INDEX

Note: Chaskalson Court is often shortened to ‘Court’ in subheading entries.

1993 Constitution, death penalty 238–9
1996 Constitution
analysis 205–7
background to inclusion of social
rights 265–73
Bill of Rights 203–4
courts’ power re violation of rights
370–1
difficulties following adoption at
same time as GEAR 177–80
equality clause 204–5
heterosexual marriage 253
housing rights 204, 283
hybrid approach to limitations on
rights 369–70
judicial appointments 169–70
judicial independence 206
jurisdiction of Constitutional Court
380–2
Karl Klare’s views see Klare, Karl
political origins of property clause
304–8
property rights 204, 325–7
rights-based judicial review 203–4
special majority for amending Bills
354
voting rights 336–7
access to constitutional courts 377–83
Ackermann, Justice, First National
Bank judgment 315–20, 332
Ackermann, Laurie 220–1, 224–5
adjudication, pragmatic 69–70
adjudication according to law see ideal
of adjudication according to law
adjudicative strategies
Chaskalson Court 217–19, 257–61
constraints 99–101
African attitudes to law, effect on
Chaskalson Court 215, 217
African National Congress see ANC
agricultural land, redistribution of 30
per cent 173
American legal system
appointment of federal judges 20
undermining Supreme Court’s
independence 23
ANC
Arms Deal 184–5
Bill of Rights following hybrid
human rights tradition 203, 236
cadre deployment policy 178
centrist faction
human rights 155–6
Mbeki 177
reining in RDP 176
vulnerable to challenge 175–6, 179
character as a political party 143–4
Chaskalson Court
judges’ management of
relationship with ANC 261, 350
legitimating social transformation
project 125
members’ ties to ANC 127
need for independence of 144,
162
nurturing ANC’s commitment to
constitutional democracy 363
relationship with 261, 350, 363
in transition to democracy 127
419
ANC (cont.)
committee to constitutional
democracy 33–4, 363
to constitutional project 388
to human rights 155–6, 203, 236
to judicial independence 127
to liberal constitutionalism 160–1
to social rights 265–7, 269–71
Constitutional Guidelines for a
Democratic South Africa 266–7
corruption 185
COSATU rift 310
crime 336, 340
death penalty 174, 239–40
divided civil service 171
economic policy after 1994, 308–12
entering office in May 1994, 171–3
factionalism 388–9
history and character 152–60
HIV-prevention strategy 185–6
land reform policy 305, 310–12
legislative reform programme 164, 173–5
moral failures 178, 184–6
National Party pact 172
NEC’s control of appointment of
provincial premiers 183
New National Party case 350
political dominance
1994 elections 67
1999 and 2004 elections 177
Court under no threat 175
Court’s lack of public support 37–8, 125–8
reputation as South Africa’s liberator 389–90
post-1996 163–5
present situation 391–3, 398
property rights 305–7
Zimbabwe 186
apartheid
human rights lawyers 150–1, 398
impact on South African
legal-professional culture 117–18, 197
implementation of 147–9
Appellate Division, manipulation of 147–8
Arms Deal, ANC 184–5
Asmal, Kader 157
Atiyah, Patrick 80
attitudinal model in judicial politics
Court’s achievement 68
death penalty decision 34
explanatory power compared with strategic model 22
judicial behaviour as function of judicial ideology 30–1, 131
main features 18–21
Australian High Court, political turbulence 94–5
authoritarian rule, culture of courts after 106
Barak, Aharon 373–4
Bilchitz, David
criticism of Court’s treatment of social rights 263–4
of Grootboom decision 285, 291
of Treatment Action Campaign decision 300
Bill of Rights
1996 Constitution 203–4
challenges to legislation 207
common law development 205
conformance test required by post-apartheid Constitutions 208
Constitutional Guidelines for a
Democratic South Africa 266–7
following ANC’s hybrid human rights tradition 203, 236
interpretation of its provisions 242, 250
judges’ reasoning methods 211
socio-economic rights 203
test for validity of legal rules 207
Bizos, George 240
Black Administration Act 1927 248–9, 251
Calland, Richard 169
