CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01766-5 - Natural Experiments in the Social Sciences: A Design-Based Approach
Thad Dunning
Index
More information

Index

Always-Treats, definition of, 138
Angrist and Lavy (1999), 76
  credibility of models in, 268–69, 282, 323
  data analysis in, 268
  plausibility of as-if random in, 216, 250, 323
    role of information, incentives, and capacities in assessing, 238
  relevance of intervention in, 268–69, 323
  role of substantive knowledge in, 327
  use of regression-discontinuity design in, 76
Argentina land-titling study (Galiani and Schargrodsky 2004, 2010), 10
  credibility of models in, 280, 281
  data analysis in, 115–17
  model-validation CPOs in, 226
  nointerference assumption in, 119, 260
  plausibility of as-if random in, 250, 322
    role of information, incentives, and capacities in assessing, 237
  relationship to theory of, 316
  relevance of intervention in, 304
  treatment-assignment CPOs in, 213–14
  use of natural experiment in, 10–12
  validation of as-if random in
    qualitative evidence for, 11
    quantitative evidence for, 11
as-if random, 9, 236
  assessment of plausibility of
    role of information, incentives, and capacities in, 236–39
  continuum of plausibility of, 249–52
  definition of, 9
  difficulty of evaluating, 252
  plausibility of, 27
  validation of, 12
auxiliary-outcome CPOs, 209, 224
  definition of, 224
  examples of, 224
average causal effect, 109–12
  for Compliers, 141
  estimation of, 112–15
  intention-to-treat parameter and, 111
  in regression-discontinuity designs, 122
  relevance of, 111
  unobservability of, 112

balance tests
  in cluster-randomized studies, 242
  and statistical power, 241
  use of, 239
Bonferroni correction for multiple comparisons
  definition of, 241
Brady and McNulty (2011)
  credibility of models in, 281
  description of, 55
  plausibility of as-if random in, 251
  relevance of intervention in, 305
bundling of treatments
  definition of, 290, 300

Card and Krueger (1994)
  bundling of treatments in, 302
  credibility of models in, 281
  plausibility of as-if random in, 251
  relevance of intervention in, 304, 305, 306
causal models *see* response schedule
  maintained assumptions of, 256
  role of interventions, 256
causality, 259
  role of manipulation in concepts of, 259
causal-process observations (CPOs), 210
  definition of, 26, 210
  relation to data-set observations of, 211
  stronger and weaker uses of, 228–29
  types of, 26
  uses of, 211
central limit theorems, use of, 171, 173, 186
Chattopadhyay and Duflo (2004), 280
  credibility of models in, 280
  description of, 50
  plausibility of as-if random in, 250
  relevance of intervention in, 304
clustered randomization, 175–86
  adjustment by intraclass correlation coefficient and, 182–84

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01766-5 - Natural Experiments in the Social Sciences: A Design-Based Approach
Thad Dunning
Index
More information

clustered randomization (cont.)
analysis by cluster mean and, 179
advantages of, 181, 183
formal details of, 195
problems with unequal cluster sizes of, 201
variance of estimator in, 179
consequences of, 176
Neyman model and, 175–78
within-cluster homogeneity of potential outcomes and, 177
Compliers, definition of, 138
compound treatment problem *see* bundling of treatments
conditional density (sorting) tests, in regression-discontinuity designs, 245–46
conditional independence
definition of, 23
confounders
examples of, 5–6
methods of controlling for, 6, 23
natural experiments and, 118
convenience sample
definition of, 294
conventional observational studies
definition of, 16
evaluation of, 319
counterfactuals
and causality, 109
credibility of models
continuum of, 278

