Inequality, Grievances, and Civil War

This book argues that political and economic inequalities following group lines generate grievances that can motivate civil war. The theoretical approach highlights ethnonationalism and how linkages between group identities and inequalities spur mobilization and resort to violence. Although contemporary research on civil war has largely dismissed grievances as irrelevant, emphasizing instead the role of opportunities, the authors show that many alleged nonresults for grievances stem from atheoretical measures, typically based on individualist data. The authors develop new indicators of political and economic exclusion at the group level and demonstrate how these exert strong effects on the risk of civil war. They provide new analyses of the effects of transnational ethnic links and the duration of civil wars and extended case discussions illustrating causal mechanisms.

Lars-Erik Cederman is Professor of International Conflict Research at the Center for Comparative and International Studies at ETH Zürich. He is the author of Emergent Actors in World Politics (1997), the editor of Constructing Europe’s Identity (2001), and the co-editor of New Systems Theories of World Politics (2010). He is the winner of the 2012 and 2002 American Political Science Association’s Heinz I. Eulau Awards, the 2000 Furniss Book Award, and the Horace H. Rackham Dissertation Award from the University of Michigan.

Kristian Skrede Gleditsch is Professor in the Department of Government, University of Essex, and a Research Associate at the Peace Research Institute Oslo (PRIO). He is the author of All International Politics Is Local (2002) and Spatial Regression Models (2008) as well as numerous journal articles. He is the winner of the 2012 American Political Science Association’s Heinz I. Eulau Award, the 2011 International Association for Conflict Management outstanding article in the field award, the 2007 Karl Deutsch Award from the International Studies Association, and the 2000 American Political Science Association’s Helen Dwight Reid Award.

Halvard Buhaug is Research Professor at the Peace Research Institute Oslo and Professor of Political Science at the Norwegian University of Science and Technology. He received the 2006 Royal Norwegian Society of Sciences and Letters award for excellent research by young scholars in human sciences. Recent academic publications include articles in the Journal of Conflict Resolution, Global Environmental Change, International Security, International Organization, and Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the USA.
Cambridge Studies in Contentious Politics

Editors
Mark Beissinger Princeton University
Jack A. Goldstone George Mason University
Michael Hanagan Vassar College
Doug McAdam Stanford University and Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences
Sarah A. Soule Stanford University
Suzanne Staggenborg University of Pittsburgh
Sidney Tarrow Cornell University
Charles Tilly (d. 2008) Columbia University
Elisabeth J. Wood Yale University
Deborah Yashar Princeton University

Ronald Aminzade et al., Silence and Voice in the Study of Contentious Politics
Javier Auyero, Routine Politics and Violence in Argentina: The Gray Zone of State Power
W. Lance Bennett and Alexandra Segerberg, The Logic of Connective Action: Digital Media and the Personalization of Contentious Politics
Clifford Bob, The Marketing of Rebellion: Insurgents, Media, and International Activism
Charles Brockett, Political Movements and Violence in Central America
Valerie Bunce and Sharon Wolchik, Defeating Authoritarian Leaders in Postcommunist Countries
Lars-Erik Cederman, Kristian Skrede Gleditsch, and Halvard Buhaug, Inequality, Grievances, and Civil War
Christian Davenport, Media Bias, Perspective, and State Repression
Gerald F. Davis, Doug McAdam, W. Richard Scott, and Mayer N. Zald, Social Movements and Organization Theory
Donatella della Porta, Clandestine Political Violence
Todd A. Eisenstadt, Politics, Identity, and Mexico’s Indigenous Rights Movements
Daniel Q. Gillion, The Political Power of Protest: Minority Activism and Shifts in Public Policy
Jack A. Goldstone, editor, States, Parties, and Social Movements
Tamara Kay, NAFTA and the Politics of Labor Transnationalism

Continued after the Index
Inequality, Grievances, and Civil War

LARS-ERIK CEDERMAN
Center for Comparative and International Studies,
ETH Zürich

KRISTIAN SKREDE GLEDITSCH
University of Essex and Peace Research Institute Oslo

HALVARD BUHAUG
Peace Research Institute Oslo
Contents

Tables

Figure

Preface

1. Introduction

PART I: THEORIES AND CONCEPTS

2. Inequality and Grievances in the Civil War Literature

3. From Horizontal Inequality to Civil War via Grievances

PART II: EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS OF CIVIL WAR ONSET

