

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

Note 1: Article numbers in square brackets refer to earlier versions of the legislation or treaty in question. In volume 149 (*Kadi* cases), references to the EC Treaty are to the post-Amsterdam Treaty consolidated version

Note 2: The variants 'Al-Qaeda' and 'Al-Qaida' (with differing capitalization and use of the hyphen) both occur in cases reported in the *International Law Reports*. Unless the reference is specifically to 'Al Qaeda' in an English-language legislative text, the version used in the index is 'Al-Qaida'.

Abbreviations used in the index

- AQO (Al-Qaida and Taliban (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (UK))
- ASI (Agreement on [SFRY] Succession Issues (2001))
- BVerfGG* (FRG Constitutional Court Law)
- CFI/CFIROP (Court of First Instance/Rules of Procedure)
- CFSP (Common Foreign and Security Policy)
- CJEC (Court of Justice of the European Communities)
- EC (European Community/European Communities/European Community Treaty (1957) including amendments)
- ECJ (European Court of Justice/ECJ Statute)
- ECPSD (European Convention for the Peaceful Settlement of Disputes (1957))
- ETC [or TEC] (Treaty Establishing the European Community) (1957)
- GFS (Final Settlement (Two plus Four Agreement) (1990))
- GG* (Basic Law (FRG))
- GSC (German Settlement Convention (1952/1954))
- HAY (Hani El Sayed Sabaei Youssef)
- Lisbon Treaty (2007) (Treaty of Lisbon amending the Treaty on European Union and the Treaty establishing the European Community)
- NBS (National Bank of Serbia)
- NBY (National Bank of Yugoslavia)
- SADC (South African Development Community)
- TC (Torture Convention (1984))
- TEU (Lisbon Treaty on the European Union (2007))
- TO (Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (UK))
- UNC (UN Charter (1945))

- access to courts, right of (ECHR 6(1)):** *see also* *Prince Hans-Adam II* (ECtHR)
 - acceptance of treaty provision as bar to exercise of jurisdiction and 72
 - jurisprudence, *Waite* 70-1
 - justified restrictions/interference, requirements, legitimate aim 70-1, 72-4
 - margin of appreciation 70-1
 - as one aspect of ECHR 6(1) rights 70
- act of State doctrine:** *see also* judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power including acts of State), jurisprudence

- act of State doctrine (acts of foreign State within its own territory: non-justiciability)**, State immunity from jurisdiction and, jurisprudence, *Unocal* 521
- act of State doctrine (acts of foreign State within its own territory: non-justiciability), territorial limitation**, acts outside territory/subject to jurisdiction of 500-1, 527
- act of State doctrine (acts of forum State)**
 act outside the jurisdiction involving own national
 aiding and abetting acts of officials of foreign State 480-528
 acts of foreign officials distinguished 521-2
 excess of powers challenge under Constitution distinguished 488-95, 525-6
- act of State doctrine, definition, theory and nature of the doctrine including procedural aspects** 495-501
 as choice of law rule under private international law 495-6, 499
 jurisdictional bar to prosecution and liability distinguished 482
 validity vs judicial restraint 497, 500-1
 waiver, possibility of, accession to human rights conventions as 493-5
- admissibility (ECtHR)**
 manifestly ill-founded applications (ECHR 35(3) [27(2)]) 51
 measures taken to implement UNSCR
 Behrami 324-5, 394-5, 690-2
 Berić 324-5
 Bosphorus 324-5, 394-5
 Gajić 324-5
 Kasumaj 324-5
- Afghanistan, Coalition operations in**, as state of war 542, 564-7
- Ahmed (validity of anti-terrorist freezing orders)** 650-758
 Court's findings/conclusion (voidness and suspension of orders) 687-8
 factual background 663-7
 effect of TO/AQO 651-2, 666-7
 listing of appellants under TO and AQO 650-1
 notification to applicants 664
 judgments
 Brown 717-24
 Hope 650-88
 Mance 724-48
 Phillips 688-709
 Rodger 709-17
 legislative background
 Security Council resolutions, 656-60: *see also* sanctions (Al-Qaida/Taliban), Security Council resolutions relating to
 UK terrorism orders 659-62
 AQO (summary of provisions) 662-3
 procedure for making Orders (UN Act 1946, s 1) 652
 TO (summary of provisions) 660-2
 Terrorism Order (2009) 662
 UN Act 1946, 654-6, 726-30: *see also* United Kingdom, Security Council measures, application/compliance obligation (UN Act 1946 s 1)
 UN Charter provisions 653-4
 procedural history

- A, K, M and G (Administrative Court proceedings) 664-5
 HAY: *see also* *Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases)
 judicial review 665-6, 725-6, 739-40
 request for information relating to Sanction Committee's decision to include
 on consolidated list 665
ultra vires nature of orders based on
 breach of right to judicial review of UN resolution (ECHR 6) 684-7, 705-9, 740
 breach of right to property (ECHR Protocol 1) 683-4
 Human Rights Act 3(1) (interpretation of legislation 'in a way compatible with
 the Convention rights') 689-95
 Human Rights Act 6(1) (obligation of public authority to act in conformity with
 ECHR) 689
 legal certainty/foreseeability test (ECHR 7) 736-8
 legality principle/fundamental rights 669, 683-4, 705-9, 741-2
 legality principle/separation of powers 669, 683-4, 696-700, 705-9, 713-14,
 718, 735-6
 primacy of UNC obligations (UNC 103) 689-95
 UN Act 1946 660, 667-78, 695-708, 717-24
 Order going beyond requirements of UNSCR 1371 (2001) (TO) ('reasonable
 grounds' test) 674-7, 701-5, 719, 730-6
 right to effective remedy/judicial review 705-9
Al Barakaat: *see* *Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases)
- Australia**
 act of State doctrine (acts of foreign State within its own territory:
 non-justiciability), territorial limitation, acts outside territory/subject to
 jurisdiction of 500-1, 527
 act of State doctrine (acts of forum State)
 aiding and abetting acts of officials of foreign State 480-528
 acts of foreign officials distinguished 521-2
 excess of powers challenge under Constitution distinguished 488-95, 525-6
 act of State doctrine, definition, theory and nature of the doctrine including
 procedural aspects 495-501
 as choice of law rule under private international law 495-6, 499
 as part of common law 481-3, 507-23
 as procedural bar to prosecution and liability distinguished 482
 validity vs judicial restraint 497, 500-1
 waiver, possibility of, accession to human rights conventions as 493-5
 Constitution by section
 61 (executive power), act of State and 488-95, 525-6
 75(iii) (Commonwealth as party) 490-1, 524-5
 75(v) (mandamus, prohibition or injunction) 490-1, 524-5
 Criminal Code (pre-2012), s 11.2 (complicity and common purpose) 480-1, 486-8
 judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power), excess of
 powers under Constitution s 61 488-95, 525-6
 judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power including acts
 of State), considerations of possible relevance
 international law, status of rule under consideration (*Sabbatinol Kuwait*
 Airways) 519
 developments in international law and 519
 jus cogens and 522

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

762

INDEX

Australia (*cont.*)

- public policy of forum State 519
- Sabbatino* factors 515-16, 521-2, 523

- law of

- Federal Court Act 1976, s 25(6) (reserved questions) 481
- Geneva Conventions Act 1957 s 7(1) 480-1, 486, 488, 493-5, 506, 524
- Judiciary Act 1903 by section
 - 39B 502
 - 44(3) 502

- legislation, interpretation, guidelines, consistency with common law 481-3

- non-justiciability (act of State/political question doctrine), exceptions, torture 482, 517, 522

- non-justiciability (act of State/political question doctrine), reasons for/justification

- absence of judicially discoverable and manageable standards 523
 - foreign relations considerations, avoidance of embarrassment to executive 523
 - judicial restraint 499

- separation of powers doctrine 523

- territorial jurisdiction (criminal and tort) (including cross-border offences), jurisdictional bar to prosecution and liability distinguished 482

- torture

- criminal jurisdiction (including TC obligations), Crimes (Torture) Act 1988 and 480-1, 482, 486, 520-1

- definition/classification as, action 'by a public official or other person acting in an official capacity' (TC 1)/Crimes (Torture) Act 480-1, 482

- as *jus cogens*/peremptory norm 482

AY Bank (State succession issues: justiciability) 616-40

- applications 627-8

- Court's determination/order 639

- Court's findings

- judicial review/justiciability of treaties
 - consent to jurisdiction by treaty parties, relevance 635-6
 - treaties between third States and not part of forum State law 629
 - non-justiciability (act of State/political question doctrine)
 - private law rights as exception 636-9
 - review of 628-30

- factual background: *see also* Yugoslavia, Socialist Federal Republic (SFRY), succession issues, ASI (2001)

- ASI (2001) (summary of provisions/extracts) 618-21

- Bank's status/accounts with 616-17
 - transactions on NBY accounts 621-4

- parties' arguments

- Croatia 631-2
 - Serbia and Montenegro 630-1

- parties' claims/proofs of debt 624-7

- Bosnia and Herzegovina 625, 633-4
 - Croatia 626, 633-4
 - FRY (now Serbia and Montenegro)/NBS 624
 - Macedonia 625
 - Slovenia 626
 - unsecured creditors 627

Campbell (SADC Tribunal)

dissenting opinions

Pillay (on costs) 475-6

Tshosa (on Amendment 17 discrimination) 476-7

Certain German Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany) (ICJ): see also German

Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Chapter 6 (reparations);

Pieter van Laer Painting; *Prince Hans-Adam II* (ECtHR)

admissibility/challenge to the jurisdiction 94, 99-111

disputes within the domestic jurisdiction of States (ECPSD 27(b)) 120, 146-7

European Convention for the Peaceful Settlement of Disputes (ECPSD) as basis
99-100

exhaustion of established processes (ICJ ROC 79) 122-3, 150-1

existence of legal dispute 101-3

Court's analysis and conclusions 102-3, 107-11

critical date (ECPSD 27(a)) 104-11, 115-20, 123-9, 134-6, 139-46,
155-65Final Settlement (Two plus Four Agreement) as *novus actus interveniens*
127-8, 162-3German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC)/Beneš Decrees as source
of dispute 109-11, 119, 124-7, 137-9position taken by Germany during consultations/negotiations as evidence of
103, 113, 152, 154-5

real cause test 108, 109-11, 119, 124-7, 130-3, 139-46, 160-1

intervention of third State (Czechoslovakia) (ICJ 62) 121-2, 148-50

'subject of the dispute'

applicability of GSC to neutral/non-German States 113-20, 121-2, 125-8,
137-9, 143-5, 157-9application of GSC VI.3 as alleged breach of Germany's international
responsibility towards Liechtenstein 102-3, 113-15, 133

determination by Court 132-3

jurisdiction of German courts under GSC VI.3, 110, 115-20: *see also* German
Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Chapter 6 (reparations),
jurisdiction of German courts (GSC VI.3)

obligation to indicate in application (ICJ 40(1)/ROC 38(2)) 100, 147-8

Court's decision/*dispositif* 111-12

alternative ways to resolve/acknowledge dispute, need for 129, 164-5

Court's judgment 93-112

dissenting opinions/declarations

Berman 152-66

Elaraby 123-9

Fleischhauer 152

Kooijmans 112-23

Owada 129-51

factual background/procedural history 93-4

Application (Liechtenstein) 93, 95

appointment of judge ad hoc (ICJ 31(2) and (3)) 93, 94

Beneš Decrees 97

oral hearings/availability of pleadings to the public (ROC 53(2)) 94

Pieter van Laer Painting 99*Prince Hans-Adam II* 99

Certain German Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany) (ICJ) (cont.)

