Regimes of Ethnicity and Nationhood in Germany, Russia, and Turkey

This is a book about what it meant to be German, Soviet, Russian, and Turkish in the twentieth century, and how that definition radically changed at the turn of the twenty-first century. Germany’s ethnic citizenship law, the Soviet Union’s inscription of ethnic origins in personal identification documents, and Turkey’s prohibition on the public use of minority languages, all put in place in the early twentieth century, underpinned the definition of “nationhood” in these countries. Despite many challenges from political and societal actors, these policies did not change for many decades, until around the turn of the twenty-first century, when Russia removed ethnicity from the internal passport, Germany changed its citizenship law, and Turkish public television began to broadcast in minority languages. How did such tremendous changes occur? This book develops a new typology of “regimes of ethnicity,” whereby the ideal-types of monoethnic, multiethnic, and antiethnic regimes are defined and identified. This new conceptualization connects the study of nation building to studies of ethnic diversity and citizenship, while providing a coherent typology of state policies on ethnicity that accommodates the full range of variation across cases. Using this new typology and a close study of primary documents and numerous interviews, Şener Aktürk argues that the coincidence of three key factors – counterelites, new discourses, and hegemonic majorities – explains successful change in state policies toward ethnicity.

Şener Aktürk is an Assistant Professor at Koç University in Istanbul. He holds degrees from the University of Chicago (BA, MA) and the University of California, Berkeley (MA, PhD). He has spent extended periods in Vienna, Berlin, and Moscow for language study and doctoral research. Prior to his current appointment, he was a postdoctoral Fellow at the Davis Center for Russian and Eurasian Studies and a visiting lecturer in the Department of Government at Harvard University. He is a recipient of a Marie Curie International Reintegration Grant from the European Commission. He has published more than thirty articles in international and national refereed academic journals including World Politics, Post-Soviet Affairs, European Journal of Sociology, Middle Eastern Studies, Nationalities Papers, Ab Imperio, Turkish Studies, Insight Turkey, and Theoria. He has authored chapters in various edited books published in Turkey, Russia, Hungary, and the United States.
Problems of International Politics

Series Editors

Keith Darden, Yale University and NUS College, Singapore
Ian Shapiro, Yale University

The series seeks manuscripts central to the understanding of international politics that are empirically rich and conceptually innovative. It is interested in works that illuminate the evolving character of nation-states within the international system. It sets out three broad areas for investigation: (1) identity, security, and conflict; (2) democracy; and (3) justice and distribution.

Titles in the Series

Donald Horowitz, Constitutional Change and Democracy in Indonesia
Steven Levitsky and Lucan A. Way, Competitive Authoritarianism: Hybrid Regimes after the Cold War
Regimes of Ethnicity and Nationhood in Germany, Russia, and Turkey

ŞENER AKTÜRK

Koç University, Istanbul
Canım annem, babam, ve kardeşim
Rukiye, Şerif, ve Sibel Aktürk’e . . .
Contents

List of Tables, Figures, Graphs, and Maps  xi  
List of Abbreviations  xv  
Acknowledgments  xix  

PART I. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND EMPIRICAL OVERVIEW  
1 Regimes of Ethnicity: Comparative Analysis of Germany, the Soviet Union, Post-Soviet Russia, and Turkey  3  

PART II. GERMANY  
2 The Challenges to the Monoethnic Regime in Germany, 1955–1982  47  
3 The Construction of an Assimilationist Discourse and Political Hegemony: Transition from a Monoethnic to an Antiethnic Regime in Germany, 1982–2000  74  

PART III. TURKEY  
4 Challenges to the Ethnicity Regime in Turkey: Alevi and Kurdish Demands for Recognition, 1923–1980  117  
5 From Social Democracy to Islamic Multiculturalism: Failed and Successful Attempts to Reform the Ethnicity Regime in Turkey, 1980–2009  163  

PART IV. SOVIET UNION AND THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION  
6 The Nation That Wasn’t There? Sovetskii Narod Discourse, Nation Building, and Passport Ethnicity, 1953–1983  197  

PART V. CONCLUSION
8  Dynamics of Persistence and Change in Ethnicity Regimes  261

