

SEXTING AND CYBERBULLYING

Defining the Line for Digitally Empowered Kids

Directed at policy makers, legislators, educators, parents, members of the legal community, and anyone concerned about current public policy responses to sexting and cyberbullying, this book examines the lines between unintentionally offensive online forms of expression such as jokes, sarcastic comments, and impulsive but non-consensual distribution of intimate images, and potential legal consequences. It offers an analysis of reactive versus preventive legal and educational responses to these issues using evidence-based research with digitally empowered kids.

Shaheen Shariff highlights the influence of popular and "rape culture" on the behavior of adolescents who establish sexual identities and social relationships through sexting. She argues that we need to move away from criminalizing children and toward engaging them in the policy-development process, and she observes that important lessons can be learned from constitutional and human rights frameworks. She also draws attention to the value of children's literature in helping the legal community better understand children's moral development. She highlights the need to understand assumptions about Digitally Empowered Kids (DE Kids) that can inform judicial decisions regarding children's culpability at various ages. She emphasizes the need to engage DE Kids and help them to define the line between jokes and harmful online postings that could land them in jail.

Shaheen Shariff is an Associate Professor at the Faculty of Education at McGill University, an Associate Member of the Law Faculty at McGill University, and an Affiliate Scholar at Stanford Law School's Center for Internet and Society. In 2012, she was awarded a Queen Elizabeth II Diamond Jubilee Medal for scholarship and service to Canada. Shariff is a frequent news media commentator, researcher, and policy advisor who has written extensively on the intersection of law and education, diversity, and pluralism. She has been an expert witness at the Canadian Standing Senate Committee on Human Rights and two House of Commons Committee hearings on legislative amendments involving cyberbullying. She is the author of Confronting Cyberbullying: What Schools Need to Know to Control Misconduct and Avoid Legal Consequences (2009) and Cyberbullying: Issues and Solutions for the School, the Classroom, and the Home (2008).





Sexting and Cyberbullying

DEFINING THE LINE FOR DIGITALLY EMPOWERED KIDS

Shaheen Shariff

McGill University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107625174

© Shaheen Shariff 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Shariff, Shaheen.

Sexting and cyberbullying : defining the line for digitally empowered kids / Shaheen Shariff, McGill University.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-01991-1 (Hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-62517-4 (Paperback)

1. Sexting. 2. Cyberbullying. 3. Internet–Safety measures 4. Parent and teenager. I. Title. HQ27.85193 2015
302.34′302854678–dc23 2014026553

ISBN 978-1-107-01991-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-62517-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



I dedicate this book to my Define the Line family at McGill University.

Through your commitment, each of you models and defines the lines of leadership for future generations.

Mama Bear





Contents

Рı	Preface page	
Acknowledgments xvi		
1	Confronting Cyberbullying: Are We Any Wiser?	I
	Introduction	I
	Who Is the Fittest Online?	3
	Seeking Suitable Definitions for Digital Generations	3
	"Generation Empowered" or "Generation Screwed"?	5
	Digitally Empowered Kids, Young Adults, and Generations	6
	"Cyberbullying," Child Pornography, or "Flirty Fun"?	8
	Questions on the Role of Law	ΙI
	Goal, Objectives, and Chapter Organization	12
	Chapter 2: Sexism Defines the Lines between	
	Fun and Power	14
	Girls Receive Contradictory Messages from Society	15
	Influence of Media	15
	Entertainment and "Fun" at All Costs	16
	Shifting Norms and a Need to Define the Lines	16
	Scholarship on Moral Development, Empathy, and Moral	
	Disengagement of Youth	18
	Chapter 3: The Irony of Charging Children with Distribution	
	of Child Pornography	19
	Applying Child Pornography Laws: "A Square Peg in a Round Hole"	
	Big Stick Sanctions Don't Work	19
	Victims as Perpetrators	20
	Perspectives of Legal Academics	2 I 2 I
	Chapter 4: Keeping Kids Out of Court: Jokes, Defamation,	21
	and Duty to Protect	23
	Civil Lawsuits	24
	Z. II Dawouto	- 4
		vii



