Index

3314 Definition of Aggression
basis in Rome Statute, 62–63, 96–97
critiques, 75–79, 89–95, 97, 100–101
definitional issues, 70–82
frontier incidents, 72
ILC drafts, 6–9
indirect use of force, 71
interpretations, 73, 76, 78, 79, 80–81, 82
and jus ad bellum
General Assembly practice, 87–89
generally, 82
ICJ decisions, 89–95
Security Council practice, 83–87
summary of issues, 95–96
limitation to armed aggression, 71
list of illustrative acts, 103–105
options, 70–71
priority principle, 72
proof of an aggressive intent, 72
Resolution 3314, 5–6, 95–96,
98–101, 151
revision issues, 105–106
Rome Conference, 9–12
self-defence, 72–73
Special Working Group negotiations,
14–16, 97–103, 124–125
terminology, 63–70
threat of force, 71–72
Understandings see Understandings
act of aggression
‘aggressor/victim’ dichotomy, 262
armed attack distinguished, 68–69
crime of aggression distinguished, 62
cyber operations, 110–112
determination
proposals as to, 16–18
by Security Council see UN Security Council
and jus ad bellum
3314 Definition of Aggression, 95–96,
294
General Assembly practice, 87–89
ICJ decisions, 89–95
Security Council practice, 83–87
‘manifest violation’ threshold see
‘manifest violation’ threshold
by non-State actors, 106–110
as State act element of crime of
aggression see crime of aggression,
State act element
summary of issues, 122–123
use of term, 63, 65, 67–68, 70
see also 3314 Definition of Aggression
aggression
act of see act of aggression
crime of see crime of aggression
aggressive intent
inclusion in 3314 Definition of
Aggression, 72
amendments to Rome Statute
activation of ICC jurisdiction
delay effect of provisions, 281–282
prospects for active jurisdiction,
286–289
requirements, 283–286
choice of provisions, 237–243
domestic prosecutions
bases of domestic jurisdiction, 315–320
immunities as barrier, 320–324
other potential barriers, 324–326
provisions generally, 311–315
summary of issues, 326–327
Monetary Gold principle, 245–246
review, 327–332
State Parties and see State Parties
text of amendments, xv–xxi
Armed Activities Case, 18, 36–38, 47–48, 57,
92–96, 227–229
INDEX 375

universal jurisdiction, 318–320
see also Code of Offences Against the Peace and Security of Mankind (Draft Code)

crime of aggression
act of aggression distinguished, 62
adoption of criminalisation provisions, 1–2, 24–31
amendments see amendments to Rome Statute
Code of Offences Against the Peace and Security of Mankind (Draft Code), 4–5, 6–9, 81, 140–141, 142, 151–153, 210–211, 312
complexity of, 5, 23
consistency with customary international law, 137–155
definition of, 6–7, 10, 12, 14–16, 24–25
deterrence of, 43–45, 132–133, 186
domestic jurisdiction over, 8, 312–320
every history, 2–6
elements of, 62
exclusion of criminal responsibility, grounds for, 163–164
exclusion of lesser violations, 132–137
harm caused by, 40–41
ICC jurisdiction over see International Criminal Court (ICC)
incorporation of elements of the 3314
definition of Aggression, 6–7, 10, 14–16, 25, 96–97
individual conduct elements
initiated, 186–187, 188
‘leadership’ requirement
applicability of Rome Statute provisions, 183–185
development, 168–183
mental elements
mistake of fact / mistake of law defences, 196–197
Rome Statute provisions, 189–196
superior orders defence, 197–198
modes of participation
attempted crimes, 200–202
Rome Statute provisions, 198–199
Third State officials, 199–200
perpetrator’s contribution, 185–189
planned, 173–174, 186, 187–188
prepared, 186, 187–188
scope of inclusion, 167–168
summary of issues, 202–204
international politics and, 49–53
and jus ad bellum, 54–56
‘manifest violation’ threshold see ‘manifest violation’ threshold
pre-Rome Conference, 6–9
crime of aggression (cont.)