Bibliography  275
Index  295
## List of Tables, Figures, Graphs, and Maps

### Tables

1. Most Different Systems Analysis: Germany, the USSR and Russia, and Turkey  
   page 6
2. Seven Symptoms of Ethnic Regime Type: Membership (1–3) and Expression (4–7)  
   11
   15
4. Regimes of Ethnicity in Germany, the Soviet Union, the Russian Federation, and Turkey  
   16
5. Challenges to the Status Quo and the Main Issue Areas of Contestation in Ethnic Politics in Germany, Turkey, the Soviet Union, and Russia  
   17
6. Configurations That Would Falsify My Theory of Ethnic Regime Change  
   26
7. Average Time in Office of Native Party Secretaries in Ethnic Republics  
   34
8. Sources of Change in State Policies on Ethnicity: Germany, Russia, and Turkey  
   40
9. German Federal Election and the Distribution of Seats in the Bundestag, 1969  
   53
10. German Federal Election and the Distribution of Seats in the Bundestag, 1976  
    54
11. German Federal Election and the Distribution of Seats in the Bundestag, 1980  
    55
12. The Breakdown of Foreigners Living in Germany (as of the end of 1978)  
    61
13. The Distribution of Foreigners in FRG by State of Residence (as of September 30, 1978)  
    62
List of Tables, Figures, Graphs, and Maps

14 The Rise in the Number of Foreigners with Secure Forms of Residence under the Late SPD-FDP and Early CDU/CSU-FDP Periods 69
15 German Federal Election and the Distribution of Seats in the Bundestag, 1983 76
16 Who Is a German? Wars of Discourse: Views on Ethnic Diversity and Nationhood before and after the New Citizenship Law 100
17 German Federal Election and the Distribution of Seats in the Bundestag, 1998 101
19 Muslim Population and Official Minorities in Turkey, 1927–2005 125
20 Languages of Muslim Ethnic Groups in Turkey, 1927–1965 126
21 Provinces with the Largest Proportion of Kurdish Populations 127
22 Results of the 1950 General Elections in Turkey 134
23 Results of the 1950 Elections in Provinces with Large Kurdish Populations 135
24 Results of the 1950 Elections in Provinces with Large Alevi Populations 135
25 Results of the 1961 General Elections 145
26 Fifteen Provinces Where YTP Had the Best Electoral Performance in 1961 145
27 TIP Vote in Some Provinces of Alevi and Kurdish Concentration in 1965 152
28 Provinces Where the TBP Received More Than 5 Percent of the Vote in 1969 157
29 National Salvation Party (MSP) in the 1977 Elections in Eastern Anatolia 162
30 1987 General Election Results in Southeastern Anatolian Provinces 169
31 1991 General Election Results in Southeastern Anatolian Provinces 171
32 2002 Elections in Eighteen Provinces with Large Kurdish Populations 177
33 AKP, DEHAP, and CHP Support in Eighteen Eastern Anatolian Provinces in 2007 186
34 Key Terms of Nationalities Policy in the Journal Kömmunist, 1953–1964 206
35 Key Terms in the Titles of Articles in Kömmunist, 1965–1982 218
36 Competing Discourses of Ethnic Diversity in the Soviet Union, 1953–1991 219
List of Tables, Figures, Graphs, and Maps

37 Battle over Passport Ethnicity: Beyond the Liberal-Illiberal Divide 236

Figures
1 Deductive Test of “Membership and Expression” 8
2 Three Ethnicity Regimes: Monoethnic, Multiethnic, and Antiethnic 8
3 Modes of Governing Ethnic Diversity in the Three Ethnicity Regimes 13
4 The Missing Link: Regimes of Ethnicity Connecting Nation Building, Ethnicity, Immigration, and Citizenship 18
5 Six Possible Transitions between Ethnicity Regimes 19
6 The Main Political Challenge to the Ethnicity Regime in Turkey: Against Assimilation, toward Consociation 121

Graphs
1 Number of Asylum Seekers in Germany, 1975–1995 93
2 Ethnic German Immigrants (Aussiedler) in Germany, 1986–1993 94
3 Xenophobic Criminal Offenses in Germany, 1991–1998 96
4 Naturalization of Foreigners in Germany, 1994–2005 105
5 Naturalization of Turkish Citizens in Germany, 1994–2005 106