viii		CONTENTS
	Chapter 5: From Lord of the Flies to Harry Potter: Freedom	m,
	Choices, and Guilt	25
	Survival of the Fittest	29
	References	30
2	Sexism Defines the Lines between Fun and Power	36
	Introduction	36
	Goal of this Chapter	37
	Well-Publicized Cases, Influence of News Media, Popular	
	Culture, and "Rape Culture"	37
	Amanda's Story	38
	Jane Doe's Story, the Maple Ridge Case, and Steubenville	41
	Rape Culture in Postsecondary Institutions	42
	"Rape Culture" Resides in Popular Culture	44
	Why Do Girls Post Nude "Selfies" or Engage in Sexting?	45
	Girls Receive Contradictory Messages from Society	45
	The Define the Line Research (DTL Research)	48
	Background and Project Objectives	48
	Methodologies	48
	Phase 1: Online Survey	48
	Phase 2: Focus Groups	49
	Phase 3: Interactive Projects	49
	Data Collection	49
	Phase 1: Online Survey	49
	Phase 2: Focus Groups	49
	Phase 3: Interactive Projects	50
	Data Analysis	50
	Results and Discussion	50
	Participants' Experiences and Thoughts on "Cyberbullying'	, 51
	Motivation to Use Social Media	53
	Non-consensual Distribution of Images (Intimate	
	or Embarrassing)	54
	"Harmless Fun": Jokes or Intentional Harm?	55
	Language and Symbolic Cues	59
	Jokes and Relationships	59
	Posting of Non-consensual Images and Contradictions	
	in Empathy	60
	Sexting Perceived to be "Normal"	62
	Moral Development, Empathy, and Moral	
	Disengagement of Youth	64
	Influence of Age on Moral Understanding	65
	Type of Offense Can Influence How Kids Define the Line	67
	Summary and Conclusion	68
	References	69



CONTENTS		ix
3	The Irony of Charging Children with Distribution of Child Pornography	75
	Introduction	
	"Just Joking" Syndrome	75 76
	Pressure to Punish	78
	Is "Flirty Fun" Child Porn?	80
	American Case Law and Scholarly Discussion	81
	Lack of Intent to Engage in "Pornography"	81
	Impact and Need for "Zone of Teen Privacy"	82
	American Case Law	83
	Case 1: RE: C.S. (2012)	83
	Case 2: Miller, et al. v. Skumanick (2009)	84
	Case 3: State of New Jersey v. Dharun Ravi (2012)	84
	Case 4: Steubenville High School Rape Case (2012)	85
	Case 5: A.H. v. State of Florida (2007)	86
	Canadian Case Law	87
	Case 1: Maple Ridge, B.C., Case (2012)	88
	Case 2: Vancouver Island Sexting Discrimination Case	89
	Case 3: Laval Snapchat Case	90
	Criminal Sanctions or Reintegrating Young	
	Offenders into Society?	93
	Legal Scholars on the Role of Law	94
	Legal Assumptions/Child Complexity Theory (LACT)	95
	Need to Address Outdated Laws How Can the Law Help and Not Hinder?	95
	References	97 98
	References	90
4	Keeping Kids Out of Court: Jokes, Defamation, and	
	Duty to Protect	103
	Introduction and Framework for Discussion	103
	Jokes and Hyperbole Can be Libelous: D.C. v. R.R. (2010)	106
	Victim Privacy and the "Open Court Principle": A.B.	
	(Litigation Guardian of) v. Bragg Communications, Inc. (2012)	110
	Protection of Victim Privacy	III
	Fear of Being Identified and "Discernible Harm"	III
	Increased Isolation and Emotional Distress	116
	An Expanded Meaning for "Objectively Discernible Harm"	117
	Implications of the A.B. Ruling for Victim-Perpetrators	119
	The Impact of Media Reports on Child-Victims' Privacy	120
	The Need for a Responsible Free Press	120
	Media Influence on Reactive Policy Responses "Private" Venting in Public	121
	Girls and Personal Online Information	122
	DTL Research: Lines between Public and Private Spaces	123
	DIL Research, Lines between I ubile and I hvate spaces	124



