# ATONEMENT AND SELF-SACRIFICE IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY NARRATIVE

Jan-Melissa Schramm explores the conflicted attitude of the Victorian novel to sacrifice and the act of substitution on which it depends. The Christian idea of redemption celebrated the suffering of the innocent: to embrace a life of metaphorical self-sacrifice was to follow in the footsteps of Christ's literal Passion. Moreover, the ethical agenda of fiction relied on the expansion of sympathy which imaginative substitution was seen to encourage. But Victorian criminal law sought to calibrate punishment and culpability as it repudiated archaic models of sacrifice that scapegoated the innocent. The tension between these models is registered creatively in the fiction of novelists such as Dickens, Gaskell, and Eliot, at a time when acts of Chartist protest, national sacrifices made during the Crimean War, and the extension of the franchise combined to call into question what it means for one man to 'stand for', and perhaps even 'die for', another.

JAN-MELISSA SCHRAMM is a Fellow in English at Trinity Hall, and an affiliated Lecturer in the Faculty of English at the University of Cambridge, where she teaches Victorian literature. She worked as a lawyer before undertaking doctoral research in English. She is the author of *Testimony and Advocacy in Victorian Law, Literature, and Theology* (Cambridge, 2000), as well as a number of articles and book chapters on representations of the law in the works of Dickens and Eliot, Victorian satire, and first-person narration. She is also co-editor of *Fictions of Knowledge: Fact, Evidence, Doubt* (2011).

### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY LITERATURE AND CULTURE

#### General editor

GILLIAN BEER, University of Cambridge

Editorial board

ISOBEL ARMSTRONG, Birkbeck, University of London KATE FLINT, Rutgers University CATHERINE GALLAGHER, University of California, Berkeley D. A. MILLER, University of California, Berkeley J. HILLIS MILLER, University of California, Irvine DANIEL PICK, Birkbeck, University of London MARY POOVEY, New York University SALLY SHUTTLEWORTH, University of Oxford HERBERT TUCKER, University of Virginia

Nineteenth-century British literature and culture have been rich fields for interdisciplinary studies. Since the turn of the twentieth century, scholars and critics have tracked the intersections and tensions between Victorian literature and the visual arts, politics, social organisation, economic life, technical innovations, scientific thought - in short, culture in its broadest sense. In recent years, theoretical challenges and historiographical shifts have unsettled the assumptions of previous scholarly synthesis and called into question the terms of older debates. Whereas the tendency in much past literary critical interpretation was to use the metaphor of culture as 'background', feminist, Foucauldian, and other analyses have employed more dynamic models that raise questions of power and of circulation. Such developments have reanimated the field. This series aims to accommodate and promote the most interesting work being undertaken on the frontiers of the field of nineteenth-century literary studies: work which intersects fruitfully with other fields of study such as history, or literary theory, or the history of science. Comparative as well as interdisciplinary approaches are welcomed.

A complete list of titles published will be found at the end of the book.

## ATONEMENT AND SELF-SACRIFICE IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY NARRATIVE

Jan-Melissa Schramm



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge св2 8ru, ик

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107021266

© Jan-Melissa Schramm 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Schramm, Jan-Melissa. Atonement and self-sacrifice in nineteenth-century narrative / Jan-Melissa Schramm. p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in nineteenth-century literature and culture; 80) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-02126-6 (hardback) I. English fiction – 19th century – History and criticism. 2. Self in literature. 3. Atonement in literature. 4. Self-sacrifice in literature. I. Title.

PR468.843837 2012

823′.809355–dc23 2012007346

18BN 978-1-107-02126-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

> For Nicholas Alexander (b. 2006) and Joshua Florian (b. 2008)

> The case of Barabbas ought to clear the doctrine of substitution from the charge of cruelty and exclusiveness, - for it shows us that the greatest sinners are not excluded from the benefits of Christ's death. Undoubtedly [substitution] is offensive to Pharisees of every denomination, for as these rest their hopes of God's favour on some merit in themselves, they do not like to accept even life eternal on the same terms as those on which a robber and murderer was delivered from temporal death: but such terms, humiliating as they are to human pride, are very full of comfort to those who are brought to feel themselves verily guilty and criminal in God's sight; to those who see themselves on a level with Barabbas, not perhaps as regards man's law, but as regards God's. Yes: when we are firmly convinced that on our own account we cannot expect a verdict of acquittal from a God who is of purer eyes than to behold iniquity, then our case instead of being hopeless becomes hopeful; then, like Barabbas, we rejoice to hear of one to take our place, - we acknowledge, as he must have acknowledged, that Jesus alone will be accepted in our stead; we learn to look first with hope and then with confidence at the bleeding substitute who suffered on Calvary's cross, in whom we see Divine justice satisfied, the claims of God's violated law met in full, and we understand what is meant by the words, 'faith in Christ'.

