Privacy, Confidentiality, and Health Research

The potential of the e-health revolution, increased data sharing and interlinking, research biobanks, translational research, and new techniques such as geolocation and genomics to advance human health is immense. For the full potential to be realized, though, privacy and confidentiality will have to be carefully protected. Problematically, many conventional approaches to such pivotal matters as consent, identifiability, safeguarding, security, and the international transfer of data and biospecimens are inadequate. The difficulties are aggravated in many countries by the fact that research activities are hobbled by thickets of laws, regulations, and guidance that serve neither research nor privacy well. The challenges are being heightened by the increasing use of biospecimens, and by the globalization of research in a world that has not globalized privacy protection. Drawing on examples from many developed countries and legal jurisdictions, William Lowrance critiques the issues, summarizes various ethics, policy, and legal positions (and revisions underway), describes innovative solutions, provides extensive references, and suggests ways forward.

Dr. William W. Lowrance is a consultant in health research policy and ethics, based in La Grande Motte, France. After earning a Ph.D. from The Rockefeller University in the life sciences with a concentration in organic chemistry, he shifted his attention to the social aspects of science, technology, and medicine. He has been a faculty member or fellow, teaching and conducting research on health policy, environmental policy, and risk decisionmaking, at Harvard, Stanford, and Rockefeller Universities. He has served as the Director of the Life Sciences and Public Policy Program of Rockefeller University, and as the Executive Director of the International Medical Benefit/Risk Foundation, headquartered in Geneva. His books include Of Acceptable Risk: Science and the Determination of Safety and Modern Science and Human Values. In recent years he has focused on the issues of privacy and confidentiality in health research, and he chaired the advisory committee that drafted the Ethics and Governance Framework of UK Biobank.
This series of books was founded by Cambridge University Press with Alexander McCall Smith as its first editor in 2003. It focuses on the law’s complex and troubled relationship with medicine across both the developed and the developing world. In the past twenty years, we have seen in many countries increasing resort to the courts by dissatisfied patients and a growing use of the courts to attempt to resolve intractable ethical dilemmas. At the same time, legislatures across the world have struggled to address the questions posed by both the successes and the failures of modern medicine, while international organizations such as the WHO and UNESCO now regularly address issues of medical law.

It follows that we would expect ethical and policy questions to be integral to the analysis of the legal issues discussed in this series. The series responds to the high profile of medical law in universities, in legal and medical practice, as well as in public and political affairs. We seek to reflect the evidence that many major health-related policy debates in the UK, Europe and the international community over the past two decades have involved a strong medical law dimension. With that in mind, we seek to address how legal analysis might have a transjurisdictional and international relevance. Organ retention, embryonic stem cell research, physician-assisted suicide and the allocation of resources to fund health care are but a few examples among many. The emphasis of this series is thus on matters of public concern and/or practical significance. We look for books that could make a difference to the development of medical law and enhance the role of medico-legal debate in policy circles. That is not to say that we lack interest in the important theoretical dimensions of the subject, but we aim to ensure that theoretical debate is grounded in the realities of how the law does and should interact with medicine and health care.

**Cambridge Bioethics and Law**

**Series Editors**
Professor Margaret Brazier, University of Manchester
Professor Graeme Laurie, University of Edinburgh
Professor Richard Ashcroft, Queen Mary, University of London
Professor Eric M. Meslin, Indiana University

Marcus Radetzki, Marian Radetzki, Niklas Juth *Genes and Insurance: Ethical, Legal and Economic Issues*

Ruth Macklin *Double Standards in Medical Research in Developing Countries*

Donna Dickenson *Property in the Body: Feminist Perspectives*
Matti Häyry, Ruth Chadwick, Vilhjálmur Árnason, Gardar Árnason The Ethics and Governance of Human Genetic Databases: European Perspectives

Ken Mason The Troubled Pregnancy: Legal Wrongs and Rights in Reproduction

Daniel Sperling Posthumous Interests: Legal and Ethical Perspectives

Keith Syrett Law, Legitimacy and the Rationing of Health Care

Alastair Maclean Autonomy, Informed Consent and the Law: A Relational Change

Heather Widdows, Caroline Mullen The Governance of Genetic Information: Who Decides?

David Price Human Tissue in Transplantation and Research

Matti Häyry Rationality and the Genetic Challenge: Making People Better?