Cape voters’ roll, removal of Coloureds 148–9
cases
chronological or thematic approach 140
politically salient 138–9
centrism faction of ANC 175–6
Chanock, Martin 194–6
charts depicting constraints of constitutional courts 77–111
Chaskalson, Arthur 220–1
acquaintance with Mandela 173
Constitution Fourteenth Amendment Bill speech 187
as human rights lawyer 221–2
as JSC interviewer 222–3
leadership contribution to work of Court 41–2
rhetorical skills 385–6
role in transition to democracy 40
term as Chief Justice 170
Chaskalson Court
1993 Constitution, expressing underlying values of 242
1996 Constitution
balance with GEAR 178–80
certification 162
effect on Court 206
1996 Constitution review 271–2
access and jurisdiction 377–83, 393
achievement attributable to own actions 135–6, 391
historical-institutionalist approach 68
reasons for investigation 15–17
reassessment factors 187–8
adjudicative strategies
foreign decisions, ubuntu 217–19
identification of 257–61
African attitudes to law 215, 217
ANC connection 127
ANC’s deployment policy 180–4
ANC’s internal democratic processes 183–4
annual caseload 379–80
assessment methods explained 112–14
attacks on Court’s authority 187
beginning
in mature democracy 126–8
in uncertain political circumstances 67–8, 126–7
cases chosen for study 138–40, 377–83
civil society organisations 127–8
composition of 219–31
‘constitutional matter’ expansive approach 380–1, 383
constitutional and positive morality linked 235
ccontext-sensitive balancing
case-specific resolution in property cases 329
FNB test 322–3
Jaftha case 324–5
preference in property rights jurisprudence 331–3
property rights and PIE Act 326–7
as corporate institution 131–2
criminal procedure cases in early years of democracy 174
criticism by Karl Klare 44–5, 384
death penalty 33–5
see also death penalty
democracy consolidation contribution 36–7
external factors promoting a particular view of law 210–15
gay and lesbian groups 36
GEAR 178–80
globalisation of legal-professional audience 215–17
Grootboom case 280–92
Grootboom decision criticised 285
Grootboom and Treatment Action Campaign compared 372–4
housing rights 39–40, 324–33
see also Chaskalson Court,
Grootboom case
institutional efficacy 38
institutional independence
with ANC support 388–90
during Mbeki presidency 177–86
not that of a mature constitutional democracy 391
institutional legitimacy 34–8
Chaskalson Court (cont.)
  internal factors promoting a particular view of law 210–15 judges
  appointment 220–1
  reaction to composition 221
  speaking engagements 130
  summarised 230–1
  judgments structure 241–2
  judicial ethic 219–31
  justificatory burden 367
  law/politics distinction
    necessary condition of Court’s independence 215
    strategies 210–15
    strict conception of 383–5
  law/politics tension 274
  legislative reform programme period 174–7
  male primogeniture 251–2
  mandatory relief 372–3
  Mandela presidency 137
  matrix
    horizontal axis issues 120–8, 390–1
    starting point 114–28
    vertical axis questions 117, 390–1
  micro-politics management 137–8
  minimum core approach
    in Grootboom 285–90, 374
    in Treatment Action Campaign 302
  morality
    building public support in Fourie decision 258–9
    decisions corresponding to highest aspirations of the people 257–8
  natural law and positivism 214
  party/state distinction 182–3
  political attack
    exposure 125
    insulation 144
    political context
      changes 136–8, 180–4
      summary 189–90
  political rights jurisprudence
    overview 334–6, 363
  positive and constitutional morality linked 235
  positivism or natural law 214
  property rights
    cases options 312–14
    cases overview 311
  Court’s enforcement role 304–5, 308
  reconciled with right to housing in s 26 324–33
  public perceptions of 260
  public support in early stages 125–6
  reasonable review standard
do developed in Grootboom
  flexibility 292, 300
  highly discretionary and logically confused 290–1
  not used in New National Party case 375
  Treatment Action Campaign case 302–3
  reasoning in
