Nuclear Weapons (Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons) 54, 111, 140-1 on armed attacks 45-7, 54, 56 Cases Corfu Channel (United Kingdom v. Albania) 26 Gabčikovo-Nagymoros (Hungary v. Slovakia) 38-9 Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Serbia and Montenegro) 32 - 3, 80Nicaragua (Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua) 26, 44-7, 55-6, 58, 61, 68 Oil Platforms (Iran v. United States) 38, 56, 61 Tehran Hostages (United States v. Iran) 234 on countermeasures 38-9 on effective/overall control 32, 80 on law of armed conflict 3 on means and methods of warfare 143 on prohibited interventions 44 on protection of diplomatic premises 234 on self-defence rights 68 on sovereign equality 26 ICRC (International Committee of the Red Cross) on belligerent reprisals 151 on collective punishments 235 Customary International Humanitarian Law Study on improper use of enemy/neutral indicators 190, 192 Interpretive Guidance 97–8 on levées en masse 102-3 on military advantage 132 observer status at drafting of Tallinn Manual 10 on perfidy 182 on precautions in attack 164-5, 177

on protection of natural environment 232 on threshold of violence for existence armed conflict 82-3 ICT use see cyber infrastructure ICTY (International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia) Cases Galić 163 Limai 89 Tadić 32-3, 80-1, 87-8 on organized armed groups 89 overall control test of 32-3, 80-2 on proportionality in attack 163 on thresholds for non-international armed conflicts 87-8 identification of medical computers, networks and data 206-8 of originators of cyber attacks 110 immediacy of consequences 49 requirement for self-defence acts 66 - 7imminent attacks, and self-defence rights 63-6 immovable State property, obligations of Occupying Powers to safeguard capital value of 245-6 immunity combatant 95-102 for cyber operations participants 98 for levées en masse participants 102 - 3for spies 195 sovereign, and international armed conflicts 25 incidents, amounting to armed attacks 56 indirect effects of cyber attacks 160-1 indiscriminate attacks/means and methods of warfare 125, 144-6, 156-9 individuals criminal responsibility of 32-3, 91-4 overall control test not applicable to 81 - 2



272 INDEX

individuals (cont.) applicable to cyberspace 3, 13 prohibition to direct compliance with, and sovereign countermeasures at 39 immunity 24-5 informal groups, collective activities customary on combatant immunity 96 on intervention 44 injury prohibition to cause superfluous 143-4 on State responsibility 29 see also collateral damage, and Tallinn Manual Rules 6-9 excessive on use of force 43-4 intensity criterion for non-international legality presumption in 51 armed conflicts 87 obligations and cyber operations 88 to comply with UN Security intentions Council resolutions 255-6 of armed attacks, and self-defence to prevent acts contrary to rights 59-60 international law 27-8 of cyber operations, relevance of 57 to prosecute war crimes 91-2 to attack objects indispensable to State jurisdiction limited by 21 survival of civilian peremptory norms of 39 population 226 on sovereign immunity 23-4 to carry out threats of force 53-4 violations/breaches of interference with sovereign to spread terror 123-4 to use a civilian object for military immunity 24 involvement of States with nonends 129 interception of cyber attacks 110 State actors as 33-4 interference 217 and State responsibility for cyber operations 29-34 with functionality, as damage caused by cyber attacks 108-9 international telecommunications law, with humanitarian assistance and restricted access to operations 236-8 Internet 17 with sovereign immunity 24 internationally wrongful acts see wrongful acts international airspace 21 cyber infrastructure in 21-2 Internet 260 international armed conflicts cyber attacks against 136 categorizations of, and State control military use of, and neutrality 251 over non-State actors 79-82 and objects indispensable to survival criteria for existence of 79-84 of civilian population 227 law of neutrality in, and cyber restricting access to 17 operations/infrastructure 15 interventions, UN Charter prohibition and sovereign immunity 25 on 44 see also law of armed conflicts noncyber operations as violations of 17, international armed conflicts 44 - 5international cyber security law 13 invasiveness criterion for international humanitarian law see law determination of use of force of armed conflict 49 - 50international law Iran, cyber operations directed against applicable to cyber warfare see law of nuclear capabilities of armed conflict, applicable to (Stuxnet, 2010) 58, 83-4, 170, cyber operations 262



