The product of a three-year project by twenty renowned international law scholars and practitioners, the Tallinn Manual identifies the international law applicable to cyber warfare and sets out ninety-five ‘black-letter rules’ governing such conflicts. It addresses topics including sovereignty, State responsibility, the *jus ad bellum*, international humanitarian law, and the law of neutrality. An extensive commentary accompanies each rule, which sets forth each rule’s basis in treaty and customary law, explains how the Group of Experts interpreted applicable norms in the cyber context, and outlines any disagreements within the group as to each rule’s application.

The Director of the Project, Professor Michael N. Schmitt, is Chairman of the International Law Department at the United States Naval War College.
TALLINN MANUAL ON THE INTERNATIONAL LAW APPLICABLE TO CYBER WARFARE

Prepared by the International Group of Experts at the Invitation of the NATO Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence

General editor
MICHAEL N. SCHMITT
# CONTENTS

The International Group of Experts and Participants  x
Short form citations xiv

Introduction 1

**PART I  International cyber security law**

1 States and cyberspace  15

Section 1: Sovereignty, jurisdiction, and control  15
   Rule 1 – Sovereignty  15
   Rule 2 – Jurisdiction  18
   Rule 3 – Jurisdiction of flag States and States of registration  21
   Rule 4 – Sovereign immunity and inviolability  23
   Rule 5 – Control of cyber infrastructure  26

Section 2: State responsibility  29
   Rule 6 – Legal responsibility of States  29
   Rule 7 – Cyber operations launched from governmental cyber infrastructure  34
   Rule 8 – Cyber operations routed through a State  36
   Rule 9 – Countermeasures  36

2 The use of force  42

Section 1: Prohibition of the use of force  42
   Rule 10 – Prohibition of threat or use of force  42
   Rule 11 – Definition of use of force  45
   Rule 12 – Definition of threat of force  52

Section 2: Self-defence  54
   Rule 13 – Self-defence against armed attack  54
   Rule 14 – Necessity and proportionality  61
   Rule 15 – Imminence and immediacy  63
vi

CONTENTS

Rule 16 – Collective self-defence 67
Rule 17 – Reporting measures of self-defence 68

Section 3: Actions of international governmental organizations 69
Rule 18 – United Nations Security Council 69
Rule 19 – Regional organizations 71

PART II The law of cyber armed conflict

3 The law of armed conflict generally 75
Rule 20 – Applicability of the law of armed conflict 75
Rule 21 – Geographical limitations 78
Rule 22 – Characterization as international armed conflict 79
Rule 23 – Characterization as non-international armed conflict 84
Rule 24 – Criminal responsibility of commanders and superiors 91

4 Conduct of hostilities 95

Section 1: Participation in armed conflict 95
Rule 25 – Participation generally 95
Rule 26 – Members of the armed forces 96
Rule 27 – Levée en masse 102
Rule 28 – Mercenaries 103
Rule 29 – Civilians 104

Section 2: Attacks generally 105
Rule 30 – Definition of cyber attack 106
Rule 31 – Distinction 110

Section 3: Attacks against persons 113
Rule 32 – Prohibition on attacking civilians 113
Rule 33 – Doubt as to status of persons 114
Rule 34 – Persons as lawful objects of attack 115
Rule 35 – Civilian direct participants in hostilities 118
Rule 36 – Terror attacks 122

Section 4: Attacks against objects 124
Rule 37 – Prohibition on attacking civilian objects 124
Rule 38 – Civilian objects and military objectives 125
Rule 39 – Objects used for civilian and military purposes 134
Rule 40 – Doubt as to status of objects 137
Section 5: Means and methods of warfare 140

Rule 41 – Definitions of means and methods of warfare 141
Rule 42 – Superfluous injury or unnecessary suffering 143
Rule 43 – Indiscriminate means or methods 144
Rule 44 – Cyber booby traps 146
Rule 45 – Starvation 148
Rule 46 – Belligerent reprisals 149
Rule 47 – Reprisals under Additional Protocol I 152
Rule 48 – Weapons review 153

Section 6: Conduct of attacks 156

Rule 49 – Indiscriminate attacks 156
Rule 50 – Clearly separated and distinct military objectives 158
Rule 51 – Proportionality 159