    August and Another v. Electoral Commission and Others case 337–41
    Bhe case 251–2
    First National Bank case 322–3
    Fourie case 252–6, 375–6
    Jaftha case 327
    Kyalami Ridge case 332–3
    New National Party case 344–50, 362
    NICRO case 339–40
    Port Elizabeth Municipality v. Various Occupiers case 325–7
    President of the Republic of South Africa v. Modderklip 328–31
    Soobramoney case 273–80
    Treatment Action Campaign case 299–303
    United Democratic Movement case 354–62
  reasoning quality re institutional role 42–3
  remedial powers 375–6
  remedy decision in Fourie case 258–9
INDEX

reputation in comparative constitutional law community 67, 70–1
rhetoric in Treatment Action Campaign case 366–7, 372
debates on rights-based constitutionalism 119–20
same-sex marriage 252–6
separation of powers 278, 366–77
Fourie case 255–6
rival understandings 371–7
small group dynamics 132
social rights 273–92
and ANC 288
enforcement 272–3
socio-economic rights jurisprudence 40–1, 43
strategic choices requirement 201–7
strategies for rights-based judicial review system 210–15
success in legal terms 38–49, 78–9
in political terms 33–8, 78–9
Treatment Action Campaign 36, 43
veto role 35, 79
voting rights
limitations 375
need to define scope of 361
New National Party case 341–50
politics issues 339–41
prisoners 337–41
written opinions as study focus 129–30
Chaskalson, Justice
deadly sentence
international jurisprudence survey 243
limitations clause analysis 244
formalist argument use 332–3
prisoners’ right to vote 339–41
public opinion and supreme-law Constitution 245–6
substantive moral reasoning 244–5
civil service 171, 180
reform under President Thabo Mbeki 181
civil society organisations, use of Court 127–8

Clayton and Gillman, editors 25
Cockrell, Alfred, ‘rainbow jurisprudence’ 218–19
Coetsee, Kobie, Justice Minister 166
Colombian Constitutional Court, annual caseload 379
common law development, Bill of Rights 205
comparative constitutional law community
assessment of Court 39–45
courageous stands on principle and Court’s reputation 70–1
ideal of adjudication according to law and Court’s reputation 67
liberal-legalists and Court’s reputation 49
shared criteria and Court’s success 46
Concept of Law, The, H. L. A. Hart 50–3
Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU)
constitutional litigation 185
derendorsement of RDP 308
constitution-making process, two stages 162–5
Constitutional Committee 157–8
Constitutional Guidelines 157–8
constitutional courts
access and jurisdiction 377–83
after transition from authoritarian rule 106
competitive electoral system 121–2
constitutional rights assessment 369
constraints charts 77–111
ideal of adjudication according to law 70
independence from political control benefits 122–3
explained 86–8
options 121–4
provisions 161–70
institutional efficacy standard of success 66–7
institutional legitimacy standard of success 66–7, 87
institutional role in the political system 65–6

© in this web service Cambridge University Press
www.cambridge.org
constitutional courts (cont.)

legal legitimacy 92
liberal-democratic government systems 40, 70
loss of institutional independence 79, 87
loss of legal legitimacy 79 explained 84–5 through disregard of legal constraints 90–1
morality enforcement 237
a new constitution 63
new constitutional value system 64–5
performance assessment 111
political attack
capacity to frustrate 122–3
constraints both legal and political 97 explained 86–8
law and politics in permanent contradiction 90–1
principled decision-making 96–7 weakened cases 90
powers adjustment 105
protection measures for newly established 107–8
purpose of 27
separation of powers doctrine explained 368–9
success criteria 62–6
success in interdisciplinary law/politics terms 108–11
veto capacity
an essential factor 28 dependent on widespread public support 27
institutional legitimacy necessity 85–6
constitutional democracies
mature 89, 104–8, 126
new 89–90, 103–8
Constitutional Guidelines, Constitutional Committee 157–8