data mining
problems with, 268, 283
data-set observations (DSOs) *see* causal-process observations (CPOs) definition of
Defiers, definition of, 138, 149
design-based research, Rationale for, 4, 24–25
design effect *see* clustered randomization, definition of, 183
Di Tella, Galiani and Schargrodsky (2007) *see* Argentina land-titling study (Galiani and Schargrodsky 2004, 2010)
difference-of-means estimator
and bias in regression-discontinuity designs, 128–33
and confounding variables, 118
examples of analysis using, 13, 115, 279
standard error of, 168
conservative formula for, 191–94
exactness under strict null hypothesis of, 194
unbiased estimation of average causal effects and, 115
Doherty, Green, and Gerber (2006)
credibility of model in, 273
description of, 51
instrumental-variables analysis in, 94
plausibility of as-if random in, 250
relevance of intervention in, 304
double crossover, definition of, 137
Dunning and Nilekani (2010), description of, 82

effect of treatment on Compliers
estimation of, 141–42 *see* instrumental-variables analysis
instrumental-variables least squares (IVLS) estimator and, 151
linear regression and, 150–52
evaluative typology
relationship between dimensions of, 324
exchangeable, definition of, 131
exclusion restriction
in Neyman model, 120–21
expected value
definition of, 114
experiments, true
advantages of, 7
external validity
of conventional observational studies, 297
definition of, 290, 293
in natural experiments, 295–96
in true experiments, 294–95

Fisher's exact test, 186–90
Monte Carlo simulations and, 189
fundamental problem of causal inference, 109
fuzzy regression discontinuity designs *see* regression-discontinuity designs
definition of, 81–82
examples of, 134–35
instrumental-variables analysis of, 135
intention-to-treat principle and, 135

Galiani and Schargrodsky (2004, 2010) *see* Argentina land-titling study
Grofman, Griffin, and Berry (1995)
credibility of models in, 282
description of, 60
plausibility of as-if random in, 252
relevance of intervention in, 305, 306

heteroskedasticity
definition of, 181
Hidalgo (2010), 125
analysis of, 125–26
description of, 72
relevance of intervention in, 291
Hyde (2007) description of, 55

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01766-5 - Natural Experiments in the Social Sciences: A Design-Based Approach
Thad Dunning
Index
More information

hypothesis testing *see* Fisher's exact test
  t-tests and, 171

idiosyncrasy of interventions
  definition of, 290, 298
  in instrumental-variables designs, 299
  randomization and, 298–99
  variation in, 299
independent-variable CPOs
  definition of, 209, 219
  examples of, 219–21
instrumental-variables designs, 87
  analysis of, 135–49
  as-if random assignment in, 152
  assumptions of, 148
  credibility of models in, 101
  definition of, 18
  effect of treatment on Compliers in, 89
    estimation of, 142–43, 154–57
  external validity of, 153
  historical or institutional variation as sources of, 97–101
  key assumptions of, 90, 152, 270
  lotteries as, 94–95
  model- vs. design-based research and, 90
  natural experiments as, 92
  no-Defiers assumption in, 148
  rationale for, 87
  sources of, 91
  standard errors in, 174–75
  true experiments as, 91
  validation of as-if random in, 101
  weather shocks as source of, 95–97
instrumental-variables estimator
  small-sample bias in, 157
instrumental-variables least squares (IVLS) regression, 270
  model specification in, 271
  use of control variables in, 277
intention-to-treat analysis, 87
  definition of, 87
  in the presence of crossover, 138
  reduced-form regression as, 102
intention-to-treat parameter, 111 *see* intention-to-treat analysis
intervention, 29
  relevance of, 29
Iyer (2010), 97
  assumptions of analysis in, 99–100
  description of, 97–100

jurisdictional borders, 175
  clustered randomization and, 175–76, 185–86
  problem of bundling in, 300–02

linear regression models, 263–64
  homogenous partial effects assumption and, 271
  and instrumental-variables estimation, 270
  vs. Neyman model, 152, 264
local average treatment effect (LATE)
  definitions of, 33, 84
lottery studies
  examples of, 49–53
Lyall (2009)
  description of, 55

