

## Capabilities, Gender, Equality

Questions of gender, injustice and equality pervade all our lives, and as such, the capabilities or "human development" approach to understanding well-being and basic political entitlements continues to be debated. In this thought-provoking book, a range of authors provides unique reflections on the capabilities approach and, specifically, Martha C. Nussbaum's contributions to issues of gender, equality and political liberalism. Moreover, the authors tackle a broad range of development issues, including those of religion, ecological and environmental justice, social justice, child care, disability, and poverty. This is the first book to examine Nussbaum's work in political philosophy in such depth, bringing together a group of distinguished experts with diverse disciplinary perspectives. It also features a unique contribution from Nussbaum herself, in which she offers reactions to the discussion and her latest thoughts on the capabilities approach. Capabilities, Gender, Equality will interest a wide range of readers and policy-makers interested in new human development policies.

FLAVIO COMIM is an Associate Professor of Economics at the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS), Brazil. He is also an Affiliated Lecturer for the Department of Land Economy and the Centre of Development Studies and a Von Hugel Research Associate at the University of Cambridge. He has published widely in areas such as history of economic thought, economic methodology, development ethics, and the capability approach.

MARTHA C. NUSSBAUM is the Ernst Freund Distinguished Service Professor of Law and Ethics at the University of Chicago, appointed in the Law School and the Philosophy Department. Over the years, Nussbaum has extended and developed the capabilities approach, and she has received numerous awards for her work.





# Capabilities, Gender, Equality

Towards Fundamental Entitlements

Edited by

Flavio Comim and Martha C. Nussbaum





**CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107015692

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Capabilities, gender, equality: towards fundamental entitlements / edited by Flavio Comim and Martha C. Nussbaum.

pages cm

Includes index.

ISBN 978-1-107-01569-2 (Hardback)

Economic development–Developing countries.
 Equality–Developing countries.
 Social planning–Developing countries.
 Comim, Flavio.
 Nussbaum, Martha Craven, 1947–

HC59.7.C3137 2013

330.9172'4001-dc23 2013014367

ISBN 978-1-107-01569-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### Contents

	List of figures pa	ge vii
	List of tables	viii
	List of contributors	ix
	Preface	xi
	Introduction: capabilities, challenges, and the omnipresence of political liberalism MARTHA C. NUSSBAUM	1
Par	t I The capabilities approach	17
1	Perfectionist liberalism and political liberalism MARTHA C. NUSSBAUM	19
2	Rawlsian social-contract theory and the severely disabled HENRY S. RICHARDSON	57
3	Logos, pathos and ethos in Martha C. Nussbaum's capabilitie approach to human development DES GASPER	s 96
4	Building capabilities: a new paradigm for human development FLAVIO COMIM	131
5	Capabilities or functionings? Anatomy of a debate MARC FLEURBAEY	155
6	From humans to all of life: Nussbaum's transformation of dignity JEREMY BENDIK-KEYMER	175

v



vi Contents

٧ı	Contents	
Par	t II Gender	193
7	Questioning the gender-based division of labour: the contribution of the capabilities approach to feminist economics ULRIKE KNOBLOCH	195
8	Primary goods, capabilities, and the millennium development target for gender equity in education ELAINE UNTERHALTER AND HARRY BRIGHOUSE	215
9	The weight of institutions on women's capabilities: how far can microfinance help? MURIEL GILARDONE, ISABELLE GUÉRIN AND JANE PALIER	244
10	The capabilities of women: towards an alternative framework for development SANTOSH MEHROTRA	274
11	Applying the capabilities approach to disability, poverty, and gender PATRICIA WELCH SALEEBY	308
12	Educational transformation, gender justice and Nussbaum's capabilities MELANIE WALKER	322
13	The social contract, unpaid child care and women's income capability HILDE BOJER	341
Par	t III Equality	355
14	Lists and thresholds: comparing the Doyal–Gough theory of human need with Nussbaum's capabilities approach IAN GOUGH	357
15	Nussbaum, Rawls, and the ecological limits of justice: using capability ceilings to resolve capability conflicts BREENA HOLLAND	382
16	Social justice and Nussbaum's concept of the person JOHN M. ALEXANDER	414
17	God and Martha C. Nussbaum: towards a Reformed Christian view of capabilities JONATHAN WARNER	437
	Index	464



## **Figures**

10.1	Education and health feedback effects	<i>page</i> 285
10.2	Life cycle of an educated girl	287
10.3	Malnutrition rates by regions – under-fives suffering	
	from underweight (Mod+ Severe), 2006–2010	290
10.4	Small women create low-birth-weight babies – percentag	ge
	of infants with lbw by region	291
10.5	Discrimination against women – life expectancy of	
	females as a percentage of males – by region, 2010	293
10.6	Sex ratio by region (males per 100 females), 2010	294

vii



## **Tables**

3.1	Essential areas for work on human development	page 97
3.2	First three parts of a comparison of the capabilities	
	ethics of Sen and Nussbaum	103
3.3	Sen and Nussbaum's capability concepts and labels	106
3.4	Final two parts of a comparison of the capabilities ethics	
	of Sen and Nussbaum	111
3.5	Comparison of Sen and Nussbaum's attention to stages	
	and cases	112
8.1	Primary net enrolment ratio and survival rate to last	
	primary grade by gender 2010	218
8.2	Proportion of age cohort aged 17-22 in 2011 with less th	an
	four years of education in selected East African countries	219
8.3	Women as a proportion of the projected population	
	of adult illiterates, 2015	219
10.1	Economic growth by level of income-poverty and	
	human development	296
14.1	Comparing the lists	370
17.1	Central human functional capabilities	460

