The Theory of Economic Policy in a Strategic Context

In developing a new and highly innovative theory of economic policy, this book deals with conflicts between strategic actions by public and private agents. It builds on the Lucas critique, but also applies the tools introduced by Tinbergen and Theil to dynamic policy games and from there derives a new theory of economic policy. Its main propositions describe such properties in the models currently used for policymaking as neutrality and equilibrium existence, uniqueness, and multiplicity. These properties are key to understanding the impact of concepts such as rational expectations, time inconsistency, communication and the use of policy announcements. As the numerous examples show, they are useful both for model building and for devising optimal institutions. *The Theory of Economic Policy in a Strategic Context* is an essential but accessible tool for economic researchers involved in policy questions.

NICOLA ACOCELLA is Professor of Economic Policy at the University of Rome "La Sapienza."

GIOVANNI DI BARTOLOMEO is Associate Professor of Economics at the University of Teramo, where he is also the Director of the postgraduate course in Management and Business Communication.

ANDREW HUGHES HALLETT is Professor of Economics and Public Policy at George Mason University, and Professor of Economics at the University of St. Andrews. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Edinburgh.

The Theory of Economic Policy in a Strategic Context

NICOLA ACOCELLA GIOVANNI DI BARTOLOMEO ANDREW HUGHES HALLETT



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107023864

© Nicola Acocella, Giovanni Di Bartolomeo and Andrew Hughes Hallett 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in Great Britain by the MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Acocella, Nicola, 1939–
The theory of economic policy in a strategic context / Nicola Acocella,
Giovanni Di Bartolomeo, Andrew Hughes Hallett.
pages ; cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-02386-4
1. Economic policy. 2. Rational expectations (Economic theory)
I. Di Bartolomeo, Giovanni, 1969– II. Hughes Hallett, Andrew. III. Title.
HD87.A286 2012
330.1–dc23
2012018814

ISBN 978-1-107-02386-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Flavia, Elena and Viola, for being smart, sweet, and joyful. N.A.

To Daniela (wherever she might be) and Raffaele with love, as always. G.D.B.

To David, Jim and Nicky, who prefer controllability to stabilizability, but understand both. A.H.H.

Contents

List	t of figures	<i>page</i> ix
List	t of tables	х
Prej	face	xi
Сог	nmon symbols	xiv
1	An overview: the realm of economic policy	1
	Part I The classical theory of economic policy	15
2	Statics	17
3	Dynamics	45
	Part II From the classical to the new theory of economic policy	81
4	The Lucas critique	83
5	Policy games: an introduction	95
	Part III The new theory of economic policy: statics	123
6	A theory of strategic conflict: foundations	125
7	From individual players to system controllability	152
8	Conflicts and coordination among groups	170
9	Announcements as a coordination mechanism	197
	Part IV The new theory of economic policy: dynamics	225
10	Controllability in a strategic dynamic setting	227

vii

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02386-4 - The Theory of Economic Policy in a Strategic Context
Nicola Acocella, Giovanni Di Bartolomeo and Andrew Hughes Hallett
Frontmatter
More information

viii		Contents
11	Dynamic policy games with rational expectations	250
12	Credibility, dynamic controllability and rational expectations	272
13	Expectations and target coordination: institutional aspects	307
14	A summary and round-up of the conclusions	322
References		326
Index		344
Author index		348

Figures

2.1	Fixed target approach	page 27
2.2	Iso-loss curves	28
2.3	Flexible target approach	29
2.4	Losses and optimization	30
3.1	A time line for dynamic policy problems	52
3.2	Relations among state controllability (C), null	
	controllability (NC) and stabilizability (S)	65
3.3	A schematic view of the sequence of an optimal	
	policy plan	78
5.1	Best response function	103
5.2	Quasi-reaction function	105
5.3	Stackelberg equilibrium	110
5.4	Nash equilibrium	111
6.1	A monetary and fiscal policy game	139
9.1	Announcement equilibrium vs. commitment	209
9.2	Multiple Nash equilibria	211
9.3	Announcement equilibria	213
9.4	Market shares and Δt	223

Tables

3.1 Summary of policy models	page 57
6.1 Properties of the model	147
9.1 Monetary and fiscal announcements	214
11.1 A complete taxonomy	266