Parties' submissions/arguments

Germany 95-6, 97, 100, 101, 104, 105-6, 131-2

Liechtenstein 95, 96, 97, 101-2, 104-5, 106-7, 130-1, 132

CFSP

EC competence

EC 60(1) and EC 301 [EC 228a] as enabling clause/provision 212-14, 231, 276-8, 291, 314, 374-5, 376-7, 392

UNC 41 and EC 301 compared 374

EC 308 flexibility clause, whether basis for Community jurisdiction 275-6

civil rights and obligations (ECHR 6(1)), classification as, enemy property, determination of validity of expropriation 68**CJEU/ECJ/CJEC**

amendment of claim following replacement or amendment of contested decision 194-5, 464

appeals

referral back to CFI for final judgment/Court's right to give (ECJ 61) 327, 338-9, 397-8

right to overrule points of law 432, 434, 435

CFI procedure, addition of comments on observations, ECJ/CJEC, CFI procedure 192

ex proprio motu jurisdiction

jurisprudence 264-78

on matter of public policy 263-4

expedited procedure (CFIROP 76a) 190

judgment, delay in implementation (CJEU/ECJ Statute 60 derogation) 471-2 jurisdiction

concurrent jurisdiction with international courts 327-9

ECtHR jurisdiction distinguished 325-6, 394-5

legal aid 193, 462, 473

Rules of Procedure (CFI)

50 (joinder of cases) 193, 260

51 (referral to Chamber) 260

64(3)(a) (measures of organization: questions to parties) 193, 260

76a (expedited procedure) 190

99 (discontinuance of action) 193

113 (voidness of purpose) 192, 195, 260

115(1) (application to intervene: time limits) 192, 260

116(6) (application to intervene: outside ROP 115(1) time limits) 192, 260

Rules of Procedure (ECJ)

43 (joinder of cases) 366

87(2) (costs: unsuccessful party) 453, 472

87(4) (costs: intervening Member States and institutions) 453

87(6) (costs: case not proceeding to judgment) 472

compensation for breach of ECHR (just satisfaction obligation (ECHR 41 [50])), right to/measure, respect for the family (ECHR 8) and 613**competences (EC/EU prior to Lisbon Treaty)**

Member States, security policy 320-1

UN obligations and 230-2, 290-2

- compulsory jurisdiction (Optional Clause) (ICJ 36(2)), acceptance and implementation**, treaty or convention conferring: *see* European Convention for the Peaceful Settlement of Disputes (1957) (ECPSD)
- constitution (State)**, unenumerated rights, judicial restraint in respect of 611-12
- costs (CJEU/ECJ)** 249, 308, 404-5, 453, 472-3
 timing of application, relevance 473
- costs (SADC) (ROC 78)** 475-6
- derogation in time of public emergency (ICCPR 4)**, 'public emergency threatening the life of the nation' (ICCPR 4(1)) 248, 307-8
- diplomatic protection**, Sanctions Committee and 243-4
- domestic jurisdiction (UNC 2(7))**, compulsory jurisdiction (ICJ 36(2)) and, European Convention for the Peaceful Settlement of Disputes (ECPSD 27(b)) 120, 146-7
- Dubsky (overflights and landings (foreign military aircraft)) (Ireland)** 531-78
 Constitutional and legislative provisions (text)
 Air Navigation (Carriage of Munitions of War, Weapons and Dangerous Goods) (Amendment) Order 1989, text (extracts) 539
 Air Navigation (Carriage of Munitions of War, Weapons and Dangerous Goods) Order 1973 538-9
 Air Navigation (Foreign Military Aircraft) Order 1952 538
 Air Navigation and Transport Act 1946, s. 5 ('State aircraft') 536
 Air Navigation and Transport Act 1950 538
 blanket exemption 539-40
 Constitution
 Art. 15.2 535
 Art. 15.6 535
 Art. 28.3 536
 Art. 28.4.1° 536
 Art. 29 536
 Court's conclusions 562-78
 factual background 531-2
 UNSCR 1368/2001 540-1
 judicial review/justiciability
 grounds (excess of power/*ultra vires*) 572-6
 prompt hearing requirement 576-8
 Security Council resolutions 569
 war-related decisions 569-72
 overflight and landing rights as alleged participation in war being waged in
 Afghanistan (Constitution 28.1.3°)
 Air Navigation (Carriage of Munitions of War, Weapons and Dangerous Goods) Order 1973, text (extracts) 538-9
 as breach of neutrality 567-9
 Dáil's consent and 542, 543
 existence/state of war in Afghanistan 542, 564-7
 burden of proof 567
 individual's standing/right to challenge (Constitution 29)
 Court's findings 567-8
 parties' arguments 544, 558
 interpretation of relevant legislative provisions 564

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

766

INDEX

Dubsky (overflights and landings (foreign military aircraft)) (Ireland) (cont.)

parties' submissions 543-6, 550-8

war, definition

absence of 565-6

armed conflict distinguished 564-5

'participation in' 567-8, 569-72

States or recognized belligerents, need for 567-8

overflights and landing rights, permissions as alleged excess of power/*ultra vires*

Court's findings 573-6

parties' submissions 542, 546-50, 558-62

parties' submissions

applicant

detailed 543-50

outline 542-3

respondents

detailed 552-62

outline 550-2

relief

applicant's request 532-3, 572

grounds 533

Court's findings 573-6

respondents' statement of opposition 533-5

EC Council, competence

EC 308 [EC 235] (implied power to enable Community to carry out its functions)

264, 376-7

absence of alternative requirement 183, 206-12, 252, 271-2, 375

amendment of treaty distinguished 264

compliance with EC objectives (EC 2/EC 3) 208-11, 272-5, 375, 380-2

compliance with EC objectives (preamble) 275-6

in conjunction with EC 60(1) and EC 301 212-14, 376-7, 378-80

EU 3 (single institutional framework/consistency of Union activities) and 213,

276-7, 380-2

'in the operation of the common market' 213-14, 277, 377

EC legal order: *see* UN Charter (1945) (UNC), primacy (UNC 103), EC/EU

and

EC Treaty (EC) (1957) (including amendments prior to Lisbon Treaty (2007))

individuals, avoidance of distortion of competition (EC 3(1)(g)) and 208-11,

272-4

interpretation, Council practice, relevance 274-5

EC/EU Member State agreements (TFEU 351 [EC 307] [EC 234]), compatibility

of proposed agreement with EC obligations 322-3

EC/EU treaties with third parties (TFEU 218 [EC 300])

compatibility with EC Treaty (TFEU 351 [EC 307](6) [EC 228(6)] reference) 394

primacy of treaty over secondary EU law/binding effect on EC institutions (EC

300(7)) 393-4

ECHR (1950)

applicability to claims arising before entry into force/retroactive effect (VCLT 28)

80-1

applicability 'within their jurisdiction' (ECHR 1)

matters arising prior to entry into force, Protocol 1 and 80-1

- transfer of obligations to third State/international organization, relevance 71
- justified restrictions/interference
 - 'legitimate aim', compliance with treaty obligation excluding jurisdiction to review measures of occupying powers 72-4
 - 'proportionate to the legitimate aim' 84-8
- municipal law and
 - jurisprudence
 - In re S 6 (Care Order: Implementation of Care Plan)* 594-5
 - Poplar Housing* 595
 - R v. A* 592-4
 - presumption of compatibility/obligation to interpret in manner compatible with 592-6
- ECtHR jurisdiction/role and powers (including ECHR 19 and ECHR 32)**, interpretation of municipal law/compliance with, determination of compatibility with ECHR, limitation to 72, 76
- ECtHR Rules of Court (1998)**
 - 24 (composition of Chamber) 54
 - 59(2) 54
 - 61(1) 54
 - 72 (relinquishment to Grand Chamber) 54
- effective remedy before national authority, need for (UDHR 8)** 248, 307-8
- enemy property (German), post-WWII confiscation of external assets**
 - Czechoslovak measures including Beneš Decrees: *see also Certain German Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany)* (ICJ); German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Chapter 6 (reparations); *Pieter van Laer Painting; Prince Hans-Adam II* (ECtHR)
 - applicability to all persons of German or Hungarian nationality 19-20
 - Czechoslovak jurisprudence 23-4, 38-9, 55-6
 - jurisdiction to determine validity 16-17, 18-19, 21-4, 83
 - presence of property in forum State, relevance 76-7
 - as measure against German external assets (GSC VI.3) 18-19, 21-4
 - property covered by 21
 - standing to challenge 24
- EU law**
 - individual, right to make views known prior to adoption of legislation 244-6, 301-2
 - judicial review
 - of Council regulation implementing UNSCR 226-37, 286-97, 305-8, 318-23, 384-97
 - limitation to legislation in force at time of review 238, 298
 - rule of law and 232-3, 292-3, 323-4, 329, 389-90
 - timely communication of grounds for decision, need for 398-401
 - remedy for breach
 - annulment of regulation 246-9, 305-8, 397-404, 453
 - delayed implementation (EC 231) ('serious and irreversible prejudice' requirement) 404, 471-2
 - effective remedy, right to 246-9, 305-8
 - UNC and: *see Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases); UN Charter (1945) (UNC), primacy (UNC 103)
- EU treaties with third parties (TFEU 218 [EC 300]):** *see* EC/EU Member State agreements (TFEU 351 [EC 307] [EC 234])