  prosecutions see domestic prosecutions;
  International Criminal Court (ICC)
  restriction to grave violations, 132–137
  Rome Conference, 9–12
  State act element
  content of chapter, 124
  debate on definition, 151–153, 154
  and nullum crimen sine lege principle, 130–132
  and prohibition of interpretation by analogy, 130–132
  as qualifying threshold, 124–130
  summary of issues, 332–335
  and transitional justice, 43
  see also 3314 Definition of Aggression;
  criminalisation of aggression;
  Special Working Group on the Crime of Aggression (SWGCA); use
  of force; Working Group on the Crime of Aggression (WGCA)
  criminal law
  elements of deterrence, 43–44
  criminal responsibility
  grounds for exclusion, 163–164
  criminalisation of aggression
  arguments as to, 34, 56–59
  effect on international coalition actions, 59–60
  practicality of prohibition, 39–49
  scope of prohibition, 34–39
  summary of issues, 60–61
  customary international law
  3314 Definition as, 15, 24–25, 89–95, 323
  crime against peace as, 39–40, 150–153
  crime of aggression as, 2–3, 137–155
  exception to functional immunity, 323
  exception to Head of State immunity, 305–308
  exclusion of criminal responsibility, 164
  Nuremberg Principles as, 142
  permission to use force, 157
  prohibition of use of force, 38–39, 136, 226
  Rome Statute and, 206–208
  rules on use of force, 55
  as to unauthorised humanitarian interventions, 161–162
  universal jurisdiction over crime of aggression, 314, 320
  violation creating new law, 36
  cyber operations
  acts of aggression by, 110–112
  Definition of Aggression see 3314
  Definition of Aggression
  domestic prosecutions
  domestic jurisdiction over crime of aggression, 8, 312–320
  immunities as barrier, 320–324
  other potential barriers, 324–326
  Rome Statute amendments generally, 311–315
  summary of issues, 326–327
  Draft Code see Code of Offences Against the Peace and Security of Mankind
  (Draft Code)
  ‘force’
  use of term, 65–66
  Friendly Relations Declaration, 80, 89, 151
  frontier incidents
  armed attack distinguished, 68
  inclusion in Definition of Aggression, 72
  future States Parties
  SWGCA negotiations as to, 264–265
  General Assembly see UN General Assembly
  genocide
  rulings as to, 57–58, 310, 323
  Genocide Case, 57–58, 224, 310
  Germany
  crime of aggression cases, 40
  domestic prosecution provisions, 139, 142–143, 147–148
  Nuremberg Trials, 169–175, 178, 186–189, 193–194, 196, 199, 317
  Review Conference, 25, 50–51
  Rome Conference, 11–12
  ‘green light’ model for ICC proceedings
  operation of, 20–21, 26, 27
  resistance to proposal, 19–20, 278
  Head of State immunity
  national practice, 169, 304–311
  non-State Parties, 304–311
  Heads of State
  prosecutions of, 168–169, 304–311
  humanitarian intervention
  exclusion for, 120, 127, 155, 161–162, 164
  use of force, 54–55, 60
  humanitarian law see international humanitarian law (IHL)
  illustrative acts, list of
  closed or open, 97, 99, 103–105
  provision of, 5–6, 73–74, 105
  use of, 14–15, 70–71, 136, 212–213
  illustrative chart of jurisdictional scenarios
  development of, 23, 247
  indirect use of force
  inclusion in Definition of Aggression, 71
  individual victims
Rome Statute provisions, 292–301
International Court of Justice (ICJ) and 3314 Definition, 82, 89–95
action brought in, 44–45, 133–134
contest with Security Council, 56–59
determination of acts of aggression, 10, 16–18, 20–21, 26
determination of State responsibility, 48
distinction between levels of use of force, 67–68
foreign state immunities, 320–324
identification of crimes attracting universal jurisdiction, 319–320
prohibition of use of force, 36–38, 47
referred to, 306–307
remit, 220
ruling as to obligation to prevent genocide, 310
rulings as to Security Council’s role, 211–212, 215, 220–229
International Criminal Court (ICC) conflict with Security Council, 56–59
determination of acts of aggression, 16–17, 18
establishment see Rome Conference judgement of State acts, 48
jurisdiction over crime of aggression
activation delay effect of Statute provisions, 281–282
prospects for active jurisdiction, 286–289
requirements, 283–286
exclusions absence of Understanding, 257–258
adoption of amendments, 251–252
applicability of provisions, 263–264
comparison of provisions, 256–257
exercise of jurisdiction, 252–253
future States Parties, 264–265
generally, 249–250
rationale of opt-out declaration, 253–255
scope of jurisdiction, 258–262
issue of interpretation, 205–206
and jurisdictional regime generally, 234–237