Preface

Economics lost an important part of its foundations, and some would say of its *raison d'être*, when the theory of economic policy devised by Jan Tinbergen, Henry Theil, Ragnar Frisch and others was destroyed under the logical stringency of the Lucas critique. The idea of the government as influencing or even controlling a private sector with conflicting targets, but not fully informed and possibly inactive, was certainly short-sighted and correctly dismissed after Lucas' criticisms. However, the Lucas critique contributed to a widespread but often incorrect belief of policy irrelevance, time inconsistency in policy actions and the need to substitute government by markets.

This book recognizes Lucas' point of view and the idea that different agents – in particular, the government and private agents – can have fully or partially divergent goals and actively intervene in order to try to pursue them. But it distinguishes that idea from its implications, derived in specific context, by attempting to build, on the ashes of the Tinbergen–Theil contributions, a general approach to the theory of economic policy consistent with the Lucas critique and rational expectations. In our view, the proper general context where such active conflicts can be analyzed is to be seen in policy games. Then, by using a revised version of the tools introduced by Tinbergen, Theil and others in this context, we derive a new and more relevant theory of economic policy.

The main propositions of this new theory describe such properties of the models usually used for policymaking as neutrality or equilibrium existence, uniqueness, and multiplicity. These properties are also the key to understanding the impact of many concepts – such as rational expectations, time inconsistency, communication effectiveness, and policy announcements – currently used in macroeconomic theory and many other applications. These concepts are therefore useful both for model building and for devising proper institutions, and we hope that they will re-establish the theory of economic policy as xii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02386-4 - The Theory of Economic Policy in a Strategic Context Nicola Acocella, Giovanni Di Bartolomeo and Andrew Hughes Hallett Frontmatter More information

Preface

part of mainstream economic thinking or make it an essential tool for any economic social science researcher interested in evaluating different policy issues. Finally, they may also contribute to putting public action into a more balanced and nuanced perspective: not blindly powerful as in the fifties and sixties, but also not powerless as it was presented to be in the following decades.

Whilst innovative, and the first comprehensive restatement of the theory of economic policy for several decades, our book should be accessible to every graduate or advanced undergraduate student of economic and social sciences familiar with the essentials of game theory, linear algebra and calculus; and should become a "vade mecum" for researchers in academia, think tanks or research institutes who lack an overview of the flaws and alternative approaches to the policy problems they are familiar with.

The book is based on the techniques and outlook of a number of papers published by the three of us over the past eight years. Those papers in turn build on earlier work by one of the authors, Andrew Hughes Hallett, who some time earlier had contributed to the theory of economic policy along the lines of Tinbergen and Theil.

This book would not have appeared without the support of a number of institutions and people. Nicola Acocella and Giovanni Di Bartolomeo acknowledge funding from Sapienza University of Rome and MIUR when the new theory was only in their minds. The Department of Geo-economics and that of Methods and Models for Economics, Territory and Finance (Memotef) at Sapienza have also provided them with a friendly and encouraging environment. Nicola Acocella is deeply indebted to Federico Caffè, who started his interest in the theory of economic policy some fifty years ago, suggesting that policymaking should be considered as the result of the interaction of "big government" with "big business" and "big labor" before the Lucas critique was stated and game theory applied to policy problems (Caffé, 1966: 14). Nicola Acocella has taught parts of the book to his students in the Doctoral School Program of Sapienza University and would like to thank them for all their suggestions, doubts and questions on some initial versions of the theory. Elisa Guglielminetti spotted some remaining typos in the last version of the manuscript. Giovanni Di Bartolomeo also acknowledges the University of Teramo and the Marie Curie Fellowship Program for funding, the University of Crete (Department of Economics), and the CORE at the Université

Preface

Catholique de Louvain for hospitality during his work on the very last part of the book.

