Problem Solving in Organizations

This concise introduction to the methodology of problem solving in organizations is an indispensable guide to the design and execution of practical business improvement projects in real organizational settings. The methodology is design-oriented and theory-informed. It encourages students to use the theory gained in their disciplinary courses by showing them how to do so in a fuzzy, ambiguous and politically charged real-life organizational context. The book provides an in-depth discussion of the various aspects and steps of the process of business and organizational problem solving. Rather than presenting the methodology as a recipe to be followed, the authors demonstrate how to adapt the approach to specific situations and to be flexible in scheduling the work at the various steps in the process. It will be indispensable to MBA and other students who venture outside the university walls to do real-life fieldwork.

Joan Ernst van Aken is Professor Emeritus of Organization Science at the School of Industrial Engineering, Eindhoven University of Technology, the Netherlands.

Hans Berends is Assistant Professor at the Department of Innovation, Technology, Entrepreneurship and Marketing in the School of Industrial Engineering, Eindhoven University of Technology, the Netherlands.

Hans van der Bij is Associate Professor at the Department of Innovation, Management and Strategy in the Faculty of Economics and Business, Groningen University, the Netherlands.

Problem Solving in Organizations

A Methodological Handbook for Business and Management Students

SECOND EDITION

Joan Ernst van Aken Hans Berends Hans van der Bij





University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107619142

© Joan van Aken, Hans Berends and Hans van der Bij 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007 Second edition 2012 7th printing 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Aken, Joan Ernst van.
Problem solving in organizations : a methodological handbook for business and management students / Joan van Aken, Hans Berends, Hans van der Bij. – Second edition.
pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-01936-2 (Hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-61914-2 (Paperback) 1. Problem solving.
I. Berends, Hans. II. Bij, Hans van der, 1955– III. Title.
HD31.A37 2012
658.4'03-dc23

2011051363

ISBN 978-1-107-01936-2 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-61914-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01936-2 — Problem Solving in Organizations 2nd Edition Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

Contents

List of figures	page ix
List of tables	х
List of boxes	xi
Preface	xiii

PART I FUNDAMENTALS

1	Sco	pe and nature of this handbook	3
	1.1	Objectives and target audiences	3
	1.2	Design-oriented and theory-informed problem solving	
		in organizations	5
	1.3	How to use this handbook	8
2	Stu	dent projects	9
	2.1	Introduction	9
	2.2	Two basic process structures	10
	2.3	Three knowledge-generating research processes	13
	2.4	Problems caused by mixing different process structures	18
	2.5	Concluding remarks	22
3	Pro	blem solving projects	24
	3.1	Introduction	24
	3.2	Rational problem solving	24
	3.3	Problem solving strategies	26
	3.4	Theory-informed field problem solving	28
	3.5	The application domain of design-oriented and	
		theory-informed problem solving	30
	3.6	The nature of field problem solving projects	31
	3.7	The basic set-up of a field problem solving project	37
	3.8	Characteristics of good field problem solving projects	39
4	Des	igns and designing	42
	4.1	Introduction	42
	4.2	Designing material entities	42

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01936-2 – Problem Solving in Organizations 2nd Edition Frontmatter More Information

Contents		
4.3 4.4	Social system design Paradigmatic starting points in social system design	52 56
5 Proh	lem solving projects to develop generic theory	59
5.1	Introduction	59
	Research paradigms	60
5.3	Developing generic theory on the basis of problem solving projects	62
PART II		
THE PRO	OBLEM SOLVING PROJECT	
6 Intal	ke and orientation	71
6.1	Introduction	71
6.2	Intake	71
6.3	Orientation	76
6.4	Problem context	78
6.5	Problem definition	78
	Assignment and deliverables	82
6.7	Project approach	83
6.8	Project costs and organization	87
6.9	Problem solving projects in different formats	88
6.10	Example	92
7 Theo	ory-informed diagnosis of business problems	99
7.1	Introduction	99
7.2	Empirical exploration and validation of the business	
	problem and its causes	100
7.3	Theoretical analysis	107
7.4	Process-oriented analysis	113
7.5	The diagnostic story	116
7.6	Alternative approaches: quick scan	117
7.7	Concluding remarks	118

8

Solution design		119
8.1	Introduction	119
8.2	The deliverables of the field problem solving project	119
8.3	The design process	121
8.4	Solution design	123
8.5	Solution justification	128
8.6	Solution design: the IIS case	130