X		CONTENTS
	Pre-Facebook Group More Thoughtful about Privacy	125
	"Privacy Breach" or "Privacy Harm"?	127
	The Canadian Debate on the Protection of Privacy and the	
	Open Court System	127
	Role of International Human Rights Law in Protecting DE Kids	129
	Application of Human Rights Law to Cyberbullying	130
	Article 2 of CRC: Non-discrimination	130
	Article 3 of CRC: Best Interests of the Child	131
	Article 12 of CRC: Right to be Heard	131
	Article 19 of CRC: Protection from Abuse, Violence, and	
	Negligence	131
	Anti-Bullying Legislation: Canadian Provinces	133
	Anti-Bullying Legislation: U.S. States	134
	References	136
5	From Lord of the Flies to Harry Potter: Freedom, Choices,	
)	and Guilt	141
	Introduction	141
	The Role of Law and Paradoxes in Children's Vulnerability and	-4-
	Accountability	142
	Role of Law: We Cannot Criminalize Those We Should Protect	144
	Conforming with the Peer Group	145
	Root Causes	145
	Popular and Rape Culture Sends Mixed Messages	146
	Accepted Norms: I Was "Just Joking"	146
	Peer Punishment for Crossing Invisible Peer-Group Lines	147
	Punishment for Crossing Blurred Lines	147
	Big Stick Sanctions and Child Pornography Laws	148
	Constitutional and Human Rights Protections	149
	Too Much Media Exposure Re-victimizes	149
	Conclusion and Recommendations	150
	A Holistic National Strategy	150
	Sensitivity Education	150
	Funding for Research on Assumptions Held by Law	
	Enforcement Personnel	151
	Developing Non-arbitrary and Informed Legal Responses	152
	Funding for Sustainable Policy and Program Initiatives	153
	University and School Programming, Legal and Digital Liter	racy 153
	Better Prepare Teachers: University Programs in Legal, Digit	tal,
	and Media Literacy	154
	Sensitize the News Media	155
	Engage DE Kids: Agency, Responsibility, and Benefit	
	of the Doubt	155
	Moving from Reactive to Proactive Responses	156



CONTENTS	
Survival of the Fittest in a Digital World	156
References	159
Appendix A: Charting Out Canadian and U.S. Anti-Bullying Legislation (as it Applies or Can be Applied to Cyberbullying	
Incidents)	161
Appendix B: Expanded DTL Research Data	188
Appendix C: Sample Workshop Provided to Undergraduate Students at McGill University	190
Appendix D: Public Policy, Law, and Digital Media (Sample University-Level Course)	201
Index	212





Preface

This book was originally contracted to be the second edition of my earlier book with Cambridge University Press, Confronting Cyberbullying: What Schools Need to Know to Control Misconduct and Avoid Legal Consequences, published in 2009. It was certainly time for an update, given the continued media and public policy focus on cyberbullying. However, try as I might, I could not update the book because even though some of the issues remain the same, the modes of expression and digital media used to carry them out have evolved rapidly. That is not to say that the legal and educational dilemmas and challenges I addressed in Confronting Cyberbullying are not important, or that they have all been successfully resolved. In fact, the reactive responses I argued against in earlier publications continue, emerging as harsher and often misapplied laws to criminalize children's online behavior. This is a disturbing trend because in adopting reactive responses, we overlook young people's motivations and moral development, or the adult modeling and societal influences that bring out such behavior.