We should also express our thanks to many colleagues for their comments and feedback, after many discussions on the issues investigated in the book during the last ten years, when we were developing the first concepts of our approach to the theory of economic policy. These were invaluable in giving us a better understanding of the subject matter. We are particularly grateful to Bas van Aarle, Guido Candela, Maria Chiarolla, Jacob Engwerda, Peter Flaschel, Douglas Hibbs, George Kouretas, Reinhard Neck, Stefano Papa, Wilfried Pauwels, Joseph Plasmans, Emanuela Randon, Patrizio Tirelli. We are also grateful to the anonymous referees of Cambridge University Press for their appreciation of our manuscript and their valuable remarks.

All the authors especially thank Paolo G. Piacquadio, a former student of the Sapienza Doctoral School, for his cooperation in a number of papers and his revision of the whole manuscript. His coauthorship in Chapters 8 and 9 is formally recognized, but his contribution of ideas as well as formal solutions to a number of issues goes well beyond that.

Veronica Fedeli has provided invaluable help in editing the many papers on which this book is based, as well as editing the many versions of the manuscript. Chris Harrison, of Cambridge University Press, provided us with valuable suggestions and has followed the various steps of the publication with care and efficiency. Thanks also to Elizabeth Spicer for her efficiency and patience.

Finally, we would like to thank our respective families without whom, it might be thought, the book would have been completed in half the time. In fact, the blame for that is entirely ours (although not perhaps in equal measure); as is the responsibility for any errors, omissions or views that the reader might not agree with.