Constitutional Guidelines for a Democratic South Africa, ANC 266–7
constitutional litigation, COSATU 185

constitutional rights, assessment by courts 369
constitutional value system competing religious values 254–5
indigenous social values conflict 248–50
legitimated as South African through ubuntu 248
new 64–5
constraints adjudicative strategies 99–101
by legal norms on judicial behaviour 31–2
by legal-professional norms and practices 115
charts re constitutional courts 77–111
context-specific and case-specific 93
four central cases 88–93
judicial decision-making
CLS view 80
ideal of adjudication according to law 75
judges as check on abuse of political power 56–7
liberal-legalist view 80
strategic model 21–2
legal and political context- and case-specific 93
distinct but interrelated 74–5
entailing a loss 75–6, 91–3
example 76
matrix 77–85
overly strict conception of Court 355
study’s use of term ’constraint’ 133
context-sensitive balancing see Constitutional Court, context-sensitive balancing
corruption
ANC 185
Arms Deal 185
corruption allegations, Jacob Zuma 185, 187
COSATU constitutional litigation 185
rift with ANC 310
Cotterrell, Roger, legal culture 115–17
court powers, post-apartheid
Constitutions 151–2, 160–1
crime, ANC 336, 340
critical legal theorists
minimal constraints on judges 80
role of judges 94
versus liberal legalists 46–7
customary law
living in Bhe 249–51
and official customary law 251–2
official 250–1
right to equality 248–52
death penalty
abolishing 238–48
ANC’s opposition to 239–40
ANC’s stance 174
attitudinal model in judicial politics 34
Chaskalson Court 33–5
international jurisprudence survey 243
micro-politics of choices facing the Court 240
support for retention of 238
democracies see constitutional democracies
Didcott, John
English-speaking judge originally appointed to Court 220–1
exponent of common law approach to statutory interpretation 226
JSC interview 223
Dugard, John 197
Dworkin, Ronald
adjudication theory 52–3
Chaskalson and transition to democracy 40–3
constraints on constitutional adjudication 69
criticism
of H. L. A. Hart’s theory 50–3
of Richard Posner’s work 70
decisions on remedy as decisions of law 258–9
legal positivism tradition 50–3, 65
moral judicial decision-making 60–1
morality enforcement role of constitutional courts 237
Dyzenhaus, David
role of judiciary under apartheid 207
‘plain fact’ and ‘common law’ approach 199–201, 207
preference for common law approach 210
education, extension of 173
egalitarian strategy, socio-economic rights jurisprudence 40
electoral system
court’s role in maintaining 121–2
judicial review 341–50, 361
Ellmann, Stephen
positivism in human rights tradition 198–9
acceptable legal argument boundaries 210
crude form of positivism 200–1
environment, right to non-harmful 204
Epstein, Lee 23, 31
equality clause, 1996 Constitution 204–5
Ethics in the Public Domain
Joseph Raz’s essay on politics of rule of law 56
Joseph Raz’s views on legal reasoning 53, 55
floor-crossing
history 351–4
lifting the ban 356–8
proportional representation 357
see also Chaskalson Court, United Democratic Movement case
FNB test
ideal of adjudication according to law 322
quality of reasoning 321
Fraenkel, Ernst, dual state 196
franchise see right, to vote
Freedom Charter 1955 133
Friedman, Lawrence, wide legal culture definition 114–15
Fuller, Lon 59
GEAR 176–7  
adoption at same time as 1996 Constitution 177–80  
the Arms Deal 185  
Chaskalson Court 178–80 strategy 309–10  
Gibson, James  
constitutional-court efficacy 28  
surveys on Court’s public support 34, 125  
Ginsburg, Tom  
Korean Constitutional Court’s role in consolidation of democracy 29, 42  
success of constitutional courts in political terms 32  
globalisation of legal-professional audience, Chaskalson Court 215–17  
Goldstone, Justice, Harksen judgment 314–15  
Goldstone, Richard  
English-speaking Court judge 220–1  
exponent of common law approach 226  
Group Areas Act cases 226  
Growth, Employment and Redistribution strategy  
see GEAR, strategy  
Halpin, Andrew, on views of Joseph Raz 55  