INDEX 273

Island of Palmas Arbitral Award (Netherlands v. US) 16 journalists in armed conflict, protection of 220-2 jurisdiction of States over cyber infrastructure/operations 18-26 jus ad bellum and cyber operations 42 threat or use of force 17, 42-5 and law of armed conflict 77 knowledge, constructive, of cyber operations 28, 253 Kosovo Liberation Army (KLA) 89 last feasible window of opportunity standard 64-5 law of armed conflict applicable to cyber operations 3, 75 - 8blockades 195-8, 200-1 collective punishments 234-6 combatant immunity/ participation in hostilities 95, 101 - 3see also direct participation in hostilities constant care duty 165-7, 173 criminal responsibility of commanders and superiors 91 - 4distinction principle 110-12 espionage 50, 192-5 improper use of protective emblems prohibition 185-92 indiscriminate attacks, means and methods prohibition 125, 144-6, 156-9 non-interference with humanitarian assistance 236-8 non-international armed conflicts, existence of 84-91 participation in hostilities see direct participation in

irregular armed forces 97

perfidy 180-4 precautions in attack see cyber attacks, precautions in presumption of civilian status 115 ruses 184-5 see also cyber attacks means and methods of cyber warfare protections in armed conflict targeting rules of law of armed conflict customary 7, 29 and sovereign immunity 25 see also targeting rules of law of armed conflict law enforcement see enforcement law of neutrality 15, 78, 248-9 and compliance with UN Security Council resolutions 255-6 cyber operations in neutral territory 251 - 2inviolability of neutral territory in 250 obligations of neutral States in 252-4 protection of neutral cyber infrastructure in 250 remedies against enemy's unlawful activities on neutral territory 254-5 law of occupation 240 and collective punishments 235-6 confiscation/requisition of property 245 - 7protection of civilians in 240-2 public order and safety asssurances 242 - 4and security of Occupying Powers 244 - 5law of the sea, and rights over submarine cables 17-18 legality presumption in international law 51 levées en masse participants combatant immunity for 102-3 targetability of 116, 118 Limaj case (ICTY) 89 limitations on freedoms of expression, imposed

by Occupying Powers 243

hostilities



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02443-4 - Tallinn Manual on the International Law Applicable to Cyber Warfare:
Prepared by the International Group of Experts at the Invitation of the NATO Cooperative
Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence
Michael N. Schmitt
Index
More information

INDEX

limitations (cont.) mercenaries, unprivileged belligerent status of 103-4 geographical on blockades 197 methods of warfare see means and on cyber operations in armed methods of warfare conflict 78-9 military activities, prohibition of on non-international armed compulsory participation in conflicts 85-6 detained persons 217-18 on State jurisdiction, by international enemy nationals in occupation 242 law obligations 21 military advantage 130-3, 161-2 on State sovereignty 17 and precautions in attack 171-2 locations military character criterion for criterion for military objectives 128 determination of use of force of cyber operations, and State 50 - 1responsibility 33 military commanders/superiors, of ICT users, and territorial criminal responsibility of 91-4 jurisdiction 19 military equipment of enemy, rules on use when gaining malware 260, 262 control of 190-1 assessment of damage caused by 16 State responsibility for use of 35 introduction of, as cyber attack military manuals 109 - 10used as source for Tallinn Manual 8_9 manuals on cyber warfare see Tallinn Manual on war-sustaining activities 130-1 military objectives 7 military used as source for Tallinn Manual attacks on/targetability of 114, 125-34 8_9 on war-sustaining activities 130-1 dual-use objects 134-7 Martens Clause 77-8 segregation of military and civilian means and methods of cyber warfare use 177-8 140 - 2proximity of civilians and civilian booby traps 146-8 objects to 179 motives see intentions indiscriminate 144-6, 156-9 precautions in choice of 168-70 reprisals 149-53 nationality, of aircrafts and satellites 23 to enforce naval/aerial blockades NATO (North Atlantic Treaty 200 - 1Organization) unnecessary suffering 143-4 Allied Command Transformation weapons reviews 153-6 9-10 measurability of consequences 50 as collective security organization 72 medical personnel, units and transport, Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre computers, computer of Excellence (Tallinn, networks and data Estonia) 1 identification of 206-8 Strategic Concept (2010), cyber