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

768

INDEX

EU/EC Council Regulations, 'shall have general application' requirement (EC 249)
216-18, 353, 382-4

EU/EC legal order

autonomy/independence

exclusive jurisdiction of CJEU/ECJ (EC 220) and 390

jurisprudence

Les Verts 317, 337, 389-90*van Gend & Loos* 317, 337primacy/relationship between EC and international legal order 227-32, 287,
317-18, 337-8, 389-97

judicial review of UNSCRs and 393, 395, 436

limitation of effects of ECJ decision to EC legal order 327

international law, compliance obligation

EC law as determining factor/applicable law 317-18

Member States' right to take independent compliance action 320-1

UNSCRs 227-32, 391-2, 435

international law, compliance obligation, jurisprudence

International Fruit 230-2, 290-2*Merck* 317*Parfums Christian Dior* 317*Poulsen and Diva Navigation* 230-1, 235, 291, 391*Racke* 230-1, 235, 295, 317, 391*Van Duyn* 230-1, 291, 317**European Convention for the Peaceful Settlement of Disputes (1957)
(ECPSD)**'disputes . . . solely within the domestic jurisdiction of States' (ECPSD 27(b)) 120,
146-7

'disputes relating to facts or situations prior to the entry into force of this

Convention' (ECPSD 27(a)) (critical date) 104-11, 115-20, 123-9, 134-6,
139-46, 155-65*travaux préparatoires* 135-6

ICJ compulsory jurisdiction (ECPSD 1) 93, 99-100

**exhaustion of established processes including diplomatic negotiations (ICJ ROC
79)**applicability in, *Certain German Property* 150-1party's claim in own right and diplomatic protection claim distinguished 122-3,
150-1**fair hearing (Sanctions Committee): see Sanctions Committee, right to fair hearing
fair hearing/trial (EC)**

right of defence, non-disclosure of evidence and 448-50, 469-70

right to be heard/judicial review 240-6, 300-5, 330-3, 339-41, 360-2, 398-401,
443

interference with property rights and 403-4

fair trial (ICCPR 14), margin of appreciation 248, 307-8**family life, respect for (ECHR 8)**

as 'best efforts' obligation

Anufrijeva 603, 607, 609-10*Bernard* 600-2*Bode* 605-6

- Chapman* 599-600
Doherty 602-3, 606-7, 610
Moldovan 603-5
Sisojeva 605-6
 inhuman or degrading treatment (ECHR 3) and 607
 justified restrictions/interference by public authority, family/economic well-being of the country 608
 nomadic life style, relevance: *see O'Donnell* (travellers' right to equality of treatment (housing)) (Ireland)
- foreign law, recognition/enforcement, jurisprudence**
Banca de Vizcaya v. Don Alfonso de Borbon y Austria 499-500
Krupp 499
Lowenthal 499
Oppenheimer v. Cattermole 499, 509-10, 516-17, 519-20
Wolf v. Oxholm 499
- fundamental rights within the EU/EC**
 derogation based on EC 307 320-1
 derogation in time of emergency/terrorist threat 329-33
 ECHR (1950) and
 ECJ and ECtHR jurisdiction distinguished 325-6, 394-5
 as general principle of law 390
 EU law, as condition for lawfulness of 390
 as integral general principle of law 390
 constitutional traditions and 390, 398
 judicial review of compliance of EC/EU law, 246-9, 315-18, 327, 336-8, 384-97, 436-43: *see also Kadi/Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases)
 Member States' obligation to respect EU 6(1)/EU 49 321-2
 Security Council resolutions, EC/EU implementation obligations including compliance with EU fundamental rights
 alleged breaches of fundamental rights: *see Kadi/Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases); sanctions (EU implementation of UN sanctions), sanctions against individuals as alleged violation of fundamental rights
 CJEU/ECJ competence to determine compliance 315-27, 336-8, 339-41, 384-97: *see also Kadi/Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases)
- German Final Settlement (Two plus Four Agreement) (1990) (GFS)**
 GSC (1952/1954), interrelationship: *see German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Exchange of Notes (FRG—Three Powers) (27/28 September 1990)* relating to
 interpretation, Exchange of Notes (27/28 September), exclusion (VCLT 31(2)(a)) 10
 termination of Four Power Rights and Responsibilities/restoration of full German sovereignty (GFS 7(1)) 7-10, 30-1
 Three Power—FRG rights and obligations distinguished 8-10, 30-1
- German reparations (WWII)**
 object and purpose 65
 Paris Reparations Agreement (1946) 65
- German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), agreements associated with conclusion**
 Bonn Conventions 45, 62-3

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

770

INDEX

German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC) (cont.)

Paris Agreements (1954)

documents comprising 46-7, 63-4

Schedule 1 amendments 45-6, 63

Protocol on Termination of Occupation, continuation of rights and obligations established by Occupation Authorities 64

German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Chapter I (general provisions)/general issues relating to GSC

non-status of Germany, effect on ECHR obligations 83-4

reservation of Four Power rights and responsibilities (GSC I.2) 72-4, 83-4

German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Chapter 6 (reparations): see*also Certain German Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany) (ICJ); Pieter van Laer Painting*

final settlement, reservation to peace treaty (GSC VI.1) 11

FRG agreement not to raise objections against reparations measures (GSC VI.3(1))

acceptance by FRG as *force majeure* 83-4

applicability to neutral/non-German States 113-20, 121-2, 125-8, 137-9, 143-5, 157-9

applicability to non-parties 17-18, 113-15, 125-6, 162

'external asset' 17-18

interpretation

'manifestly erroneous'/'arbitrary' test 74-6

object and purpose 15-16

parties' intention at time of conclusion 13-14, 15-16, 83, 117-18, 158-9

political considerations 165

jurisdiction of German courts (GSC VI.3) 7-24, 110, 115-20, 137-8, 139, 155

applicable law 17-18, 29, 30

compliance with GSC VI.3 as legitimate aim justifying restrictions on access to court (ECHR 6(1)) 72-4, 83, 84-5

consistency of jurisprudence 110, 116, 125-6, 137-8, 155-7

exclusion of claims based on international law 16-17, 29

GSC VI.3 as absolute bar to access to FRG courts 83-4, 85

over acts outside forum State 14-15

presence of confiscated property in forum State, relevance 76-7

as waiver of German jurisdiction 13-14

jurisprudence

AKU 110, 138, 157

miscellaneous 1960s cases in German courts 110, 116, 155, 156-7

Pieter van Laer Painting 110, 116, 138, 143-5, 157

as self-executing treaty 157-8

termination/continuation of provisions: *see* German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Exchange of Notes (FRG–Three Powers) (27/28 September 1990) relating to

text (extracts) 98

German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Exchange of Notes (FRG–Three Powers) (27/28 September 1990) relating to

continuation in force of GSC VI.3(1) and (3) 7-13, 98-9, 127-8, 162-3

human rights and 12-13

- legislative approval, need for 10-13
- entry into force 8-10
- legislative approval, need for 10-13, 30
- as *novus actus interveniens* 162-3
- right to remedy for expropriation and 11-12
 - for acts outside forum State 14-15
- status
 - as administrative agreement (*GG* 59(2)) 10-11, 12
 - 'agreement . . . in connection with the conclusion of the [GFS]' (VCLT 31(2)(a))
 - distinguished 10
 - declaratory nature 11-12
 - as treaty in own right 8-10
 - 'termination at any time by consent of all the parties' (VCLT 54(b)), compliance
 - with 10
 - termination of compensation for measures taken under GSC VI.2 and VI.3 (GSC VI.5) 98-9, 127-8, 162-3
 - termination with exception of provisions listed in paragraph 3 8, 98-9, 127-8, 162-3
- Germany, Federal Republic (FRG)**
 - Basic Law (*GG*) by article (including 2009 amendments)
 - Art. 14 (property, inheritance, expropriation), alleged breach by German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) 11-12, 14-15, 30
 - Art. 59(2) (treaties: legislation requirement), administrative agreements 10-11, 12
 - Constitutional Court Law (*BVerfGG*), s 93a(2)(b) 29-31
 - law of
 - Private International Law Reform Act 1986 67-8
 - property matters, absence of statutory provision/customary international law 67-8
 - Reparation of Losses Law 1969 65-6
 - s 2(1) (definition of 'losses') 65-6
 - treaties, validity (VCLT 46-53)
 - legislative approval, need for
 - administrative agreement 10-11, 12
 - Exchange of Notes (FRG-Three Powers) (27/28 September 1990) relating to 10-13
 - treaties not having constitutive effect 11
- Germany, occupation (post-WWII)**, Four Power rights and responsibilities, termination: *see* German Final Settlement (Two plus Four Agreement) (1990) (GFS); German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC)
- Habib (act of State doctrine)** 480-528
 - act of State doctrine (common law) 481-3, 507-23
 - Commonwealth submissions 507
 - review of the jurisprudence 481, 514-22
 - act of State doctrine (constitutional and statutory context) 482, 523-7
 - act of State doctrine, definition, theory and nature of the doctrine 495-501
 - Court's decision 527-8
 - factual background 483-6, 503-4

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

772

INDEX

Habib (act of State doctrine) (*cont.*)

conduct forming basis of claim 485, 505-7

persons involved 504-5

States involved 505

judgments

Black 480-3

Jagot 501-28

Perram 483-501

jurisdictional bar to prosecution and liability distinguished 482

non-justiciability (act of State/political question doctrine), reasons for/justification 522-3

procedural matters

applicant's claim 480, 501-2

limitation of proceedings to justiciability considerations 480, 485, 502

procedural history 502

reserved question, text/summary 481, 502

summary of issues 483, 502-3

summary of parties' arguments 480-1, 507

torture, definition/classification as

act of State 517, 522

action 'by a public official or other person acting in an official capacity'

(TC 1)/Crimes (Torture) Act 480-1, 482, 520-1

human rights, UNC provisions 296-7**human/fundamental rights and freedoms (municipal law/general)**, legality

principle and 669, 683-4, 705-9, 741-2

ICJ, procedural issues, pleadings, availability to the public (ROC 53(2)) 94**ICJ Rules of Court (as variously amended)**

37(1) 94

53(1) 93-4

79 94

79(1) 93

interim measures (ECJ), failure to follow correct procedure 191**intervention of third State (ICJ 62) (with 'interest of a legal nature which may be affected by the decision')**jurisprudence, *Monetary Gold* 121, 148-50, 164

