Practising Self-Government

Autonomy is an important constitutional concept allowing for regions within countries to exercise self-government. This book presents detailed case studies of thirteen such autonomies from around the world, in which noted experts on each outline the constitutional, legal and institutional frameworks as well as how these arrangements have worked in practice to protect minority rights and prevent secession of the territories in question. The volume's editors draw on the case studies to provide a comparative analysis of how autonomy works and the political and institutional conditions under which it is likely to become a workable arrangement for management of the differences that brought it into being.

Yash Ghai is Professor Emeritus at the University of Hong Kong and Director of the Katiba Institute, Nairobi. For the past thirty years, he has been involved in the study of autonomy as a scholar and as a framer of constitutional arrangements that use autonomy as a device for resolving conflict.

Sophia Woodman is a postdoctoral research fellow at the University of British Columbia, Vancouver. She is a sociologist who studies Chinese politics, including the politics of autonomy and minorities in contemporary China.
The Law in Context Series

Editors: William Twining (University College London), Christopher McCrudden (Queen’s University Belfast) and Bronwen Morgan (University of Bristol).

Since 1970 the Law in Context series has been at the forefront of the movement to broaden the study of law. It has been a vehicle for the publication of innovative scholarly books that treat law and legal phenomena critically in their social, political and economic contexts from a variety of perspectives. The series particularly aims to publish scholarly legal writing that brings fresh perspectives to bear on new and existing areas of law taught in universities. A contextual approach involves treating legal subjects broadly, using materials from other social sciences, and from any other discipline that helps to explain the operation in practice of the subject under discussion. It is hoped that this orientation is at once more stimulating and more realistic than the bare exposition of legal rules. The series includes original books that have a different emphasis from traditional legal textbooks, while maintaining the same high standards of scholarship. They are written primarily for undergraduate and graduate students of law and of other disciplines, but will also appeal to a wider readership. In the past, most books in the series have focused on English law, but recent publications include books on European law, globalisation, transnational legal processes, and comparative law.

Books in the Series

Anderson, Schum & Twining: Analysis of Evidence
Ashworth: Sentencing and Criminal Justice
Barton & Douglass: Law and Parenthood
Bell: French Legal Cultures
Bercusson: European Labour Law
Birkinshaw: European Public Law
Birkinshaw: Freedom of Information: The Law, the Practice and the Ideal
Brownsword & Goodwin: Law and the Technologies of the Twenty-First Century
Cane: Atiyah’s Accidents, Compensation and the Law
Clarke & Kohler: Property Law: Commentary and Materials
Collins: The Law of Contract
Collins, Ewing & McCollan: Labour Law
Cowan: Housing Law and Policy
Cranston: Legal Foundations of the Welfare State
Darian-Smith: Laws and Societies in Global Contexts: Contemporary Approaches
Dauvergne Making People Illegal: What Globalisation Means for Immigration and Law
Davies: Perspectives on Labour Law
Dembour: Who Believes in Human Rights?: The European Convention in Question
de Sousa Santos: Toward a New Legal Common Sense
Diduck: Law’s Families
Fortin: Children’s Rights and the Developing Law
Glover-Thomas: Reconstructing Mental Health Law and Policy
Gobert & Punch: Rethinking Corporate Crime
Goldman: Globalisation and the Western Legal Tradition: Recurring Patterns of Law and Authority
Harlow & Rawlings: Law and Administration
Harris: An Introduction to Law
Harris, Campbell & Halson: Remedies in Contract and Tort
Harvey: Seeking Asylum in the UK: Problems and Prospects
Hervey & McNair: Health Law and the European Union
Holder & Lee: Environmental Protection, Law and Policy
Jackson & Summers: The Internationalisation of Criminal Evidence
Kostakopoulou: The Future Governance of Citizenship
Lewis: Choice and the Legal Order: Rising above Politics
Likosky: Transnational Legal Processes
Likosky: Law, Infrastructure and Human Rights
Maughan & Webb: Lawyering Skills and the Legal Process
McGlynn: Families and the European Union: Law, Politics and Pluralism
Moffat: Trusts Law: Text and Materials
Monti: EC Competition Law
Morgan: Contract Law Minimalism
Morgan & Yeung: An Introduction to Law and Regulation: Text and Materials
Norrie: Crime, Reason and History
Oliver: Legal Ethics
Oliver & Drewry: The Law and Parliament
Picciotto: International Business Taxation
Probert: The Changing Legal Regulation of Cohabitation, 1600–2010
Reed: Internet Law: Text and Materials
Richardson: Law, Process and Custody
Roberts & Palmer: Dispute Processes: ADR and the Primary Forms of Decision-Making
Rowbottom: Democracy Distorted: Wealth, Influence and Democratic Politics
Scott & Black: Cranston’s Consumers and the Law
Seneviratne: Ombudsmen: Public Services and Administrative Justice
Stapleton: Product Liability
Stewart: Gender, Law and Justice in a Global Market
Tamanaha: Law as a Means to an End: Threat to the Rule of Law
Twining: Globalisation and Legal Theory
Twining: Rethinking Evidence
Twining: General Jurisprudence: Understanding Law from a Global Perspective
Twining: Human Rights, Southern Voices: Francis Deng, Abdullahi An-Na’im, Yash Ghai and Upendra Baxi
Twining & Miers: How to Do Things with Rules
Ward: A Critical Introduction to European Law
Ward: Law, Text, Terror
Ward: Shakespeare and Legal Imagination
Wells & Quick: Lacey, Wells and Quick: Reconstructing Criminal Law
Zander: Cases and Materials on the English Legal System
Zander: The Law-Making Process