Anne-Maree Farrell, David Price and Muireann Quigley Organ Shortage: Ethics, Law and Pragmatism

Sara Fovargue Xenotransplantation and Risk: Regulating a Developing Biotechnology


Mark Taylor Genetic Data and the Law: A Critical Perspective on Privacy Protection

Anne-Maree Farrell The Politics of Blood: Ethics, Innovation and the Regulation of Risk

Stephen Smith End-of-Life Decisions in Medical Care: Principles and Policies for Regulating the Dying Process

Michael Parker Ethical Problems and Genetics Practice

William W. Lowrance Privacy, Confidentiality, and Health Research
To my wonderfully supportive wife,
Catherine Couttenier-Lowrance
## Contents

*Preface and acknowledgments*  
page xiii

1 **Introduction**  
1 Health research as a public-interest cause  
1 Privacy protection as a public-interest cause  
4 Health data vulnerability  
4 The challenges

2 **Data, biospecimens, and research**  
7 A few essential notions  
10 The e-health revolution  
11 Data and databases  
13 Biospecimen collections  
18 Public research resource platforms  
18 Degrees of sensitivity  
22 Data and biospecimen ownership  
24 What is research, anyway?

3 **Privacy, confidentiality, safeguards**  
29 Privacy  
33 Confidentiality  
34 Safeguards

4 **Broad privacy and data protection regimes**  
35 The plethora of controls  
36 Two sorts of regimes  
36 Early concerns about computers and privacy  
38 The OECD privacy principles  
40 Council of Europe Convention 108  
40 The European strategy  
47 The US approach  
48 The Canadian strategy  
49 Australia, Japan, APEC

5 **Healthcare, public health, and research regimes**  
52 Healthcare and payment regimes  
53 Public health regimes
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>x</th>
<th>Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Consent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Identifiability and person-specific data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Genetics and genomics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Safeguards and responsibilities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**6 Consent**

Consent as it is applied now
Legitimately sought, meaningfully informed, willingly granted
The casting of consent
Right to withdraw
Community engagement
Searching for research candidates
Research without consent
Some reflections

**7 Identifiability and person-specific data**

“Personal data”
Identifiers
De-identification for research
Ways non-identified data can become identified
Retaining the possibility to re-identify
The HIPAA Privacy Rule approach
Key-coding
Identifiability terminology
Identifiable to whom?
No personal data: no human subject?
Some reflections

**8 Genetics and genomics**

Genetics/genomics
GWAS
EHR-driven genomic discovery
Genotype-driven recruitment
Notice and consent
Genetic and genomic identifiability
The Personal Genome Project
Some reflections

**9 Safeguards and responsibilities**

Operational safeguards
Formal responsibilities
Stewardship
Data and biospecimen retention
Security
Privacy risk assessment
Requests for non-research access
Enforcement and sanctions
The potential of the e-health revolution, increased data sharing and interlinking, research biobanks, translational research, and new scientific techniques such as genomics to advance human health is immense. For the full potential to be realized, though, privacy and confidentiality will have to be carefully protected. Problematically, many current approaches to such pivotal matters as consent, identifiability, safeguarding, security, and the international transfer of data and biospecimens are inadequate. The difficulties are aggravated in many countries by the fact that research activities are hobbled by thickets of laws, regulations, guidance, and governance that serve neither research nor privacy well.

For reasons that will be discussed, much of the legal context is in flux. The EU Data Protection Directive (adopted in 1995) is being thoroughly revised, after which the Member States will revise their laws to implement the new provisions. The Council of Europe Convention 108 on Protection of Personal Data (1981) is being revised, as are the EU Clinical Trials Directive (2001), the Australian Privacy Act (1988), and the US Federal Common Rule on Protection of Human Subjects (1991). And it is inevitable that at least the research-related requirements of the Privacy Rule under the US Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (2002) will be revised before long. Similar changes are occurring in Asia and elsewhere as well.

This book can’t resolve all of the issues; no-one has, and no book could. It is concerned not just with information recorded in the course of medical care, central though that is, but with any kind of information, from any source, that can be brought to bear as scientific evidence in health research. It uses selected examples to illustrate thematic points, not to develop comprehensive comparisons. For practical realism, it describes many of the ways research proceeds and how existing data are accessed and used and new data are generated. It is oriented to research in the developed world, and it draws on anglophone examples and sources, but most of the considerations are relevant everywhere health research is pursued.
Every effort has been made to keep the discussion concise. Complementing this, extensive references are provided, not only to support the exposition but also to help novices get their bearings and help experienced readers think about how things are done in technical specialties and ethico-legal cultures other than their own.

What this book attempts to do is identify the central issues, review them, describe ways they have been, or are being, addressed in various situations, provide resources, and suggest ways forward. Its purpose is to stimulate and inform reflection and discussion. In particular it focuses on issues, currently handled in rather different ways in different places, that must be worked on as both privacy protection and health research take on more international dimensions, and for which more internationally accepted rules and practices are urgently needed.

All web references were current as of March 2012.

Acknowledgments

The work on this book was supported by the Wellcome Trust, grant number [086258], for which the author is of course grateful. No-one at the Trust influenced the writing or saw the book until it was published. The author alone is responsible for the contents.

The material on p. 25 is reprinted with kind permission from the Council of State and Territorial Epidemiologists.

The material in Box 3 from the Institution of Medicine report, *Beyond the HIPAA Privacy Rule*, is reprinted with permission from the National Academies Press, copyright 2009, National Academy of Sciences.