

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02392-5 - Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan

Dipali Mukhopadhyay

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## **WARLORDS, STRONGMAN GOVERNORS, AND THE STATE IN AFGHANISTAN**

Warlords have come to represent enemies of peace, security, and “good governance” in the collective intellectual imagination. In this book, Dipali Mukhopadhyay asserts that, in fact, not all warlords are created equal. Under certain conditions, some of these much maligned actors are both able and willing to become effective governors on behalf of the state. This provocative argument is based on extensive fieldwork in Afghanistan, where Mukhopadhyay examined warlord governors who have served as valuable exponents of the Karzai regime in its struggle to assert control over key segments of the countryside. She explores the complex ecosystems that came to constitute provincial political life after 2001 and goes on to expose the rise of “strongman” governance in two important Afghan provinces. Although this brand of governance falls far short of international expectations, its emergence reflects the reassertion of the Afghan state in material and symbolic terms that deserve our attention. This book pushes past canonical views of warlordism and state-building to consider the logic of the weak state as it has arisen in challenging, conflict-ridden societies such as Afghanistan.

**Dipali Mukhopadhyay** is an assistant professor in the School of International and Public Affairs at Columbia University and a member of the Arnold A. Saltzman Institute of War and Peace Studies. She has been conducting research in Afghanistan since 2007 and made her first trip to the country in 2004.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02392-5 - Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan

Dipali Mukhopadhyay

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-02392-5 - Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan  
Dipali Mukhopadhyay  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# ***Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan***

**Dipali Mukhopadhyay**

Columbia University



Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-02392-5 - Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan  
Dipali Mukhopadhyay  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107023925](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107023925)

© Dipali Mukhopadhyay 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Mukhopadhyay, Dipali.

Warlords, strongman governors, and the state in Afghanistan / Dipali Mukhopadhyay.  
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-107-02392-5 (hardback)

1. Governors – Afghanistan – Biography. 2. Warlordism – Afghanistan – History. 3. Afghanistan – Politics and government – 2001– 4. Political culture – Afghanistan. 5. Afghanistan – Biography. I. Title.

DS371.42M85 2014

320.9581–dc23

2013029440

ISBN 978-1-107-02392-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02392-5 - Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan

Dipali Mukhopadhyay

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*This book is dedicated to my husband, Kishore Kuchibhotla, and my  
late father, Nimai C. Mukhopadhyay.*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02392-5 - Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan

Dipali Mukhopadhyay

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page ix</i>
<b>1 Building a Theory of Strongman Governance in Afghanistan</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2 Atta Mohammad Noor, the Son of Balkh</b>	<b>76</b>
<b>3 Gul Agha Sherzai, the Neo-Khan of Nangarhar</b>	<b>166</b>
<b>4 Ismail Khan, the Emir of Herat, and Juma Khan Hamdard, the Wandering Wali</b>	<b>243</b>
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>316</b>
<i>Appendix: Map and Provincial Security Metrics</i>	<b>363</b>
<i>Index</i>	<b>371</b>

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02392-5 - Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan

Dipali Mukhopadhyay

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---



## Acknowledgments

I owe my largest debt of gratitude to all of the Afghans who took the time to teach me about their country since my first visit in 2004. Although most of those cited in this book will remain unnamed, each of them taught me something, many inspired me, and some have become lifelong friends. My time with these individuals was deeply humbling, but it also empowered me to examine the profound complexities of modern Afghan political life as a student, scholar, and teacher.

Conducting research in a conflict zone can be an overwhelming endeavor. If not for the intelligence, hard work, and good humor of my dear interpreters and fixers, I would have been lost in the cities of Mazar-i-Sharif and Jalalabad. Although I will not disclose their names, they made this book possible and give me great hope about Afghanistan's future. Similarly, a number of very dear friends in Kabul went out of their way to facilitate my research and made for wonderful company along the way. I have learned so much from them and can hardly wait to see what they do next. I am very grateful for the exceptional generosity of hosts such as Jonathan Greenham and Marguerite Roy. Numerous Afghans, including my drivers and guesthouse staffs, also extended their country's famous hospitality to me.

I began this project as a graduate student and wish to acknowledge the three remarkable members of my dissertation committee who guided me through my doctoral studies. Antonia Chayes has become a part of my extended family, always inspiring me to think harder, write more, teach

better, and live well. Marina Ottaway became an intellectual role model of mine many years ago and, in addition to advising me on my dissertation, gave me the chance to present this argument to a policy audience at the Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. Richard Shultz was my first teacher in graduate school, and his investment in my career from that moment on has made all of this possible. Several other professors at The Fletcher School mentored me; I am especially grateful to Peter Uvin, who inspired me to study state-building with rigor and creativity, and to Anna Seleny, who encouraged me to pursue a career in the academy.

Having earned my PhD, I sought an institutional home to do the hard work of transforming my dissertation into a book; I found an ideal setting at Princeton University's Liechtenstein Institute on Self-Determination. Wolfgang Danspeckgruber, whose enduring commitment to Afghanistan is well evidenced, offered me a place at the institute, and I am indebted to him and his team for making me feel very much a part of their Princeton family.