Hart, H. L. A., The Concept of Law 50–3  
health care, extension of services 173  
Hepple, Bob 397  
heterosexual marriage 253, 255  
historical-institutionalist approach  
Court’s achievement 68 courts as composite political actors 131  
judges’ legal-professional socialisation 34  
reaction to attitudinal and strategic models 24–7  
HIV-prevention strategy of ANC 185–6  
housing, provision of affordable 173  
housing rights  
1996 Constitution 204, 283  
reconciling with property rights 324–33  
Sunstein on Grootboom decision 39–40  
human rights  
ANC’s commitment to 155–6  
ANC’s tradition adapted to post-Cold War era 157–8  
ANC’s tradition reflected in Bill of Rights 203, 236  
lawyers and apartheid 150–1, 398  
three-dimensionality of constitutional courts in South African legal-professional culture 198–9  
Hungarian Constitutional Court 68  
political constraints 95  
ICESCR as framework for Constitution 268, 270–1  
signing by South Africa 272  
ideal of adjudication according to law  
adjudication style changes 64  
attachment of legal-professional culture to 92, 117  
discussed 49–62  
FNB test 322  
moral and political clarity 66  
motivation of judges 98–9  
requirement for 47, 49  
South African legal-professional culture 219–20  
strength indicators of attachment of legal-professional culture to 117  
strict conception of law/politics distinction 383  
independence from political control  
see constitutional courts, independence from political control  
indigenous social values, in conflict with constitutional value system 248–50  
Inkatha Freedom Party 171–2, 175  
institutional independence of Chaskalson Court 388–91  
loss of  
following prioritising of legal constraints 92
on political constraints axis 79
in political terms 87
institutional legitimacy
capacity to withstand political
attacks 87
Chaskalson Court 34–8
precondition to veto role 31
weakened by decisions outside
tolerance level 23–4
instrumental and non-instrumental
views of law 82–3
internal legal culture 114, 116
International Covenant on Economic,
Cultural and Social Rights
see ICESCR
International Journal of Constitutional
Law 40–1
judges
see also Chaskalson Court, judges
ability to rationalise their decisions
80, 377
developing common law in 1996
Constitution 208
global audience constraint 216–17
global audience emboldening 216
guardians of country’s legal tradition
62–3
judicial ethic study methodology
133–5
law/politics distinction to be
maintained 220
law/politics tension
judge-driven changes on matrix
93–103, 133
strategies 214–15
legal and political constraints
management of relationship with
ANC 261, 350
matrix navigation tools 94–6, 98
motivation 133
political constraints awareness
135–6, 382
prioritising constraints in New
National Party case 350
public justification of decisions
rationing actors 21–2
rationalising decisions 80
reasoning conform to Bill of Rights
211
reasoning conform to FNB test 321
role of 94
setting parameters for social rights
litigation 273–6
strategies of communicating reasons
to public 235, 260–1
strategies open to liberal judges
198–201
substantive reasoning requirement
214
tone of language of decisions 385–6
transitional period cases 192
judicial appointments
1996 Constitution 169–70
JSC 169–70, 220, 222–3
judicial appointments process 165–70
National Party 167–9
three tranches 166–8
judicial decision-making, constraints
see constraints, judicial
decision-making
judicial ethic, Chaskalson Court 219–31
judicial independence
the 1996 Constitution 206
ANC’s respect for 127
National Party’s commitment to
147–9, 159
South Africa’s pre-democratic
tradition 145–52
tradition, timescale 146–7, 150–2
judicial politics
attitudinal model see attitudinal
model in judicial politics
comparative studies
legitimacy theory 28
multi-party democracy 182
political conditions for
constitutional court efficacy 30
strategic model 31–2
historical-institutionalist approach
see historical-institutionalist
approach
introduction 17–27
Makwanyane decision 246
judicial politics (cont.)