4. Political Exclusion and Civil War

5. Economic Inequality and Civil War

6. Transborder Ethnic Kin and Civil War

7. Country-Level Inequalities and Civil War

PART III: BEYOND CIVIL WAR ONSET

8. The Duration and Outcome of Civil Wars

9. Conclusions for Theory and Policy

References

Index
Tables

4.1. Comparing excluded and included groups’ conflict propensities  
4.2. Ethnic groups’ conflict propensity by power-access category  
4.3. Political horizontal inequality and group-level onset of civil war, 1946–2009  
5.1. Economic horizontal inequality and group-level onset of civil war, 1991–2009  
6.1. TEK and group-level onset of civil war, 1946–2009  
7.2. Logit model of civil war onset, 1991–2009  
7.3. Multinomial logit models of civil war onset, 1991–2009  
7.4. High horizontal inequality in 1999 and civil war onset, 2000–9  
7.6. Summary of findings  
8.1. Approaches to civil war dynamics/duration  
8.2. Cox proportional hazard regression estimates of termination, 1946–2009  
8.3. Multinomial logit by outcome type (to conflict continuation), 1946–2009  
9.1. A summary of the confirmed hypotheses of this book  
9.2. Top-ten countries with largest excluded and discriminated shares of the population in 2009
Figures

3.1. The causal path from inequalities to onset through grievances  
3.2. The causal path from horizontal inequalities to grievances  
3.3. The causal path from grievances to civil war onset  
3.4. Grievance-based mechanism as spurious explanation  
3.5. Grievances bypassed through reverse causation  
4.1. The polity model with included and excluded groups  
4.2. Comparing the effect of power access status on civil war onset  
4.3. Comparing the effect on civil war onset for EPR categories  
4.4. The effect of status reversals on the probability of civil war onset  
4.5. Conflict propensity of included and excluded groups as a function of their relative size  
4.6. Conflict propensity as a function of the number of the group’s previous conflict onsets  
5.1. G-Econ cells for Yugoslavia overlaid with GeoEPR group polygons for Slovenes and Albanians  
5.2. Result of spatial wealth estimation for groups in Yugoslavia  
5.3. Result of spatial wealth estimation for groups in the Sudan  
5.4. Result of spatial wealth estimation for groups in Myanmar  
5.5. Conflict probability for groups less wealthy than the country average  
5.6. Conflict probability for groups wealthier than the country average  
5.7. Comparing the effect of relative poverty on the conflict probability of included and excluded ethnic groups
5.8. First-order difference between excluded and included groups

6.1. The ethnonationalist triad with an excluded TEK group

6.2. The ethnonationalist triad with an included TEK group

6.3. The probability of conflict as a function of relative TEK size

6.4. Conflict probability varying with size of included and excluded TEK groups

6.5. Contour plot showing the effect on conflict probability of relative group and TEK sizes

7.1. Vertical versus horizontal political inequality in 2000

7.2. Vertical versus horizontal economic inequality in 2000

7.3. Estimated risk of ethnic governmental conflict as a function of extent of political discrimination (black line) with 90% confidence interval (gray area)

7.4. Estimated risk of ethnic territorial conflict as a function of extent of economic inequality (black line) with 90% confidence interval (gray area)

7.5. ROC plot of out-of-sample prediction, 2000–9

7.6. Scatter plot of individual out-of-sample predictions, 2000–9

8.1. Sequential fighting in civil wars

8.2. Outcome probabilities by time, organizations with link to an excluded group

8.3. Outcome probabilities by time, organizations with link to an excluded group and support from a transnational constituency included in another state

8.4. Outcome probabilities by time, organizations with no link to an excluded ethnic group

9.1. Average democracy levels by world region

9.2. Ethnically excluded population by world region

9.3. Ethnically discriminated population by world region

9.4. Share of excluded population by country in 2009

9.5. Share of discriminated population by country in 2009
Preface

Apart from acquiring real estate, there are few things that make you more indebted than writing collaborative monographs. Indeed, this book is the product not only of our own efforts, but also those of our colleagues and students who made major contributions in terms of conceptual development, data collection, software development, and analysis. In this very respect, the book falls somewhere between a co-authored book and a co-edited volume.

More than anything else, this book is the fruit of several years of intense research collaboration involving a tight network of conflict researchers in Europe. These activities started as an informal network that we labeled Geographic Research On War Network (GROWnet), which originally included colleagues at the Peace Research Institute Oslo (PRIO) and the Norwegian University of Science and Technology in Norway, ETH Zürich and University of Geneva in Switzerland, and the University of Essex in the United Kingdom, and was subsequently extended to collaborators at Uppsala University in Sweden. Within this context, we have published a large amount of co-authored research, with an author list featuring every possible combination of the three authors of this book and beyond. Some of the research panning the way for the book was funded by an ECRP grant on “Disaggregating Civil War” (06ECRPF004) awarded by the European Science Foundation, 2007–10, through individual grants from the national research councils, that is, the Research Council of Norway (182399), Swiss National Science Foundation (105511–116795), and UK Economic and Social Research Council (RES-062–23–0259). Gleditsch also acknowledges support from the Research Council of Norway (180441/V10). As of the summer of 2012, the network received new funding from the European Union as a COST Action (IS 1102), which will allow it to expand its activities to many more partners in Europe under the heading of the European Network of Conflict Research (ENCoRe).
Sidney Tarrow played an instrumental role at a pivotal moment by suggesting that we publish our book project with Cambridge University Press, where Lewis Bateman has supported our work with both patience and professionalism. All in all, we held three book workshops at ETH Zürich on 10 November 2011, at Yale on 24 February 2012, and at PRIO on 10 March 2012. We received excellent feedback from the participants at those workshops, including Keith Darden, Hanne Fjelde, Scott Gates, Jack Goldstone, Håvard Hegre, Helge Holtermann, Simon Hug, Thathis Kalyvas, Janet Lewis, Nicholas Sambanis, Frances Stewart, Andres Vargas, Nils Weidmann, and Tore Wig. We also benefited from comments from participants at seminar presentations at Koç University on 16 April 2012 and the London School of Economics and Political Science on 9 May 2012, including Belgin San Akça, Ali Çalkoğlu, Emre Hatipoglu, Bill Kissane, Omar McDoom, Michael Mousseau, and Jameson Lee Ungerer. In addition, Carles Boix, Michael Hechter, Erik Melander, and Camber Warren commented on parts of the manuscript.

