

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

INTERNATIONAL  
LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 149

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Volumes published under the title:***ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS  
OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES**

- |                   |   |   |
|-------------------|---|---|
| Vol. 1 (1919-22)  | } | Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C.,<br>and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D. |
| Vol. 2 (1923-24)  |   |   |
| Vol. 3 (1925-26)  | } | Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D.,<br>and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D. |
| Vol. 4 (1927-28)  |   |   |
| Vol. 5 (1929-30)  | } | Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A.                           |
| Vol. 6 (1931-32)  |   |   |
| Vol. 7 (1933-34)  |   |   |
| Vol. 8 (1935-37)  |   |   |
| Vol. 9 (1938-40)  |   |   |
| Vol. 10 (1941-42) |   |   |
| Vol. 11 (1919-42) |   |   |
| Vol. 12 (1943-45) |   |   |
| Vol. 13 (1946)    |   |   |
| Vol. 14 (1947)    |   |   |
| Vol. 15 (1948)    |   |   |
| Vol. 16 (1949)    |   |   |

*Volumes published under the title:***INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS**

- |  |   |  |
|--|---|--|
| Vol. 17 (1950)   | } | Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,<br>F.B.A.                     |
| Vol. 18 (1951)   |   |  |
| Vol. 19 (1952)   |   |  |
| Vol. 20 (1953)   |   |  |
| Vol. 21 (1954)   | } | Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,<br>F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht |
| Vol. 22 (1955)   |   |  |
| Vol. 23 (1956)   |   |  |
| Vol. 24 (1957)   |   |  |
| Vol. 25 (1958-I)   | } | Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.   |
| Vol. 26 (1958-II)  |   |  |
| Vols. 27-68 <i>and</i> Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1-35 <i>and</i> 36-45<br>Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C.  |   |  |
| Vols. 69-149 <i>and</i> Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases<br>and Treaties to Vols. 1-80, Vols. 81-100<br><i>and</i> Vols. 1-125<br>Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,<br>and Sir Christopher Greenwood, C.M.G., Q.C. |   |  |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*Lauterpacht Centre for International Law  
University of Cambridge*

# INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME  
149

*Edited by*

SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC  
*Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge  
Bencher of Gray's Inn*

SIR CHRISTOPHER GREENWOOD, CMG QC  
*Judge of the International Court of Justice  
Bencher of Middle Temple*

*and*

KAREN LEE  
*Assistant Editor  
Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge  
Fellow of Girton College, Cambridge*

GROTIUS PUBLICATIONS



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,  
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107021808](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107021808)

© Sir Elihu Lauterpacht 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-1-107-02180-8 Hardback

---

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to  
in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such  
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
PREFACE	vii
EDITORIAL NOTE	ix
TABLE OF CASES (alphabetical)	xiii
TABLE OF CASES (according to courts and countries)	xv
DIGEST (main headings)	xvii
DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 149	xix
TABLE OF TREATIES	xxxiii
REPORTS OF CASES	1
INDEX	759

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee  
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## PREFACE

The present volume opens with a group of judgments concerning the long-running dispute over ownership of a painting taken by the Czech Government from the royal family of Liechtenstein at the end of the Second World War and, many years later, exhibited in an art gallery in Germany. There are, first, the decisions of the Court of Appeal of Cologne and the Federal Constitutional Court of Germany and then the judgments of the European Court of Human Rights (*Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany*) and the International Court of Justice (*Liechtenstein v. Germany*). Much of the rest of the volume is devoted to judgments concerning economic sanctions imposed by the United Nations Security Council. These judgments come from the now Court of Justice and General Court (previously the Court of First Instance) of the European Union and the United Kingdom Supreme Court. National jurisprudence is also reflected in decisions from the courts of Australia (*Habib*), England (*AY Bank*) and Ireland (*Dubsky and O'Donnell*).

There are many people, to all of whom the Editors are most grateful, whose work has made this volume possible. Ms Karen Lee, Assistant Editor, summarized the European Court of Human Rights *Liechtenstein v. Germany* case, the *Kadi* cases, *Othman* and *Ahmed* and saw the volume through the press. Ms Tara Grant prepared the summaries of the Irish cases, the Tables of Cases and Digest and provided general and secretarial assistance. Dr Chester Brown and Ms Anna Medvinskaia wrote the summaries of *Habib* and *AY Bank* respectively. We are extremely grateful to Mr Malcolm Forster, of Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer LLP, for kind permission to publish the translations of the German cases. Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG compiled the Table of Treaties and the Index. Mrs Diane Ilott checked the copy and Mr Ian Pickett read the proofs.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

viii

PREFACE

Finally, our thanks go to all the others who have worked to complete this volume, particularly our publishers, Cambridge University Press, and typesetters, Aptara, and their staff.