manipulation, 7
  of experimental treatments, 7
  natural experiments and absence of, 8
matching, 20
  contrast of natural experiments and, 20–21
  definition of, 20–21
mechanism CPOs
  definition of, 209, 222
  examples of, 222, 223
  and mediation analysis, 222
  qualitative methods and, 223
mediation analysis, 38
Miguel, Satyanath, and Sergenti (2004), 95
  assumptions of analysis in, 96
  credibility of model in, 274
  description of, 95–96
  relevance of intervention in, 304
models
  credibility of, 28
  importance of, 283
model-validation CPOs, 209
  definition of
  examples of, 225–28
Moulton correction factor *see* clustered randomization: adjustment by intraclass correlation coefficient and
Multi-method research
  rationale for, 25–26
multivariate regression
  homogeneous partial effects assumption in, 285–86
  limitations of, 265, 267
  rationales for, 263–64

natural experiments, 34
  checklist for, 328
  clustered randomization in, 175–86
  comparative, cross-national questions and, 307
  conceptual stretching and, 34–35
  contrast with conventional observational studies, 15
  contrast with true experiments, 16, 17
  critiques and limitations of, 32–34

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01766-5 - Natural Experiments in the Social Sciences: A Design-Based Approach
Thad Dunning
Index
More information

natural experiments (cont.)
  data analysis in, 172
  definition of, 15–17
  discovery of, 41–42
  evaluation of, 321
  evaluative framework for, 27, 30–32
  external validity of, 295–96
  growth of, 1–2
  importance of substantive knowledge in, 326
  limitations of, 3
  non-compliance in, 136
    box model and, 138
  qualitative methods and, 4
  quantitative analysis of, 4
  rationale for, 2
  role of chance in, 167
  role of qualitative methods in, 208, 218, 228, 229–30
  strengths and limitations of, 315–18
Never-Treats, 138
  definition of, 138
Neyman model, 107–09, 119 *see* potential outcomes
  assumptions of, 119
  as box model, 112
  box of tickets in, 166
    sampling potential outcomes from, 166
  causal parameters in, 259
  and clustered randomization, 175–78
  contrast with linear regression model, 172
  and counterfactuals, 259
  extensions of, 118
  nointerference assumption in, 119
  non-compliance and, 138–40
  simplicity of, 173
  statistical assumptions of, 112–13, 165–66
  strengths and limitations of, 259
Neyman-Rubin-Holland model *see* Neyman model
noninterference assumption, 119, 260
  examples of, 119
  in regression models, 120, 261
null hypothesis, 186
  strict form of, 186
  weak form of, 190

observational studies, 16
  definition of, 16

placebo tests, 247
  in regression-discontinuity designs, 247
Posner (2004), 57
  bundling of treatments in, 300–02
  credibility of models in, 281
  description of, 57–58
  plausibility of as-if random in, 251
  relevance of intervention in, 306
  shoe-leather research of, 221
potential outcomes, 108–09 *see* Neyman model
pre-treatment covariates, 239
  definition of, 239
probability limits, 157
process tracing, 211
  definition of, 211
publication bias, 296
  definition of, 296
  in natural experiments, 296

quasi-experiments, 18
  contrast of natural experiments and, 18–20
  definition of, 18–20

random assignment, 7
  random sampling and, 113
random sampling, 112
randomization, 6
  rationale for, 6–7
randomization inference *see* Fisher's exact test
randomization tests *see* Fisher's exact test
ratio-estimator bias, 157
reduced-form regression *see* intention-to-treat analysis
regression analysis, 22
  credibility of models in, 23
  limitations of, 22–24
regression-discontinuity design, 130
  average causal effect in, 130
    limit of intercepts vs., 130
regression-discontinuity designs, 18
  analysis of, 121–23
  bias of difference-of-means estimator in, 158–60
  close elections as, 77–79
    plausibility of as-if random in, 79
  definition of, 18, 63
  definition of average causal effect in, 122
  discovery of, 69
  history of, 63
  limitations of, 68, 84
  local linear or global polynomial regressions and, 128, 133–34
  plausibility of as-if random in *see* conditional-density (sorting) tests
  population thresholds in, 72–75
  potential outcomes regression function, 130
    slope of, 159
  role of as-if random in, 64, 67, 122
  selection of bandwidth in, 127
    bias-variance tradeoff and, 127
    algorithms for, 127