204 - 6

loss of 208-10

membership, of organized armed

protection in armed conflict of

groups 97-8, 116-17

warfare included in 2-3

armed conflict of 231-3

nature criterion, for military objectives

natural environment, protection in

127



INDEX 275

Naulilaa Arbitral Award (Portugal v. combatant immunity absent from Germany) 38 101 - 2naval blockades, cyber warfare used for and cyber operations 76-7 enforcement of 200-1 distinction principle 111 necessity humanitarian assistance defences, actions/countermeasures operations 236 improper use of neutral indicators based on 39-40 determination of 245 principle, in exercise of self-defence precautions in attack 176 rights 61-3 manuals on 7-8 neutral indicators, prohibition on presumption of civilian status in 115 improper use of 191-2 non-intervention principle 44 neutrality cyber operations as violations of 17, and blockades 198, 200-1 44 - 5law of 15, 78, 248-9 non-kinetic armed attacks 54-5 non-State actors and compliance with UN Security Council resolutions 255-6 armed attacks by, and self-defence and cyber operations in neutral rights 58-9 territory 251-2 in armed conflict inviolability of neutral territory as armed attack 54 in 250 State control over 79-82 obligations of neutral States in as violations of State sovereignty 252 - 4protection of neutral cyber cyber operations by, and attribution infrastructure 250 of wrongful acts to States remedies against enemy's unlawful 32-3, 35 State involvement with, as violation activities on neutral territory 254-5 of international law 33-4 neutralization, of military objectives UN Charter prohibition on use of 132 - 3force not applicable to 43-4 NIAC Manual (non-international norms, peremptory, of international armed conflicts) 7-8 law 39 Nicaragua case (Military and nuclear capabilities, of Iran, cyber Paramilitary Activities in and operations directed against (Stuxnet, 2010) 58, 83-4, 170, against Nicaragua, ICJ) 26, 44-7, 55-6, 58, 61, 68 non-commercial use 35 nuclear electrical generating stations, non-forceful measures against threats cyber attacks on, duty of care to peace 69-70 for 223-5 non-international armed conflicts Nuclear Weapons Advisory Opinion 84 - 91(Legality of the Threat or Use civilians in 105 of Nuclear Weapons, ICJ) 54, geographic limitations of 78-9, 85-6 111, 140-1law of armed conflict applicable to attacks on objects indispensable to objective territorial jurisdiction 20 survival of civilian over cyber operations 20 population 226 objects 126-7

of attack 113-18, 125

blockades 198



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02443-4 - Tallinn Manual on the International Law Applicable to Cyber Warfare:
Prepared by the International Group of Experts at the Invitation of the NATO Cooperative
Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence
Michael N. Schmitt
Index
More information

INDEX

objects (cont.) prohibition to conscript/enlist see also targeting rules of law of children in 218-20 armed conflict targetability/combatant status of obligations members of 97-8, 116-17 of international law virtual organizations qualifying as breaches of, and State 98-9 responsibility for cyber organs of State 30-1 operations 29-34 constructive knowledge of 253 State jurisdiction limited by 21 governmental authority equated to comply with UN Security with 31 Council resolutions 255-6 and State responsibility 31 to prevent acts contrary to originators international law 27-8 of armed attacks 58 to prosecute war crimes 91–2 of cyber attacks of neutral States 252-4 identification of 110 of Occupying Powers 241-3 legitimacy of concealing of 183, 189-90 of parties to armed conflicts outer space 21 to care for dams, dykes and nuclear electrical generating cyber infrastructure in 21-2 inclusion in natural environment of stations 223-5 231 - 2to respect and protect journalists 220-1 overall control test 32-3, 79-82 medical and religious personnel, medical units and paramilitary groups, incorporated into armed forces 100-1 transports 205-6 passive cyber defences 261 UN personnel 211-12 to take precautions in attack passive precautions 176-7 164-5, 167-80 failure to take 180 of States peace to respect the sovereignty of other threats to 69 non-forceful measures against States 26 to review weapons 153-6 69 - 70occupation law 239-40 peacekeeping operations, protection of persons involved in 210-13 and collective punishments 235-6 peremptory norms of international confiscation/requisition of property in 245-7 law 39 protection of civilians in 240-2 perfidy, prohibition of 180-4 public order and safety assurances Permanent Court of Arbitration, Island of Palmas Arbitral Award 242 - 4and security of Occupying Powers (Netherlands v. US) 16 244 - 5Permanent Court of International Oil Platforms case (Iran v. United Justice, on international law 3 States, ICJ) 38, 56, 61 platforms, jurisdiction over cyber operational zones 199-200 infrastructure on cyber operations in support of 202 enjoying sovereign immunity 23-6 organized armed groups 88–90 in high seas/international airspace/ criteria for combatant status of outer space 21-3 members of 97 policing, of cyber operations 28