International Journal of Law in Context: A Global Forum for Interdisciplinary Legal Studies

The International Journal of Law in Context is the companion journal to the Law in Context book series and provides a forum for interdisciplinary legal studies and offers intellectual space for ground-breaking critical research. It publishes contextual work about law and its relationship with other disciplines including but not limited to science, literature, humanities, philosophy, sociology, psychology, ethics, history and geography. More information about the journal and how to submit an article can be found at http://journals.cambridge.org/ijc.
Practising Self-Government

A Comparative Study of Autonomous Regions

Edited by

YASH GHAI AND SOPHIA WOODMAN
Contents

List of tables page ix
List of contributors x
Acknowledgements xiii

Introduction: Nature and origins of autonomy 1
Yash Ghai

1 Seeking autonomy in a decentralised federation: the case of Qu´ebec 32
Richard Simeon and Luc Turgeon

2 Prosperity and happiness through autonomy: the self-government of the Åland Islands in Finland 62
Markku Suksi

3 Puerto Rico: autonomy or colonial subordination? 91
Efr´en Rivera-Ramos

4 Foundations and institutions of South Tyrol’s autonomy in Italy 118
Oskar Peterlini

5 Kashmir: the vanishing autonomy 163
Jill Cottrell

6 Autonomies of scale: precarious self-government on Norfolk Island 200
Helen Irving

7 The autonomy of Catalonia: the unending search for a place within pluralist Spain 228
Carlos Flores Juberias
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Zanzibar in Tanzania: from sovereignty to autonomy?</td>
<td>Yash Ghai</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Defective democracy in a failed state? Bridging constitutional design, politics and ethnic division in Bosnia-Herzegovina</td>
<td>Joseph Marko</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Hong Kong’s autonomy: dialects of powers and institutions</td>
<td>Yash Ghai</td>
<td>315</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The autonomy of devolved Scotland</td>
<td>Chris Himsworth</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Macau: transformation of an historic autonomy</td>
<td>Paulo Cardinal</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Autonomy and conflict resolution in Bougainville, Papua New Guinea</td>
<td>Anthony J. Regan</td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Comparative perspectives on institutional frameworks for autonomy</td>
<td>Sophia Woodman and Yash Ghai</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Index

487
Tables

4.1 Language groups in South Tyrol (total population and percentages) .......................................................... page 134
5.1 Constitution of India, Article 370 ................................................................................................................. 169
7.1 Referendums on the Catalan Statutes of Autonomy ...................................................................................... 236
9.1 Population figures for BiH from the Yugoslav Census 1991 and results of the first multi-party elections 1990 ........................................................................................................................................ 286
9.2 Ethnic breakdown of the population on hypothetical RS and FBiH territory according to the 1991 census in comparison with 1997, estimates by UNHCR ........................................................................................................ 294
9.3 Ethnic breakdown of judiciary and police forces in 1999 ........................................................................... 295
9.4 Legislative (in-)activity 1997–2007 in the Parliament of BiH ......................................................................... 301
9.5 Use of Bonn Powers by fields of intervention 1996–2007 ........................................................................... 302
14.1 Factors favourable to granting of autonomous status, at time of establishment ...................................... 452
14.2 Factors facilitating exercise of autonomy ..................................................................................................... 465
14.3 Social and political consequences of autonomy ........................................................................................ 476
Contributors

Paulo Cardinal has been a legal adviser to the Macau Legislative Assembly since 1992, and is an invited lecturer at the Faculty of Law, University of Macau. He has published widely on public law issues. Besides autonomy systems and fundamental rights, his main areas of research include the amparo writ, constitutional justice, comparative constitutional law and some international law areas such as human rights and international personality.

Jill Cottrell taught law at university level for many years, with research interests mainly in the areas of tort, environmental law and human rights. She has also written several articles on aspects of Indian law. Over the last decade she has advised on constitution making in a number of countries, and is now mostly involved in helping with the implementation of the constitution of Kenya through engagement with civil society.

Carlos Flores Juberías is Professor of Constitutional Law at the University of Valencia Law School. He has been a Fulbright scholar at the University of California San Diego, and received a Doctor honoris causa from the St. Francis Xavier University in Sucre, Bolivia.

Chris Himsworth is Emeritus Professor of Administrative Law at the University of Edinburgh. He has written widely on devolution (especially in relation to Scotland and the United Kingdom), human rights, local government and administrative law, as well as general constitutional law.