E. LAUTERPACHT

LAUTERPACHT CENTRE  
FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW,  
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

C. J. GREENWOOD

THE PEACE PALACE,  
THE HAGUE

*December 2011*



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## EDITORIAL NOTE

The *International Law Reports* endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the *Reports* will include cases which bear on the exception of “political offences” or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

### DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or ad hoc arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of Justice of the European Union). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

*Human rights cases.* The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the *Reports* to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the *Reports* will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as “views” of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

*International arbitrations.* The *Reports* of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see *Yearbook Commercial Arbitration* (ed. Albert Jan van den Berg, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration).) But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, *force majeure*) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

#### DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

#### EDITORIAL TREATMENT OF MATERIALS

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

EDITORIAL NOTE

xi

PRESENTATION OF MATERIALS

The material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the “Report” in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text in non-English cases indicate the pagination of the original report.

NOTES

*Footnotes.* Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

*Other notes.* References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at p. xvii.

CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 were published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-125 were published in 2004. Volume 145 contains Consolidated Tables of Cases for volumes 126-145.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

## ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word “note” in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| <p>A and Others v. HM Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) (Nos 1 and 2) 641</p> <p>Ahmed and Others v. HM Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) (Nos 1 and 2) 641</p> <p>Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union (Case C-415/05P) 167, 309</p> <p>Al-Ghabra v. HM Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) 641</p> <p>AY Bank Ltd (in liquidation), <i>Re</i>; AY Bank Ltd (in liquidation) v. Bosnia and Herzegovina and Others 614</p> <p>Certain Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany) (Preliminary Objections) 89</p> <p>Dubsky v. Government of Ireland and Others 529</p> <p>Habib v. Commonwealth of Australia 478</p> <p>Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities (Case T-85/09) 167, 406</p> <p>Kadi v. Council of the European Union; Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P) 167, 309</p> <p>Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-315/01) 167, 250</p> <p>Kadi Cases 167</p> <p>Liechtenstein v. Germany (Certain Property) (Preliminary Objections) 89</p> <p>Liechtenstein/Pieter van Laer Painting Cases 1, 26, 32, 89</p> | <p>Mike Campbell (Pvt) Ltd, William Michael Campbell and Others v. Republic of Zimbabwe (SADCT Case No 2/2007) (Dissenting Opinions) 475</p> <p>O'Donnell (a minor suing by her mother and next friend) and Others v. South Dublin County Council 579</p> <p>Othman v. European Council and Another (United Kingdom intervening) (Case T-318/01) 454</p> <p>Prince Hans-Adam II v. Municipality of Cologne (Case No 22 U 215/95) [Germany] 1</p> <p>Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein, <i>In re</i> (Case No 2 BvR 1981/97) [Germany] 26</p> <p>Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Admissibility) [European Court of Human Rights] 32, 38</p> <p>Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Merits) [European Court of Human Rights] 32, 53</p> <p>R (Youssef) v. HM Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) 641</p> <p>Youssef Case 641</p> <p>Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-306/01) 167, 180</p> |
|---|---|

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS AND  
TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES) AND  
COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word “note” in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

### I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

<p><i>Court of First Instance of the European Communities</i> see also <i>General Court of the European Union</i></p>	<p>2001 Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Merits) 32, 53</p>
<p>2005 Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-315/01) 167, 250 Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-306/01) 167, 180</p>	<p><i>General Court of the European Union</i> see also <i>Court of First Instance of the European Communities</i></p> <p>2010 Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities (Case T-85/09) 167, 406</p>
<p>2009 Othman v. European Council and Another (United Kingdom intervening) (Case T-318/01) 454</p> <p><i>Court of Justice of the European Communities</i></p>	<p><i>International Court of Justice</i></p> <p>2005 Certain Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany) (Judgment on Preliminary Objections) 89</p>
<p>2008 Kadi v. Council of the European Union; Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P) 167, 309</p> <p><i>European Court of Human Rights</i></p>	<p><i>Southern African Development Community Tribunal</i></p> <p>2008 Mike Campbell (Pvt) Ltd, William Michael Campbell and Others v. Republic of Zimbabwe (Case No 2/2007) (Dissenting Opinions) 475</p>
<p>2000 Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Admissibility) 32, 38</p>	