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01766-5 - Natural Experiments in the Social Sciences: A Design-Based Approach
Thad Dunning
Index
More information

shape of potential outcomes regression function in, 131
sources of, 68
standard errors in, 173–74
true randomization in, 82–83
use of age as, 79–80
use of indices in, 80
use of multiple thresholds in, 83
validation of as-if random in, 127
relevance of intervention, 289, 303
continuum of, 303
definition of, 289–91
importance of, 306
strengthening of, 308
replication
natural experiments, 295–96
of true experiments, 294
response schedule, definition of, 23

sampling distribution, definition of, 165
sampling variance, 168
definition of, 168
of the difference of means of two independent samples, 169
of the mean of an independent random sample, 168
sensitivity analysis, 38
sharp null hypothesis *see* strict null hypothesis
shoe-leather research, 26
definition of, 26, 208, 221, 229
examples of, 221
usefulness of, 313
simplicity of data analysis, advantages of, 105
single crossover, definition of, 137
Slutsky theorem, 157
small-sample bias, 157 *see* ratio-estimator bias
Snow on cholera, 12
credibility of models in, 280
data analysis in, 13
description of, 12–15
natural experiment in, 13
plausibility of as-if random in, 13, 243, 250
qualitative evidence for, 14
quantitative evidence for, 14
relevance of intervention in, 304
role of information, incentives, and capacities in assessing, 243
strengths of study of, 14
treatment-assignment CPOs and, 214–15
specification tests, 248
in instrumental-variables designs, 248
stable-unit treatment-value assumption (SUTVA) *see* noninterference
standard error, 165
definition of, 165
of the difference-of-means estimator, 169
i.i.d. assumption and, 171
standard natural experiments, 18
as-if randomization in, 53–60
definition of, 18
sources of, 43
true randomization in, 48
use of jurisdictional borders in, 57–59
limitations of, 58
use of redistricting as, 59
statistical assumptions, 258
vs. causal assumptions, 258
statistical independence of treatment assignment and confounders, 6, 21
statistical inference, definition of, 258
strict null hypothesis *see* null hypothesis
definition of, 186, 192
relevance of, 190
strong research designs, 318
as aspirational, 319
definition of, 318
importance of mixed methods for, 326
tradeoffs involved in, 319
study group, 108
in regression-discontinuity designs, 122, 127
and selection of bandwidth, 127

Thistlewaite and Campbell (1960), 64
analysis of, 123–25
description of, 64–67
treatment-assignment CPOs
definition of, 209, 212–13
examples of, 213
in instrumental-variables designs, 218
in regression-discontinuity designs, 215–18, 248
true experiments, 320
evaluation of, 320

unbiased estimator, definition of, 114
unit causal effect, 109
urn model *see* Neyman model statistical assumptions

Vietnam draft lottery study (Angrist 1990)
credibility of models in, 322
description of, 8–9
effects in, 8
imperfect compliance in, 137
instrumental-variables analysis in, 87, 143–48
assumptions of, 269–70, 271
intention-to-treat analysis in, 87, 88, 144

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-01766-5 - Natural Experiments in the Social Sciences: A Design-Based Approach
Thad Dunning
Index
More information

Vietnam draft lottery study (Angrist 1990) (cont.)
no-Defiers assumption in, 149
plausibility of as-if random in, 322, 331
relevance of intervention in, 322
study group in, 108, 295
Vietnam draft lottery study (Erikson and Stoker 2011), political effects in, 49

weak form of null hypothesis *see* null hypothesis
definition of, 192

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org