Maps
1 Kurdish Population Estimate in Turkey by Province, 1990s 128
2 Map of the Provinces Where the TBP Received More Than 5 Percent of the Vote in 1969 158
3 Support for Kurdish Nationalist DEHAP in 2002 General Elections 181
4 Support for Kurdish Nationalist Independents in 2007 General Elections 181
5 Support for Kurdish Nationalist DTP in 2009 Provincial Elections 182
## List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Germany</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BVFG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BVG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDU/CSU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DGB</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NRW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RfM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TGD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## List of Abbreviations

### Turkey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AKP</td>
<td>Justice and Development Party (Adalet ve Kalkınma Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANAP</td>
<td>Motherland Party (Anavatan Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AP</td>
<td>Justice Party (Adalet Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBP</td>
<td>Great Unity Party (Büyük Birlik Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDP</td>
<td>Peace and Democracy Party (Barış ve Demokrasi Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHP</td>
<td>Republican Peoples’ Party (Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CKMP</td>
<td>Republican Peasant Nation Party (Cumhuriyetçi Köylü Millet Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDKO</td>
<td>Revolutionary Eastern Cultural Hearths (Devrimci Doğu Kültür Ocakları)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEHAP</td>
<td>Democratic People’s Party (Demokratik Halk Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DGM</td>
<td>State Security Court (Devlet Güvenlik Mahkemesi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRA</td>
<td>Directorate of Religious Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSP</td>
<td>Democratic Leftist Party (Demokratik Sol Parti)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DTP</td>
<td>Democratic Society Party (Demokratik Toplum Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DYP</td>
<td>True Path Party (Doğru Yol Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FP</td>
<td>Virtue Party (Fazilet Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAK-PAR</td>
<td>The Right and Liberties Party (Hak ve Özgürlükler Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEP</td>
<td>People’s Labor Party (Halkın Emek Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HP</td>
<td>Liberty Party (Hürriyet Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HP</td>
<td>Populist Party (Halkçı Parti)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Reformist Democracy Party (İslahatçı Demokrasi Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IHD</td>
<td>Human Rights Association (İnsan Hakları Derneği)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDP</td>
<td>Nationalist Democracy Party (Milliyetçi Demokrasi Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHP</td>
<td>Nationalist Action Party (Milliyetçi Hareket Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MP</td>
<td>Member of Parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSP</td>
<td>National Salvation Party (Milli Selamet Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATO</td>
<td>North Atlantic Treaty Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKK</td>
<td>Kurdistan Workers’ Party (Partiya Karkerên Kurdistan)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RP</td>
<td>Welfare Party (Refaş Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHP</td>
<td>Social Democratic Populist Party (Sosyal Demokrat Halkçı Parti)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SP</td>
<td>Felicity Party (Saadet Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBMM</td>
<td>Grand National Assembly of Turkey (Türkiye Büyük Millet Meclisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBP</td>
<td>Turkey’s Unity Party (Türkiye Birlik Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIP</td>
<td>Turkey’s Labor Party (Türkiye İşçi Partisi)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRT</td>
<td>Turkish Radio and Television (Türkiye Radyo Televizyon Kurumu)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YTP</td>
<td>New Turkey Party (Yeni Türkiye Partisi)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Abbreviations

The Soviet Union and the Russian Federation

CDPSP  Current Digest of Post-Soviet Press
CPRF  Communist Party of the Russian Federation
CPSU  Communist Party of the Soviet Union
GARF  State Archive of the Russian Federation (Gosudarstvennyi arkhiv Rossiiskii Federatsii)
IEA  Institute of Ethnology and Anthropology
IML  Institute of Marxism-Leninism
JAO  Jewish Autonomous Oblast
KGB  State Security Committee (Komitet Gosudarstvennoi Bezopasnosti)
RGANI  Russian State Archive for Contemporary History (Rossiiskii Gosudarstvennyi arkhiv noveishei istorii)
RGASPI  Russian State Archive for Socio-Political History (Rossiiskii Gosudarstvennyi arkhiv sotsial'no-politicheskoi istorii)
USSR  Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
Acknowledgments

The conceptualization, research, and writing of this book required the pooling of substantial resources in four countries on three continents over many years. I have accumulated many debts along the way, and I am grateful to everybody who made this – at the beginning seemingly insurmountable – undertaking possible.