INDEX 277

political coercion 46 in exercise of self-defence rights 61–3 precautions in attack 164-5, 176-80, prosecution, of war crimes, obligations of 91-2 2.2.4 cancellations/suspensions of attacks prospective acts 27 172 - 3protections in armed conflict choice of targets duty 170-2 of children 218-20 constant care duty 165-7, 173 of civilians/civilian objects 113-14 means and methods of warfare distinction principle 110-12 choice 168-70 in occupation 240-2 and proportionality 170 see also direct civilian verification of targets duty 167-8 participation in hostilities precautions in attack warnings duty 173-6 preparations, for attacks 65 of cultural property 228-30 presumptions of detained persons 213-18 of civilian status 114-15 of diplomatic archives and of civilian use of objects 137-40 communications 25-6, 233-4 against direct participation in of journalists 220-2 hostilities 122 of medical personnel, units and of legality in international law 51 transport, computers, of public ownership, for confiscation systems and networks 204-8 loss of 208-10 and requisition of property in occupation 246 of natural environment 231-3 of neutral cyber infrastructure 250 prevention of objects indispensable to survival of of acts contrary to international law 27 - 8civilian population 225-7 of exercise of belligerent rights 253-4 religious personnel 204-5 specific 203-4 of harmful cyber operations/attacks 27 - 9of UN personnel, installations, materiel, units and vehicles preventive strikes 65-6 private contractors, targetability of 210 - 13protective emblems, prohibition on 117 - 18improper use of 185-92 private property, rules on confiscation/ requisition of 246-7 protracted violence 88 in occupation 246-7 proximate causes of death or injury propaganda, spread of, as direct 181 - 2participation in hostilities punishments, collective, prohibition of 234-6 property purposes confiscation/requisition of, in of countermeasures 37 occupation 245-7 criterion for military objectives 129 cultural, protection of 152, 228-30 destruction of, and perfidy 182-3 reasonableness tests 27 see also civilian objects dual-use Red Cross/Crescent/Crystal objects military objectives prohibition on improper use of proportionality principle 185 - 7in countermeasures 38-9 see also ICRC in cyber attacks 159-64, 170 regional organizations, self-defence against Internet 136 rights exercised by 71–2



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02443-4 - Tallinn Manual on the International Law Applicable to Cyber Warfare:
Prepared by the International Group of Experts at the Invitation of the NATO Cooperative
Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence
Michael N. Schmitt
Index
More information