The face of what we broadly refer to as "cyberbullying" has also taken on a more sexually charged and insidious nature. Many news media reports and policy initiatives appear to confuse the actions of pedophiles and online child sexual predators with cyberbullying. Child pornography laws in the United States and Canada are being applied to arrest, charge, and jail adolescents who engage in sexting. However, as the research disclosed in this book illustrates, these kinds of behaviors demonstrated by adolescents are not the same thing as "child pornography." Although some forms of sexting among youth are seriously demeaning and offensive, and need to be prevented, my research finds that most young people are testing social boundaries online as their hormones rage and they attempt to establish social relationships. As one of my doctoral students, Ashley DeMartini, notes, many of these activities of sexual exploration have "moved from the back of a car [as in kissing in the back seat at a drive-in], to playing itself out over social media." The public policy spotlight has been on kids, as though they are the only ones engaging in online forms of harassment, teasing, and demeaning expressions. We should also be looking at what kinds of adult role models children have in popular culture, and the

xiii



xiv PREFACE

thriving rape culture that is increasingly perpetuated online among adults. Once again, I am concerned that we scapegoat kids for adult faults. The underpinnings of public policy are often grounded in assumptions that "kids are bad." But the fact of the matter is that we need to look at ourselves, and at the hostile, misogynist, homophobic, and racist social norms we model for our children. What can we possibly expect from future generations when they are growing up immersed in such a society? They see adult violence on the news and in movies; insulting and offensive put-downs and power plays on sitcoms, in stand-up comedy, and on reality shows; and they hear misogynist and power-driven words in music lyrics. Therefore, it is no wonder young people imitate the norms of modern society. In this book, I highlight examples and scholarship relating to some of these societal norms and their influences on children while also examining some studies on children's moral development.

In Chapter 3, I challenge the wisdom of criminalizing children using laws that are meant to protect them. I argue that we should spend more time finding and putting away pedophiles and online groups of "cappers" who are the real threat to children's safety. More so, umbrella terms, such as "cyberbullying," have resulted in shifting the blame away from the adult realm of rape culture to the turbulent, emotionally and impulsively driven attempts of young people trying to establish their social and sexual identities among peers. At their age, reputation and acceptance in a peer group are everything.

Scholars have always grappled with and debated the true definition of "cyberbullying." This is especially so because as soon as we understand one type of behavior, say, bullying on social media, there are a host of other online applications like Snapchat and Ask.fm that bring out other challenging forms of communication. I realized several years ago that trying to fit young people's online behaviors into an umbrella description, especially when they involve social exclusion, taunting, threats and harassments, and demeaning messages designed to humiliate peers or adults, is futile. Therefore I have also highlighted a range of legal responses that are grounded in constitutional, human rights, and tort law considerations that provide a better fit for these forms of expression, and that also contain an educational message.

I conclude the book with reference to ways in which children's literature can not only help us better understand how judges might apply the law in private civil actions involving defamation, but also how children's literature would be invaluable in helping children and teens define the lines between joking and teasing, especially when it concerns an act so harmful that it could result in legal or criminal liability. Children's literature would also help youths to develop empathy and their "moral underbellies" as they grapple with the challenges of growing up immersed in digital media. I have also emphasized the power of generations working together using social media that can be engaged to enhance socially responsible digital citizenship that is congruent with the substantive principles of constitutional and human rights frameworks.

Without being too legalist, I hope this book will be of interest to anyone who wants to better understand the complexities and nuances of children's online



PREFACE XV

communication, and responses that show the greatest promise of balancing free expression and free press, safety, supervision, protection, and regulation in our digital society, while ensuring we avoid censorship, harsh punishment, and overregulation. The answers are clear – we simply need to recognize them. We need to critically question our own assumptions and those of adults who make decisions on how children's behavior ought to be addressed. This includes taking into consideration the norms, assumptions, and biases that might inform the police, prosecutors, and the judiciary – that analysis will follow in a second edition of this book. For now, I have focused on the need, once again, to concentrate our efforts on supporting, protecting, and educating children, instead of blaming and incarcerating them. With the onslaught of new laws and litigation directed at controlling children's online expression, such a focus will be essential if we want to develop future leaders, not criminals.