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi

## TABLE OF CASES

## II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

<i>Australia</i>	<i>United Kingdom</i>
2010	2010
Habib v. Commonwealth of Australia 478	Ahmed and Others v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) (Nos 1 and 2) 641
<i>Germany, Federal Republic of</i>	Al-Ghabra v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) 641
1996	Regina (Youssef) v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) 641
Prince Hans-Adam II v. Municipality of Cologne (Case No 22 U 215/95) 1	
1998	<i>United Kingdom, England</i>
<i>In re</i> Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein (Case No 2 BvR 1981/97) 26	2006
<i>Ireland</i>	<i>Re</i> AY Bank Ltd (in liquidation); AY Bank Ltd (in liquidation) v. Bosnia and Herzegovina and Others 614
2005	
Dubsky v. Government of Ireland and Others 529	
2007	
O'Donnell (a minor suing by her mother and next friend) and Others v. South Dublin County Council 579	



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## DIGEST OF CASES

## List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics.  
For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air	<i>International Tribunals</i>
Aliens	Jurisdiction
Arbitration	Lakes and Landlocked Seas
Canals	Nationality
Claims	Recognition
Comity	<i>Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law</i>
Conciliation	Reprisals and Countermeasures
Consular Relations	Rivers
Damages	Sea
Diplomatic Relations	Sources of International Law
<i>Economics, Trade and Finance</i>	Space
Environment	State Immunity
Expropriation	State Responsibility
Extradition	<i>State Succession</i>
Governments	<i>States</i>
<i>Human Rights</i>	Territory
<i>International Court of Justice</i>	<i>Terrorism</i>
International Criminal Law	<i>Treaties</i>
<i>International Organizations</i>	<i>War and Armed Conflict</i>

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee  
Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 149

Page

### Economics, Trade and Finance

Economic sanctions — Consequences — European Community law — Implementation in Community law of sanctions imposed by United Nations Security Council — Security Council Resolutions 1267 (1999), 1333 (2000) and 1390 (2002) — Council Regulation (EC) No 881/2002 — Duty to take measures to freeze funds and other financial assets of individuals and entities associated with Usama bin Laden, Al-Qaeda network and Taliban — Designation by Sanctions Committee — Applicants suspected of supporting terrorism — Applicants listed by Sanctions Committee — Applicants listed in Annex I to Regulation — Applicants' funds frozen in European Community — Applicants seeking annulment of Regulation — Whether effects of Regulation to be maintained on applicants — Court of First Instance (Second Chamber), Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) and General Court (Seventh Chamber) of the European Communities

*Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-306/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-315/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P); Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities (Case T-85/09)*

167

Economic sanctions — Freezing of funds pursuant to United Nations Security Council Resolutions — Implementation within European Community — Council Regulation (EC) No 881/2002 — Applicant seeking annulment of contested regulation in so far as it concerned him — Whether annulment with immediate effect capable of seriously and irreversibly prejudicing effectiveness of restrictive measures imposed by regulation — Court of First Instance of the European Communities (Seventh Chamber)

*Othman v. European Council and Another (United Kingdom intervening) (Case T-318/01)*

454

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xx

DIGEST OF CASES

**Economics, Trade and Finance** (*cont.*)

Economic sanctions — Orders in Council imposing asset-freezing regime — Freezing of funds, economic resources and financial services without time-limit — Sanctions Committee established by Security Council Resolution 1267 (1999) having consolidated list — Persons named on list subject to freezing of funds, assets and economic resources — Effects of restriction on designated persons and third parties under Orders in Council — United Kingdom, Supreme Court

*Ahmed and Others v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) (Nos 1 and 2); al-Ghabra v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening); Regina (Youssef) v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening)*

641

**Human Rights**

Due process — Right to be heard — Right to effective legal remedy — Right to property — Impact of restrictive measures on rights and freedoms of applicant — Whether contested regulation adopted according to procedure where applicant's rights infringed — Extent, effects and justification, if any, of restriction of use of right to property — Applicant seeking annulment of contested regulation — Court of First Instance of the European Communities (Seventh Chamber)

*Othman v. European Council and Another (United Kingdom intervening) (Case T-318/01)*

