

INTERPRETING SCHELLING

This book is the first collection of essays on Schelling in English that systematically explores the historical development of his philosophy. It addresses all four periods of Schelling's thought: his Transcendental Philosophy and Philosophy of Nature, his System of Identity [*Identitätsphilosophie*], his System of Freedom, and his Positive Philosophy. The essays examine the constellation of philosophical ideas that motivated the formation of Schelling's thought, as well as those later ones for which his philosophy laid the foundation. They therefore relate Schelling's philosophy to a broad range of systematic issues that are of importance to us today: metaphysics, epistemology, aesthetics, ethics, our modern conceptions of individual autonomy, philosophy of history, philosophy of religion, political philosophy, and theology. The result is a new interpretation of Schelling's place in the history of German Idealism as an inventive and productive thinker.

LARA OSTARIC is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Temple University. She has published on Schelling and Kant in *Philosophisches Jahrbuch*, *Kantian Review*, *Kant-Studien*, and *Inquiry*.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01892-1 — Interpreting Schelling: Critical Essays
Edited by Lara Ostaric
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

INTERPRETING SCHELLING

Critical Essays

EDITED BY
LARA OSTARIC



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01892-1 — Interpreting Schelling: Critical Essays
Edited by Lara Ostacic
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107018921

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2014
First paperback edition 2018

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Interpreting Schelling : critical essays / edited by Lara Ostacic.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-01892-1 (Hardback)

1. Schelling, Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph von, 1775-1854. 1. Ostacic, Lara, editor.

B2898.I58 2014

193-dc23 2014013072

ISBN 978-1-107-01892-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-45526-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Notes on contributors</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
<i>Method of citation</i>	xi
Introduction	I
<i>Lara Ostaric</i>	
1 The early Schelling on the unconditioned <i>Eric Watkins</i>	10
2 Schelling and skepticism <i>Michael N. Forster</i>	32
3 The concept of life in early Schelling <i>Lara Ostaric</i>	48
4 Knowledge and pleasure in the aesthetics of Schelling <i>Paul Guyer</i>	71
5 “Exhibiting the particular in the universal”: philosophical construction and intuition in Schelling’s <i>Philosophy of Identity</i> (1801–1804) <i>Daniel Breazeale</i>	91
6 “Identity of identity and non-identity”: Schelling’s path to the “absolute system of identity” <i>Manfred Frank</i>	120
7 Idealism and freedom in Schelling’s <i>Freiheitsschrift</i> <i>Michelle Kosch</i>	145
8 Beauty reconsidered: freedom and virtue in Schelling’s aesthetics <i>Jennifer Dobe</i>	160

9	Nature and freedom in Schelling and Adorno <i>Andrew Bowie</i>	180
10	Church and state: Schelling's political philosophy of religion <i>Günter Zöller</i>	200
11	Schelling's critique of Hegel <i>Fred Rush</i>	216
	<i>Bibliography</i>	238
	<i>Index</i>	251

Notes on contributors

ANDREW BOWIE is Professor of Philosophy and German at Royal Holloway, University of London. He is the author of *Adorno and the Ends of Philosophy* (2013), *German Philosophy: A Very Short Introduction* (2010), *Music, Philosophy, and Modernity* (Cambridge, 2007), *Introduction to German Philosophy from Kant to Habermas* (2003), *From Romanticism to Critical Theory: The Philosophy of German Literary Theory* (1997), *Schelling and Modern European Philosophy: An Introduction* (1993), and *Aesthetics and Subjectivity from Kant to Nietzsche* (1990).

DANIEL BREAZEALE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Kentucky. He is the author of *Fichte and the Project of Transcendental Philosophy* (forthcoming) and numerous journal articles, book chapters, translations, and editions of/on German philosophy from Kant to Nietzsche, with a research focus on the philosophy of J.G. Fichte.

JENNIFER DOBE is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at Grinnell College. She has published in *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* and is working on a book that traces the development of Schelling's philosophy of art.

MICHAEL N. FORSTER is Alexander von Humboldt Professor, holder of the Chair for Theoretical Philosophy, and co-director of the International Center for Philosophy at Bonn University. He is the author of *German Philosophy of Language: From Schlegel to Hegel and Beyond* (2011), *After Herder: Philosophy of Language in the German Tradition* (2010), *Kant and Skepticism* (2008), *Wittgenstein on the Arbitrariness of Grammar* (2004), *Hegel's Idea of a Phenomenology of Spirit* (1998), and *Hegel and Skepticism* (1989).