'very subject-matter of the decision' requirement

application in, *Certain German Property* 121-2, 148-50

indispensable third party principle 121-2, 164

Ireland, Republic of

Air Navigation (Carriage of Munitions of War, Weapons and Dangerous Goods) (Amendment) Order 1989, text (extracts) 539

Air Navigation (Carriage of Munitions of War, Weapons and Dangerous Goods) Order 1973

civil aircraft, limitation to 573-4

text (extracts) 538-9

Air Navigation (Foreign Military Aircraft) Order 1952

delegation of powers under as alleged excess of power/*ultra vires* 574-5

'express permission' 575-6

text (extracts) 538

- Air Navigation and Transport Act 1946
 - constitutionality of provision and implementing orders 573-6
 - extracts 537
 - section 5 (applicability of orders) 536-7
- Air Navigation and Transport Act 1950 by section, s 5 ('State aircraft') 538
- Constitution 1937, unenumerated rights, judicial restraint in respect of 611-12
- Constitution 1937 by article
 - 15.2.1° (law-making powers: Oireachtas) 535
 - 15.6 (right to raise armed forces) 535
 - 28.3.1° (declaration of war: assent of Dáil) 536, 572
 - 'war' 565-6
 - 28.3.3° (emergency laws: validity) 536
 - 'time of war' and 'armed conflict' distinguished 564-5
 - 28.4.1° (responsibility of government to Dáil) 536
 - 29 (international relations), individual's standing/right to challenge 544, 558, 567-8
 - 29.1 (devotion to peace and friendly co-operation founded on international justice and morality) 536
 - 29.2 (peaceful settlement of international disputes) 536
 - 29.3 (generally recognized principles of international law/customary international law) 536
 - 29.4 (external relations: executive powers) 536
 - 29.4.1° (exercise of Art. 28 executive power) 536
- ECHR (1950), municipal law and, presumption of compatibility/obligation to interpret in manner compatible with 592-6
- ECHR Act 2003 by section
 - 2 (interpretation and application of legislation in manner compatible with ECHR obligations) 592-6
 - 3(1) (obligation of State organs to act in conformity with ECHR obligations) 598-610
 - text 598
- family life, respect for (ECHR 8)
 - as 'best efforts' obligation 598-607, 609-10
 - inhuman or degrading treatment (ECHR 3) and 607
- family life, respect for (ECHR), justified restrictions/interference by public authority, family/economic well-being of the country (ECHR 8) 608
- Housing Act 1988
 - positive nature of ss 9 and 13 obligations 591-2, 596-7
 - s 9 (periodic assessments of need for housing accommodation) 591, 597
 - s 9(2) (periodic assessments of need for housing accommodation: special groups) 591
 - s 13(2) (caravans/sites with limited facilities) (now 1998 Act s 29) 591, 595-6
 - s 13(3) (application of Housing Act 1966 s 56(2)) 591
- Housing (Traveller Accommodation) Act 1998
 - s 29 (nomadic way of life) 591
 - s 30 (grant or subsidy for provision of a caravan), interpretation by reference to ECHR 2 (ECHR Act 2003) 592-6
- judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power)
 - burden of proof (right to review) 562-3
 - prompt hearing requirement 576-8

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

774

INDEX

Ireland, Republic of (*cont.*)scope/standard of review/grounds, excess of powers/*ultra vires* act
572-6

war-related decisions 569-72

judicial review/justiciability (standing/private right of action) 544, 558,
567-8

legislation, interpretation

aids, previous legislation (under previous regime) 565

amendment, exclusion/distinguished 594-6

presumption of constitutionality/interpretation in accordance with 596-7

neutrality

breach, overflights and landing rights (foreign military aircraft) 567-9

as matter of policy 568-9

overflights and landings (foreign military aircraft): *see also* Air Navigation legislation
listed above; Dubsy (overflights and landings (foreign military aircraft))
(Ireland)

blanket exemption 539-40

as breach of neutrality 567-9

as 'participation in war' 567-8, 569-72

UNSCR 1368/2001 and 540-1

Security Council resolutions, judicial review/justiciability (municipal courts)
569standing (municipal courts), individual challenge to government's application of
international law (Constitution 29) 544, 558, 567-8

war, declaration of, as prerogative right/Dáil involvement 563-4, 572

war, definition/classification as

absence of definition 565-6

armed conflict distinguished 564-5

'participation in' 567-8, 569-72

war, existence/state of

Afghanistan (Coalition operations in) 542, 564-7

burden of proof 567

definition/classification as, armed conflict distinguished 564-5

judge ad hoc (ICJ 31(2) and (3))appointment, *Certain German Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany)* (ICJ) 93, 94
role and purpose 153-4**judicial protection/effective remedy (EU/EC)** 326-7, 330-3, 339-41, 395-7,
436-7

derogation in time of emergency 307-8, 329-33, 399-400

as general principle of EU law 398

non-disclosure of evidence and 450-1, 470

judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power)

burden of proof (right to review) 562-3

excess of powers under Constitution 488-95, 525-6

prompt hearing requirement 576-8

treaties: *see* treaties, judicial review/justiciability

war-related decisions 569-72

**judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power including
act of States), jurisprudence, *Oppenheimer v. Cattermole*: *see* foreign law,
recognition/enforcement, jurisprudence, *Oppenheimer v. Cattermole***

judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power including acts of State), considerations of possible relevance

public policy of forum State 510-11, 517, 519

Sabbatino factors 515-16, 521-2, 523**judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power including acts of State), jurisprudence***Abbasi* 518-19*Applicant S* 519-20*Boland* 572*Buttes* 495-6, 499*CND* 569-70*Ditfort* 495-6, 499*First National City Bank v. Banco Nacional de Cuba* 514*Horgan* 569-70, 572*Jones* 511-12*Kavanagh* 572*Kirkpatrick v. Environmental Tectonics* 495-6, 497, 515*Kuwait Airways* 499, 510-11, 519-20*Lam* 519-20*Moçambique* 495-6, 497-9*O'Malley* 570*Petrotimor* 495-6, 497-8, 499, 519-20*Pinochet (No 1)* 502*Potter* 495-6, 497-9, 519-20*Sabbatino* 509*Sarei v. Rio Tinto* 516*Spycatcher* 495-6, 497*Sue v. Hill* 519-20*Underhill v. Hernandez* 481, 498-9, 514*Unocal* 515-16**judicial review/justiciability (foreign relations or prerogative power), scope/standard of review/grounds, excess of powers/*ultra vires* act 572-6****judicial review/justiciability (standing/private right of action)**

government's application of international law 544, 558, 567-8

jurisprudence

Horgan 567-8*O'Laighléis* 568***jus cogens*/peremptory norm**

jurisprudence

Bosphorus 237, 297*Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons* 237, 297

Security Council resolutions and 236-7, 296-7, 707

UN Charter provisions 236-7, 296-7

voidness of treaty (VCLT 53/VCLT 64) and 296

***Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases)**

factual background 252, 408-15

Commission Regulation (EC) 374/2008 460

Commission Regulation (EC) 2062/2001 414, 458

Common Position 1999/727/CFSP 184, 253, 344

Common Position 2001/154/CFSP 185, 254-5, 345, 414-15

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)***Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases)*** (*cont.*)

Common Position 2001/931/CFSP 414-15

Common Position 2002/402/CFSP 186-7, 256, 311, 347, 458

Common Position 2003/140/CFSP 188-9, 257-8, 311, 348, 459

Council Regulation (EC) 337/2000 (flight ban and freeze of Taliban funds) 184, 253, 310, 344, 413-14

avoidance of distortion of competition and (preamble 3) 185

Council Regulation (EC) 467/2001 (strengthening of measures against Taliban) applicability (Art. 2) 185, 310, 345-6, 413-14, 458-9

'funds'/'freezing of funds' (Art. 1) 185, 345, 458-9

list of persons, entities and bodies affected (Annex 1) with amendments 185-6, 255-6, 346

summary of provisions 185-6, 255

Council Regulation (EC) 561/2003 (amendments to Council Regulation 881/2002) 311, 459

Council Regulation (EC) 881/2002 (specific restrictive measures)

applicability (Art. 2) 187, 310, 311, 347-8, 413-14

frequency of resort to 415

'funds'/'freezing of funds' (Art. 1) 187, 458-9

insertion of Article 2a (Council Regulation 561 (2003)) 189-90, 258-9, 311, 348-9

list of persons and entities affected (Annex 1) with amendments 187-8, 189-90, 257, 347-8, 458-9

summary of provisions (including extracts from the text) 187-8, 256

Council Regulation (EC) 1190/2008 (amending Regulation 881/2002) 420-1

Council Regulation (EC) 2580/2001 (specific restrictive measures) 414-15

Council Regulation (EU) 1286/2009 413-14

Security Council resolutions: *see* sanctions (Al-Qaida/Taliban), Security Council resolutions relating to

legal framework 181-3, 251-2

EC 60(1) 182, 252

EC 301 [EC 228a] 182, 252

EC 308 (implied power to enable Community to carry out its functions) 183, 252

TEU(M) 11(1) 182, 252

TFEU 347 [EC 297] 408

TFEU 351 [EC 307] 182, 252, 408

UNC preamble 407

UNC 1(1)(3) 342, 407

UNC 24(1) 181, 251, 342, 407

UNC 25 181, 251, 342, 407

UNC 39 342, 408

UNC 41 342, 408

UNC 42 408

UNC 48(2) 182, 251, 343, 408

UNC 103 182, 251, 343, 408

Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (ECJ Grand Chamber)

alleged breach of EC 249 ('A regulation shall have general application') 353, 382-4 parties' arguments 382-3

