INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY AND THE COMMON LAW

In this volume, leading scholars of intellectual property and information policy examine what the common law – understood broadly as a method of reasoning, an approach to rulemaking, and a body of substantive law – can contribute to discussions about intellectual property. Drawing on a range of interdisciplinary ideas and principles that are embedded within the working of the common law, the volume shows that answers to many of modern intellectual property law’s most puzzling questions may be found in the versatility and adaptability of the common law in all of its wisdom. The various chapters argue that, despite the degree of interdisciplinary specialization that the field sees today, intellectual property is fundamentally a creation of the law; and that the basic building blocks of the law can shed important light on the working of our various intellectual property regimes.

Shyamkrishna Balganesh is an Assistant Professor of Law at the University of Pennsylvania Law School. His scholarship focuses on understanding how intellectual property and innovation policy can benefit from the use of ideas, concepts, and structures from different areas of private law. He obtained his J.D. from Yale Law School, where he was an Articles & Essays Editor at the *Yale Law Journal* and a Student Fellow at the Information Society Project.
Intellectual Property and the Common Law

Edited by

SHYAMKRISHNA BALGANESH
University of Pennsylvania Law School
Intellectual property and the common law / edited by Shyamkrishna Balganesh, University of Pennsylvania Law School.

pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
isbn 978-1-107-01415-2 (hardback)
K4601.15724 2013
346.048–dc23 201301076
isbn 978-1-107-01415-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of urls for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.
## Contents

**Contributors**  
*page ix*

**Acknowledgments**  
*xi*

**Introduction: Exploring an Unlikely Connection**  
Shyamkrishna Balganesh  
*1*

**PART I. JUDGE-MADE INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW**

1 **Judges and Property**  
Hanoch Dagan  
*17*

2 **Equitable Intellectual Property: What’s Wrong with Misappropriation?**  
Henry E. Smith  
*42*

3 **The Mixed Heritage of Federal Intellectual Property Law and Ramifications for Statutory Interpretation**  
Peter S. Menell  
*63*

4 **Interpretive Methodology and Delegations to Courts: Are “Common Law Statutes” Different?**  
Margaret H. Lemos  
*89*

5 **Dynamic Claim Interpretation**  
Dan L. Burk  
*107*

R. Polk Wagner and Lee Petherbridge  
*123*
vi

Contents

7 An Empirical Look at Trade Secret Law’s Shift from Common to Statutory Law  
Michael Risch 151

8 The Impact of Codification on the Judicial Development of Copyright  
Christopher S. Yoo 177

PART II. THE COMMON LAW METHOD IN INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY

9 Legal Pragmatism and Intellectual Property Law  
Thomas F. Cotter 211

10 Copyright, Custom, and Lessons from the Common Law  
Jennifer E. Rothman 230

11 Common Law Reasoning and Cybertrespass  
Emily Sherwin 252

PART III. STATE INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW

12 The Intellectual Property Clause’s Preemptive Effect  
Jeanne C. Fromer 265

13 Trademark Law’s Faux Federalism  
Mark P. McKenna 288

PART IV. PLURAL VALUES IN INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY

14 The Normative Structure of Copyright Law  
Shyamkrishna Balganesh 313

15 Trade Secret and Human Freedom  
Madhavi Sunder 334

16 Laying Bare an Ethical Thread: From IP to Property to Private Law?  
David Lametti 353

PART V. PARALLELS BETWEEN THE SUBSTANTIVE COMMON LAW AND INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY

17 Technology and Tracing Costs: Lessons from Real Property  
Molly Shaffer Van Houweling 385
Contents

18 Intellectual Usufructs: Trade Secrets, Hot News, and the Usufructuary Paradigm at Common Law  404
   Eric R. Claeys

19 The Fault Liability Standard in Copyright  431
   Steven Hetcher

20 The Concept of “Harm” in Copyright  452
   Wendy J. Gordon

21 The Role of Unfair Competition in the Common Law  484
   Shyamkrishna Balganesh and Gideon Parchomovsky

22 The Fractioning of Patent Law  504
   Mark A. Lemley

23 Permanent Injunctions as Punitive Damages in Patent Infringement Cases  514
   Paul J. Heald

24 Sequential Injunctions in Patent Litigation: The Gratuitous Novelty of TiVo v. EchoStar  530
   Richard A. Epstein

Index  553
Contributors

Shyamkrishna Balganesh is an Assistant Professor of Law at the University of Pennsylvania Law School.