This book began as a dissertation at the University of California, Berkeley. My greatest debts are to the cochairs of my dissertation committee, M. Steven Fish and J. Nicholas Ziegler. Steve has supported my intellectual curiosity ever since my arrival at Berkeley in 2003. At key moments in the development of this work, he helped me refocus toward the broader questions of political science and comparative politics to which this endeavor pertains. The comparison at the origin of this dissertation was first conceived in a seminar on European politics I took with Nick. His mentorship has transformed the project in its various aspects ever since. Nick and Steve have been excellent mentors for me, both in my research and in my teaching at Berkeley. George W. Breslauer has provided timely commentary and suggestions not only on the substantive content but also on the presentation of this work. Yuri Slezkine inspired me through his work on ethnicity and nationalism in the Soviet Union and around the world, while providing indispensable help during my fieldwork in Moscow. The unflinching support and encouragement of my dissertation committee was essential for the completion of this book.

The manuscript for this book first benefited from the scrutiny of friends and colleagues at the Institute for Qualitative Research Methods (IQRM) at Arizona State University in January 2006, followed by the Dissertation Research Workshop led by Paul Pierson at UC Berkeley in the spring of 2006. Apart from the Department of Political Science, the Berkeley Program in Soviet and Post-Soviet Studies (BPS) provided institutional support for my intellectual endeavors at large and served as a forum at which I could present and receive feedback on multiple chapters of this manuscript over the years. BPS also provided crucial financial support at various stages in my graduate studies and
was a place where I befriended many great minds, including fellow graduate students and faculty. I thank Ned Walker, the executive director of BPS, who also commented on several draft chapters of this manuscript, and the BPS staff, for their help. I thank the Institute of International Studies at UC Berkeley for the John L. Simpson Memorial Research Fellowship in International and Comparative Studies, which enabled me to undertake the necessary fieldwork for my dissertation in 2007, and the Allan Sharlin Memorial Award, which supported me at the writing stage.

Dominique Arel, Ahmet Kuru, Olivier Roy, Leonardo Arriola, Harris Mylonas, Jennifer Dixon, Ja Ian Chong, Charles King, Adnan Naseemullah, Jonathan Chow, Neophytos Loizides, Elise Massicard, Peter Rutland, Steve Sabol, and Hakan Yavuz commented on various papers that were draft chapters of this book in different settings.

The Davis Center for Russian and Eurasian Studies at Harvard University provided me with the opportunity to work on this manuscript and solicit further comments and criticisms in public talks and seminars. I thank its director, Timothy Colton, and associate director, Lis Tarlow, for making this possible. Terry Martin, Dmitry Gorenburg, Prerna Singh, Cemal Kafadar, Ceren Belge, Lenore Martin, Oxana Shevel, Serhii Plokhi, Kelly O’Neill, Jerry Easter, Jennifer Howk, and the participants in the Comparative Politics workshop and the Turkey in the Modern World series, both at the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs, commented on parts of this manuscript.

The people who deserve the greatest gratitude for the success of my fieldwork are my interviewees, who took time off from their very busy schedules to talk to a graduate student from California whom they had not known before. These included former ministers in the German, Russian, and Turkish governments; members of the parliament from different political parties; civil society leaders; intellectuals; scholars; and bureaucrats, among others. They are listed in the bibliography. In Germany, one of my interviewees, Safter Çınar, not only suffered through two lengthy interviews, but also followed up with many documents and sources afterward. Deniz Göktürk’s course (and later book) on multicultural Germany, her guidance during my stay in Berlin, and her comments on my argument were all very helpful. I thank Michael Minkenberg and the faculty and staff of the European University-Viadrina in Frankfurt-Oder, where I was a visiting scholar throughout my work in Germany, and where I presented my preliminary arguments. I am grateful to Mischa Gabowitsch, at whose invitation I presented the final version of my arguments on Germany at the Einstein Forum in Potsdam in May 2011, and to Werner Schiffauer who provided ample commentary on this occasion.