CFI actions/judgments under appeal 349-64

- competence of Council to adopt Regulation 881/2002 on the basis of EC 60(1) and EC 301 (ex EC 288a) 350-3, 372-82, 392
 - EC 57(2) as alternative 376
 - EC 60(2) as alternative 376, 381
 - sanctions against individuals 372-5
 - 'action . . . to reduce . . . economic relations with one or more third countries' (EC 301) 373-5
 - 'as regards the third countries concerned' (EC 60(1)) 373
 - 'in part' (EC 301) 374
 - UNC 41 compared 374
- competence of Council to adopt Regulation 881/2002 on basis of EC 308 (implied powers) 366
 - absence of alternative Treaty-based power 375
 - avoidance of distortion of competition (EC 3(1)(g)) and 381
 - in conjunction with EC 60(1) and EC 301 (ex EC 288a) 376-7, 378-80
 - EU 3 (single institutional framework/consistency of Union activities) and 380-2
 - 'in the operation of the common market' 377, 381
 - object and purpose of Treaty (EC 2/EC 3) and 375, 380-2
- competence of Council to adopt Regulation 881/2002 implementing UNSCR (general)
 - Court's analysis 372
 - Court's findings 383-4
 - parties' arguments 366-72
 - Al Barakaat 371
 - Commission 368-9
 - Council 367, 371-2
 - France 367, 368
 - Kadi 366-7, 370-1
 - Spain 367, 368, 370-1
 - UK 367, 368, 370-1, 372
- Court's decision (annulment of Regulation) 404, 405-6
 - delayed implementation (EC 231) ('serious and irreversible prejudice' requirement) 404
 - possibility of examination of merits proving justification of measures 404
- factual background, 343-9: *see also Kadi Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases), factual background
- fundamental rights within the EU/EC, alleged breaches 397-404
 - disproportionate interference with property rights 359-60, 401-4
 - possibility of exemptions and derogations, relevance 403
 - proportionality and 401-2
 - public purpose requirement 402-3
 - right to be heard and 403-4
- effective judicial remedy/right of judicial review 395-7
 - derogations in time of emergency 399-400
 - non-disclosure/use of 'closed material' (national security considerations) 399-400
 - review of lawfulness of grounds of measure 398-9
 - right to be heard 360-2, 398-401, 403-4
 - summary of CFI findings 362-4
 - timely communication of grounds for decision, need for 398-401

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

778

INDEX

- Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (ECJ Grand Chamber) (cont.)***
 fundamental rights within the EU/EC, Court's competence to determine compliance of regulation implementing UNSCR (judicial review) 384-97
 Court's findings 389-97
 on admissibility 389
 derogation based on EC 307
 parties' claims and arguments 384-9
 Al Barakaat 386
 Commission 387-8
 Council 386-7
 France 386-7
 Kadi 384-6
 Netherlands 386-7
 UK 386-7, 388-9
 relationship between EC/EU and international legal orders
 'full review' obligation 389, 397, 436-8, 443
 general considerations 389-97
 summary of CFI findings 355-9, 372-82
 legal framework, 342-3: *see also Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases)*, legal framework
 procedural matters
 costs 404-5
 forms of order sought by parties 364-5
 Al Barakaat 364
 Commission 364
 Council 364
 France 365
 Kadi 364
 Netherlands 365
 Spain 365
 UK 364
 grounds of appeal
 Al Barakaat 365
 Kadi 365
 UK 366
 joinder of cases (ECJ ROC 43) 366
- Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (ECJ Grand Chamber) (Advocate General's Opinion (Barakaat)) 333-41***
 factual and procedural background 333-6
 fundamental rights within the EU/EC, alleged breaches 338-41
 disproportionate interference with property rights 339
 right to be heard/judicial review 339-41
 fundamental rights within the EU/EC, Court's competence to determine compliance of regulation implementing UNSCR (judicial review) 336-8
 Bosphorus, relevance 337-8
 individual's right to judicial protection and 339-41
 primacy/relationship between EC and international legal order 337-8

- Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (ECJ Grand Chamber) (Advocate General's Opinion (Kadi))*** 309-33
- competence of Council to adopt Regulation 881/2002 on the basis of EC 60(1) and EC 301 (ex EC 288a) 312-14
 - EC 301 as basis for EC CFSP jurisdiction 314
 - EC 308, relevance 314
 - sanctions directed against individuals 312-14
 - as agents of State 313-14
 - EC/EU Member State agreements (TFEU 351 [EC 307] [EC 234]), obligation to ensure compatibility with EC obligations 322-3
 - fundamental rights within the EU/EC, alleged breaches
 - disproportionate interference with property rights 330
 - right to be heard/judicial review 330-3
 - fundamental rights within the EU/EC, Court's competence to determine compliance of regulation implementing UNSCR (judicial review) 315-27
 - AG's views 317-27
 - Bosphorus*, relevance 318-20
 - CFI findings 315
 - applicant's position 316
 - concurrent jurisdiction with international courts and 327-9
 - derogation based on EC 307 320-1
 - ECtHR jurisprudence, relevance 324-6
 - derogation in time of emergency/terrorist threat 329-33
 - EC 307 as basis 320-3
 - exercise of jurisdiction as alleged excess of power 326-9
 - individual's right to judicial protection and 326-7, 330-3
 - Member States' obligation to respect EU 6(1)/EU 49 321-2
 - Member States' right to take independent compliance measures 320-1
 - political question doctrine and 323-4, 328-9
 - primacy/relationship between EC and international legal order 317-18
 - EC law as determining factor/applicable law 317-18
 - UK position 316-17
 - procedural history (*Kadi* (CFI)) 311-12
 - Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (Kadi (General Court))*** 406-53
 - alleged breach of right to fair hearing/judicial protection 443
 - failure to take account of applicant's observations 448
 - non-disclosure/use of 'closed material' (national security considerations) 448-51
 - counterbalancing measures/procedural safeguards, sufficiency 451-2
 - right of defence and 448-50
 - right to effective judicial review/judicial protection and 450-1
 - parties' arguments 443-7
 - applicant 443-7
 - Commission 447
 - Council 447
 - alleged disproportionate interference with property rights 452
 - Court's findings 452-3
 - parties' arguments
 - applicant 452
 - Commission 452

Kadi Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (Kadi (General Court)) (cont.)

- Court's decision (annulment of Regulation) 453
- Court's findings 448-53
- legal context and background 407-15, 423-4: *see also Kadi Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases), factual background; *Kadi Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases), legal framework
 - EC Council Regulation (EC) 1190/2008 (amending Regulation 881/2002), adoption and summary 420-1
 - reasons for inclusion of Kadi on Sanctions Committee's list (UNSC letter of 21 October 2008) 418-19
 - applicant's observations 420
 - Commission's response to applicant's observations 421-2
 - transmission to applicant 419-20
 - transmission to Commission 419
 - summary of findings
 - Kadi* (CFI) 415-16
 - Kadi* (ECJ (Grand Chamber)) 416-18
- procedure 422-3
 - costs 453
 - forms of order sought 423
- standard of review 425-43
 - autonomy/independence of EU/EC legal order and 436
 - Court's findings 432-43
 - 'full review' obligation 436-43
 - fundamental rights, compliance of regulations implementing UNSCR 436-43
 - balance between anti-terrorist requirements and interests of the individual 439
 - judicial protection/effective remedy, right to 436-7
 - non-disclosure/use of 'closed material' (national security considerations) 438-9
 - General Court's right to revisit CFI/ECJ decisions on legal facts 434
 - jurisprudence 434-5
 - legal community's criticisms of *Kadi* decisions 432-4
 - Court's reaction to 434-6
- parties' arguments 425-32
 - applicant 425-6
 - Commission 426-30
 - Council 430-2
 - intervening governments 427, 428-30
 - sufficiency of ECJ's review 437-9
- Kadi Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (Kadi judgment (CFI)) 250-309***
 - alleged breach of fundamental rights 278-308
 - Court's findings 286-308
 - disproportionate interference with property rights 297-300
 - effective judicial remedy/right of judicial review 305-8
 - non-disclosure/use of 'closed material' (national security considerations) 301
 - right of access to the courts (UDHR 8/ICCPR 14), derogations at time of public emergency 307-8
 - parties' arguments
 - applicants 278-82
 - Council and Commission 282-6

- right to be heard 300-5
 - Community institutions 301-2
 - Sanctions Committee 302-5
- competence of Council to adopt Regulation 881/2002 on basis of EC 308 (implied powers) 264-78
 - absence of alternative requirement 271-2
 - amendment of treaty distinguished 264
 - Court's findings 269
 - EC 60(1)/EC 301 [EC 228a] as basis for EC CFSP jurisdiction 276-8
 - EC 60(1)/EC 301 [EC 228a] as basis, link with third country requirement 269-71
 - EC 308 in conjunction with EC 60(1) and EC 301 276-8
 - EU 3 (single institutional framework/consistency of Union activities) and 276-7 'in the operation of the common market' 277
 - object and purpose of Treaty (EC 2/EC 3) and 272-5
 - EC 3(1)(b) (establishment of common commercial purpose) 272
 - EC 3(1)(c) (internal market) 272-4
 - EC 3(1)(g) (avoidance of trade distortion) 272-4
 - object and purpose of Treaty (preamble) and, safeguarding international peace and security 275-6
 - parties' arguments
 - applicant 269
 - Commission 267-8
 - Council 264-7
 - UK 268-9
 - Court's decision/*dispositif* 308-9
 - parties' observations and arguments 259-60
 - primacy of UNC obligations
 - judicial review of regulation implementing UNSCR 286-97
 - Court's finding 295-6
 - on *jus cogens* grounds 296-7
 - transfer of Member State powers to EC and 290-2
 - procedure and parties' requests 259-61
 - amendment of claim following amendment of Regulation (EC) 467/2001 261-2
 - costs 308
 - EC 230 action 259
 - ex proprio motu* consideration of additional ground 263-4
 - joinder of cases (CFIROP 50) 260
 - leave to intervene
 - Commission 260
 - UK 260
 - parties' applications 259
 - parties' defences 259
 - voidness of purpose (CFIROP 113) 260, 261-2
 - Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (Yusuf & Al Barakaat judgment (CFI))*** 180-250
 - alleged breach of EC 249 ('A regulation shall have general application') 216-18
 - Court's findings 217-18
 - parties' arguments 216-17

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

782

INDEX

Kadi Yusuf & Al Barakaat (joined cases) (Yusuf & Al Barakaat (CFI))