Current and past PhD students and researchers of the International Conflict Research Groups at ETH Zürich have selflessly sacrificed large chunks of their valuable research time to provide public goods in the shape of data projects and analysis. Nils Weidmann and Christa Deiwiks volunteered their skills in terms of data management and computational and spatial analysis. Julian Wucherpfennig and Philipp Hunziker played an instrumental role in project management and econometric analysis. Luc Girardin, with the help of Sebastian Schutte and Philipp Hunziker, created the computational infrastructure that made the project possible, including the data portal GROW®. Manuel Vogt, Nils-Christian Bormann, and Seraina Ruegger managed the coding and updating of large data structures, all related to the Ethnic Power Relations (EPR) data set. Indeed, this book project revolves around this data resource, which originates from research collaboration involving Andreas Wimmer and Brian Min, both then at UCLA. We are grateful to a long list of experts who offered their advice regarding, the coding of countless country cases; see Chapter 4, footnote 7, and http://www.icr.ethz.ch/data. In particular, we would like to acknowledge the expert input by James Scarritt and Manuel Vogt, who helped us update the coding of Sub-Saharan Africa. Our data collection efforts were generously supported by the National Center of Competence in Research, “Challenges to democracy in the 21st century,” and funded by the Swiss National Science Foundation (SNSF) and the Swiss Network for International Studies (SNIS).

At the University of Essex, we have benefited from comments and suggestions from current and former colleagues Tobias Böhmler, Han Dorussen, Ismene Gizelis, Steve Pickering, and Ulrich Pilster. Nils Metternich and Andrea Ruggeri served as research officers on our ESF project and have become valued collaborators who have influenced the research reported in this book in numerous ways.
Research underpinning this book has also benefited greatly from brown-bag seminars and informal discussions with colleagues at PRIO under the auspices of the Centre for the Study of Civil War (CSCW). Being associated with the GROWnet, Scott Gates, Nils Petter Gleditsch, Johan Dittrich Hallberg, Håvard Hegre, Helge Holtermann, and Gudrun Østby have followed the development of this project and generously offered insightful and constructive comments and suggestions along the way. Likewise, we have benefited tremendously from input on GIS, data, and statistical methods from Jan Ketil Rød, Håvard Strand, and Andreas Forø Tollefsen. External CSCW affiliates such as Sabine Carey, David Cunningham, Kathleen Cunningham, Magnus Öberg, Idean Salehyan, and Gerald Schneider have also provided valuable comments. Finally, we would like to thank Andrew John Feltham for his excellent help managing our activities through CSCW.

It should be stressed that a lot of crucial steps were taken in connection with collaborative publications that preceded this book. Andreas Wimmer and Brian Min co-authored an article that inspired Chapter 4 (see Cederman, Wimmer, and Min 2010). Nils Weidmann co-authored the article that constitutes the initial basis of Chapter 5 (see Cederman, Weidmann, and Gleditsch 2011). Chapter 6 draws heavily on an article co-authored with Idean Salehyan and Julian Wucherpfennig (see Cederman, Gleditsch, Salehyan, and Wucherpfennig 2013), Chapter 7 builds on some of our other joint work (see Buhaug, Cederman, and Gleditsch Forthcoming), and Chapter 8 relies on material from articles that we co-authored with David Cunningham and Idean Salehyan (Cunningham, Gleditsch, and Salehyan 2009) as well as Julian Wucherpfennig and Nils Metternich (Wucherpfennig, Metternich, Cederman, and Gleditsch 2012). We are also grateful for the publishers’ permission to use material from these publications.

Last but not least, we would like to acknowledge the continuous support from our partners and families who provided both intellectual inspiration and a healthy counterweight to the “workaholic” tendencies of academic life. Without their boundless patience and generous willingness to bear the burden of often-absent spouses and fathers, this book could not have been written.