Section 7: Precautions 164

Rule 52 – Constant care 165
Rule 53 – Verification of targets 167
Rule 54 – Choice of means or methods 168
Rule 55 – Precautions as to proportionality 170
Rule 56 – Choice of targets 170
Rule 57 – Cancellation or suspension of attack 172
Rule 58 – Warnings 173
Rule 59 – Precautions against the effects of cyber attacks 176

Section 8: Perfidy, improper use, and espionage 180

Rule 60 – Perfidy 180
Rule 61 – Ruses 184
Rule 62 – Improper use of the protective indicators 185
Rule 63 – Improper use of United Nations emblem 187
Rule 64 – Improper use of enemy indicators 188
Rule 65 – Improper use of neutral indicators 191
Rule 66 – Cyber espionage 192

Section 9: Blockade and zones 195

Rule 67 – Maintenance and enforcement of blockade 200
Rule 68 – Effect of blockade on neutral activities 200
Rule 69 – Zones 202
5 Certain persons, objects, and activities 203

Section 1: Medical and religious personnel and medical units, transports, and material 204

Rule 70 – Medical and religious personnel, medical units and transports 204

Rule 71 – Medical computers, computer networks, and data 206

Rule 72 – Identification 206

Rule 73 – Loss of protection and warnings 208

Section 2: United Nations personnel, installations, materiel, units, and vehicles 210

Rule 74 – United Nations personnel, installations, materiel, units, and vehicles 210

Section 3: Detained persons 213

Rule 75 – Protection of detained persons 214

Rule 76 – Correspondence of detained persons 216

Rule 77 – Compelled participation in military activities 217

Section 4: Children 218

Rule 78 – Protection of children 218

Section 5: Journalists 220

Rule 79 – Protection of journalists 220

Section 6: Installations containing dangerous forces 223

Rule 80 – Duty of care during attacks on dams, dykes, and nuclear electrical generating stations 223

Section 7: Objects indispensable to the survival of the civilian population 225

Rule 81 – Protections of objects indispensable to survival 225

Section 8: Cultural property 228

Rule 82 – Respect and protection of cultural property 228

Section 9: The natural environment 231

Rule 83 – Protection of the natural environment 231

Section 10: Diplomatic archives and communications 233

Rule 84 – Protection of diplomatic archives and communications 233

Section 11: Collective punishment 234

Rule 85 – Collective punishment 234
Section 12: Humanitarian assistance 236

Rule 86 – Humanitarian assistance 236

6 Occupation 239

Rule 87 – Respect for protected persons in occupied territory 240
Rule 88 – Public order and safety in occupied territory 242
Rule 89 – Security of the Occupying Power 244
Rule 90 – Confiscation and requisition of property 245

7 Neutrality 248

Rule 91 – Protection of neutral cyber infrastructure 250
Rule 92 – Cyber operations in neutral territory 251
Rule 93 – Neutral obligations 252
Rule 94 – Response by parties to the conflict to violations 254
Rule 95 – Neutrality and Security Council actions 255

Glossary 257

Index 263
THE INTERNATIONAL GROUP OF EXPERTS
AND PARTICIPANTS

International Group of Experts

Director

Professor Michael Schmitt
United States Naval War College

Editorial Committee

Air Commodore (Retired) William H. Boothby
Formerly Deputy Director of Legal Services, Royal Air Force (United Kingdom)

Bruno Demeyere
Catholic University of Leuven

Professor Wolff Heintschel von Heinegg
Europa-Universität Viadrina

Professor James Bret Michael
United States Naval Postgraduate School

Professor Thomas Wingfield
George C. Marshall European Center for Security Studies

Legal Group Facilitators

Professor Eric Talbot Jensen
Brigham Young University Law School

Professor Sean Watts
Creighton University Law School

1 Affiliations during participation in the project.
THE INTERNATIONAL GROUP OF EXPERTS AND PARTICIPANTS

Legal Experts

Dr Louise Arimatsu
Chatham House

Captain (Navy) Geneviève Bernatchez
Office of the Judge Advocate General, Canadian Forces

