

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
Introduction	1
PART I Problematic, Theory, Methodology	13
1 The Chaskalson Court's achievement	15
1.1 Judicial politics: a brief introduction	17
1.2 Criteria of success in political terms	27
1.3 The Court's success in political terms	33
1.4 The Court's success in legal terms: four illustrative responses	38
1.5 The ideal of adjudication according to law	49
1.6 Translating the common elements of the ideal into shared criteria	62
1.7 The distinctiveness of the criteria and the justification for this study	66
2 A conceptual framework for assessing the performance of constitutional courts	72
2.1 Two forms of constraint	73
2.2 Four central cases	88
2.3 Judge-driven changes to a court's position on the matrix	93
2.4 Constitutional courts in new and old democracies	104
2.5 The success of constitutional courts in interdisciplinary law/politics terms	108
3 Operationalising the conceptual framework to explain the Court's achievement	112
3.1 The Court's starting position on the matrix	114
3.1.1 The vertical axis: South African legal-professional culture	114
3.1.2 The horizontal axis: the Court's relative insulation from political attack	120

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01364-3 - The Politics of Principle: The First South African Constitutional Court, 1995–2005

Theunis Roux

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x

CONTENTS

3.2	Tracking the Court's movement across the matrix	128
3.3	Choosing the cases	138
PART II Context		141
4	The political context for judicial review, 1995–2005	143
4.1	South Africa's pre-democratic tradition of judicial independence	145
4.2	The character of the ANC and its commitment to liberal constitutionalism	152
4.3	Constitutional provisions affecting the Court's independence from political control	161
4.3.1	The two-stage constitution-making process	162
4.3.2	The judicial appointments process	165
4.4	The changing political context for judicial review	170
4.4.1	Racial reconciliation, 1994–1996	171
4.4.2	Technocratic centralism, 1997–2005	177
4.5	Conclusion	189
5	Constraints and opportunities: The law/politics distinction in South African legal-professional culture	191
5.1	The received tradition: South African legal-professional culture before 1994	192
5.2	The impact of the post-apartheid Constitutions on South African legal-professional culture	201
5.2.1	The character of the post-apartheid Constitutions	203
5.2.2	The necessarily entailed impact of the post-apartheid Constitutions	207
5.2.3	The contingent impact: internal factors	209
5.2.4	The contingent impact: external factors	215
5.3	The Chaskalson Court's judicial ethic	219
PART III Thematic Case Studies		233
6	Death, desire and discrimination: the Chaskalson Court between constitutional and positive morality	235
6.1	Abolishing the death penalty: <i>S. v. Makwanyane</i>	238
6.2	Customary law and the right to equality: <i>Bhe</i>	248
6.3	Same-sex marriage: <i>Fourie</i>	252
6.4	Identifying the strategy	257
7	Social rights	262
7.1	Background to the inclusion of social rights in the 1996 Constitution	265

CONTENTS

xi

7.2	An ‘agonising’ start: <i>Soobramoney</i>	273	
7.3	Choosing the strategy: <i>Grootboom</i>	280	
7.4	Exploiting the micro-politics: <i>Treatment Action Campaign</i>	292	
8	Property rights	304	
8.1	Political parameters	305	
8.1.1	The political origins of s 25	305	
8.1.2	ANC economic policy after 1994	308	
8.2	The cases	312	
8.2.1	Constructing the constitutional property clause inquiry	314	
8.2.2	Reconciling property rights and the right to housing in s 26	324	
8.3	Concluding thoughts	331	
9	Political rights	334	
9.1	Prisoners’ right to vote: <i>August</i> and <i>NICRO</i>	336	
9.2	Judicial review of electoral system rules: <i>New National Party</i>	341	
9.3	Floor-crossing: <i>United Democratic Movement</i>	351	
9.4	Resolving the paradox	362	
10	Cross-cutting strategies	365	
10.1	The Court’s separation of powers doctrine	366	
10.2	Access and jurisdiction	377	
10.3	Purely rhetorical strategies	383	
	Conclusion	387	
	<i>Bibliography</i>	399	
	<i>Index</i>	419	