454

Inhuman or degrading treatment — Right to respect for family and private life — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Articles 3 and 8 — Interpretation and application — Whether States have an obligation to intervene actively to protect Article 8 rights — Limited nature of positive obligation to intervene — Limited nature of State resources — Statutory protection of Convention rights — No breach of statutory duty — Gap in legislative protection — Liability of State authorities under Convention where no breach of statutory duty — Duty of State authorities to act in manner compatible with Convention — Ireland, High Court

*O'Donnell (a minor suing by her mother and next friend) and Others v. South Dublin County Council*

579

Prohibition of discrimination — Admissibility of applicant's complaint — Nationality — Whether discrimination against

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## DIGEST OF CASES

xxi

applicant as Liechtenstein national — Article 14 of European Convention on Human Rights complementing other substantive provisions of Convention and its Protocols — Whether Article 14 applicable — Whether Germany violating Article 14 — European Court of Human Rights (Fourth Section) (Grand Chamber)

*Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Admissibility) (Merits)*

32

Protection of rights — Right to respect for family and private life — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 8 — Duty of State authorities to take account of traditions and sensitivities of nomadic peoples — Irish travellers — Accommodation — Provision of accommodation for Irish travellers by local housing authority — Extent of duty to provide caravan accommodation — Living conditions and circumstances — Plaintiffs with disabilities and special needs living in overcrowded and unsuitable conditions — Circumstances posing risk and affecting privacy and personal dignity of plaintiffs — Whether failure of housing authority to improve living conditions breaching Article 8 — Whether State authorities obligated to provide additional caravan to alleviate plaintiffs' suffering — Ireland, High Court

*O'Donnell (a minor suing by her mother and next friend) and Others v. South Dublin County Council*

579

Right to enjoyment of property — Right to privacy — Right to family life — Right of access to effective remedy — Whether Order in Council incompatible with fundamental rights at common law — Whether Order in Council incompatible with rights protected by European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 under Human Rights Act 1998 — Whether measures seriously interfering with individual's fundamental rights justifiable — United Kingdom, Supreme Court

*Ahmed and Others v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) (Nos 1 and 2); al-Ghabra v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening); Regina (Youssef) v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening)*

641

Right to a fair trial — Admissibility of applicant's complaint — German courts' decisions declaring applicant's action inadmissible under Chapter 6, Article 3(1) and (3) of Settlement Convention — Whether amounting to denial of access to court — Whether limitation on applicant's right pursuant to

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxii

## DIGEST OF CASES

**Human Rights** (*cont.*)

legitimate aim — Whether proportionate — Interpretation and application of Chapter 6, Article 3(1) and (3) of Settlement Convention — Whether applicant's interest outweighing public interest — Whether impairment to very essence of applicant's right of access to court — Whether applicant having a fair hearing in Federal Constitutional Court — Whether Germany violating Article 6(1) of European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — European Court of Human Rights (Fourth Section) (Grand Chamber)

*Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Admissibility) (Merits)*

32

Right to property — Admissibility of applicant's complaint — Confiscation of painting belonging to applicant's father by former Czechoslovakia in 1946 while on Czechoslovak territory — German courts declaring applicant's claims of ownership of painting inadmissible — Germany returning painting to Czech Republic — Whether interference with applicant's "possessions" — Whether Germany violating Article 1 of Protocol No 1 to European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — European Court of Human Rights (Fourth Section) (Grand Chamber)

*Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Admissibility) (Merits)*

32

Rights of defence — Right to be heard — Right to effective judicial review — Right to property — Whether restrictions justified — Principle of proportionality — Guidelines provided by international human rights instruments in which Member States of European Community involved — European Convention on Human Rights — Whether United Nations sanctions system adequately protecting fundamental rights — Nature and effect of restrictive measures on applicants — Whether infringement of applicants' fundamental rights — Court of First Instance (Second Chamber), Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) and General Court (Seventh Chamber) of the European Communities

*Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-306/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-315/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union (Joined Cases*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

*C-402/05P and C-415/05P*; *Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities (Case T-85/09)* 167

Torture — Prohibition of torture a *jus cogens* rule — Whether status of rule affecting justiciability of alleged breach — Detention of applicant at Guantánamo Bay — Allegations of torture — Australia, Federal Court

