

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02233-1 - Charity Law and the Liberal State
Matthew Harding
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CHARITY LAW AND THE LIBERAL STATE

Charity Law and the Liberal State considers questions relating to state action and public discourse that are raised by the law of charity. Informed by liberal philosophical commitments and of interest to both charity lawyers and political philosophers, it addresses themes and topics such as: the justifiability of the state's non-neutral promotion of charitable purposes; the role of altruism in charity law; charity law, the tax system and the demands of distributive justice; the proper treatment of religious and political purposes in charity law; and the appropriate response of the liberal state to discrimination in the pursuit of charitable purposes.

MATTHEW HARDING is an associate professor in the Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02233-1 - Charity Law and the Liberal State
Matthew Harding
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02233-1 - Charity Law and the Liberal State
Matthew Harding
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CHARITY LAW AND THE LIBERAL STATE

MATTHEW HARDING



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-02233-1 - Charity Law and the Liberal State
 Matthew Harding
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107022331

© Matthew Harding 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Harding, Matthew, 1974- author.

Charity law and the liberal state / Matthew Harding.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-02233-1 (Hardback)

1. Charity laws and legislation. 2. Charitable uses, trusts, and foundations.

3. Charities. I. Title.

K797.H37 2014

344.03'17632-dc23 2014014734

ISBN 978-1-107-02233-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	viii
Introduction	1
1 Charity law in overview	6
1. Introduction	6
2. The criteria of charity law	7
a. General descriptions of charitable purpose	7
b. The public benefit test	13
i. The ‘public’ component	14
ii. The ‘benefit’ component	21
3. Disqualifying rules	30
4. The privileges of charity law	38
5. Conclusion	41
2 Towards a liberal theory of charity law	43
1. Introduction	43
2. Choosing a liberal perspective	44
3. Autonomy-based liberalism	50
4. Charity law and the ideal of autonomy	55
a. Charitable purposes and the conditions of autonomy	56
b. Charity law and the harm principle	62
5. Public discourse, autonomy and ‘benefit’ in charity law	66
6. Conclusion	74
3 The choice and the boundaries of charity law	76
1. Introduction	76
2. The choice of charity law	77
3. The boundaries of charity law	85
a. Rule of law considerations	86
b. Altruism, the ‘public’ component of the public benefit test and the ‘not for profit’ rule	88
i. Altruism	89

	ii.	The ‘public’ component of the public benefit test and the ‘not for profit’ rule	92
	4.	Charity law and altruism from a liberal perspective	102
	5.	Conclusion	108
4		Charity law and distributive justice	110
	1.	Introduction	110
	2.	Distributive justice and the recognition of charitable purposes	117
	3.	Distributive justice and the tax privileges of charity law	130
	4.	Conclusion	142
5		Religious purposes	144
	1.	Introduction	144
	2.	Religious purposes and the conditions of autonomy	145
		a. Are religious lives autonomous lives?	146
		b. Religious purposes and autonomy-promoting goods	151
		c. Conflicts between religion and autonomy	156
	3.	Religious purposes and public discourse in charity law	158
		a. Secularism	158
		b. Autonomy-promoting goods	163
		c. Conflicts between religion and autonomy	168
		d. Singling out ‘advancement of religion’	169
	4.	Conclusion	174
6		Political purposes	175
	1.	Introduction	175
	2.	The rule against political purposes	175
		a. The history and nature of the rule	175
		b. Traditional defences of the rule	180
	3.	Political purposes and public benefit: a liberal perspective	185
		a. Constitutional rights and the rule against political purposes	186
		b. Do political purposes generate public benefit?	188
		c. When are political purposes inconsistent with democracy and autonomy?	193
	4.	Political purposes and altruism	197
	5.	Conclusion	204
7		Charity and discrimination	205
	1.	Introduction	205
	2.	Varieties of discrimination in the pursuit of charitable purposes	206
		a. Discriminatory purposes and discriminatory activities	206
		b. Discriminatory purposes and discriminatory motivations	209

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02233-1 - Charity Law and the Liberal State
Matthew Harding
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CONTENTS vii

c.	The purpose of discrimination and purposes entailing discrimination	210
3.	Current approaches to charity and discrimination	212
a.	Public norms and public institutions	212
b.	Public norms and public purposes	213
c.	Public norms and private purposes	216
d.	Evaluating current approaches	221
4.	Charity, discrimination and autonomy	225
a.	Discrimination and the harm principle	226
b.	Discrimination, autonomy and state action	233
c.	Charity and discrimination: a principled approach	236
5.	Conclusion	240
<i>Index</i>		241

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02233-1 - Charity Law and the Liberal State
Matthew Harding
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Some of the research for this book was funded by an Australian Research Council grant awarded to me and my colleagues Ann O'Connell and Miranda Stewart for 2010–2; I am grateful to the ARC for that support. My thanks are due to those family, friends and colleagues who helped me by providing advice, support, encouragement and wisdom: Elise Bant, Nick Beach, Natalie Burgess, Joyce Chia, Kirsty Gover, Robin Hickey, Brian Lucas, Ann O'Connell, Finola O'Sullivan, Hubert Picarda, Pauline Ridge and Andrew Robertson. I am also grateful to participants in the Melbourne Law School Legal Theory Workshop, the 2012 Not-for-Profit Conference at the University of Melbourne, the 2012 NCVO Conference at the University of Birmingham, and a 2012 seminar at the University of Liverpool (kindly organised by Debra Morris), at which ideas from this book were presented and discussed. Farrah Ahmed, Katy Barnett, Michael Bryan, Mark Burton, Chris Dent, Carolyn Evans, Dan Halliday, Tony Lee, Myles McGregor-Lowndes, Julian Sempill, Miranda Stewart, Matthew Turnour and Lael Weis all read and provided me with comments on draft materials, and in some cases on the larger part of the manuscript. Their critical and insightful attention has improved the book immensely and where my argument still falls short of the mark it is most likely because I did not heed their advice. Anna Dziedzic undertook research assistance and editorial work with great care and skill: thank you, Anna. Mathew Reiman, Cindy Bors and Joshua Keyes-Liley helped me with research assistance at the eleventh hour: thanks to all three. Rob Atkinson deserves special mention as a characteristically gracious and thoughtful reader, and more generally as an example of what an academic should be. So does Ian Malkin for his unwavering support and his friendship, so dear to me. And, of course, my wife Clare and my children Isabel and Charlie, who remind me when I most need it that there is more to life than work.