		Contents	vii
9 Cha	nge plan design and the actual change process	137	
9.1	The timing of change plan design	137	
9.2	Change plan design	138	
9.3	The change process	144	
9.4	Change plan design: the IIS case	145	
9.5	Change plan design: the importance of developing		
	organizational support	150	
10 Eva	luation, learning and termination	153	
10.1	Introduction	153	
10.2	Project-oriented evaluation	154	
10.3	Learning for the future	159	
10.4	Scientific reflection	162	
10.5	Personal and professional development	165	
10.6	Project termination and reporting	166	
ART II			
/IETHO	DS		
11 Oua	litative research methods	171	
11.1		171	
11.2	Unit of analysis	173	
11.3	Sampling and case selection	176	
11.4	Qualitative data collection methods	178	
11.5	Qualitative methods of analysis	182	
11.6	Selecting a method	186	
12 Sea	rching and using scholarly literature	188	
12.1	Introduction	188	
12.2	Types of publication	189	
12.3	Focusing a literature review	193	
12.4	Searching the literature	194	
12.5	Integrating ideas and findings	197	
13 Qua	lity criteria for research	201	
13.1	Introduction	201	
13.2	Controllability	203	
13.3	Reliability	204	
13.4	Validity	209	
13.5	Recognition of results	212	
13.6	Concluding remarks	213	

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01936-2 — Problem Solving in Organizations 2nd Edition Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

viii

Contents

PART IV CASE MATERIAL

14	Cases		217
	14.1	Introduction	217
	14.2	The assignment: make a project proposal	217
	14.3	Four cases	219
enc	es		230

230
239
240

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01936-2 — Problem Solving in Organizations 2nd Edition Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

Figures

2.1	The empirical cycle	page 11
2.2	The problem solving cycle	12
2.3	The theory development process	14
2.4	The theory-testing process	16
2.5	Reflective redesign	18
3.1	The problem solving cycle	37
4.1	Process, object and realization design	43
4.2	Synthesis-evaluation iterations (loop A) and	
	requirement-design iterations (loop B)	45
4.3	A general model for a design process	47
6.1	Example of a preliminary cause-and-effect tree	80
6.2	General structure of conceptual project design for the	
	diagnosis in field problem solving projects	83
7.1	Results of incident analysis at ABC Research	111
7.2	Information-processing model	112
7.3	An example of a process diagram	115
7.4	Ishikawa diagram for a group of patients with chronic	
	obstructive pulmonary diseases	116
8.1	The key activities in actual designing: synthesis-evaluation	
	iterations	122
10.1	Number of damaged and missing products over a two-year	
	period	156



11.1	Choosing the unit of analysis	page	173
11.2	Strategies for selecting cases of a unit of analysis		177

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01936-2 — Problem Solving in Organizations 2nd Edition Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

Boxes

2.1	Example of theory development process	page 15
2.2	Example of theory-testing process	17
2.3	Example of reflective redesign	19
2.4	Example 1	21
2.5	Example 2	22
6.1	Example of the use of an external exploration	73
6.2	Examples of business problems and corresponding	
	assignments	74
6.3	Examples of parts of four exploratory interviews	
	regarding the ABC Research case	92
6.4	Example of a project proposal	93
7.1	An indirect validation of a business problem	102
7.2	Multiple sources of evidence	106

Preface

This handbook provides the methodology for problem solving in organizations. Its target audience includes not just undergraduate and graduate students in management and in business but also other people regularly involved in business and organizational problem solving, such as junior management consultants or engineers and other professionals working in organizational contexts. This second edition is a thoroughly revised version of the 2007 edition. The revision includes a new chapter on how to use problem solving projects to develop generic theory, further detailed discussions on designs and the design process, and more illustrative cases and cases for instruction.

The ability to solve business and organizational problems in real-life organizational settings can be regarded as the key competence of managers and of professionals working in organizations. A powerful way for students to develop this competence is to engage in problem solving in real organizational settings under academic supervision. Solving paper cases can develop a number of cognitive competences, but not all the competences that are needed to be successful in the fuzzy, ambiguous and politically charged real-life organizational context. This handbook aims to provide a methodological basis for problem solving in organizations.