viii



## Contributors

- JOHN M. ALEXANDER Professor of Business Ethics, Loyola Institute of Business Administration, Loyola College, Chennai, India
- JEREMY BENDIK-KEYMER Elmer G. Beamer Hubert H. Schneider Professor in Ethics and Associate Professor of Philosophy, Department of Philosophy, Case Western Reserve University
- HILDE BOJER Associate Professor Emerita, Department of Economics, University of Oslo
- HARRY BRIGHOUSE Professor, Philosophy Department and Affiliate Professor of Educational Policy Studies, University of Wisconsin–Madison
- FLAVIO COMIM Associate Professor, UFRGS, Brazil and Affiliated Lecturer in Human Development and Ecosystems, Department of Land Economy and the Centre of Development Studies, University of Cambridge.
- MARC FLEURBAEY Robert E. Kuenne Professor of Economics and Humanistic Studies, Woodrow Wilson School and University Center for Human Values, Princeton University
- DES GASPER Professor of Human Development, Development Ethics and Public Policy, International Institute of Social Studies, Erasmus University Rotterdam
- MURIEL GILARDONE Associate Professor, Normandie Université, UCBN, CREM (UMR CNRS 6211)
- IAN GOUGH Visiting Professor, London School of Economics and Political Science, Centre for the Analysis of Social Exclusion (CASE) and Centre for the Study of Global Governance; Emeritus Professor of Social Policy, University of Bath
- ISABELLE GUÉRIN Research Fellow, Institut de Recherche pour le Développement, Paris School of Economics

ix



#### x List of contributors

- BREENA HOLLAND Associate Professor, Political Science Department and the Environmental Initiative, Lehigh University
- ULRIKE KNOBLOCH PostDoc and Lecturer in Gender, Economics and Ethics, Department of Social Sciences, University of Fribourg, Switzerland
- SANTOSH MEHROTRA Director-General Institute of Applied Manpower Research, Planning Commission, Government of India
- MARTHA C. NUSSBAUM Ernst Freund Distinguished Service Professor of Law and Ethics, The Law School, The University of Chicago
- JANE PALIER Research Fellow, Centre Walras, University Lumière Lyon 2; Research Scholar, Institut de Recherche pour le Développement
- HENRY S. RICHARDSON Professor, Department of Philosophy and Senior Research Scholar, Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University
- PATRICIA WELCH SALEEBY Assistant Professor, School of Social Work, Southern Illinois University Carbondale
- ELAINE UNTERHALTER Professor of Education and International Development, Faculty of Policy and Society, Institute of Education, University of London
- MELANIE WALKER National Research Foundation Chair in Higher Education and Human Development, University of the Free State, South Africa
- JONATHAN WARNER Professor and Tutor in Economics, Quest University Canada



#### **Preface**

Professor Martha C. Nussbaum is one of the most distinguished and influential philosophers of our times, a towering figure in philosophy and the social sciences. Her work has inspired a generation of philosophers, economists, sociologists, educators, anthropologists, psychologists, social scientists, policy-makers, planners and development practitioners to reflect upon issues of justice, gender, human rights, political liberalism, religion, education, disability, among many others. This book delves into key elements of her work from a critical perspective and explores future challenges for the capabilities approach.

The origin of this book lies in a conference entitled 'Promoting Women's Capabilities: examining Nussbaum's Capabilities Approach', convened by the Von Hügel Institute of St Edmund's College, Cambridge in September 2002. The conference brought interdisciplinary scholars from around the world to discuss the work of Professor Nussbaum and it closed with a riveting debate between Professor Nussbaum and Professor Sen on their work on capabilities. In 2001 a conference at St Edmund's College had examined the work of Professor Amartya Sen. These two conferences were followed by the Pavia Conferences in 2003 and 2004 and the founding of the Human Development and Capability Association (HDCA). Not enough could be said of the inspirational leadership of the late Father Frank Carey, then Director of the Von Hügel Institute, in the realization of the Cambridge Conferences. His compassion and love for humanity and his faith in the fight against injustices were defining of these two special moments for capabilities scholars.

The contributions to this book include a number of papers based on the conference and also invited papers. The preparation process, in addition to two rounds of peer reviewing, benefited from comments from Professor Nussbaum on the conference papers and, following the publication of her *tour de force*, *Frontiers of Justice*, in 2006 and of *Creating Capabilities* in 2011, authors had the opportunity to further elaborate their papers.

хi



#### xii Preface

This book examines, from an interdisciplinary perspective, several aspects of Professor Nussbaum's work, with focus on gender, equality and foundational issues of her approach. While her research and writings cover a much wider universe, the book themes are strategic in her work and key for understanding the impact of her capabilities approach on political philosophy and human development.

To a large extent, Professor Nussbaum's work is revolutionary. She invites her readers to reinterpret the contribution of John Rawls and the meaning of political liberalism. She presents new views on transnational justice, disability and justice to non-human animals, new perspectives on gender discrimination, new challenges to educational policies, and new policies for considering the role of art, public spaces, emotions, the workplace and the government in the promotion of human development and global justice. Professor Nussbaum's work enriches our understanding of the 'human' in human development. Her capabilities approach provides a solid foundation for tackling complex issues. The present book offers a reflection on core aspects of her magnificent contribution to philosophy, political and social sciences.

Flavio Comim