

## Structural Dynamics and Economic Growth

Ever since Adam Smith, economists have been preoccupied with the puzzle of economic growth. The standard mainstream models of economic growth were and often still are based either on assumptions of diminishing returns on capital with technological innovation or on endogenous dynamics combined with a corresponding technological and institutional setting. An alternative model of economic growth emerged from the Cambridge School of Keynesian economists in the 1950s and 1960s. This model – developed mainly by Luigi Pasinetti – emphasizes the importance of demand, human learning and the growth dynamics of industrial systems. Finally, in the past decade, new mainstream models have emerged incorporating technology or demand-based structural change and extending the notion of balanced growth. This collection of essays reassesses Pasinetti's theory of structural dynamics in the context of these recent developments, with contributions from economists writing in both the mainstream and the Cambridge Keynesian traditions and including Luigi Pasinetti, William Baumol, Geoffrey Harcourt and Nobel laureate Robert Solow.

RICHARD ARENA is Professor of Economics at the University of Nice-Sophia Antipolis, France, where he is Director of the Institute of Human and Social Sciences. He is also the managing editor of the Revue d'Économie Industrielle.

PIER LUIGI PORTA is Professor of Economics at the University of Milano-Bicocca, Italy, and a visiting fellow of Wolfson College, Cambridge. He is also the Editor-in-Chief of the *International Review of Economics*.





# Structural Dynamics and Economic Growth

Edited by

Richard Arena and Pier Luigi Porta





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107015968

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Structural dynamics and economic growth  $\slash$  edited by Richard Arena, Pier Luigi Porta.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-1-107-01596-8 (Hardback)

1. Economic development. 2. Sustainable development. 3. Pasinetti, Luigi L.–Political and social views. I. Arena, R. (Richard) II. Porta, Pier Luigi. III. Title.

HD82.S84577 2011 338.9-dc23

2011025054

#### ISBN 978-1-107-01596-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



# Contents

List of figures List of tables List of contributors		page vii viii ix
	Introduction: structural dynamics and contemporary growth theory RICHARD ARENA AND PIER LUIGI PORTA	1
Pa	art I Structural dynamics: past and present	35
1	Structural change: some historical aspects of Pasinetti's work with special reference to classical economics PETER D. GROENEWEGEN	37
2	Structural dynamics in historical perspective MARIO POMINI	49
3	Two approaches to the study of structural change and economic development: Kuznets and Pasinetti MOSHE SYRQUIN	69
4	Analyzing knowledge flows by means of vertical integration ÖNDER NOMALER AND BART VERSPAGEN	88
5	Growth: towards a structural endogenous macro-model WILLIAM J. BAUMOL	125
Pa	art II Structural dynamics: the Cambridge Keynesian perspective	135
6	Luigi Pasinetti: the senior living heir of the Cambridge School of Economics and the last of the great system-builder GEOFFREY HARCOURT	rs 137

V



vi	Contents	
7	Towards a synthesis in Post-Keynesian economics in Luigi Pasinetti's contribution HEINRICH BORTIS	145
8	Growth theory, structural dynamics and the analysis of consumption DAVIDE GUALERZI	181
9	Luigi Pasinetti's structural economic dynamics and the employment consequences of new technologies HARALD HAGEMANN	204
10	The concept of 'natural economic system': a tool for structural analysis and an instrument for policy design ROBERTO SCAZZIERI	218
11	Structural change and invariable standards TAKASHI YAGI	241
Par	et III Epilogue: structural dynamics as part of the 'unfinished revolution'	265
	On Pasinetti and the unfinished Keynesian Revolution ROBERT M. SOLOW	267
	First afterword: Pasinetti on structural dynamics ROBERT M. SOLOW	274
	Growth and structural change: perspectives for the future LUIGI L. PASINETTI	276
	Second afterword: the significance of structural economic dynamics LUIGI L. PASINETTI	283
Inde	ex	288