- alleged breach of fundamental rights 218-49
 - Court's findings 226-49
 - effective judicial remedy/right of judicial review 246-9
 - non-disclosure/use of 'closed material' (national security considerations) 244, 245
 - right of access to the courts (UDHR 8/ICCPR 14), derogations at time of public emergency 248
 - parties' arguments 218-26
 - applicants 218-22
 - Council and Commission 222-6
 - UK 225-6
 - peaceful possession of property 237-40
 - possibility of exemptions and derogations, relevance 238-9, 298-9
 - right to be heard 240-6
 - Community institutions 244-6
 - Sanctions Committee 240-4
- alleged delegation of EU powers to Sanctions Committee 215-16
- competence of Council to adopt Regulation 467/2001 195-216
 - Court's findings 202-15
 - grant of powers to Commission under Regulation 467/2001 as breach of EC 202 215
 - legal basis (EC 60(1)/EC 301 [EC 228a]) 202-8
 - EC 60(1)/EC 301 [EC 228a] as basis for EC CFSP jurisdiction 212-14
 - legitimate aim and 206
 - proportionality and 206
 - parties' arguments
 - applicants 195-6
 - Commission 200-1
 - Council 197-200
 - institutions/UK 196-7
 - UK 201-2
 - sanctions directed against individuals 195-215
- competence of Council to adopt Regulation 881/2002 on the basis of EC 60(1) and EC 301 (ex EC 288a), EU 3 (single institutional framework/consistency of Union activities) and 213
- competence of Council to adopt Regulation 881/2002 on basis of EC 308 (implied powers)
 - absence of alternative Treaty-based power 206-12, 271-2
 - avoidance of distortion of competition as justification 208-11
 - in conjunction with EC 60(1) and EC 301 (ex EC 288a) 212-14
 - 'in the operation of the common market' 213-14
 - object and purpose of Treaty (EC 2/EC 3) and 208-11
 - EC 3(1)(b) (establishment of common commercial policy) 209
 - EC 3(1)(c) (internal market) 209-11
 - EC 3(1)(g) (avoidance of trade distortion) 209-11
 - EC 58(1)(b) 210
- Court's decision/*dispositif* 249-50
- primacy of UNC obligations
 - judicial review of regulation implementing UNSCR 226-37

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

783

- Court's finding 235-6
 - on *jus cogens* grounds 236-7
 - transfer of Member State powers to EC and 230-2
 - procedure and parties' requests 190-4
 - amendment of claim following amendment of Regulation (EC) 467/2001 191-2, 194-5
 - arguments of respondent released from proceedings, right of hearing 195
 - costs 249
 - discontinuance of action (CFIROP 99) 193
 - EC 230 action 190
 - EC 243 action 190
 - joinder of cases (CFIROP 50) 193
 - leave to intervene
 - Commission 192
 - UK 192
 - legal aid 193
 - parties' applications 190-1
 - parties' defences 191
 - request for expedited procedure (CFIROP 76a) 190
 - request for interim measures, failure to follow correct procedure 191
 - request to add comments on observations 192
 - voidness of purpose (CFIROP 113) 192, 195
- legal certainty/legality principle**
- fundamental/human rights and 669, 683-4, 705-9, 741-2
 - jurisprudence
 - Anufrijeva* 683, 697
 - Ghaidan v. Godin-Mendoza* 697
 - Pierson* 670-1, 676-7, 696, 716-17, 741-2
 - Pyx* 684, 742
 - Sheldrake* 697
 - Simms* 669-70, 676-7, 696, 719-21, 723-4, 741-2, 747-8
 - legislation, interpretation and 669, 696-700, 703, 713-14, 718
- legal dispute, need for/classification as/requirements (including ICJ 36(2) and arbitration provisions)**
- critical date/date arising
 - applicability in, *Certain German Property* 104-11, 115-20, 123-9, 134-6, 139-46, 155-65
 - jurisprudence
 - Electricity Company of Sofia and Bulgaria* 107-8, 119, 126-7, 134-5, 141-2
 - Phosphates in Morocco* 107, 108, 118-19, 126-7, 134-5, 140-1
 - Right of Passage* 108, 120, 126-7, 134-5, 142-3, 160-1
 - multilateral and unilateral acceptances of jurisdiction, distinguishability 108, 124-5
 - real cause test 108, 109-11, 119, 124-7, 130-3, 139-46, 160-1
 - dispute relating to interpretation or application of treaty (treaty/compromise provision for), treaties considered, German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC) 101-3
 - evidence of, position taken during consultations/negotiations 103, 113, 152, 154-5

legality principle: *see* legal certainty/legality principle; rule of law

legislation, interpretation

aids, previous legislation, under previous regime 565

amendment, exclusion/distinguished 594-6

intention of legislature, 'living tree'/subsequent changes in law and practice 707-8

legal certainty/legality principle 669, 696-700, 703, 713-14, 718

legislation, interpretation, guidelines, consistency with common law 481-3

legislation, interpretation, presumption of, constitutionality/interpretation in accordance with 596-7

margin of appreciation (ECHR), balance of interests, family/economic well-being of the country (ECHR 8) 608

minorities, travelling people (Ireland): *see O'Donnell* (travellers' right to equality of treatment (housing) (Ireland))

neutrality

breach, overflights and landing rights (foreign military aircraft) 567-9

Ireland 567-9

as matter of policy 568-9

nexu s for purposes of jurisdiction, confiscation of enemy assets, *situs*, relevance 76-7

non-disclosure/use of 'closed material' (national security considerations)

counterbalancing measures/procedural safeguards, balance between anti-terrorist requirements and interests of the individual 439, 448

fair trial (EC)

judicial review/judicial protection and 450-1, 470

right of defence/right to be heard and 448-50, 469-70

judicial review of EU/EC regulation implementing UNSCR 245, 301, 399-400, 438-9, 448-51

jurisprudence

A v. UK 448-9

Chahal 399-400, 438, 441

Criminal proceedings against E 439

Öcalan 441

OMPI 451-2

PMOI I 451-2

PMOI II 440-1

non-discrimination obligation (ECHR 14), ancillary nature of right/obligation 81-2

non-justiciability (act of State/political question doctrine), exceptions

Bernstein exception, *Sabbatino* and 509, 514, 523

international law violation

status of rule under consideration (*Sabbatino/Kuwait Airways*), relevance 519

developments in international law and 519

jus cogens and 522

private law rights 636-9

torture 482, 517, 522

non-justiciability (act of State/political question doctrine), reasons for/justification

absence of judicially discoverable and manageable standards 523

comity 523

- foreign policy considerations, avoidance of embarrassment to executive 523
- judicial restraint 499, 629
- separation of powers doctrine 523
- nullum crimen nulla poena sine lege***/non-retroactivity (ECHR 7), legal certainty/foreseeability and 736-8
- O'Donnell (travellers' right to equality of treatment (housing)) (Ireland)*** 581-613
 - alleged infringement of constitutional rights 589
 - Constitution/ECHR Act 2 obligations, interpretation of Housing Acts in accordance with 589
 - Constitution 596-7, 611-12
 - ECHR Act 2 592-6
 - ECHR Act 3 (obligation of State organs to act in conformity with ECHR obligations) 598-610
 - Equal Status Act 2000/ECHR 14 obligations 589, 610-11
 - estoppel/*res judicata* abuse of process 589, 612
 - expert evidence 586-8
 - factual background 581-6
 - defendant 588-9
 - Housing Acts 1966-98 590-8: *see also* Ireland, Republic of, Housing Acts *entries*
 - positive nature of obligations 591-2, 596-7
 - parties' claims and arguments, plaintiffs 588
 - remedy (damages for breach of ECHR 8) 613
 - respect for family life (ECHR 8) 589, 598-610
 - balance of interests between family/economic well-being of the country (ECHR 8) 608
 - as 'best efforts' obligation 598-607, 609-10
 - Court's application of findings on law to facts 607-10
 - inhuman or degrading treatment (ECHR 3) and 607
- Othman (CFI) (action for annulment of Council Regulation)*** 457-74
 - alleged breach of fundamental rights 466-72
 - Court's findings 469-72
 - disproportionate interference with property rights, right to be heard and 470-1
 - non-disclosure/use of 'closed material' (national security considerations) effective remedy/judicial protection 470
 - right of defence/right to be heard and 469-70
 - parties' arguments 466-9
 - applicant 466-7
 - Commission 466, 467, 468
 - Council 466, 467-8
 - UK 467, 468
 - amendment of claim following amendment of Regulation (EC) 881/2002 464
 - applicant's arguments 464
 - Commission 464, 468
 - Council 464
 - Court's findings 464-6
 - Court's decision (annulment of Regulation) 473
 - delayed implementation (EC 231) ('serious and irreversible prejudice' requirement) 471-2

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

786

INDEX

Othman (CFI) (action for annulment of Council Regulation) (cont.)legal context and factual background: *see also Kadi Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases)

facts specific to applicant 463-4

Sanctions Committee list, addition of applicant 458

parties' claims and arguments

applicant 460, 461

Commission 460, 462

Council 460, 461

UK 462

procedural matters 460-3

costs 472-3

leave to intervene, UK 461

legal aid 462, 473

suspension pending final judgment in *Kadi* 462suspension pending final judgment in *Yusuf* 461**overflights and landings (foreign military aircraft) 531-78: *see also Dubsy***

(overflights and landings (foreign military aircraft)) (Ireland);

Ireland, Republic of, overflights and landings (foreign military aircraft)

'military aircraft' 573-4

Pieter van Laer Painting: *see also Certain German Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany)* (ICJ)

Exchange of Notes (27/28 September 1990)

continuation in force of GSC VI.3(1) and (3) 7-13

legislative approval, need for 10-13

status 10

factual background 4

GSC (1952/1954)

applicability to non-parties 17-18

applicable law 17-18, 29, 30

'external asset' (GSC VI.3) 17-18

standing of transferee to challenge confiscation 24

judgment 1-25

Court's decision 3

judgment (Constitutional Court) (non-admissibility of constitutional complaint) 28-31

as alleged violation of right to fair hearing (ECHR 6(1)) 77-8

jurisdiction of German courts (GSC VI.3) 7-24: *see also German Settlement*

Convention (1952/1954) (GSC), Chapter 6 (reparations), jurisdiction of German courts (GSC VI.3)

exclusion of claims based on international law 16-17, 29

over acts outside forum State 14-15

validity of confiscation under Beneš Decrees 16-17, 18-19, 21-4

parties' submissions 5-6

procedural history 4-5, 28-9

precedent (ECtHR), ECtHR decisions 325-6**preliminary objections (ICJ) (ROC 79)**

joinder with merits (ICJ)