  political attack
    explanation 86–8
        insulation from 90, 96–7
    standards of principled
decision-making 96–7
    strategic model 21–4, 31–2, 34–5
  judicial politics literature compared
    with legal-academic
        138–9
  judicial protection of socio-economic
    rights 39–40
  judicial review
    defence of legitimacy of 211–12
    electoral system rules 341–50
    over both intergovernmental and
    rights issues 203
  Judicial Service Commission (JSC),
    judicial appointments 169–70,
        220, 222–3
  jurisdiction of constitutional courts
        377–83
  justification of decisions, judges’ duty
    to make public 56–7

Kabwe ANC conference 156–7
Klare, Karl
1996 Constitution 205–6
1996 Constitution and the Court
    legal-cultural transformation
        212–13, 231
    political project needing political
    means 223
    criticism of Chaskalson Court 44–5,
        384
Klug, Heinz 156
Knight, Jack 23, 31
Korean Constitutional Court 29–30, 42
Kriegler, Johann
    Afrikaans-speaking Court judge
        220–1
    JSC interviewee 223, 225–6
Kriegler, Justice, 1993 Constitution and
    death penalty 243
land redistribution and housing
    provision, RDP 308–9
land reform policy, ANC 305, 310–12

Langa, Justice, state’s provision of
    mechanisms for dispute
    resolution 329, 332
Langa, Pius
    Court judge 220–1
    career 227
    JSC interviewee 223
law
    African customary 194
    in construction of South African
    state 194–6
    responsive 81–2, 110
    as weapon in hands of the state 195
law/politics distinction
    necessary condition of Court’s
    independence 215
    refashioning by Court 210–15
    strict conception of liberal-legalists
        383–5
law/politics tension, judges see judges,
    law/politics distinction, judges,
    law/politics tension
legal constraints see constraints
legal culture 114–16
    development of South African
        192–201
    narrow definition 115
    wide definition 114–15, 194
legal factors
    constraints on adjudication
        entailing a loss if disregarded 75–6
    matrix position 77–85
legal ideology, definition 116
legal legitimacy of court
    loss of through failure to justify
    decision 89
    loss of through failure to engage in
    principled legal argument 84–5
    loss of through non-compliance with
    legal constraints 79, 90–1
    store of 92
legal norms, constraint on judicial
    behaviour 31–2
legal positivism
    Joseph Raz 53–4
    Ronald Dworkin 50–3
Legal Process School 58–60
legal reasoning
INDEX

dominant mode before 1994, 192
Joseph Raz 53–6
legal rules, Karl Llewellyn 57–9, 64
legal-professional culture 79–85
after transition from authoritarian
rule 106, 209
American
ideological decision-making 81
policy-based reasoning 102–3
substantive norms of judicial
reasoning 80
attachment to ideal of adjudication
according to law 92, 383
Australian 81, 94–5
Canadian 81
English 80
formal 80–1
German 81–2
impact of apartheid on South
African see South African
legal-professional culture
justification for use of term 116–17
substantive 80–1
legislative reform programme of ANC
173–5
legitimacy theory 28–9
Leiter, Brian 51
liberal constitutionalism, ANC’s
commitment to 160–1
liberal legal theory, need for
constraining judicial decision-
making 75
liberal legalists
constraints on constitutional
adjudication 69, 80
judges’ insulation from political
attack 93–4
political morality 83, 398
responsible law 82
versus critical legal theorists 46–7
Liebenberg, Sandra 397
literature, legal-academic and judicial
politics compared 138–9
Llewellyn, Karl, legal rules 57–9, 64
Madala, Tholie 220–1, 226
Mahomed, Ismail 220–1, 223–4
male primogeniture 248
mandatory relief, Chaskalson Court
372–3
Mandela, President Nelson 33
1955 Freedom Charter 153
acquaintance with Chaskalson 173
Chaskalson Court during his
presidency 137
commitment to value of judicial
independence 127
death penalty 239
impartial Constitutional Court 163
judicial independence 173
leadership style 172–3, 177
Liberal Party 153
release from prison 158
Manuel, Trevor, Minister of Finance
309
marriage, same-sex 252–6
matrix
Chaskalson Court’s starting point
114–28
constitutional court success and
failure 107–8, 390–1
navigation tools for judges 94–6, 98
Maveety, Nancy 26
Mbeki, President Thabo 170, 176
ANC’s HIV-prevention strategy
185–6
civil service reform 181
Court’s institutional independence
177–86
Treatment Action Campaign case
292–9
Meierhenrich, Jens, pre-democratic
South African state 196–7
Michelman, Frank 279
minimum core approach
in Grootboom 285–90, 374
social rights
basic shelter needs 285–90
versus rational justification
approach 394–5
in Treatment Action Campaign 302
Mokgoro, Justice, context-sensitive
balancing 324–5, 332
Mokgoro, Yvonne 220–1, 227
morality  
constitutional different from positive  
235
enforcement by constitutional courts  
237
linking constitutional and positive  
Court’s stance 259
social rights cases 257–8
Mugabe, President Robert 186
Mureinik, Etienne  
JSC interviewer 225, 228–9
rational justifi cation approach  
289–90
social rights enforcement  