# **Figures**

4.1	Stylized patent-citation network graph	page 91
4.2	Stylized citation network graph used to illustrate	
	formal approach	100
4.3	The construction of the patent citation flow table	102
4.4	Science intensity and net science multipliers ( $\lambda$ and $\gamma$ )	114
4.5	Use pervasiveness versus supply pervasiveness	115
4.6	MDS map of mutual knowledge dependencies	
	among the sectors	117
9.1	Structural economic dynamics: analytical perspectives	207
11.1	Effective wage curve	258
11.2	Real wage curve	261

vii



Table

4.1 Factor analysis on the indicators

page 103

viii



## Contributors

WILLIAM J. BAUMOL is Professor of Economics and Academic Director of the Berkley Center for Entrepreneurial Studies at New York University, and Professor Emeritus at Princeton University. Professor Baumol has written some 40 professional books and 500 articles. He holds eleven honorary degrees and has been elected to three of the United States' leading honorific societies, including the National Academy of Science, as well as to the world's oldest honorary academic society in Italy, the Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei.

HEINRICH BORTIS is Professor of Political Economy at the University of Fribourg, Switzerland, where he teaches economic theory, history of economic thought and economic history. He is the author of numerous articles and books, including *Institutions, Behaviour and Economic Theory* (Cambridge University Press 1997; translated into Ukrainian 2007 and into Russian 2009).

DAVIDE GUALERZI teaches political economy in the Department of Economics at the University of Padua, Italy. He received his PhD from the Graduate Faculty, New School for Social Research, New York. He has taught at the University of Pisa and was Assistant Professor of Economics at Bard College, New York, as well as Visiting Professor at UBA (University of Buenos Aires), and Visiting Scholar in the Department of Economics, New School for Social Research, New York. He has served as a consultant to several Italian and international institutions. His research is in the fields of political economy, growth and structural change, consumption theory, urban and regional development. His latest book is *The Coming of Age of Information Technologies and the Path of Transformational Growth* (2010), a long-run perspective on the late 2000s' recession.

PETER D. GROENEWEGEN is Emeritus Professor of Economics at the University of Sydney and a well-known scholar of the history of economic thought. He is a distinguished fellow of the History of Economics

ix



## x List of contributors

Society and an honorary life member of the European Society of the History of Economic Thought. His published works include the definitive biography of Alfred Marshall, a series of edited economic classics, some of them in English translation, three volumes of collected essays, an edition of Turgot's major economic writings in English translation, and a history of Australian economics. He is currently completing a volume on 'minor' Marshallians dealing with ten students of Marshall and their role in spreading the 'economic organon'.

HARALD HAGEMANN is Professor of Economic Theory at the University of Hohenheim, Stuttgart, Germany. He is also a life member of Clare Hall, University of Cambridge. In the academic year 1999/2000 he was Theodor-Heuss-Professor at the Graduate Faculty of Political and Social Sciences at New School University, New York. He has taught at the universities of Bremen and Kiel, the Free University of Berlin, and as a Visiting Professor at the Universities of Bologna, Linz, Nice, Paris I Pantheon-Sorbonne, Strasbourg and Sydney. His research covers growth and structural change, technological change and employment, business cycle theory and the history of economic thought. He is President of the European Society for the History of Economic Thought (ESHET).

GEOFFREY HARCOURT is a graduate of the universities of Melbourne and Cambridge. He taught for half his working life in Adelaide and the other half (with overlaps) in Cambridge, where he has spent part of every decade since the 1950s. He is Visiting Professorial Fellow (2010–2013) at the School of Economics at UNSW (and Emeritus Reader in the History of Economic Theory, Cambridge (1998), Emeritus Fellow, Jesus College, Cambridge (1998) and Professor Emeritus, Adelaide (1988)). He is the author and/or editor of 25 books, including 9 volumes of selected essays and more than 240 articles and/or chapters in volumes. With Prue Kerr, in 2009 he wrote an intellectual biography of Joan Robinson.

ÖNDER NOMALER is Assistant Professor in the Department of Industrial Engineering and Innovation Sciences at Eindhoven University of Technology. In 1993, he received his BSc degree in Industrial Engineering at the Middle East Technical University (METU) in Ankara. In 1996, he received his MSc degree in Economics at the same university, where he also worked as research and teaching assistant for two years. He earned his PhD in Economics in 2006 at Maastricht University. His research interests include economic growth and international trade, innovation and technological change,



List of contributors xi

evolutionary modelling, agent-based simulation modelling, bibliometrics, scientometrics and infometrics.