Common symbols

Matrix rankr[.]Matrix determinantdet(.)Partial derivative of y with respect to x $\partial y/\partial x$ Expectation operator $E[.]$ Lag operatorLSpectrum $\sigma[.]$ The i-th element of vector y $y(i)$ The i-th element of matrix B $B(i,j)$ Identity matrixIVector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^s = \{x_i\}_1^s \in \Omega_x$ Endogenous (target) variables y Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of linear targets I Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H Economic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S Information set Ω	Real number set	R
Partial derivative of y with respect to x $\partial y/\partial x$ Expectation operator $E[.]$ Lag operatorLSpectrum $\sigma[.]$ The <i>i</i> -th element of vector y $y(i)$ The <i>i</i> -th element of matrix B $B(i,j)$ Identity matrixIVector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^s = \{x_i\}_1^s \in \Omega_x$ Endogenous (target) variables y (Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets q Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices $A, B, C, D, E, F,$ G, H G, H Economic system parameter vectors u, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	Matrix rank	r[.]
Expectation operator $E[.]$ Lag operatorLSpectrum $\sigma[.]$ The <i>i</i> -th element of vector y $y(i)$ The <i>i</i> -th element of matrix B $B(i,j)$ Identity matrixIVector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^S = \{x_i\}_1^S \in \Omega_X$ Endogenous (target) variables y (Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets q Number of linear targets l Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices $A, B, C, D, E, F,$ G, H G, H Economic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	Matrix determinant	det(.)
Lag operatorLSpectrum $\sigma[.]$ The <i>i</i> -th element of vector y $y(i)$ The <i>i</i> -th , <i>j</i> -th element of matrix B $B(i,j)$ Identity matrixIVector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^S = \{x_i\}_1^S \in \Omega_X$ Endogenous (target) variables y (Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets d Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices $A, B, C, D, E, F,$ G, HEconomic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	Partial derivative of y with respect to x	ду/дх
Spectrum $\sigma[.]$ Spectrum $\sigma[.]$ The <i>i</i> -th element of vector y $y(i)$ The <i>i</i> -th , <i>j</i> -th element of matrix B $B(i,j)$ Identity matrix I Vector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^S = \{x_i\}_1^S \in \Omega_X$ Endogenous (target) variables y (Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets l Number of linear targets l Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices $A, B, C, D, E, F,$ G, HEconomic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	Expectation operator	E[.]
The <i>i</i> -th element of vector y $y(i)$ The <i>i</i> -th, <i>j</i> -th element of matrix B $B(i,j)$ Identity matrixIVector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^S = \{x_i\}_1^S \in \Omega_X$ Endogenous (target) variables y (Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets q Number of linear targets l Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H Economic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	Lag operator	L
The <i>i</i> -th, <i>j</i> -th element of matrix B $B(i,j)$ Identity matrixIVector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^S = \{x_i\}_1^S \in \Omega_X$ Endogenous (target) variables y (Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets q Number of linear targets l Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H Economic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	Spectrum	σ[.]
Identity matrixIVector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^S = \{x_i\}_1^S \in \Omega_X$ Endogenous (target) variables y (Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets q Number of linear targets l Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H Economic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	The <i>i</i> -th element of vector <i>y</i>	y(i)
Vector y at time t y_t Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^S = \{x_i\}_1^S \in \Omega_X$ Endogenous (target) variables y Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets q Number of linear targets l Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H Economic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T	The <i>i</i> -th, <i>j</i> -th element of matrix <i>B</i>	B(i,j)
Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s $X^s = \{x_i\}_1^s \in \Omega_X$ Endogenous (target) variablesyExogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instrumentsuState variableszNumber of quadratic targetsqNumber of linear targetslNumber of instrumentsmPolicymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matrices $A, B, C, D, E, F,$ G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target intervalTPolicy leadS	Identity matrix	Ι
Endogenous (target) variablesyEndogenous (desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets q Number of linear targets l Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (target) variable lags p Irrelevant endogenous variable lags r Exogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices A, B, C, D, E, F, G, H Economic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	Vector y at time t	${\mathcal Y}_t$
(Exogenous) desired target values \overline{y} Exogenous (control) instruments u State variables z Number of quadratic targets q Number of linear targets l Number of instruments m Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors Q, r, l Endogenous (target) variable lags p Irrelevant endogenous variable lags r Exogenous (control) instrument lags g Economic system parameter matrices $A, B, C, D, E, F,$ G, H G, H Economic system parameter vectors w, d Policy multipliers Π Target interval T Policy lead S	Sequence of vectors x between time 1 and s	$X^{s} = \{x_{i}\}_{1}^{s} \in \Omega_{X}$
Exogenous (control) instrumentsиState variableszNumber of quadratic targetsqNumber of linear targetslNumber of instrumentsmPolicymaker's preference matrices and vectorsQ, r, lEndogenous (target) variable lagspIrrelevant endogenous variable lagsrExogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersΠTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Endogenous (target) variables	у
State variableszNumber of quadratic targetsqNumber of linear targetslNumber of instrumentsmPolicymaker's preference matrices and vectorsQ, r, lEndogenous (target) variable lagspIrrelevant endogenous variable lagsrExogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersΠTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	(Exogenous) desired target values	\overline{y}
Number of quadratic targetsqNumber of linear targetslNumber of instrumentsmPolicymaker's preference matrices and vectorsQ, r, lEndogenous (target) variable lagspIrrelevant endogenous variable lagsrExogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersΠTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Exogenous (control) instruments	и
Number of linear targetsINumber of instrumentsmPolicymaker's preference matrices and vectorsQ, r, lEndogenous (target) variable lagspIrrelevant endogenous variable lagsrExogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersПTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	State variables	z
Number of instrumentsmPolicymaker's preference matrices and vectorsQ, r, lEndogenous (target) variable lagspIrrelevant endogenous variable lagsrExogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersΠTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Number of quadratic targets	<i>q</i>
Policymaker's preference matrices and vectorsQ, r, lEndogenous (target) variable lagspIrrelevant endogenous variable lagsrExogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersПTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	5	l
Endogenous (target) variable lagspIrrelevant endogenous variable lagsrExogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersПTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Number of instruments	т
Irrelevant endogenous variable lagsrExogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersПTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Policymaker's preference matrices and vectors	Q, r, l
Exogenous (control) instrument lagsgEconomic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F,G, HG, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersПTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Endogenous (target) variable lags	Þ
Economic system parameter matricesA, B, C, D, E, F, G, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersПTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Irrelevant endogenous variable lags	r
G, HEconomic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersПTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Exogenous (control) instrument lags	g
Economic system parameter vectorsw, dPolicy multipliersПTarget intervalTPolicy leadS	Economic system parameter matrices	A, B, C, D, E, F,
Policy multipliersΠTarget intervalTPolicy leadS		G, H
Target intervalTPolicy leadS	Economic system parameter vectors	w, d
Policy lead S	Policy multipliers	П
,	Target interval	Т
Information set Ω	Policy lead	S
	Information set	Ω

xiv

© in this web service Cambridge University Press