

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

<i>List of tables</i>	page	xiv
<i>List of contributors</i>		xv
<i>Foreword</i>		xvii
<i>Preface</i>		xix
<i>List of abbreviations</i>		xxi

1	The derivative action: an economic, historical and practice-oriented approach	1
	HARALD BAUM AND DAN W. PUCHNIAK	
	I Introduction	1
	II The derivative action from an economic and functional perspective	7
	1 Definition, characteristics and delimitation	7
	a Definition	7
	b Characteristics	8
	c Delimitation	10
	2 Economic efficiencies and inefficiencies	12
	a Function	12
	b Empirical studies on the derivative action's compensatory value	15
	c The comparative value of the empirical research	19
	d The ambiguous empirical picture is compounded by the deterrence effect	23
	e Illuminating the potential negative effects of derivative actions	26
	3 Key elements of regulatory design	31
	a The need for economic incentives and disincentives	31
	b Designing appropriate economic incentives	35
	c Sufficient access to corporate information	43

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

vi

CONTENTS

	d Making the company the first option	46
	e Filtering out unmeritorious actions	47
	f Settlement and abandonment	58
	4 The derivative action in context: functional alternatives	60
III	The derivative action from a historical perspective	64
	1 Historical development in the United States	64
	2 Historical development in the United Kingdom	66
	3 Germany's historical rejection of the derivative action	72
IV	The derivative action from a practical perspective	74
	1 Procedure and practice in the United States	74
	2 Procedure and practice in the United Kingdom	77
	3 Procedure and practice in France	82
	4 Procedure and practice in Germany	84
2	The complexity of derivative actions in Asia: an inconvenient truth	90
	DAN W. PUCHNIAK	
	I Introduction	90
	II The seven leading Asian jurisdictions	98
III	An overview of the derivative action in Asia	100
	1 Japanese derivative actions: the rise of non-economic litigiousness	100
	2 South Korean derivative actions: moderately litigious and intriguingly unpredictable	104
	3 Taiwanese derivative actions: the chill of financial disincentives and domestic cultural norms	108
	4 Chinese derivative actions: a complex pathway to minority shareholder protection	111
	5 Hong Kong derivative actions: a late and partial break with common law tradition lays a path for reform	114
	6 Singapore's derivative actions: mundanely non-Asian, intriguingly non-American and at the forefront of the Commonwealth	117
	7 Derivative actions in India: explaining the rarity of derivative actions in a sea of litigation	120
IV	The complexity of derivative actions in Asia: a less convenient, but more realistic, truth	124

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

vii

- 3 Land of the rising derivative action: revisiting irrationality to understand Japan's unreluctant shareholder litigant 128**
- MASAFUMI NAKAHIGASHI AND DAN W. PUCHNIAK
- I Introduction 128
- II Applying the assumption of the economically motivated and rational shareholder litigant to Japan 132
- 1 The economically motivated and rational explanation for the absence of shareholder litigation in postwar Japan 132
- 2 Japan's explosion of derivative actions (mis)understood through the lens of the economically motivated and rational shareholder litigant and its testable hypotheses 139
- III Putting the hypotheses of the economically motivated and rational Japanese derivative litigant to the test 144
- 1 Testing the economically motivated and rational shareholder hypothesis: do shareholders benefit financially from derivative actions in Japan? 144
- 2 Testing the economically motivated and rational attorney hypothesis: do economically motivated and rational attorneys drive derivative litigation in Japan? 150
- 3 Testing the financial tracking hypothesis: does the rate of derivative actions track changes in their financial costs/benefits? 155
- IV Providing a rational explanation for 'economically irrational' derivative litigation in Japan 158
- 1 Demarcating the boundaries between rational and irrational behaviour 158
- 2 Quasi-rational (non-economically motivated) behaviour drives derivative litigation in Japan 160
- 3 Purely irrational behaviour as a potential driver of derivative litigation in Japan 163
- V Conclusion 168
- Appendices 170