MANFRED FRANK is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at Eberhard Karls University Tübingen. He is the author of numerous articles, editions, and monographs, which have been translated into over twenty

languages. His books include *Der unendliche Mangel an Sein. Schellings Hegelkritik und die Anfänge der Marxschen Dialektik* (1975/1992), *Selbstbewußtsein und Selbsterkenntnis. Essays zur analytischen Philosophie der Subjektivität* (1991), and 'Unendliche Annäherung.' *Die Anfänge der philosophischen Frühromantik* (1997).

PAUL GUYER is Jonathan Nelson Professor of Humanities and Philosophy at Brown University. He is the author of nine books on Kant, including *Kant and the Claims of Taste* (Cambridge, 1997, 2nd edn.), *Kant and the Claims of Knowledge* (Cambridge, 1987), *Kant and the Experience of Freedom* (Cambridge, 1993), and *Kant on Freedom, Law, and Happiness* (Cambridge, 2000). Professor Guyer is one of the general co-editors of the Cambridge Edition of Kant for which he has also translated several volumes. His three-volume work, *A History of Modern Aesthetics* was published by Cambridge in 2014.

MICHELLE KOSCH is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Cornell University. She is the author of *Freedom and Reason in Kant, Schelling, and Kierkegaard* (2006) and a number of articles on Kierkegaard, Fichte and nineteenth-century Continental philosophy. Professor Kosch is currently at work on a book-project on Fichte's ethics.

LARA OSTARIC is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Temple University. She has published articles on Kant and Schelling, and is working on a book on Kant's third *Critique* and its influence on post-Kantian German philosophy.

FRED RUSH is Associate Professor of Philosophy at University of Notre Dame. He is the author of *Irony and Idealism* (forthcoming 2014), *On Architecture* (2009), and the editor of the *Cambridge Companion to Critical Theory* (Cambridge, 2004).

ERIC WATKINS is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California San Diego. He is the author of *Kant and the Metaphysics of Causality* (Cambridge, 2005), the editor of *Kant and the Sciences* (2001), and the editor and translator of *Kant's Critique of Pure Reason: Background Source Materials* (Cambridge, 2009). Professor Watkins is currently working on a book on Kant and the fate of the "unconditioned" in post-Kantian German philosophy.

GÜNTER ZÖLLER is Professor of Philosophy at Ludwig-Maximilians University Munich. He is the author of *Fichte lesen* (2013), *Fichte's Transcendental Philosophy: The Original Duplicity of Intelligence and Will*

Notes on contributors

ix

(Cambridge, 1998) and *Res Publica: Plato's "Republic" in Classical German Philosophy* (2014) as well as numerous journal articles and book chapters on Kant and German Idealism. His translations and co-editions include J.G. Fichte, *The System of Ethics* (Cambridge, 2005), Immanuel Kant, *Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics* (2004), and The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant, vol. 7: *Anthropology, History, and Education* (Cambridge, 2007).

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my collaborators for their contributions to this volume. I am also grateful to Hilary Gaskin for her guidance and support for this project and Katie Brennan for helping me proofread the book manuscript for accuracy and consistency of reference. I would also like to thank the Center for Advanced Studies of Ludwig-Maximilian University Munich for the fellowship support in relation to this project and the Schelling-Kommission of the Bavarian Academy of Sciences for resources.

Method of citation

Where references are by author and year of publication, full reference information may be found in the Bibliography.

Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph Schelling

Citations to Schelling's texts are generally given parenthetically, although additional references are sometimes included in the footnotes to the essays. The following abbreviations have been used in referring to standard editions of Schelling's works:

AA *Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph Schelling: Historisch-kritische Ausgabe, im Auftrag der Schelling-Kommission der Bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften*, ed. Jörg Jantzen, Thomas Buchheim, Wilhelm G. Jacobs, and Siegbert Peetz. Stuttgart: Cotta, 1976–. (All citations are first to the series [in upper case roman numerals], followed by volume and page numbers.)

SW *Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph Schellings sämmtliche Werke*, ed. K.F.A. Schelling, I Abtheilung vols. 1–10, II Abtheilung vols. 1–4. Stuttgart: Cotta, 1856–61. (All references are first to the section number [in upper case roman numerals], followed by the relevant volume and page numbers.) This edition is more readily available as reprinted in *Schellings Werke*, ed. M. Schröter. Munich: Beck, 1927. The reprinted edition sets the SW pagination in the margins to the text, with the exception of the *Philosophie der Offenbarung*, “Einleitung,” which is contained in its Ergänzungsband 6, page-identical with SW 11.3.

AS *Ausgewählte Schriften*, ed. Manfred Frank, 6 vols. Frankfurt a. M.: Suhrkamp Verlag, 1985. (All references are first to the relevant volume, followed by page numbers.)