Dan L. Burk is the Chancellor’s Professor of Law at the University of California-Irvine School of Law.

Eric R. Claeys is a Professor of Law at the George Mason University School of Law.

Thomas F. Cotter is the Briggs and Morgan Professor of Law at the University of Minnesota Law School.

Hanoch Dagan is the Stewart and Judy Colton Professor of Law at the Tel-Aviv University Faculty of Law.

Richard A. Epstein is the Laurence A. Tisch Professor of Law at the New York University School of Law. He is also the Peter and Kirsten Bedford Senior Fellow at the Hoover Institution and the James Parker Hall Distinguished Service Professor of Laws (Emeritus) and Senior Lecturer at the University of Chicago.

Jeanne C. Fromer is a Professor of Law at the New York University School of Law.

Wendy J. Gordon is a William Fairfield Warren Distinguished Professor and Professor of Law at Boston University School of Law.

Paul J. Heald is a Professor of Law at the University of Illinois College of Law.

Steven Hetcher is visiting scholar at the University of Tennessee, Knoxville, School of Law.

David Lametti is an Associate Professor of Law at the McGill University Faculty of Law.

Mark A. Lemley is the William H. Neukom Professor of Law at the Stanford Law School.
Contributors

Margaret H. Lemos is a Professor of Law at the Duke University School of Law.

Mark P. McKenna is a Professor of Law at the Notre Dame University Law School.

Peter S. Menell is the Koret Professor of Law at the University of California Berkeley Law School.

Gideon Parchomovsky is the Robert G. Fuller, Jr., Professor of Law at the University of Pennsylvania Law School.

Lee Petherbridge is a Professor of Law and the Richard A. Vachon, S.J. Fellow at Loyola Law School, Los Angeles.

Michael Risch is a Professor of Law at the Villanova University School of Law.

Jennifer E. Rothman is a Professor of Law and the Joseph Scott Fellow at Loyola Law School, Los Angeles.

Emily Sherwin is a Professor of Law at the Cornell University Law School.

Henry E. Smith is the Fessenden Professor of Law at the Harvard Law School.

Madhavi Sunder is a Professor of Law at the University of California Davis School of Law.

Molly Shaffer Van Houweling is a Professor of Law at the University of California Berkeley School of Law.

R. Polk Wagner is a Professor of Law at the University of Pennsylvania Law School.

Christopher S. Yoo is the John H. Chestnut Professor of Law, Communication, and Computer & Information Science and the Founding Director of the Center for Technology, Innovation and Competition at the University of Pennsylvania.
Acknowledgments

This volume originated at a symposium on the connection between intellectual property and the common law, held at the University of Pennsylvania Law School on May 6–7, 2011. The symposium was sponsored by the law school’s Center for Technology, Innovation and Competition (CTIC), and it brought together a wonderful group of scholars working in the areas of intellectual property law, common law, and legal philosophy. Most of the chapters in this volume were presented in draft form at the symposium and formed the basis for discussion there. I am especially grateful to my colleague Christopher S. Yoo for encouraging me to explore the connection between intellectual property and the common law, which is the dominant theme in my own work, as part of a full symposium and volume (his idea that I should look for a theme that “really pops” resonated well with me). I would also like to thank my other colleagues on the Penn Law faculty who work on intellectual property issues – David Abrams, Gideon Parchomovsky, and R. Polk Wagner – for their encouragement, and Dean Michael Fitts for his unfailing support and help in making the symposium happen.

Working with the authors of the chapters in this volume has been a genuine pleasure, and I am grateful to them for the readiness with which they all embraced the broad theme, even when it did not fully fit with their prior research, and for sharing in my general sentiment that there was indeed something meaningful to explore in the connection between intellectual property and the common law. I owe each of them a debt of gratitude for their creative contributions to the volume and, above all, for their patience and cooperation during the editing process. At the law school, Anna Gavin played a pivotal role in helping with the logistics of the symposium from which this volume arose. I also owe special thanks to my research assistant at the law school, Eric Hague, who did a masterful job editing the various chapters, and to John Berger at Cambridge University Press for facilitating the endeavor.