I thank Yuri Slezkine for opening the doors of Moscow’s archives for me, and for putting me in contact with my first interviewees. I am grateful to the staff of the Russian State Archive for Contemporary History, the Russian State Archive for Socio-Political History, and the State Archive of the Russian Federation for not giving up on me despite my broken Russian.
During my research in Turkey, I benefited twice from invitations to present my work at Boğaziçi University (in 2007 and 2008), Koç University, and Sabancı University. I thank Koray Çalışkan, Dilek Çınar, Mine Eder, Ersin Kalaycıoğlu, Selcan Kaynak, Fuat Keyman, Kemal Kirisci, Meltem Mütüleri Baş, Michael Mousseau, Sabri Sayarı, Murat Somer, Binnaz Toprak, Demet Yalçın-Mousseau, and Şuha Yılmaz for their comments and criticisms during these presentations. Aydın Komsuoğlu, Evangelos Liaras, and Orhan Postalçoğlu shared their wisdom and contacts. I thank Şemseddin Kılınç, the director of the General Files and Archives Directorate of the Grand National Assembly of Turkey, for giving me full access to the parliamentary proceedings. Cihan Tuğal commented on both the puzzle and the argument as it later developed, in Berkeley and in Istanbul.

Much less spectacular than an epic battle, the writing of a dissertation resembles a drawn-out military campaign over many years, where logistics play an important role. Over the years, many friends provided logistical support, hosted me during my presentations, and attended and commented on my presentations during conferences and other public presentations in New York, Chicago, and Berkeley. I thank them all. I thank my research assistant at Harvard, Kerry Eickholt, and my assistants at Koç, Melek Arı, İmren Borsuk, Mehmet Cansoy, and Gökçe Silman. I thank my students at Berkeley, Harvard, Koç, Boğaziçi, and Viadrina for providing stimuli on questions of ethnic and religious diversity that we tackled together.

Although this book was conceived and completed entirely at UC Berkeley, Harvard, and Koç University, I would also like to thank my mentors at the University of Chicago for sparking my interest in the study of politics. Lloyd Rudolph, Alexander Wendt, and Terry Nichols Clark supported my desire to become a social scientist. John Mearsheimer and Salim Yaqub advised me on my undergraduate and master’s theses, respectively. Ronald Grigor Suny and Michael Khodarkovsky introduced me to Russian and Soviet history and politics, leading me to focus on this area in graduate school.

I thank my editors at Cambridge University Press, Lew Bateman, Keith Darden, and Ian Shapiro. I am grateful to two anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press and three anonymous reviewers for World Politics, who provided very detailed and useful commentary on the arguments of this manuscript. The book includes some material that previously appeared in two articles: “Regimes of Ethnicity: Comparative Analysis of Germany, the Soviet Union/Post-Soviet Russia, and Turkey,” World Politics 63, no. 1 (2011): 115–64; and “Passport Identification and Nation-Building in Post-Soviet Russia,” Post-Soviet Affairs 26, no. 4 (2010): 314–41. I thank Cambridge University Press and Bellwether Publishing for permission to use those materials.

My greatest regret is that two close relatives who were with me at the beginning of this journey are not with us anymore. My beloved grandfather Abdükerim Yıldırım (1927–2006) passed away January 2, 2006, when I was on my way to the IQRM in Tempe, Arizona. He was the first one of the family
Acknowledgments

born in Turkey following the expulsion of Muslims from Greece in 1924 as part of a reciprocal “population exchange” between Greece and Turkey. His enthusiasm for my education was only rivaled by that of my parents. My uncle, Ali Aktürk (1947–2007) died while I was doing my fieldwork in Germany. I’ll miss them both.

It is the dedication and the love of my parents, Şerif and Rukiye Aktürk, and of my sister, Sibel, that propelled me to where I am today, despite the many challenges we faced together during my eleven years in the United States (1999–2010). I feel most fortunate for having such a wonderful family, but I have neither the words nor the space here to describe their commitment to my upbringing.

I dedicate this book to them.

Berkeley, California
Cambridge, Massachusetts
Izmit and Istanbul, Turkey
July 2011