Acknowledgments

I would like to thank first and foremost my research assistants, Alyssa Wiseman, Ashley DeMartini, and Arzina Zaver, who have worked tirelessly to bring this book to fruition. Their teamwork, enthusiasm, and skill in attending to all the final details of referencing, formatting, and editing were exemplary, especially because they were in different parts of the world: Alyssa in Tokyo, Ashley in Winnipeg, and Arzina in Montreal. These researchers are part of my core Define the Line (DTL) team and have provided a significant amount of the research for this book, and also for my website. Alyssa, in particular, contributed to the legal research and analysis; Ashley brought her critical pedagogy and feminist perspectives to Chapter 2; Arzina, an efficient eye for detail; and all three brought superior and coordinated editing skills.

I would also like to thank the other members of my DTL team who contributed to this book directly or indirectly. In particular, I would like to thank Dr. Nelofar Sheikh who tackled the data coding, qualitative and quantitative analysis, and graphing using NVivo software. Dr. Sheikh is a master of data gathering, organization, and analysis, and a strong asset to DTL. Azrah Talib is a resourceful undergraduate student who is an exceptional researcher online. Azrah keeps us informed of media articles, cases and incidents of sexting and cyberbullying, emerging laws, policies, and journal articles on a daily basis. Similarly, our DTL website and social media page are managed by law student Laura Crestohl, who has also contributed to developing the tables of legal responses appended to this book. Nima Naimi, our DTL marketing manager, contributed to the legal research in Chapter 3; and Olivia Chow, who recently began to volunteer for our team, also deserves thanks for helping us retrieve court records for some of the criminal cases in the book. Yanick Touchette conducted research on provincial legislation discussed in the book.

The research reported in this book would not have been possible without consistent funding support from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC), which has funded my research for the last ten years, most recently with a five-year Insight Grant that will continue to support this work until 2017. The research was also funded in part by Facebook. In particular, I wish to thank Dave Steer and Meg Sinclair

xvii



xviii ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

of Facebook and Elliott Schragg for awarding me with the inaugural Facebook Digital Citizenship Award.

I also wish to acknowledge the contributions of my McGill University colleagues and co-applicants under the SSHRC grant, especially Professor Shauna Van Praagh, whom I quote several times in this book because she brings such wisdom to her legal analysis as it applies to children; Professor Victoria Talwar, who has shared her expertise on children and their moral development; and Professor Jamshid Beheshti, who shared his wisdom on information systems organization to inform our compendium of legal responses. I also wish to acknowledge the benefits of being part of PREVNet, a Canadian National Center for Excellence organization that brings together researchers from multidisciplinary backgrounds. In that regard, I also wish to thank Professor Shelley Hymel of the University of British Columbia, who has shared her research on moral "disengagement" and Dean Faye Mishna of the University of Toronto's Faculty of Social Work.

On the legal aspects of the issues discussed in this book, I am forever grateful for the mentorship and shared knowledge of Professor A. Wayne MacKay of Dalhousie University, Professors Jane Bailey and Valerie Steeves of University of Ottawa Law School, and Canadian Senators Mobina Jaffer and Salma Attaulahjan for their support of our endeavors to contribute to the public policy debate, particularly to inform the legislative process as Ottawa deliberates legal responses.

Thank you also to John Berger, senior editor at Cambridge University Press, for his patience in waiting an extra year for this manuscript, and for his consistent support and encouragement of my work throughout.

Last but not least, I also want to thank past members of the DTL team, who—although they have moved on to fulfill their careers—made strong contributions to advancement of the research that informs this book. Stewart Lazarus was instrumental in recruiting a large number of participants for the focus groups in the United States and Canada. To Shazia Abji, Glenn Gear, Evan Dexter, Courtney Retter, Ann Pierkewski, Amelie Lemieux, Jay Lister, Jamie Sportun, Nika Naimi, and all the law and education students who have worked with me over the last few years, too numerous to name, to advance knowledge in this important education and public policy area, I thank you all for your dedicated commitment to improving our understanding of this important area of public policy.

Shaheen Shariff, Ph.D. Associate Professor, McGill University