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

viii

CONTENTS

4	Invigorating shareholder derivative actions in South Korea	186
	HYEOK-JOON RHO AND KON-SIK KIM	
	I Introduction	186
	II Basics of derivative actions: law and reality in South Korea	187
	1 Background: the shareholding structure and the legal institutions for shareholder protection	187
	a The shareholding structure	187
	b Legal institutions for shareholder protection: shareholder direct suits and class actions	189
	2 Overview of the structure of a derivative action	192
	3 Some statistics and features	193
	III Standing for plaintiffs	196
	1 General shareholding requirement under the KCC	196
	2 Double derivative actions	198
	a Concept of a double derivative action and a recent Supreme Court case	198
	b Analysis: why are double derivative actions necessary in South Korea?	199
	IV Entrepreneurial lawyers: fees and incentives	200
	1 Lack of shareholders' incentives and the role of entrepreneurial lawyers in derivative actions	200
	2 Who will pay the plaintiff's lawyer?	201
	3 How much will the plaintiff's lawyer be paid?	203
	a Limitation on contingency fees	203
	b Limitation of directors' liability	205
	V Regulation of frivolous actions	206
	1 Demand requirement	206
	a Introduction	206
	b A corporation's decision not to sue	207
	c A derivative action filed without going through the demand process	207
	d Analysis	209
	2 Limiting collusive settlements	210
	VI A new trend in case law: digression from the passive role model?	211
	VII Concluding remarks	213
	Appendix	214

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

ix

- 5 Derivative actions in Taiwan: legal and cultural hurdles with a glimmer of hope for the future** 215
- WANG RUU TSENG AND WALLACE WEN YEU WANG
- I Introduction 215
- II The legal mechanism for conducting a derivative action: requirements for maintaining a derivative action 216
- 1 The shareholder rules 219
- 2 The ‘continuing ownership’ rule 220
- 3 The ‘security for damages or costs’ rule 220
- III The ambiguity of civil procedure in Taiwanese derivative actions 223
- 1 Notification of and intervening in a derivative action 224
- 2 Ambiguity in an involuntary decrease in a plaintiff’s shareholdings 225
- 3 The binding effect of settlements in derivative actions 227
- 4 Court fees in derivative actions: a flat rate or a percentage? 227
- IV Derivative actions versus direct suits 228
- V The relationship between culture, institutional background and the derivative action 230
- 1 The controlling shareholder system 230
- 2 Weak company code 231
- 3 Emphasis on criminal/administrative sanctions 233
- 4 Taiwan’s legal culture 233
- 5 Paternalism and mass dispute resolution: ‘Asian values’ after all? 234
- VI The impact of the derivative action on corporate governance 235
- VII The perception of the derivative action and professional services in the marketplace 237
- VIII Idiosyncrasies in derivative actions: the role of the government-sanctioned non-profit organization 240
- IX Concluding remarks 241

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x

CONTENTS

6 Pathway to minority shareholder protection: derivative actions in the People's Republic of China 243

DONALD C. CLARKE AND NICHOLAS C. HOWSON

- I Introduction 243
- II Economic and legal reform in the PRC and the derivative action 244
 - 1 Introduction: the derivative lawsuit and corporate governance in the Chinese context 244
 - 2 Corporatization and its effects 245
 - 3 The LLC form and other non-Company-Law forms 249
 - 4 The legal representative 253
 - 5 The Chinese judiciary: local protectionism, Party control and the avoidance of 'mass' litigant cases 254
 - 6 Derivative versus representative 257
 - 7 Costs, cost allocation and cost-benefit analysis for shareholder plaintiffs 258
- III Derivative actions before 2006 260
 - 1 Non-statutory rule making: CSRC principles, SPC utterances, local 'opinions', and the (draft) 'Omnibus' regulation on the 1994 Company Law 260
 - 2 Pre-2006 cases 263
 - a Genesis of the 1994 SPC Approving Response and other LLC cases 263
 - b Widely held companies 267
- IV The 2006 Company Law and statutory authorization for derivative actions 269
 - 1 Standing 270
 - 2 Demand 272
 - 3 Defendants and associated causes of action 273
- V The reality of derivative actions in the PRC from 1 January 2006 to date 275
 - 1 Absence of CLS or publicly listed CLS-related cases 275
 - 2 'Straddling' actions: 2006 Company Law application to pre-2006 transactions 278
 - 3 Avoidance of derivative pleadings 279
 - 4 Autonomy and acceptance 280
 - 5 Technical competence 282
 - 6 Difficulties regarding underlying substantive claims 284