*Habib v. Commonwealth of Australia* 478

**International Court of Justice**

Jurisdiction — Limitations *ratione temporis* — European Convention for the Peaceful Settlement of Disputes — Exclusion of disputes relating to facts or situations prior to entry into force of the Convention — Source or real cause of dispute — Beneš Decrees adopted by Czechoslovakia at the end of Second World War — Confiscation of property of Germans irrespective of nationality — Litigation in Germany in 1990s regarding painting confiscated under Decrees — Convention on the Settlement of Matters Arising out of the War and the Occupation, 1952 — German courts refusing remedy to original owner on basis that Settlement Convention applicable — Whether real cause of dispute the Decrees and the Settlement Convention or the decisions of the German courts — International Court of Justice

*Certain Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany) (Judgment on Preliminary Objections)* 89

**International Organizations**

European Community — Implementation of sanctions imposed by United Nations Security Council — Security Council Resolutions 1267 (1999), 1333 (2000) and 1390 (2002) — Council Regulation (EC) No 881/2002 giving effect to SCRs in Community — Whether Community having competence to adopt Council Regulation — Legal basis of Regulation — Whether Articles 60 and 301 of European Community Treaty appropriate and sufficient legal basis — Whether Article 308 of EC Treaty providing legal basis — Whether Community act applying generally — Whether infringement of Article 249 of EC Treaty — EC Treaty constitutional principles — Requirement that Community acts respect fundamental rights — Listing of applicants in Annex I of Regulation — Whether Regulation breaching fundamental rights of applicants — Validity of Regulation — Court of First Instance (Second Chamber),

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxiv

DIGEST OF CASES

**International Organizations** (*cont.*)

Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) and General Court (Seventh Chamber) of the European Communities

*Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-306/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-315/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P); Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities (Case T-85/09)*

167

United Nations — Security Council — Security Council having primary responsibility for maintenance of international peace and security — Security Council Resolutions — Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 giving effect to SCR 1373 (2001) and SCR 1452 (2002) — Al-Qaida and Taliban (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 giving effect to series of SCRs including SCR 1452 (2002) — SCR 1267 (1999) establishing Sanctions Committee — Measures against individual suspected terrorists — United Kingdom, Supreme Court

*Ahmed and Others v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) (Nos 1 and 2); al-Ghabra v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening); Regina (Youssef) v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening)*

641

United Nations — Security Council — Security Council having primary responsibility for maintenance of international peace and security — Threat of international terrorism — Decision under Chapter VII of United Nations Charter — Economic sanctions — Security Council Resolutions 1267 (1999), 1333 (2000) and 1390 (2002) — Sanctions Committee — Listing of applicants — Duty on Member States to implement SCRs — United Nations Charter, Article 25 — Obligation to give effect to decision of Security Council prevailing over other international obligations — United Nations Charter, Article 103 — Court of First Instance (Second Chamber), Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) and General Court (Seventh Chamber) of the European Communities

*Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-306/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-315/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Al*



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## DIGEST OF CASES

xxv

*Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P); Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities (Case T-85/09)* 167

United Nations — Security Council Resolutions — Restrictive measures directed against certain individuals and entities to combat terrorism — Freezing of funds — Implementation required by European Community — Council Regulation (EC) No 881/2002 — Applicant listed in Annex I to Regulation as person associated with Usama bin Laden — Applicant seeking annulment of contested regulation in so far as it concerned him — Whether Council Regulation (EC) No 881/2002 breaching applicant's fundamental human rights — Court of First Instance of the European Communities (Seventh Chamber)

*Othman v. European Council and Another (United Kingdom intervening) (Case T-318/01)* 454

**International Tribunals**

Court of Justice of the European Communities — Judicial review of acts of Community institutions — EC Treaty constitutional principles — Requirement that Community acts respect fundamental rights — Whether act reviewable — Standard of review — Whether Court of Justice having authority to review Community act giving effect to United Nations Security Council Resolutions — Whether Court thereby reviewing Resolutions — Whether basis in EC Treaty for immunity from jurisdiction for Regulation — Whether Regulation lawful — Court of First Instance (Second Chamber), Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) and General Court (Seventh Chamber) of the European Communities

*Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-306/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities (Case T-315/01); Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P); Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities (Case T-85/09)* 167

**Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law**

Act of State doctrine — Alleged violations of international law and Australian law by Australian officials — Allegation that Australian

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxvi

DIGEST OF CASES

**Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law** (*cont.*)

officials aided and abetted torture and ill-treatment by officials of foreign States — Whether justiciable in Australian courts — Australia, Federal Court