registration, States of, jurisdiction over	satellites
cyber infrastructure by 21–3	nationality of 23
religious personnel	sovereign immunity of 24
protection in armed conflict of	seas
204-5	high 21
loss of 208–10	cyber infrastructure in 21–2
remedial cyber operations 28	law of 17–18
remote control over cyber operations,	security
and State jurisdiction 22	collective 72
repeated actions, qualifying as direct	cyber 2, 4, 13
participation in hostilities	of Occupying Powers, measures
121–2	allowed for assurance of 244-5
reprisals	threats
Additional Protocol I on 152-3	cyber warfare as 2
belligerent 41, 149-52	laws/freedoms suspended because
requisition of property 137	of 243
in occupation 245-7	violations of law of neutrality
respect, duties to 26, 165-7, 205,	qualifying as 255
211–12, 220–1, 228–30, 241	self-defence rights
responsibility	armed (cyber) attacks triggering of
criminal 32-3, 91-4	17, 54–61
of States	anticipatory 63-6
for cyber operations 15, 29–34	collective 67–8
countermeasures permissible	exercise of
36–41	necessity and proportionality
from governmental	principle in 61–3
infrastructure 34–5	by regional organizations 71-2
routed through another State 36	reporting requirement to UN
invocation by another State 39	Security Council 68
retorsion, acts of 40	by United Nations Security
retroactive attribution of wrongful	Council 69–71
acts 34	use of force in 42
Rome Statute see ICC (International	invocation of 29
Criminal Court) Statute	of UN personnel 212–13
ruses	self-determination rights 82
legitimacy of use of 131, 184-5,	severity criterion for determination of
189–90	use of force 48
and perfidy 184	Simma, Judge 38
warnings as 176	social networks 261
Russian Federation, cyber operations in	legitimacy of cyber attacks against
international armed conflict	135–6
with Georgia (2008) by 20,	software 261
75–6	qualifying as weapons 100
	sovereign equality principle 26
St Petersburg Declaration (1868)	sovereign immunity, cyber
124–5	infrastructure on platforms
sanctuary, provision of, and use of force	subject to, jurisdiction over
criteria 46–7	23-6



sovereignty of States	recognition of cyber warfare as
and control over cyber	security threat by 2
infrastructure/operations	responsibility of
15–18	for cyber operations 15, 29-34
and cross-border actions in	countermeasures permissible in
self-defence 60-1	cases of 36-41
obligations of States to respect 26	from governmental
space see cyberspace outer space	infrastructure 34–5
speculative advantage 132	routed through a State 36
spill-over effects in neutral territory,	invocation by another State 39
of cyber attacks 250	sovereignty of, and cross-border
spoofing 261	actions in self-defence 60-1
of locations, and territorial	Stuxnet operations (2010) 58, 83-4,
jurisdiction 19	170, 262
by non-State actors, and State	subjective territorial jurisdiction 19-20
responsibility 35	submarine cables
spying see espionage	and neutrality 250-1
starvation of civilians, prohibited as	ownership of 23
method of warfare 148-9,	rights of coastal States over 17-18
226	rules on seizure or destruction of, in
States	occupation 247
attribution of wrongful acts to	suffering, unnecessary 143-4
29–31	superiors, criminal responsibility of
and governmental authority 31	91–4
and non-State actor cyber	survival of civilian population
operations 32–3, 35	assurances of continued computer
and organs of State concept 31	operations essential to 242
retroactive 34	prohibition of attack on objects
control of	indispensable to 225-7
over cyber infrastructure/	suspension of attacks 172-3
operations 15-18, 26-9, 178	
over non-State actors 79-82	Tadić case (ICTY) 32-3, 80-1, 87-8
immovable property of, obligations	Tallinn Manual 1, 3-4
of Occupying Powers to	authority of 11
safeguard capital value of	commentary 6-7
245-6	drafting process 10-11
immunity of 25	international group of experts 9-10
involvement of, as criterion for	Rules 5–6
determination of use of	consensus on 6
force 51	scope of 4–5
jurisdiction over cyber	sources 9
infrastructure/operations	of customary international law
18–26	7–9
neutral 248, 252-4	military manuals 8–9
obligations of	secondary 9
to respect sovereignty of other	targeting rules of law of armed conflict
States 26	106, 115–18
to review weapons 153-6	choice of targets duty 170-2



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02443-4 - Tallinn Manual on the International Law Applicable to Cyber Warfare:
Prepared by the International Group of Experts at the Invitation of the NATO Cooperative
Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence
Michael N. Schmitt
Index
More information

