Early Christian Monastic Literature and the Babylonian Talmud

This book examines literary analogies in Christian and Jewish sources, culminating in an in-depth analysis of striking parallels and connections between Christian monastic texts (the *Apophthegmata Patrum* or *The Sayings of the Desert Fathers*) and Babylonian Talmudic traditions. The importance of the monastic movement in the Persian Empire, during the time of the composition and redaction of the Babylonian Talmud, fostered a literary connection between the two religious populations. The shared literary elements in the literatures of these two elite religious communities shed new light on the surprisingly inclusive nature of the Talmudic corpora and on the nonpolemical nature of elite Jewish-Christian literary relations in late antique Persia.

Michal Bar-Asher Siegal is the Rosen Family Chair in Judaic Studies in the Goldstein-Goren Department of Jewish Thought at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev. She is a graduate of the Talmud Department at Hebrew University in Jerusalem (BA, MA) and the Department of Religious Studies at Yale University (PhD). She was a Harry Starr Fellow in Judaica at Harvard University, and she held a joint postdoctoral Jewish Culture in the Ancient World Fellowship at Haifa, Bar Ilan, and Tel Aviv Universities. Her articles have appeared in journals such as the *Journal of Jewish Studies, Aramaic Studies, Harvard Theological Review, Zion*, and *Shenaton leHeqer haMikra*. Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02301-7 - Early Christian Monastic Literature and the Babylonian Talmud Michal Bar-Asher Siegal Frontmatter More information Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02301-7 - Early Christian Monastic Literature and the Babylonian Talmud Michal Bar-Asher Siegal Frontmatter More information

Early Christian Monastic Literature and the Babylonian Talmud

MICHAL BAR-ASHER SIEGAL

Ben-Gurion University of the Negev



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107023017

© Michal Bar-Asher Siegal 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Siegal, Michal Bar-Asher, 1979–
Early Christian monastic literature and the Babylonian Talmud / Michal Bar-Asher Siegal. pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-02301-7 (hardback)
I. Monasticism and religious orders – History – Early church, ca. 30–600.
2. Apophthegmata Patrum. 3. Talmud. 4. Judaism – Relations – Christianity. 5. Christianity – Relations – Judaism. I. Title.
BR195.M658544 2013
271-dc23 2013009971

ISBN 978-1-107-02301-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Acknowledgments		<i>page</i> vii
Ι.	Christianity in the Babylonian Talmud: An Introductory	
	Discussion	I
2.	Monasticism in the Persian Empire	35
3.	The <i>Apophthegmata Patrum</i> and Rabbinic Literature: Form, Style, and Common Themes	64
4.	The Apophthegmata Patrum and Rabbinic Literature:	
	Narrative	IOI
5.	The Making of a Monk-Rabbi: The Stories of R. Shimon bar	
	Yoḥai in the Cave	133
6.	Repentant Whore, Repentant Rabbi: The Story of Eleazar	
	b. Dordya	170
	Conclusion	200
Bibliography		205
Subject Index		229
Index of Sources		233

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02301-7 - Early Christian Monastic Literature and the Babylonian Talmud Michal Bar-Asher Siegal Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

This book is a product of its time. Learning rabbinic literature side by side other late antique texts has been a growing and productive academic trend, and I was fortunate enough to enjoy the fruits of this *zeitgeist*. The understanding that a Talmudic page does not exist in a vacuum, and one needs to look outside that page to understand its conception, evolution, and reception, rightly stands at the heart of recent studies, this one included.

In the journey that led me to write this book, I owe a tremendous debt to two women in my life. The first is my grandmother, Suzanne Daniel Nattaf. A professor of Hellenistic Judaism, my first Greek teacher, and the support beam of my life, she introduced me to the love of books. When I entered into adulthood, she took me to her study, always stuffy with the smell of old books and cigarettes, and said to me: from this day on, you can read any book you desire. Don't let anyone tell you otherwise – this is the true meaning of adulthood, she added. Close to her passing, I was fortunate enough to meet another woman, from an entirely different generation, who taught me how to use these books to enrich my life further. My mentor and dissertation advisor, Chris Hayes, used her vast knowledge, wisdom, and great kindness to support and teach me so much more than I could ever have imagined standing there at the entrance to my grandmother's study.

My second advisor at Yale, Steven Fraade, was, and still is, a source of inspiration in scholarship and life. I am truly grateful for all he has done for me over the years.

The religious studies department at Yale, and the students and professors of its program in ancient Judaism, supplied a rare atmosphere of support and collegiality for which I am indebted. I want to thank especially Bentley Layton, Diana Swancutt, Dale Martin, Adela Yarbro Collins, and John Collins for their valuable advice and support during the writing process. viii

Acknowledgments

Outside of Yale, I am especially indebted to two scholars whose groundbreaking work stands in the background of this book. Richard Kalmin was always very generous to me with his time and offered priceless advice and resources for the improvement of this manuscript. Jeffery Rubenstein's remarkable scholarship and his willingness to encourage and comment on my work were incalculable to the writing of this book.

Others with whom I have discussed parts of this volume, and to whom I owe a debt of gratefulness, include Al Baumgarten, Adam Becker, Brouria Bitton-Ashkelony, Daniel Boyarin, Sebastian Brock, Shaye Cohen, Stephen Davis, John Gager, Yoni Garb, Sidney Griffith, Ricky Hidary, Menachem Kahana, Grigory Kessel, Yishay Kiel, Menachem Kister, Aryeh Kofsky, Hindy Najman, Hillel Newman, Maren Niehoff, Vered Noam, Tzvi Novick, Elchanan Reiner, Ishay Rosen-Zvi, Samuel Rubenson, Marc Saperstein, Joshua Schwartz, Shai Secunda, Bernard Septimus, Zvi Septimus, Nicholas Sims-Williams, David Stern, Moulie Vidas, Dov Weis, and Holger Zellentin.

Parts of this book were published in an earlier version as articles in *Harvard Theological Review* ("Shared Worlds: Rabbinic and Monastic Literature," *Harvard Theological Review* 105:4 (2012): 423–56) and *Zion* ("The Making of a Monk-Rabbi: The Background for the Creation of the Stories of R. Shimon bar Yohai in the Cave," *Zion* 76:3 (2011), 279–304 [Hebrew]), and I am thankful for their permission to use these materials in this book.

I want to thank the production team at Cambridge University Press, especially Lewis Bateman, senior editor of political science and history, and Shaun Vigil, his editorial assistant, for their efficient help. And I also thank the editing team at Newgen Knowledge Works – Bhavani Ganesh, copy editor Ami Naramor, and indexer Adam Parker.

A special thanks to my colleague and friend Sara Offenberg for her help with the cover art and to my new friends and colleagues at The Goldstein-Goren Department of Jewish Thought at Ben-Gurion University.

I want to thank my in-laws, Nechama and Moshe Bar-Asher, for their support, and my parents, Annette and Bruno Siegal, for their great love and encouragement.

And finally to my other half, my love, my constant advisor, Elitzur, and our boys, the joy of my life, Nattaf and Yadid, who I hope one day to bring into my study and introduce the riches it has to offer.