matching civil and political rights  
enforcement 269
rational justifi cation approach 273
rationality of state’s conduct 276
National Party  
commitment to judicial  
independence 147–9, 159
judicial appointment process 167–9
National Party rule 1948 to 1994  
146–50
Native Court system 250–1
natural law, distinction between law  
and politics 211
natural law and positivism  
Chaskalson Court 214
merits 200–1
Nonet, Phillipe  
law categorisation 81–2, 110
normative conception of judicial  
function 384
normative judicial function, Phillipe  
Nonet’s conception 384
normative state, pre-democratic South  
Africa 196
O’Regan, Justice  
Fourie case 256, 375–6
New National Party case 347–50
O’Regan, Kate 220–1, 227–8
parliamentary sovereignty, move to  
constitutional supremacy 191–2, 203, 207
PIE Act 325–8
political attack  
assessing a court’s exposure to 121–4
exposure of Chaskalson Court 125
insulation of Chaskalson Court 144
see also constitutional courts,  
political attack
political contraints see constraints
political culture, defi nition 115
political factors, constraints on  
adjudication 75–6, 85–8
political rights, Chaskalson Court  
jurisprudence overview 334–6, 363
politically salient cases 138–9
positivism  
distinction between law and politics  
211–12
Hartian 197–8, 208
inclusive and exclusive 208
low and high 192, 209, 213
positivism and natural law  
Chaskalson Court 214
merits 200–1
Posner, Richard 69–70
post-apartheid Constitutions  
capacity of law to restrain abuse of  
political power 387
character of 202–7
constitution and validity of legal rule  
207–9
judges’ view of law vindicated 220
political choices on delivery of  
promises 392
political environment for judicial  
review 170
powers of courts 151–2, 160–1, 203
South African legal-professional  
culture 118–19, 201–2
South Africans’ moral values 236, 390
pre-democratic South Africa  
normative state 196
prerogative state 196
pre-democratic tradition of judicial  
independence 145–52
prerogative state, pre-democratic South  
Africa 196
INDEX

prisoners' right to vote 336–41
Pritchett, Herman 18
property deprivation, proportionality
test 315–17
property deprivation (arbitrary), test
for 317–21
property rights
1996 Constitution 204, 325–7
ANC 305–7
Chaskalson Court’s enforcement role
304–5, 308
political origins of property clause
304–8
proportional representation 356
floor-crossing 358–9
proportionality test, property
deprivation 315–17
quality of reasoning, FNB test 321
rational and irrational law, South
African legal-professional
culture 196
rational justification approach
Court’s relationship with
ANC 374
social rights cases 265
social rights inclusion in
Constitution 289–90
Raz, Joseph
Ethics in the Public Domain
Chapter 13 53, 55
Chapter 16 56
ideal of adjudication according to the
law 57
legal positivism 53–4
legal reasoning 53–6
the rule of law 56–7
successful constitutional
court 62–3
reasonable review standard of
Groothoorn
adjusting level of scrutiny 292
flexibility 300
open-ended category instead of
minimum core 290–1
social rights 393–7
strategy of Court 302–3
Reconstruction and Development
Programme (RDP) 173, 179
land redistribution and housing
provision 308–9
religious freedom to, right 254–5
religious values mediation,
constitutional value system
254–5
reproduction, right to make decisions
about 203
responsive law 81–2, 110
right
of access to court 329
to emergency medical treatment 274
to equality before the law 238–9,
248–55
1993 Constitution 238–9
Bhe case 248–52
constitutional value of tolerance
253–5
to have access to adequate housing
283
to health care services 275
to housing
Court’s review standard 39–40
evictions 204
reconciling property rights 324–33
to life 238–9, 274
to non-discrimination of sexual
orientation 204
to non-harmful environment 204
to respect for and protection of own
dignity 238–9, 337–8
to shelter 283
to strike 204
to vote
1996 Constitution 336–7, 361
Electoral Act as amended 338
identity documents requirement
341–50
limitations to 375
prisoners 336–41
rights-based constitutionalism,
Chaskalson Court’s move to
119–20
rule of law, Joseph Raz 56–7
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Index</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Russian Constitutional Court</td>
<td>matching civil and political rights enforcement 269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>annual caseload 379, 383</td>
<td>Mureinik’s rational justification approach 273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>suspension 23–4, 31</td>
<td>rational justification approach and minimum core approach 265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sachs, Albie</td>
<td>Mureinik 289–90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC’s Draft Bill of Rights 268</td>
<td>socio-economic rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>career 228–9</td>
<td>Bill of Rights 203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>commitment to human rights 230</td>
<td>egalitarian strategy 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional Committee member 157</td>