INDEX

targeting rules of law of armed conflict cyber operations on 251-2 inviolability of 250 (cont.) civilian objects 110, 124-5 remedies against enemy's unlawful civilians 110, 113-14 activities on 254-5 and direct participation in physical control of, and Additional hostilities 95-6, 118-22 Protocol II type conflicts 90-1 terror, prohibition of spreading of government employees 118 proportionality principle 159-64 threats cultural property 152, 228-30 of cyber attacks 123 dams, dykes and nuclear electrical to peace 69 generating stations 223-5 non-forceful measures against distinction principle in 110-12 69-70 dual-use objects 134-7, 206 to security medical personnel, units and cyber warfare as 2 transports, computers, laws/freedoms suspended because networks and data 204-10 of 243 military objectives 125-34 violations of law of neutrality natural environment 231-3 qualifying as 255 objects indispensable to survival of of use of force, cyber operations civilian population 225-7 constituting 52-3 organized armed group members thresholds 97-8, 116-17 of control, tests for 32–3 religious personnel 204-5, 208-10 of danger for civilians 174, 178 of doubt, for presumption of civilian UN personnel, installations, materiel, units and vehicles 188, status 114-15 of due care 28 210 - 13verification of targets duty 167-8 of harm 56, 107, 113 see also combatant immunity of use of force 45-6 protections of violence Tehran Hostages case (United States for existence of armed conflict v. Iran, ICI) 234 82 - 3telecommunications law, international, for existence of non-international and restricted access to armed conflict 84-91 Internet 17 transit of data, in armed conflict 78 terminology problems 7 regarding countermeasures 40-1 States of, and obligations/ territorial jurisdiction 18 responsibilities of States and ICT use 19 28-9, 36objective 20 treachery see perfidy subjective 19-20 see also extraterritorial jurisdiction UN Charter territorial sea, rights over submarine on military actions 50-1 cables in 17-18 on powers of UN Security Council to territories authorize use of force 69 neutral 248 prohibition on intervention in 44 belligerent nexus not present in cyber operations as violations of activities on 254 17, 44-5



prohibition on threat or use of force	violations
in 43–4	of international law
on regional systems of collective	interference with sovereign
security 72	immunity 24
on self-defence rights 54	involvement of States with non-
on UN Security Council compliance	State actors as 33–4
obligations 256	and State responsibility for cyber
UN Emblem, prohibition on improper	operations 29–34
use of 187–8	of law of neutrality, remedies
UN personnel, installations, materiel,	available 254-5
units and vehicles, protection	of non-intervention principle, cyber
in armed conflict of 188,	operations as 17, 44–5
210-13	of State sovereignty
UN Safety Convention 211	by cyber operations 16
UN Security Council	by non-State actors 18
authorizations for use of force by	violence 106-7
69–71	protracted 88
compliance with resolutions of, and	thresholds of
law of neutrality 255-6	for existence of armed conflict
mandating/authorizing regional	82-3
organizations to exercise self-	for existence of non-international
defence rights 71-2	88
on protection of diplomatic premises	virtual armed groups 89-90
233	qualifying as organized armed group
self-defence actions reporting	98-9
requirement to 68	virtual confiscation/requisition 247
uncertainty, about collateral damage	
163	wanton destruction 232
United Kingdom, cyber warfare	war correspondents 221
included in national security	war crimes
strategy of 2	criminal responsibility of
United States	commanders and superiors
Cyber Command 10	for 91–4
cyber warfare policies of 2–3	cyber operations qualifying as 92
military manuals, Commander's	obligations to prosecute 91–2
Handbook 8–9, 130–1	war-sustaining activities, targetability of
unlawful acts/activities 27, 254–5	130–1
unprivileged belligerency 98, 101	warfare
by mercenaries 103–4	air and missile, manuals on 7, 9
see also combatant immunity	see also cyber warfare
urgent countermeasures 37	warnings, duty of issuing of 173-6,
use criterion for military objectives	209–10, 230
128–9	warships, carrying neutral or enemy flags 191
verification of targets duty 167-8	weapons
Vienna Convention on Diplomatic	cyber 100, 141–2
Relations, on protection of	transmission across neutral
diplomatic archives 233	territory of 252



INDEX

282

weapons (cont.)
uncontrollable chains of events
created by 145–6
obligations of review of 153–6
Webster, Daniel 63–4
worship, protection of places of 205
wrongful acts
attribution to States of 29–31
and governmental authority 31
and non-State actor cyber
operations 32–3, 35

and organs of State concept 31 retroactive 34 and causation of damage 30 countermeasures permissible for States injured by 36–41 cyber operations qualifying as 29–30

zones, operational 199–200 cyber operations in support of 202