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

CONTENTS		xi
7	Confusion between derivative and representative lawsuits	286
8	Judge-made direct litigation right for supervisors	286
9	Allocation of court fees and 'loser pays all'	287
VI	Critique of article 152 and reform suggestions	288
VII	Conclusion	293
7	A parallel path to shareholder remedies: Hong Kong's derivative actions	296
	PAUL VON NESSEN, S. H. GOO AND CHEE KEONG LOW	
I	Introduction	296
II	The common law derivative action: <i>Foss v. Harbottle</i> and its exceptions	297
III	The reform process in Hong Kong	304
1	The consultancy report	304
2	The report of the Standing Committee on Company Law Reform	305
3	The SCCLR corporate governance consultation paper (July 2001)	307
4	Companies (Amendments) Bill 2003	308
IV	How successful is Hong Kong's statutory derivative action?	310
1	The judicial pronouncements	311
2	Coexistence with the common law	315
3	Should Hong Kong adopt the British reforms?	319
4	Conclusions and observations on future success	321
8	Derivative actions in Singapore: mundanely non-Asian, intriguingly non-American and at the forefront of the Commonwealth	323
	MENG SENG WEE AND DAN W. PUCHNIAK	
I	Introduction	323
II	Law of minority protection	326
1	History and development	326
a	English tradition and seeds of change	326
b	Development of company law	328
c	Evolution of minority protection law	330

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xii

CONTENTS

2	Common law derivative action	331
a	Introduction	331
b	Critique	332
c	Conclusion	336
3	Statutory derivative action	336
a	Impetus for reform	336
b	Scope	338
c	The law	341
4	Personal right, corporate right and section 216	348
a	Introduction	348
b	Giving corporate relief under section 216	349
5	Conclusion	351
III	Debunking Western stereotypes	351
1	Western stereotypes of Singapore	351
2	Realities	354
a	The evolution of Singapore society and the concurrent rise in shareholder litigation	354
b	Singapore's shareholder litigation defies the 'nanny state' and 'Asian values' stereotypes	359
IV	Intriguingly non-American in its success	365
9	The rarity of derivative actions in India: reasons and consequences	369
	VIKRAMADITYA KHANNA AND UMAKANTH VAROTTIL	
I	Introduction	369
II	Why have derivative actions?	371
1	The desirability of derivative suits to enforce corporate laws	371
2	Application to the Indian context	378
III	The derivative action in India	380
1	<i>Foss v. Harbottle</i> and its exceptions	381
a	Ultra vires transactions or illegality	382
b	Matters requiring special resolution	382
c	Fraud on the minority	382
2	Procedural constraints	383
a	The 'clean hands' doctrine	384
b	Order I, rule 8, Civil Procedure Code 1908	384

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

xiii

3	Availability of other remedies	386	
	a	Oppression and mismanagement	386
	b	Securities laws and SEBI	388
4	Other constraints	390	
	a	Directors' duties	390
	b	Controlling shareholders' duties	391
	c	Cultural concerns	392
	d	Costs	393
IV	Recent developments and reform efforts	394	
V	Conclusions and recommendations for the future	396	
10	The derivative action in Asia: some concluding observations	398	
	DAN W. PUCHNIAK AND HARALD BAUM		
	<i>Legislative appendix</i>	404	
	<i>Bibliography</i>	422	
	<i>Index</i>	443	

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-01227-1 - The Derivative Action in Asia: A Comparative and Functional Approach

Edited by Dan W. Puchniak, Harald Baum and Michael Ewing-Chow

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

TABLES

3A.1	Number of cases of shareholders' derivative actions in Japan	<i>page</i> 170
3B.1	Results of derivative actions filed	171
3B.2	Average per share recovery in judgment for plaintiff (listed companies only)	174
3B.3	Average per share recovery in settled cases (listed companies only)	175
3B.4	Event study on stock price reaction to derivative actions filed	176
3B.5	Event study on stock price reaction to derivative actions settled	176
3B.6	Average amount of damages claimed (1993–2009)	177
3B.7	Average amount of settlement, KO versus non-KO	178
3B.8	Statistics in actions in which the court orders the plaintiff to post a bond	180
3B.9	Average length of a derivative action	184
3C.1	Suggested attorneys' fees pursuant to the post-1994 Fee Rules	185
4A.1	Derivative actions in South Korea (1 January 1997–30 May 2010)	214
9.1	Comparison of key features of direct and derivative suits	373