*Habib v. Commonwealth of Australia* 478

Relations between States — Justiciability — Separation of powers — Matters of war and participation in war — Need for court to exercise restraint in assessment of war and participation in war — Ireland, High Court

*Dubsky v. Government of Ireland and Others* 529

Settlement Convention, Chapter 6, Article 3 — Interpretation — Whether excluding German jurisdiction — German courts dismissing applicant's complaint — Confiscation of painting belonging to applicant's father — Whether constituting measure under Chapter 6, Article 3(1) and (3) of Settlement Convention — Whether provisions set aside by Treaty on Final Settlement, 1990 — Interest of applicant versus vital public interest — Whether German courts' interpretation of municipal law, including as to international law, compatible with European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 — European Court of Human Rights (Fourth Section) (Grand Chamber)

*Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Admissibility) (Merits)* 32

Treaties — Effect in domestic law — Federal Republic of Germany — Postwar treaties — Treaty on the Final Settlement with respect to Germany, 1990 — Constitutional status — Whether part of German law — Federal Republic of Germany, Court of Appeal of Cologne

*Prince Hans-Adam II v. Municipality of Cologne (Case No 22 U 215/95)* 1

Treaties — Effect in domestic law — Federal Republic of Germany — Postwar treaties — Treaty on the Final Settlement with respect to Germany, 1990 — Constitutional status — Whether part of German law — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Constitutional Court (*BVerfG*)

*In re Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein (Case No 2 BvR 1981/97)* 26

Treaties — State succession — Non-justiciability — Transactions between foreign States — Treaty between foreign States not

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

incorporated into English law — Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia — Dissolution — Succession to assets — Agreement on Succession Issues — Bank incorporated in the United Kingdom — Accounts in the name of central bank of Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia — Whether application to determine to whom funds to be paid justiciable — England, High Court, Chancery Division

*Re AY Bank Ltd (in liquidation); AY Bank Ltd (in liquidation) v. Bosnia and Herzegovina and Others*

614

Treaties — United Nations Charter, 1945 — United Nations Act 1946 giving effect to United Nations Charter in United Kingdom domestic law — Orders in Council made under Section 1 of United Nations Act 1946 — Whether Treasury empowered by Section 1(1) of United Nations Act 1946 to introduce asset-freezing regime by means of Orders in Council — Freezing of assets of individual suspected terrorists — Executive orders without parliamentary scrutiny — Separation of powers — Intention of Parliament — Orders in Council giving effect to United Nations Security Council Resolutions — Terrorism (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (“TO”) — Reasonable suspicion test — Al-Qaida and Taliban (United Nations Measures) Order 2006 (“AQO”) — Validity of TO and AQO — Whether TO and AQO ultra vires Section 1 of United Nations Act 1946 — Principle of legality — Fundamental rights — Whether terms going beyond those required by Security Council Resolution — Scope of power conferred by Section 1 of United Nations Act 1946 — Whether restrictive measures by executive order rather than primary legislation legitimate — Whether TO and AQO should be quashed — Application for suspension of court order — Whether suspension appropriate — United Kingdom, Supreme Court

*Ahmed and Others v. Her Majesty’s Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) (Nos 1 and 2); al-Ghabra v. Her Majesty’s Treasury (JUSTICE intervening); Regina (Youssef) v. Her Majesty’s Treasury (JUSTICE intervening)*

641

United Nations — United Nations Charter — European Community — EC Treaty — Relationship between international legal order under United Nations and internal and autonomous Community legal order — Community act intending to give effect to international law obligations — Regulation implementing Resolution adopted by Security Council under Chapter VII of United Nations Charter — Whether Community judicature excluded in principle from judicially

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxviii

DIGEST OF CASES

**Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law** (*cont.*)

reviewing Community act in light of fundamental freedoms — Judicial review being constitutional guarantee forming part of foundations of Community — Whether international agreement affecting allocated powers or legal autonomy of European Community — United Nations Charter, Article 103 — Court of First Instance (Second Chamber), Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) and General Court (Seventh Chamber) of the European Communities

*Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities* (Case T-306/01); *Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities* (Case T-315/01); *Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union* (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P); *Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities* (Case T-85/09)

167

**State Succession**

Dissolution of State — Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia — Succession to property located outside Yugoslavia — Succession and continuity — England, High Court, Chancery Division