> > Hely Smith, Substitution (London: Hunt & Co., 1873), p. 12.

What does *donner la mort* mean in French? How does one give oneself death [*se donner la mort*]? How does one give it to oneself in the sense that putting oneself to death means dying while assuming responsibility for one's own death, committing suicide but also sacrificing oneself for another, dying for the other, thus perhaps giving one's life by giving oneself death, accepting the gift of death, such as Socrates, Christ, and others did in so many different ways ... What is the relation between *se donner la mort* and sacrifice? Between putting oneself to death and dying for another? What are the relations among sacrifice, suicide, and the economy of this gift?

Jacques Derrida, *The Gift of Death*, trans. David Wills (University of Chicago Press, 1995), p. 10.

### Contents

Acknowledgements		page x
Introduction: (unmerited) suffering and the uses of adversity in Victorian public discourse		I
I	'It is expedient that one man should die for the people': sympathy and substitution on the scaffold	38
2	'Fortune takes the place of guilt': narrative reversals and the literary afterlives of Eugene Aram	73
3	'Standing for' the people: Charles Dickens, Elizabeth Gaskell, and professional representation in 1848	106
4	Sacrifice and the sufferings of the substitute: Charles Dickens and the Atonement controversy of the 1850s	140
5	Substitution and imposture: George Eliot, Anthony Trollope, and fictions of usurpation	181
Conclusion: innocence, sacrifice, and wrongful accusation in Victorian fiction		216
Notes Bibliography Index		237 268 286

## Acknowledgements

This study has been rather a long time in the making and, in the course of its composition, I have accumulated debts both personal and professional which it gives me great pleasure to acknowledge here. The Master and Fellows of Trinity Hall, at the University of Cambridge, have supported this project throughout, and I would particularly like to thank Nick Bampos, Alison Hennegan, and Jeremy Morris for both their invaluable friendship and their support of the discipline of literary criticism within the College over the past decade. Within the wider community of scholars, Yota Batsaki, Gillian Beer, Sally Bushell, David Clifford, Phil and Sophia Connell, Heather Glen, Michael Hrebeniak, Michael Hurley, Subha Mukherji, Jane Partner, Leah Price, Sean Pryor, Corinna Russell, Pam Thurschwell, and Anne Toner have given of themselves generously in conversation over the years, and this study is immeasurably better for discussion with them: Jan Caldwell, Beth Lynch, and Rob Macfarlane have been particularly inspirational as colleagues and supportive as friends throughout its composition, and Mark Knight has offered kind support at the journey's end. During my time in Cambridge, I have learnt much from the undergraduates I have taught for the final-year paper in Victorian literature, and I have benefited greatly from dialogue with doctoral students, including 'RJ' Jenkins, Lana Dalley, Marco Wan, and Alexandra Lewis. I should also like to thank the helpful librarians in the Rare Books Room at the University Library in Cambridge. It has been a pleasure to work again with Linda Bree and her team at Cambridge University Press (Jo Lane and Emma Walker) and I am very thankful for their professional attentions. Heart-felt thanks are also due to Caroline Howlett, who copy-edited this study with conscientious care, and to the two anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press, from whose incisive and thoughtful reports I derived great benefit. My most significant debt on this occasion is to Adrian Poole, who read and responded generously to an early draft of this manuscript, and I am particularly grateful for his support of this project in its final stages.

### Acknowledgements

The authorship of this study of the ways in which the Victorians understood ethical exemplarity and vicarious experience was given added poignancy by the arrival of my own children. This book is dedicated to Nicholas and Joshie, whose appearance inevitably delayed its completion but simultaneously enriched it and amplified the range of its enquiries tenfold. I am deeply thankful for their company and that of my husband, Chris, without whose loving care and understanding the book would never have been finished. Thank you, too, to all who have helped keep the household running while I have been preoccupied with substitution and atonement, namely Phil Cooke, Carmen and Sandy Cruse, and above all, Michelle Cooke (Joshie's 'second Mum'), and to those members of our extended family who have regularly made the long trip over from Australia to help us out - my father Mervyn Turner, my sister Susie Dewis, and my parents-in-law, Bruce and Patsie Schramm. My dearest mother, Margaret Turner, and my wonderful sister-in-law, Lil Deverell, have been so generous to us with their time over the years that these days they know Cambridge as well as their home towns of Launceston and Melbourne respectively. I remain as always deeply grateful for their many kindnesses.

An early version of part of Chapter 1 appeared in 'Towards a Poetics of (Wrongful) Accusation: Innocence and Working-Class Voice in mid-Victorian Fiction', in Yota Batsaki, Subha Mukherji and Jan-Melissa Schramm (eds.), *Fictions of Knowledge: Fact, Evidence, Doubt* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 2011), pp. 193–212.

All references to the Bible are to the King James Version.

xi