The following abbreviations have been used in referring to Schelling's writings:

AAE *Anhang zu dem Aufsatz des Herrn Eschenmayer betreffend den wahren Begriff der Naturphilosophie und die richtige Art ihre Probleme aufzulösen* (1801), pub. in *SW* 1.4 as *Ueber den wahren Begriff der Naturphilosophie und die richtige Art ihre Probleme aufzulösen* [*On the True Concept of the Philosophy of Nature and the Correct Way to Solve Its Problems*]

CP *Ueber die Construction in der Philosophie* (1802) [*On Construction in Philosophy*]

DSP *Darstellung meines Systems der Philosophie* (1801) [*Presentation of My System of Philosophy*]

EE *Erster Entwurf eines Systems der Naturphilosophie* (1st edn., 1799) [*First Outline of a System of the Philosophy of Nature*]

FD *Fernere Darstellungen aus dem System der Philosophie* (1802) [*Further Presentations from the System of Philosophy*]

GPP *Grundlegung der positiven Philosophie: Münchner Vorlesung WS 1832/33 und SS 1833* [*Foundations of the Positive Philosophy*]

PK *Philosophie der Kunst* (1802–3) [*The Philosophy of Art*]

StI *System des transzendentalen Idealismus* (1800) [*System of Transcendental Idealism*]

VM *Vorlesungen über die Methode des akademischen Studiums* (delivered 1802, pub. 1803) [*On University Studies*]

VNP *Ueber das Verhältniß der Naturphilosophie zur Philosophie überhaupt* (1802) [*On the Relationship of the Philosophy of Nature to Philosophy in General*]

Immanuel Kant

Citations from the *Critique of Pure Reason* are located by reference to the pagination of Kant's first (A) and/or second (B) editions. All other passages from Kant's works are cited by the volume and page number in the standard Akademie edition of Kant's works. These references are preceded by an abbreviation or a short title for the work cited, except where the context makes that obvious. Since standard translations of the *Critique of Pure Reason* provide the "A" and "B" page numbers and modern editions of Kant's other works always give the Akademie edition pagination, page numbers for translations have been omitted. Unless otherwise indicated in the individual essays, all translations are from The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant (1992–).

Method of citation

xiii

The following abbreviations/short titles have been used in referring to Kant's writings:

Kant AA	<i>Kants gesammelte Schriften</i> , ed. the Berlin-Brandenburgische Akademie der Wissenschaften (formerly the Königlich Preussische and later Deutsche Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin), 29 vols. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter (formerly Georg Reimer), 1900—
KrV	<i>Kritik der reinen Vernunft</i> (1st edn. 1781, 2nd edn. 1787) [<i>Critique of Pure Reason</i>]
KpV	<i>Kritik der praktischen Vernunft</i> (1788) [<i>Critique of Practical Reason</i>]
KU	<i>Kritik der Urteilskraft</i> (1st edn. 1790, 2nd edn. 1793, 3rd edn. 1799) [<i>Critique of the Power of Judgment</i>]
MM	<i>Die Metaphysik der Sitten</i> (1797) [<i>The Metaphysics of Morals</i>]
Groundwork	<i>Grundlegung zur Metaphysik der Sitten</i> (1785) [<i>Groundwork of the Metaphysics of Morals</i>]
Prolegomena	<i>Prolegomena zu einer jeden künftigen Metaphysik, die als Wissenschaft wird auftreten können</i> (1783) [<i>Prolegomena to Any Future Metaphysics that Will be Able to Come Forward as Science</i>]
Religion	<i>Die Religion innerhalb der Grenzen der bloßen Vernunft</i> (1st edn. 1793, 2nd edn. 1794) [<i>Religion within the Boundaries of Mere Reason</i>]

Johann Gottlieb Fichte

Fichte AA	<i>J.G. Fichte: Gesamtausgabe der Bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften</i> , ed. Erich Fuchs, Reinhard Lauth, Hans Jacobs, and Hans Gliwitzky, 42 vols. Stuttgart-Bad Cannstatt: Frommann-Holzboog Verlag, 1962–2012. (Cited first according to the series in roman numerals followed by volume and page numbers.)
Fichte SW	<i>Fichtes sämmtliche Werke</i> , ed. I.H. Fichte, 8. vols. Berlin: Veit, 1845–6.
Fichte SWI	<i>Fichtes Werke</i> , ed. I.H. Fichte, 11 vols. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 1971.

Georg Wilhelm Friedrich Hegel

HW	<i>Werke in zwanzig Bänden</i> , ed. Eva Moldenhauer and Karl Marcus Michel. Frankfurt a. M.: Suhrkamp Verlag, 1971.
----	--