- avoidance of prejudgment on merits 122
- importance of maintaining distinction 112-13
- Prince Hans-Adam II (ECtHR)***: *see also* *Certain German Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany)* (ICJ); *Pieter van Laer Painting*
- admissibility 37-53
 - close relationship with other complaints 51, 52, 53
 - Court's decision 53
 - 'not manifestly ill-founded' (ECHR 35(3)) 51
- alleged breach of right of access to a court (ECHR 6(1)) 83-5
 - acceptance of GSC VI.3 as bar to jurisdiction as breach 72
 - compliance with GSC VI.3 as legitimate aim justifying restriction 72-4
 - proportionality and 72-4, 83, 84-8
 - Court's assessment 70-7
 - Court's decision 77
 - determination of validity of expropriation as civil right 68
 - GSC VI.3 as absolute bar to access to FRG courts 83-4, 85
 - interpretation of GSC VI.3 by German courts, 'manifestly erroneous'/'arbitrary' test 74-6
 - parties' arguments
 - applicant 68-9
 - respondent government 69-70
 - situs* of confiscated property, relevance 76-7
- alleged breach of right to fair hearing (ECHR 6(1)) 77-8
- alleged breach of right to non-discrimination (ECHR 14) 52-3, 81-2
 - Court's assessment 82
 - Court's decision 82
 - parties' arguments, applicant 81
 - respondent government 81-2
- alleged breach of right to property (ECHR Protocol 1) 51-2, 78-81: *see also* property rights/peaceful enjoyment of possessions (ECHR Protocol 1)
 - Court's assessment 79-81
 - Court's decision 81
 - legitimate expectation and 80, 81
 - parties' arguments
 - applicant 78-9
 - respondent government 79
- concurring opinions
 - Costa 85-8
 - Ress/Zupančič 83-5
- ECtHR role in relation to interpretation and application of domestic law 72, 76
- factual background 38-44, 55-61
 - proceedings in Czechoslovak courts (1951) 38-9, 55-6
 - proceedings in German courts (1991) 39-44, 56-61
- merits 53-82
- parties' submissions
 - applicant 48-9, 50-2
 - respondent government 49-50, 52-3
- procedural history 53-5

Prince Hans-Adam II (ECtHR) (*cont.*)

relevant law

Beneš Decree No 12 44, 61-2

Exchange of Notes (27/28 September 1990) 47-8, 66-7

FRG private international law 67-8

GFS (Two plus Four Agreement) (1990) 47, 66

GSC VI.3 (measures against German external assets) 45-7, 62-5

Paris Reparations Agreement (1946) 65

Reparation of Losses Law 1969 65-6

property, right to (UDHR 17)

arbitrary deprivation (UDHR 17(2)) 239, 299

right to own alone or in association with others (UDHR 17(1)) 239, 299

property rights/peaceful enjoyment of possessions (EC) 237-40, 297-300, 330, 339, 470-1**property rights/peaceful enjoyment of possessions (ECHR Protocol 1):** *see also Prince Hans-Adam II (ECtHR)*, alleged breach of right to property (ECHR Protocol 1)

claims arising before entry into force of ECHR/Protocol 1 80-1

deprivation/interference with, justification/requirements

proportionality 401-2, 452, 470-1, 738

public interest/purpose, rights of individuals, balancing of 401-2

non-discrimination (ECHR 14) and 81-2

'possession'

lapsed conditional claim 80

legitimate expectation and 80, 81

unenforceable old property right 80

Security Council resolutions, action in compliance with

EC Council Regulation implementing UNSCR 237-40, 297-300, 330, 339, 401-4

municipal legislation implementing UNSCR 683-4

racial discrimination, prohibition (SADC 6(2)) 476-7**rule of law**, judicial protection/effective remedy and 232-3, 292-3, 323-4, 329, 389-90**SADC Treaty (1992)**, human rights, democracy and the rule of law (SADC 4(c)), racial discrimination, prohibition (SADC 6(2)) 476-7**SADC Tribunal**, costs (ROC 78) 475-6**sanctions (Al-Qaida/Taliban), Security Council resolutions relating to** 656-60

1267 (1999) 183, 252-3, 311, 343-4, 409, 458, 657-8

1333 (2000) 184, 254-6, 344-5, 409, 657

1373 (2001): *see* terrorism, treaties and other international instruments relating to, UNSCR 1373 (2001) (threats to international peace and security caused by terrorist acts)

1390 (2002) 186, 256-7, 311, 346-7, 409, 458

1452 (2002) 188, 257, 311, 348, 458-9, 659

1455 (2003) 188-90, 257, 311, 348, 409, 459

1526 (2004) 409, 459

1617 (2005) 409, 459

1730 (2006) (Sanctions Committee: delisting requests) 410

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

1735 (2006) (Sanctions Committee: list/delisting) 409-10, 460

1822 (2008) 409-12, 460, 657-8, 745

summary of provisions 657-8

1904 (2009) (Sanctions Committee: list/Ombudsman) 409-10, 412-13

effective judicial remedy/right of judicial review 705-9, 740

reasons for inclusion on list, right to information relating to 706-7

Sanctions Committee, relationship with Security Council**Sanctions Committee, right to fair hearing** 240-4, 302-5

diplomatic protection and 243-4

judicial review based on municipal law as alternative 243, 304, 326-7

mechanism for re-examination of individual cases 326-7, 403

absence of effective mechanism 333, 396-7, 436-7, 450, 684-7, 740-1

Guidelines for conduct of Sanction Committee's work 241-2, 302-3, 685-6

Ombudsman, relevance 436-7

UNSCR 1526 (2004) 242, 303-4

sanctions (EU implementation of UN sanctions)

choice of means 392-3, 436

Council competence: *see Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases) (*Yusuf & Al Barakaat* judgment (CFI)), competence of Council to adopt Regulation 467/2001

legal basis 202-14

EC 57(2) 376

EC 58(1)(b) 210

EC 60(1)/EC 301 [EC 228a] 202-8, 212-14, 269-71, 276-8, 312-14, 372-82, 392, 435

UNC 41 and 374

EC 60(2) (urgent unilateral measures with regard to capital movements for serious political reasons) 376, 381

EC 308

in absence of alternative Treaty-based power 206-12, 271-2, 375

compliance with EC objectives and 208-11, 272-5, 375, 380-2

in conjunction with EC 60(1) and EC 301 212-14, 376-7, 378-80

EU 3 (single institutional framework/consistency of Union activities) and 213, 276-7, 380-2

legitimate aim and 206

Member State measures as alternative 659-62

object and purpose of sanctions, relevance

EC 3 204-5

EC 3(1)(b) 209

EC 3(1)(c) (internal market) 209-11, 272-4

EC 3(1)(g) 209-11

obligation to take into account 392, 435

proportionality and 206

sanctions against individuals as alleged violation of fundamental rights 218-49, 312-14, 372-5

'action . . . to reduce . . . economic relations with one or more third countries' (EC 301) 196-7, 205-6, 213-14, 271, 277, 313, 373-5

'as regards the third countries concerned' (EC 60(1)) 207, 271, 373

avoidance of distortion of competition as justification (EC 3(1)(g)) 208-11, 272-4

sanctions (EU implementation of UN sanctions) (cont.)

effective judicial remedy/right of judicial review 246-9, 305-8, 315-27, 330-3,
336-8, 339-41, 395-7

fair hearing 240-6, 301-5

'in part' (EC 301) 374

individuals as agents of State 204-5, 313-14

possibility of exemptions and derogations, relevance 238-9, 298-9, 403

property rights 237-40, 297-300, 330, 339, 401-4, 470-1

freezing and deprivation distinguished 239-40, 299-300

proportionality requirement 401-2, 452, 470-1, 738

public purpose and 402-3

right to be heard and 403-4, 470-1

targeted/'smart' sanctions 203-4, 270

Security Council, obligation to act in accordance with the Purposes and Principles of
the UN (UNC 24(2)) 391-2, 435

Security Council (Chapter VII action)

classification of situation as a threat to international peace and security,
organizations other than States 727-30

compliance obligation (UNC 48(2))

choice of means 392-3, 436

EC/EU 227-32, 391-2, 435

'measures not involving the use of force' (UNC 41)

collective measures against individual 657, 727-30

exhaustive list, whether 657

Security Council resolutions

judicial review/justiciability (ECHR) 324-5

judicial review/justiciability of implementing legislation (ECJ/CJEU) 226-37,
286-97, 305-8, 318-23, 425-43

autonomy of EU/EC legal order and 393, 395, 436

challenge to resolution and application of implementing legislation
distinguished

criticisms of *Kadi* decisions 432-4

ECHR jurisprudence, relevance 324-6

exercise of jurisdiction as alleged excess of power 326-9

political question doctrine and 323-4, 328-9

standard of review 425-43

'full review' obligation 389, 397, 436-8, 443

review of lawfulness of grounds of measure 398-9, 438

judicial review/justiciability, jurisprudence

Abdelrazik 434-5, 680-1, 686

Ahmed 442

Al-Jedda 434-5, 678, 681-2

Diggs 681-2

Dorsch 230, 234, 290

Eurofood 440-1

Kadi 679-80, 681-2

KindHearts 681

Kuwait Airways 634-5

Lenzing 440

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

INDEX

791

- Nada* 434-5
OMPI 439
PMOI I 440
PMOI II 439-41
Sison 439-40
Yusuf 440
- judicial review/judiciability of resolution/implementing legislation (municipal courts) 569, 678, 729-30
 as aid to interpretation of other obligations 635
jus cogens/peremptory norm and 236-7, 296-7, 707
 compliance with purposes and principles of UN Charter 236-7, 296-7
- Security Council resolutions by number and year**
- 1022 (1995) (Former Yugoslavia: suspension of measures imposed on) 634-5
 continuing relevance/ASI and 635
 1267 (1999) (Afghanistan): *see also Kadil Yusuf & Al Barakaat* (joined cases); Sanctions Committee, right to fair hearing
 summary of provisions 183, 252-3, 343-4
 1368/2001 (threats to international peace and security caused by terrorist threats) 540-1
 1390 (2002) (Afghanistan) 186
 EC Common Position 2002/402/CFSP and 186-7
 EC Council Regulation (EC) 881/2002 (specific restrictive measures) and 187-8
 1452 (2002) (Afghanistan) 188
 1455 (2003) (Afghanistan) 188-90
 EC Common Position 2003/140/CFSP and 188-9
 1526 (2004) (threats to international peace and security caused by terrorist acts) 242, 303-4
- separation of powers**
 delegation of legislative powers to executive: *see also Ahmed* (validity of anti-terrorist freezing orders), *ultra vires* nature of orders based on legality principle 669, 696-7, 713-14, 735-6
 transposition/legislative design and 697-700
- standing (municipal courts)**, individual's right to challenge government's application of international law 544, 558, 567-8
- State responsibility for acts and omissions outside State's jurisdiction**, confiscation of German external assets (GSC) 14-15
- 'subject of the dispute', obligation to indicate in application (ICJ 40(1)/ROC 38(2))**
 determination, responsibility for 132-3
 reformulation by Court
Fisheries Jurisdiction (Spain v. Canada) 132-3
Right of Passage over Indian Territory 132-3
 'succinct statement of facts and grounds' (ROC 38(2)) 100, 147-8
- territorial jurisdiction (criminal and tort) (including cross-border offences)**, jurisdictional bar to prosecution and liability distinguished 482