I finished this book as a newly minted assistant professor at Columbia University's School of International and Public Affairs and the Saltzman Institute of War and Peace Studies. I wish to thank in particular my inimitable colleagues, Richard Betts and Robert Jervis, for welcoming me generously into this community of extraordinary scholars. Ingrid Gerstmann's infectious spirit also made this transition an easy one. Finally, I am privileged these days to spend time with many terrific students; their eagerness to engage with the most challenging questions in the field of international security energized me as I completed this work.

Through this research, I had the privilege of gaining membership in a marvelous club of scholars and practitioners who have devoted so much of themselves to Afghanistan. Thomas Barfield and Barnett Rubin shared their love and rich knowledge of this extraordinary country with me and opened many doors along the way. My understanding of Balkh and Nangarhar provinces was vastly enhanced through countless conversations with Paul Fishstein and David Mansfield. Paul and David, along with Thomas Barfield, Frances Z. Brown, Gilles Dorronsoro, Antonio Giustozzi, Marvin

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02392-5 - Warlords, Strongman Governors, and the State in Afghanistan

Dipali Mukhopadhyay

Frontmatter

[More information](#)**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS****xi**

Weinbaum, and Martine van Bijlert, were especially generous in commenting on my writing over the years. I also learned much from Sarah Chayes, Lorenzo Deslesgues, Hamish Nixon, Adam Pain, Eckart Schiewek, Michael Semple, M. Nazif Shahrani, and Andrew Wilder.

I was fortunate to engage with a number of social scientists whose work served as inspiration for my own and who offered vital counsel on this project. Karen Barkey, Charles Call, Miguel Centeno, George Gavriliis, Gary Goertz, Anna Grzymala-Busse, and Susan Woodward read earlier incarnations of this work and shared their critical insights and advice with me. I also wish to thank Steve Biddle, Kristian Berg Harpviken, Kimberly Marten, William Reno, Jacob Shapiro, Charles Tilly, and Daniel Ziblatt for their valuable feedback on various theoretical, empirical, and methodological aspects of this project. The manuscript also benefited from the valuable feedback of its two assigned readers.

I had the privilege of working with three research assistants who brought enthusiasm, intelligence, and diligence to the task at hand and, for that, I am in their debt. I was lucky to find Mark Rafferty, whose work reflected an especially high level of skill for such a young researcher. Later on, I benefited immensely from the smart and fastidious work of Maggie Penman. Finally, I drew on the exceptional research and editorial facilities of Geoffrey Kirkwood, who made himself indispensable as I shepherded this project to a close.

I undertook this research and writing with the support of a number of generous funders. In particular, I wish to thank the U.S. Department of Education, the U.S. Institute of Peace, Harvard Law School's Program on Negotiation, the Smith Richardson Foundation, the American Institute for Afghan Studies, and the Afghanistan Analysts Network for their investment in this project. I was fortunate to present and receive valuable feedback on earlier versions of my research thanks to a number of kind hosts. In particular, I am grateful to Stina Torjesen at the Norwegian Institute of International Affairs (NUPI); Sverker Gustavsson, Anna Jarstad, and Louise Olsson at Uppsala University; Elisabeth Ozdalga and Sune Persson at the Swedish Research Institute in Istanbul and the

University of Gothenburg; Hendrik Spruyt at Northwestern University's Buffett Center for International and Comparative Studies; and Kimberly Marten at Columbia University's Harriman Institute. Of course, I alone am responsible for any and all errors that appear in this book.

Writing is marked by moments of glory and despair. I am thankful to have had wonderful compatriots in this pursuit, namely Xanthe Ackerman, Susanna Campbell, Kimberly Howe, and Christof Kurz. Frances Z. Brown, Mara Karlin, Meghan O'Brien, and Anne O'Donnell also went well beyond the call of duty as friends in their support of this book. I offer many thanks to John Berger, my editor, whose warmth, expertise, and efficiency have blessed this project and whose skilled team, including the fabulous Cherline Daniel, has improved this manuscript in any number of important ways.

Although most mothers would discourage their daughters from traveling to Afghanistan alone, mine, Suhasini Mukhopadhyay, demonstrated her pride in my pursuit without fail. My sister, Piali Mukhopadhyay, inspired me through her own fearless commitment to work in troubled parts of the world and offered me sharp counsel on both substance and process. My cousin, Avani Mehta Sood, shared her invaluable "big sister" wisdom and tradecraft with me and, with her husband Atul Sood, opened her home to me during my time in Princeton. My in-laws, Sucharita and Kishore Varanasi and Rama and Ravi Kuchibhotla, were four of my loudest cheerleaders at every turn as well. I also want to thank my nieces and nephews, Ishaan, Kabir, Navya, and Samara, for offering me delightful distraction on many occasions.

And, of course, my husband Kishore Kuchibhotla, to whom this book is dedicated. In Kishore, I have found the ultimate partner in life. His investment in this project and my career has been boundless and unparalleled. From start to finish, every aspect of this book has benefited from Kishore's brilliance and love. Whatever the state of my work, I found new ideas, good humor, and true companionship in him every day and, for that, I will never be able to thank him enough. I also dedicate this book to the memory of my late father, Professor Nimai Mukhopadhyay. His irrepressible zeal for intellectual exploration and discovery is an abiding inspiration in my scholarly life.