LUIGI L. PASINETTI is a leading member of the second generation of Cambridge Keynesians. He was Reader in Economics and Official Fellow of King's College, Cambridge up to the mid-1970s, then Professor of Economic Analysis (now Emeritus) at the Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore, Milan. A student of Piero Sraffa and Richard Kahn, he developed one of the first rigorous mathematical formulations of Ricardo's theory of value and distribution. Along with them, as well as Joan Robinson, he was one of the prominent members on the Cambridge (UK) side of the Cambridge capital controversy. His contributions to economics include developing the analytical foundations of neo-Ricardian economics, including the theory of value and distribution, as well as work in the line of Kaldorian theory of growth and income distribution. He has developed the theory of structural change and economic growth, structural economic dynamics and uneven sectoral development. His most recent book is Keynes and the Cambridge Keynesians (Cambridge University Press, 2007).

MARIO POMINI is Associate Professor of Economics in the Department of Economics and Management at the University of Padua, Italy. His main research interests lie in the areas of philosophy of social sciences, economic methodology and the history of economic thought. He has published many articles on the recent history of Italian economic thought, with particular reference to the Paretian tradition.

ROBERTO SCAZZIERI is Professor of Economic Analysis at the University of Bologna. He is also Senior Member of Gonville and Caius College and life member of Clare Hall, University of Cambridge. His research interests cover the theory of production, structural economic dynamics, the economic theory of institutions and organisations, the epistemology of economics, and the history of economic analysis. He has contributed scholarly papers in the above research fields and has published a number of books, including A Theory of Production (1993), Production and Economic Dynamics (Cambridge University Press, 1996), co-edited with Michael Landesmann, Markets, Money and Capital (Cambridge University Press, 2008), co-edited with A. Sen and S. Zamagni, Capital, Time and Transitional Dynamics (2008), co-edited with H. Hagemann, and Fundamental Uncertainty (2011), co-edited with S. Marzetti Dall'Aste Brandolini. He was awarded the St Vincent Prize for Economics, 1984 and the Linceo Prize for Economics, 2004.



## xii List of contributors

ROBERT M. SOLOW is a leading theorist on economic growth. He started to specialise in economics immediately after the Second World War at Harvard University under Wassily Leontief. He then moved to MIT, where he was appointed Professor of Economics in 1958. In 1979 he served as President of the American Economic Association. In 1987 he was awarded the Nobel Prize in Economic Sciences for his contributions to the theory of economic growth, and in 1999 he was honoured with the National Medal of Science – one of only seven economists ever to have won that distinction. Since 2000 he has divided his time between MIT and the Russell Sage Foundation in New York, where he is the Foundation's only permanent fellow.

MOSHE SYRQUIN is Professor of Economics in the Department of International Studies at the University of Miami. He obtained his undergraduate degree from Bar-Ilan University in Israel and a PhD in Economics from Harvard University. He has been a visiting professor at various universities and institutes, including Harvard, Rice, Toronto, Ancona, the Catholic University of Milan, the State University of Milan at Bicocca, and ICER (International Centre for Economic Research) in Turin. He has co-authored and edited 6 books and written more than 60 papers in professional journals.

BART VERSPAGEN holds the chair of International Economics at Maastricht University and is Professorial Fellow at the United Nations University institute UNU-MERIT, Maastricht. He has a PhD from UNU-MERIT and Maastricht University, and previously held the chair of Economics of Innovation and Technological Change at Eindhoven University of Technology. He is also a visiting professor at the TIK Institute at the University of Oslo. His research interests include economic growth and the relationship to innovation and technological change, evolutionary modeling of economic processes, microeconometrics of innovation and innovation indicators.

TAKASHI YAGI is Professor in the School of Political Science and Economics at Meiji University, Japan. He studied economics at the School of Political Science and Economics, and at the Graduate School of Economics, Waseda University. He became an assistant professor at Gunma University in 1993, a professor in 2003, and moved to Meiji University in 2009. He has had visiting appointments at Wolfson College and the Faculty of Economics, Cambridge (1999–2000) through a fellowship from the Ministry of Education of Japan, and at the Centro Sraffa of the University of Rome 3 (2003) through the Piero Sraffa Fellowship. His research interests are in Sraffian economics, post-Keynesian economics, capital theory and distribution, structural dynamics and economic growth, and input–output analysis.