- terrorism, treaties and other international instruments relating to:** *see also* sanctions (Al-Qaida/Taliban), Security Council resolutions relating to summary of provisions 414
 UNSCR 1373 (2001) (threats to international peace and security caused by terrorist acts) 733-6
 generic nature 709-10
 implementation: *see also* United Kingdom, terrorism, legislation relating to, Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (TO) by article *and* Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2009 (including changes from 2006 TO)
 choice of means 710
 State practice 672, 721
 objective (combating by all means of threats caused by terrorist acts) (preamble) 239, 299-300
 standard of proof, 733-6: *see also* United Kingdom, Security Council measures, application/compliance obligation (UN Act 1946 s 1), 'any measures . . . necessary or expedient'/'reasonable grounds for suspecting' (TO)
 terrorism as international crime 710-11
 text (extracts) 658-9
- torture as**
 act of State 482, 522
jus cogens/peremptory norm 482
- torture, civil remedy obligation (TC 14(1))**, compensation under international law, effect on right to (TC 14(2)) 520-1
- Torture Convention (1984)**, effective measures to prevent torture, obligation to take (TC 2) 520
- torture, criminal jurisdiction (including TC obligations)**, obligation to create offence (TC 4) 520-1
- torture, definition/classification as**, action 'by a public official or other person acting in an official capacity' (TC 1) 480-1, 482
- torture, State immunity and**, jurisprudence, *Jones* 511-12
- travaux préparatoires as supplementary means of interpretation (VCLT 32)**
 in respect of
 ECPSD 27(a) 135-6
 UNC 41 657
- treaties, judicial review/justiciability**
 consent to jurisdiction by treaty parties, relevance 635-6
 interpretation for purposes unrelated to determination of domestic law right or interest, exclusion 632-3
 jurisprudence
CND 632-3
Occidental 633-4, 635
Tin Council 629
Westland Helicopters 629-30
 treaties between third States and not part of forum State law 629
- treaties, successive treaties relating to same subject matter (VCLT 30)**, in absence of termination or suspension of earlier treaty (VCLT 30(3)), UNC and 227-8, 288
- treaties, termination and suspension (VCLT 54-64)**, termination with consent of all the parties (VCLT 54(c)) 10

treaties, third parties and (VCLT 34-8)

customary international law and 162

opposability 162

treaties, unincorporated, as context for determination of other rights and

obligations 633-4, 635

treaties, validity (VCLT 46-53)

legislative approval, need for

administrative agreements 10-11, 12

treaty not having constitutive effect 11

treaty interpretation, parties' intention, at time of conclusion ('contemporaneity')

117-18, 158-9

treaty interpretation (VCLT 31(1)) (object and purpose/spirit and purpose)

(**teleological approach**), examples, German Settlement Convention (1952/1954) (GSC) 15-16

UN Charter (1945) (UNC)

primacy (UNC 103)

EC/EU and 227-32, 287

Community and Member States distinguished 230

EC 5 235, 295

EC 10 235, 295

EC 307 [EC 234] 228-9, 232-7, 288-9, 295, 320-3

EU 5 235, 295

judicial review of implementing legislation 226-37, 286-97

Member States' compliance obligation 228-37, 288-92

TFEU 347 [EC 297] [EC 224] 229, 230-2, 289, 290-2

transfer of Member State powers to EC, effect on UN obligations 230-2, 290-2

human rights treaties/ECHR 678, 689-95

jurisprudence

Al-Jedda 681-3, 692-3

Behrami 681-2, 690-2

Bosphorus 229, 289, 318-20, 324-5, 337-8, 394-5

Centro-Com 229, 290, 734-5

Dorsch Consult 230, 234, 290

Ebony Maritime 229, 289

International Fruit 230-2, 290-2

Kadi 693-5

Lockerbie (Provisional Measures) 228, 288

Military and Paramilitary Activities (Nicaragua v. USA) 227-8, 288

Poulsen and Diva Navigation 230-1

Member States' right to take independent compliance measures 320-1

as reviewed in *Kadi* & *Al Barakaat* cases 227-32, 287, 317-18

Security Council resolutions (UNC 25) 228, 229, 288, 294-7

sources other than UNC 103

customary international law 227, 287-8

VCLT 5 (international organizations) 227, 232-7, 287-8, 295

VCLT 27 (internal law and treaty observance) 227, 232-7, 287-8

treaties concluded prior to UNC (VCLT 30) 227-8, 288

UN Charter (1945) (UNC) (*cont.*)

- purposes and principles (UNC 1)
 - maintenance of peace and security (UNC 1(1)(3)) 342
 - Security Council duty to respect 236-7

United Kingdom

- human rights, legality principle and 669, 683-4, 705-9, 741-2
- Human Rights Act 1998 by section
 - 3(1) (interpretation of legislation: 'in a way compatible with the Convention rights')
 - anti-terrorist anti-freezing orders and 689-95
 - legality principle and 696-7
 - 6(1) (actions of public authority incompatible with Convention: unlawfulness), anti-terrorist anti-freezing orders and 689, 690
 - 21(1) ('the Convention': 'as it has effect for the time being in relation to the UK'), ECtHR decisions, relevance 690
- legal certainty/legality principle
 - fundamental/human rights and 669, 683-4, 705-9, 741-2
 - legislation, interpretation and 669, 696-700, 703, 713-14, 718
- legislation, interpretation
 - intention of legislature, 'living tree'/subsequent changes in law and practice 707-8
 - legal certainty/legality principle 696-700, 703, 713-14, 718
- non-justiciability (act of State/political question doctrine), exceptions, private law rights 636-9
- property rights/peaceful enjoyment of possessions (ECHR Protocol 1), Security Council resolutions, action in compliance with, municipal legislation implementing UNSCR 683-4
- Regulation of Investigatory Powers Act 2000, s 17(1) (SIAC: disapplication) 718, 739
- Security Council measures, application/compliance obligation (UN Act 1946 s 1):
 - see also Ahmed* (validity of anti-terrorist freezing orders)
 - absence of scrutiny requirement 654-6
 - Foreign Affairs Select Committee recommendation for amendment (1999) 671-2
 - 'any measures . . . necessary or expedient'/'reasonable grounds for suspecting' (TO) 668-71, 674-6, 677, 698-700, 701-5, 712-14, 719, 730-6
 - as basis for freezing orders (TO/AQO)/compliance of Orders with 660, 667-78, 688, 695-708, 717-24
 - EU obligations and 659-62
 - Order going beyond requirements of UNSCR 701-5
 - purpose of enactment 655-6, 695-6, 726-7, 730-6
- Security Council resolutions
 - judicial review/justiciability, as aid to interpretation of other obligations 635
 - judicial review/justiciability of implementing legislation (ECJ/CJEU), challenge to resolution and application of implementing legislation distinguished
- separation of powers
 - delegation of legislative powers to executive
 - legality principle 669, 696-700, 713-14, 718, 735-6
 - transposition/legislative design and 697-700

- terrorism, legislation relating to
- Al-Qaida and Taliban (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (AQO)
 - enactment 662
 - finding of *ultra vires* voidness/suspension 687-8
 - right to judicial review/fair hearing (ECHR 6) and 684-7, 705-9, 740
 - right to property (ECHR Protocol 1) and 683-4
 - State and non-State actors, need to distinguish
 - summary of provisions 662-3
 - TO provisions distinguished 677-8, 720-1
 - Al-Qaida and Taliban (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (AQO) by article
 - 3 (designated persons) 663
 - 3(1)(b) ('any person designated by Sanctions Committee') 664, 665, 684-7, 742-8
 - 4 (power to designate) 663
 - 5(4) (power of court to set aside direction) 663
 - Anti-Terrorism, Crime and Security Act 2001, Part 2 (Freezing Orders)
 - enactment 660, 672-3
 - summary of provisions 673-4
 - Anti-Terrorism, Crime and Security Act 2001, Part 2 (Freezing Orders) by section
 - 4 (freezing orders: conditions) 673, 732-6
 - s 5(2) (applicability to persons in the UK/UK nationals) 673
 - s 5(3) (specifiable persons) 673
 - Sch 3 (content of freezing orders) 673
 - Anti-Terrorism, Crime and Security Act 2001, Part 4 (Immigration and Asylum) 660
 - Counter-Terrorism Act 2008, enactment 660
 - overlapping measures 731-2
 - Prevention of Terrorism Act 2005 660
 - Terrorism Act 2000 (as amended by Terrorism Act 2006 and Counter-Terrorism Act 2008) 660
 - Terrorism Act 2006, enactment 660
 - Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2001, s 3 (text) 660
 - Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (TO)
 - certainty of the law/foreseeability (ECHR 7) and 736-8
 - finding of *ultra vires* voidness/suspension 687-8
 - Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (TO) by article
 - 3 (text) 660
 - 3(1) ('designated person') 660
 - 3(2) ('direction') 660
 - 4(1) (power to give a direction) 661
 - 4(2)(a) (power to give a direction on reasonable grounds for suspecting), 661, 674-7, 732-6: *see also* Security Council measures, application/compliance obligation (UN Act 1946 s 1), 'any measures . . . necessary or expedient'/'reasonable grounds for suspecting' (TO) *above*
 - 5(4) (power of court to set aside direction) 661
 - 7 (prohibitions) 661
 - 7(6) (prohibitions: 'deal with') 661
 - 8 (text) 661
 - 11 (text) 661

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Index

[More information](#)

796

INDEX

United Kingdom (*cont.*)

Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2009 (including changes from 2006 TO) 662, 739

treaties, judicial review/justiciability

consent to jurisdiction by treaty parties, relevance 635-6

treaties between third States and not part of forum State law 629

war, definition/classification as

absence of definition 565-6

armed conflict distinguished 564-5

evolution of concept 565-6

'participation in' 567-8, 569-72

States or recognized belligerents, need for 567-8

war, existence/state of

burden of proof 567

in/between, Afghanistan (Coalition operations in) 542, 564-7

prerogative right/legislative involvement 563-4, 572

Yugoslavia, Socialist Federal Republic (SFRY), dismemberment/dissolution, State succession distinguished 618**Yugoslavia, Socialist Federal Republic (SFRY), succession issues:** *see also AY Bank* (State succession issues: justiciability)

ASI (2001)

negotiation and entry into force 618

summary of provisions/extracts 618-21

dissolution/dismemberment/secession distinguished 618