*Re AY Bank Ltd (in liquidation)*; *AY Bank Ltd (in liquidation) v. Bosnia and Herzegovina and Others*

614

**States**

Germany — Status under allied occupation — Resumption of full sovereignty by united Germany — Effect on postwar treaties — Convention on the Settlement of Matters Arising out of the War and the Occupation, 1952 — Federal Republic of Germany, Court of Appeal of Cologne

*Prince Hans-Adam II v. Municipality of Cologne* (Case No 22 U 215/95)

1

Germany — Status under allied occupation — Resumption of full sovereignty by united Germany — Effect on postwar treaties — Convention on the Settlement of Matters Arising out of the War and the Occupation, 1952 — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Constitutional Court (*BVerfG*)

*In re Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein* (Case No 2 BvR 1981/97)

26

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## DIGEST OF CASES

xxix

**Terrorism**

Suppression of international terrorism — Maintenance of international peace and security — Security Council adopting Resolutions under Chapter VII of United Nations Charter — Implementation of Security Council Resolution within European Community — Council Common Position reflecting UN Security Council Resolutions — EC Community adopting EC Regulations to give effect to Council Common Position — Court of First Instance of the European Communities (Seventh Chamber)

*Othman v. European Council and Another (United Kingdom intervening)* (Case T-318/01)

454

Threat of international terrorism — Maintenance of international peace and security — Security Council — Chapter VII of United Nations Charter — Security Council Resolutions — Economic sanctions — Enforcement — Freezing funds in fight against terrorism — Whether inappropriate or disproportionate — Whether annulment of EC Regulation with immediate effect capable of seriously and irreversibly prejudicing effectiveness of measures — Whether judicial review disrupting United Nations sanctions system — Court of First Instance (Second Chamber), Court of Justice (Grand Chamber) and General Court (Seventh Chamber) of the European Communities

*Yusuf and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities* (Case T-306/01); *Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Commission of the European Communities* (Case T-315/01); *Kadi v. Council of the European Union and Al Barakaat International Foundation v. Council of the European Union* (Joined Cases C-402/05P and C-415/05P); *Kadi v. Commission of the European Communities* (Case T-85/09)

167

United Nations — Creation of permanent international system for combating terrorism — Security Council Resolutions — Security Council further broadening approach following terrorist attacks on United States of America on 11 September 2001 — Suppression and prevention of financing and preparation of acts of terrorism — Implementation in United Kingdom by executive orders — Restrictive measures against individual suspected terrorists — Encroachments upon personal

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02180-8 - International Law Reports: Volume 149

Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, Sir Christopher Greenwood and Karen Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxx

## DIGEST OF CASES

**Terrorism** (*cont.*)

liberty — Validity of executive orders — United Kingdom, Supreme Court

*Ahmed and Others v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening) (Nos 1 and 2); al-Ghabra v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening); Regina (Youssef) v. Her Majesty's Treasury (JUSTICE intervening)*

641

**Treaties**

Application — Termination — Convention on the Settlement of Matters Arising out of the War and the Occupation, 1952 — Effect in German law — Relationship with Treaty on the Final Settlement with respect to Germany, 1990 — Termination by exchange of notes, 1990 — Federal Republic of Germany, Court of Appeal of Cologne

*Prince Hans-Adam II v. Municipality of Cologne (Case No 22 U 215/95)*

1

Application — Termination — Convention on the Settlement of Matters Arising out of the War and the Occupation, 1952 — Effect in German law — Relationship with Treaty on the Final Settlement with respect to Germany, 1990 — Termination by exchange of notes, 1990 — Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Constitutional Court (*BVerfG*)

*In re Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein (Case No 2 BvR 1981/97)*

26

Interpretation — Jurisdiction — Settlement Convention — Chapter 6, Article 3(1) and (3) of Settlement Convention excluding German jurisdiction — Treaty of 12 September 1990 on Final Settlement — Amendments to Treaty by Agreement of 27 and 28 September 1990 — Suspension and termination of Settlement Convention — Preservation of Chapter 6, Article 3(1) and (3) of Settlement Convention with respect to Germany — Exclusion of German jurisdiction — European Court of Human Rights (Fourth Section) (Grand Chamber)

*Prince Hans-Adam II of Liechtenstein v. Germany (Application No 42527/98) (Admissibility) (Merits)*

32

United Nations Charter, 1945 — United Kingdom's international obligations under United Nations Charter — Whether prevailing over United Kingdom's obligations under European