<td>judicial protection of 39–40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English-speaking Court judge 220–1</td>
<td>jurisprudence of Chaskalson Court 40–1, 43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>former ANC member 230</td>
<td>substantive strategy 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tone of language 385</td>
<td>South African legal tradition 197–8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sachs, Justice</td>
<td>South African legal-professional culture apartheid 117–18, 197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>August</em> case 337–8</td>
<td>before 1994, 192–201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Fourie</em> case 376</td>
<td>formalism 195–6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>property rights 325–7, 332</td>
<td>human rights tradition 198–9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>same-sex marriage in the <em>Fourie</em> case 253–6</td>
<td>ideal of adjudication according to law 219–20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>same-sex marriage 252–6</td>
<td>impact of post-apartheid Constitutions 201–2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sampson, Anthony 239–40</td>
<td>post-1994 internal factors 209–15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selznick, Philip</td>
<td>rational and irrational law 196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>law categorisation 81–2, 110</td>
<td>separation of legal from political 195–6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>normative state 384</td>
<td>shift to rights-based constitutionalism 119–20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>separation of powers</td>
<td>strategic model in judicial politics constitutional court’s awareness of national politics 31–2, 34–5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaskalson Court doctrine 366–77</td>
<td>Court’s achievement 68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Fourie</em> case 255–6</td>
<td>court’s capacity to store institutional legitimacy 92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as system of checks and balances 367</td>
<td>judicial behaviour as function of judicial ideology 131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sexual orientation, right to non-discrimination 204</td>
<td>strengths and weaknesses 21–4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shapiro, Martin</td>
<td>transferability of model 23–4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>respect for judicial independence 105</td>
<td>strike, right to 204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>successful judicial review 29, 32</td>
<td>substantive strategy, socio-economic rights jurisprudence 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shevtsova, Olga 23, 31</td>
<td>Summers, Robert 80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>social rights</td>
<td>Sunstein, Cass</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC’s commitment to 265–7, 269–71</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>background to inclusion in 1996 Constitution 265–73</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>challenges to their provisions 271–2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaskalson Court 273–92</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enforcement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Court’s strategy 272–3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>inclusion of social rights in Constitution 276</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INDEX

1996 Constitution 203
quality of Court’s reasons
Grootboom 39–40
solving riddle of its institutional function 42–3, 65

TAC
history 293–6
litigation strategy 295–7, 303
Tamanaha, Brian 74
instrumental and non-instrumental views of law 82–3
Tambo, Oliver 157–8
Technical Committee on Fundamental Rights 239
technocratic centralism 177–88
thematic approach to cases, reasons for 140
theory of adjudication, Ronald Dworkin 52–3
transition to democracy
ANC’s reliance on the Court 127
impact on South African legal-professional culture 118–19
implications for legal-professional practice 191–2
strengthening of ideal of adjudication according to law 219–20
two stages 162–5
Treatment Action Campaign see TAC
Trengove, Wim 229
Tushnet, Mark, Chaskalson Court’s socio-economic rights jurisprudence 43–4

ubuntu 217–19
Bill of Rights interpretation 247
harmonisation of competing property interests 326–7
legitimating constitutional value system as South African 248
Makwanyane decision 246–8
US Supreme Court politically and legally unconstrained 78, 102–3
prediction of outcome of cases 18–20
values, legal-cultural 64–5
veto role of constitutional court in national politics dependent on institutional legitimacy 31
dependent on public support 28
insulation from political attack 85–6
Waluchow, Wil, morality enforcement role of constitutional courts 237
Wechsler, Herbert, principled decision-making 60
Yacoob, Justice, New National Party case 345–50
Zimbabwe 186
Zuma, Jacob corruption allegations 185, 187 elected as ANC President 187