Helen Irving is Professor in the Faculty of Law, The University of Sydney, where she teaches Australian and comparative constitutional law. Her research focuses on constitutional citizenship, including its historical relationship with gender. She is the author and editor of many publications, including Gender and the Constitution: Equity and Agency in Comparative Constitutional Design (Cambridge University Press, 2008).

Joseph Marko is Dean of the Faculty of Law and professor of public law and political science at the Institute of Austrian, European and Comparative Public Law and Political Science at the University of Graz. Since 1998 he has been
List of contributors

director of the Minority Rights Institute at the European Academy Bolzano/Italy. He is also the scientific co-ordinator of the Joint Ph.D. Program in 'Diversity Management and European Governance'. From May 1997 to May 2002 he served as an international judge of the Constitutional Court of Bosnia and Herzegovina, acting as its vice-president from 1999 to 2001.

Oskar Peterlini has represented South Tyrol in the Italian Senate since 2001. For twenty years he held a seat in the Regional Parliament of Trentino-South Tyrol and served as its President for ten years. He is an expert on autonomies and the Italian Constitution at the Free University of Bozen Bolzano. He has published several books on constitutional reforms in Italy, on federalism and electoral systems, on protection of minorities and the Special Statute of South Tyrol. He has also written on pension funds in Italy, and created an innovative complementary pension system.

Anthony J. Regan is a Fellow in the State, Society and Governance in Melanesia Program, College of Asia and the Pacific at The Australian National University. A constitutional lawyer who has lived and worked for twenty years in Papua New Guinea and Uganda, his main field of research concerns the use of constitution-making processes and constitutional arrangements as part of conflict resolution processes. He has been involved in such processes in relation to a number of countries, including Papua New Guinea, Uganda, Solomon Islands, Timor L'este, Fiji, India and Sri Lanka. He has been an adviser to the Bougainville parties in the peace process there since the late 1990s.

Efrén Rivera-Ramos is a former Dean and full professor at the School of Law of the University of Puerto Rico, where he teaches Constitutional Law, Jurisprudence and Law and Culture. He is a recognised expert on the legal and political relationship between the United States and Puerto Rico. He has been a visiting professor at Yale University, the University of Ottawa, Pompeu Fabra University and the Autonomous University of Barcelona and has lectured widely in the United States, Europe and Latin America.

Richard Simeon is Emeritus Professor of Political Science and Law, University of Toronto. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada and a recent recipient, of the Daniel Elazar award of the American Political Science Association for a lifetime contribution to the study of federalism and intergovernmental relations. His current focus is on how, whether, and when federalism and related ideas can contribute to accommodation in divided societies.

Markku Suksi is Professor of Public Law at Åbo Akademi University, Finland. He has edited or authored several autonomy-related books.

Luc Turgeon is an Assistant Professor at the School of Political Studies at the University of Ottawa. His main fields of research are federalism, nationalism and social policies. He is currently working on a manuscript on the politics of representative bureaucracy in Belgium, Canada and Switzerland.
Sophia Woodman is a sociologist who studies Chinese politics, including the politics of autonomy and minorities in contemporary China. She is currently a postdoctoral fellow at the University of British Columbia in Vancouver. Her wider research interests are in citizenship, human rights and social movements.
Acknowledgements

The genesis of this book was in an April 2005 conference held at Hong Kong University, on Comparative National Experiences of Autonomy: Purpose, Structures and Institutions. The conference was held under the auspices of the Hong Kong University Faculty of Law's Centre for Comparative and Public Law, which also provided support to this event. The stimulating conversations at this conference generated an enthusiasm that kept the project alive in the many years since then. As well as hearing papers by some of the authors in this book, we were lucky enough to have many other fascinating contributions at this conference, including from Lord David Steel, first presiding officer of the Scottish Parliament; the Rt. Hon. Robert Rae, currently acting leader of the Canadian Liberal Party; Ao Junde, an eminent scholar on China’s system of ethnic regional autonomy; Benedicto Bacani, an expert on autonomy in Mindanao; and Stephen Lam, then Secretary for Constitutional Affairs in Hong Kong. We are grateful to all those who participated in this conference, and especially to those who contributed to its organisation, in particular Lison Harris, Monnie Leung and Flora Leung.

Some of the papers from the conference became chapters in this book; others were commissioned subsequently to fill perceived gaps in the geographical coverage and thematic range of the book. We offer our sincere thanks to all our contributors for their patience and willingness to update their chapters, in some cases many years after the original papers had been delivered.

The background work for the project formed part of Yash Ghai’s research as Sir Y. K. Pao Professor of Public Law at the University of Hong Kong. It was supported by his 2001 Distinguished Researcher Award from Hong Kong University, without which the book would not have been brought to completion. A grant from the Centre of Comparative and Public Law at the later stages of editing the manuscript enabled us to finish the project.

We are grateful for the patience of our editors at Cambridge, who have put up with many delays in finishing the book.

For his careful copy-editing work and many hours inputting proofreading corrections, as well as his support to Sophia in completing this project when it seemed it would never be done, we would like to thank Alex Carr.
This book has been a long time in the making, and in the process we have become indebted to many people. We would like to thank them all, even if we have not listed their names here.

Yash Ghai and Sophia Woodman
January 2013