The theory given here can best be mastered through a – possibly brief – classroom course in which the contents of this handbook are discussed and in which, on the basis of some (paper) cases, training is given on issues such as problem definition, developing a project proposal, problem analysis and solution design. However, a richer learning experience can be realized if such classroom training is followed by the further development of problem solving competences through actual problem solving in the field, individually or in a (small) group. In this way the student can develop real 'clinical experience'.

The scientification of the field of business and management has enabled it to develop into a respectable social science. This has led to the idea that the core competence of the business or management graduate is carrying out good explanatory research and that fieldwork for a business or management student means doing explanatory research. For academically trained people in disciplines such as sociology or ethnography, carrying out good explanatory

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01936-2 — Problem Solving in Organizations 2nd Edition Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

xiv

Preface

research is indeed their core competence, and for students in these disciplines fieldwork does indeed mean doing such research. However, as mentioned above, we are of the opinion that the core competence of business or management graduates is not explanatory research but knowledge-intensive field problem solving; in other words, not just researching 'the actual', but also designing and realizing 'the preferred'.

Business or organizational problem solving is very different from business or organizational research. There are many books on methodology for business or organizational research, which are often quite similar to more general social science research methodology. However, they give the methodology for analysing *what is*, and focus on the development of descriptive and explanatory knowledge. In business or organizational problem solving, on the other hand, the focus is on designing what can be, or what should be, in order to improve the performance of a specific business system on one or more criteria. In order to be able to design a business system, or to redesign an existing one, one must analyse the present one and the possible causes of its less than satisfactory performance. For this, many classic (and non-classic, for that matter) methods of social science research can help. However, problem analysis is only the first part of field problem solving. Analysis should be at the service of the design of solutions (and the associated change plans). Therefore, the methodology given here is *design-oriented*: a problem solving project following this methodology aims at the design of a sound solution and change plan, and at the actual realization of performance improvement with the help of these designs. It is about business performance improvement on the basis of sound plans. It is not about making sophisticated analyses without designing solutions, nor about a process of logical incrementalism, or muddling through or trial and error, in which business problems are solved on the basis of increasing insight, developed along the way in a step-by-step process.

The methodology of this handbook is also *theory-informed*. In practice, problem solving in organizations is often carried out in a craftsman-like way, on the basis of business experience and common sense. However, the methodology presented in this book is theory-informed, based on state-of-the-art thinking on the types of business systems and types of problems in question and on the methods to be used in solving business problems (without, of course, disregarding common sense and relevant experience). Because of this, our approach can be regarded as a methodology for evidence-based practice, or, more specifically, evidence-based management (EBMgt). In fact, this book may be regarded as a foundation course in evidence-based management.

Preface

Our approach builds on the traditions of rational problem solving. The types of problem that are best suited to this approach should have a significant technical-economic content. At the same time, the approach recognizes that organizations are social systems, that realizing improvements in business system performance entails organizational change, and that effective organizational change needs not only technical-economic interventions (such as the presentation of a promising solution for the problem) but political and cultural interventions as well. Therefore, our focus is not simply on the design of technical solutions but also on the design of the change process that is needed to actually realize the performance improvement, and on the development of organizational support for the solution and the change plan.

Many regard the business school as a professional school, like medical schools and engineering schools, and regard the business or management graduate as a professional. In our view, this implies that field problem solving is the core competence of this graduate, rather than carrying out good explanatory research (as opposed to physicists or sociologists, for whom doing good explanatory research is indeed their core competence). However, in an academic approach to the profession, graduate students also need to develop the competence to add to the knowledge base of their field (just as medical doctors and engineers need to be able to add to the knowledge base of their fields, even if field problem solving is their core competence). Doing field problem solving projects generates a rich knowledge base, which can be used not only to solve the specific problem at hand but also as a basis to generalize across cases, thus developing new and relevant generic knowledge. Even if this book is not one on research methodology, it will nevertheless give methodological support for using the results of field problem solving for research. If academic supervisors choose the projects they are to supervise in line with their research interests, these projects can provide strong support for their research output.

Field problem solving should, in our opinion, be a very important element in any business or management course programme, as it aims to develop the core competence of the student. However, it is carried out in a terrain that has many more pitfalls and traps for the unwary than a university library. We hope that the methodology given in this handbook will help the student to navigate this challenging but important and rewarding landscape.

> JOAN ERNST VAN AKEN HANS BERENDS HANS VAN DER BIJ Eindhoven, August 2011