Colonel Penny Cumming
Australian Defence Force

Professor Robin Geiß
University of Potsdam

Professor Terry D. Gill
University of Amsterdam, Netherlands Defence Academy, and Utrecht University

Professor Derek Jinks
University of Texas School of Law

Professor Jann Kleffner
Swedish National Defence College

Dr Nils Melzer
Geneva Centre for Security Policy

Brigadier General (Retired, Canadian Forces) Kenneth Watkin
United States Naval War College

Technical Experts

Dr Kenneth Geers
NATO Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence

Dr Rain Ottis
NATO Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence

Observers

Colonel Gary D. Brown, US Air Force
United States Cyber Command

Dr Cordula Droegge
International Committee of the Red Cross

Dr Jean-François Quéguiner
International Committee of the Red Cross
Xii  THE INTERNATIONAL GROUP OF EXPERTS AND PARTICIPANTS

Ulf Häußler
Headquarters, Supreme Allied Commander Transformation, NATO

Peer Reviewers

Professor Geoffrey Corn
South Texas College of Law

Professor Ashley Deeks
University of Virginia

Dr Heather A. Harrison Dinniss
Swedish National Defence College

Commander Clive Dow
Royal Navy (United Kingdom)

Professor Charles Garraway
Human Rights Centre, University of Essex

Group Captain Ian Henderson
Royal Australian Air Force

Dr Gleider Hernandez
Durham University

Professor Chris Jenks
Southern Methodist University School of Law

Dr Noam Lubell
University of Essex

Sasha Radin
University of Melbourne Law School

Commander Paul Walker
United States Navy

Colonel David Wallace, US Army
United States Military Academy

Dr Katharina Ziolkowski
NATO Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence

Project Coordinator

Dr Eneken Tikk
NATO Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence
THE INTERNATIONAL GROUP OF EXPERTS AND PARTICIPANTS xiii

Project Manager

Liis Vihul
NATO Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence

Rapporteurs

Jean Callaghan
George C. Marshall European Center for Security Studies
Dr James Sweeney
Durham University

Legal Research

Creighton University Law School

Jennifer Arbaugh
Nicole Bohe
Christopher Jackman
Christine Schaad

Emory University Law School

Anand Shah

Chatham House

Hemi Mistry
SHORT FORM CITATIONS

**Treaties**


**Additional Protocol II:** Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and Relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts, 8 June 1977, 1125 U.N.T.S. 609.


**Chicago Convention:** International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO), Convention on Civil Aviation, 7 December 1944, 15 U.N.T.S. 295.


SHORT FORM CITATIONS

**Geneva Convention I:** Convention (I) for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field, 12 August 1949, 75 U.N.T.S. 31.

**Geneva Convention II:** Convention (II) for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea, 12 August 1949, 75 U.N.T.S. 85.

**Geneva Convention III:** Convention (III) Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War, 12 August 1949, 75 U.N.T.S. 135.

**Geneva Convention IV:** Convention (IV) Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War, 12 August 1949, 75 U.N.T.S. 287.

**Hague Convention IV:** Convention (IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land, 18 October 1907, 36 Stat. 2277.

**Hague Convention V:** Convention (V) Respecting the Rights and Duties of Neutral Powers and Persons in Case of War on Land, 18 October 1907, 36 Stat. 2310.

**Hague Convention XIII:** Convention (XIII) Concerning the Rights and Duties of Neutral Powers in Naval War, 18 October 1907, 36 Stat. 2415.

**Hague Regulations:** Convention (IV) Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land and its annex: Regulations concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land, 18 October 1907, 36 Stat. 2277.


xvi

SHORT FORM CITATIONS

St Petersburg Declaration: Declaration Renouncing the Use, in Time of War, of Explosive Projectiles Under 400 Grammes Weight, 29 November/11 December 1868, 18 Martens Nouveau Recueil (ser. 1) 474.


Case law


SHORT FORM CITATIONS


Nuremberg Tribunal judgment: Judgment of the International Military Tribunal Sitting at Nuremberg, Germany (30 September 1946), in 22 The Trial of German Major War Criminals: Proceedings of the International Military Tribunal Sitting at Nuremberg, Germany (1950).


Other sources


xviii  SHORT FORM CITATIONS