operation (table), 261
opt-out declaration
operation, 265–268
rationale, 253–255
politicalisation of, 48–49
Pre-Trial Division Filter
comparison of provisions, 273–274
operation generally, 271–273
Security Council powers, 274–275
scope of, 258–262
and Security Council prerogative, 229–230, see also UN Security Council, determination of acts of aggression
summary of issues, 279–280
Preparatory Committee
Draft Statute, 10
Final Report, 9
session, 207
prosecutions cooperation provisions, 301–311
generally, 289
judicial appointments, 289–292
staff appointments, 289–292
victims of crimes of aggression, 292–301
see also amendments to Rome Statute, Rome Statute
international criminal law
3314 Definition within, 10, 78–80, 81, 96, 186
basis in consensus, 158–159
determination of acts of aggression within framework of, 5, 70
deterrent effectiveness, 43–44, 183, 326–327
and ICC jurisdiction, 160–161, 163, 210
individual focus of, 46–47, 108–109, 168
interpretation issues compared with international humanitarian law, 55–56
judges’ demonstrable knowledge, 329–330
and jus ad bellum, 55–56, 121, 158, 163
leadership immunity, 169
need for certainty, 121–122
Security Council prerogative as to, 214–220, 225–226
Security Council’s role, 8
speed of change, 327–328
International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY) establishment, 212–213, 219–220
obligation to accept jurisdiction of, 310
ruling as to immunity, 323
ruling as to obligation to prevent genocide, 57–58, 310
international humanitarian law (IHL)
binding force, 133
interpretation issues compared with international criminal law, 55–56
judges’ demonstrable knowledge, 329–330
International Law Commission (ILC)
Code of Offences Against the Peace and Security of Mankind (Draft Code), 4–5, 6–9, 81, 140–141, 142, 151–153, 210–211, 312
INDEX 379

proposals for, 24
to exercise, 265
right to exercise, 265
regime for, 258
rationale of, 253–255
permanent members of Security Council (P5)
conference on, 23, 50–51, 52–53
defence of arbitration role, 50, 60, 206–208, 270, 275
and ICC jurisdiction, 162–163
and Rome Statute of ICC, 10
and Rome Statute of International Criminal Court (ICC)
and Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court
Preparatory Committee on the Establishment of an International Criminal Court (ICC) Pre-Trial Division Filter see International Criminal Court (ICC) Princeton Process description of, 13–14
principles on Universal Jurisdiction, 318–319
priority principle and Definition of Aggression, 72
prohibition of aggression see criminalisation of aggression
prohibition of interpretation by analogy and State act element of crime of aggression, 130–132
prohibition of use of force see use of force proof of an aggressive intent inclusion in Definition of Aggression, 72
prosecutions see domestic prosecutions: Heads of State; International Criminal Court (ICC)
R v. Jones, 148–150, 153
red light proposal resistance to, 20
Review Conference (Kampala 2010) adoption of amendments, provision for, 249, 251, 281–282
convening, 238–239, 284–285
international politics and, 49–53
parties, 260
preparations for, 12
presentations, 21, 153–154, 258–259, 334
proceedings, 1–2, 24–31, 275, 276, 289
results, 205, 237–238
review of amendments, 327–332
negotiations prior to, 6–9, 39, 178–179, 234–235
UN Charter
  3314 Definition of Aggression, 11–12, 25, 63–70, 71–72, 75–76, 77–79, 82, 88–89, 91–92, 100–102, 119, 120–121
Article 1(1), 66, 67–68
Article 24, 213, 217, 220, 224
Article 51, 35, 65, 69, 72, 77, 157
Article 103, 214, 229–230
authorised use of force, 155
computer network attacks, 110–111
determination of acts of aggression, 8, 10, 16, 208–230, 234, 268–269, 275, 276
inter-State armed violence, 3–6, 7, 39–40
interpretations of, 31
manifest violation see ‘manifest violation’ threshold
prohibition of use of force, 10, 34–40, 41, 55, 93–94, 97–98, 190–191
UN Conference on International Organisation (UNCIO)
definitional issues, 211, 216
Security Council judicial powers, 218
UN General Assembly
act of aggression and just war doctrine, 87–89
definition of act of aggression, 77
determination of acts of aggression, 16–18, 20–21, 26
identification of acts of aggression, 220–223
peacekeeping operations, establishment of, 219–220
recommendations, 192–193, 335
Resolution 3314, 5–6, 92–95, 98–101, 151
use also 3314 Definition of Aggression
resolutions, 4–5, 17–18, 65, 73, 78–79, 133–134, 140–142, 151, 222–223
use of terminology, 66
UN Security Council
act of aggression, 83–87
authorisation for interventions, 47, 59–60, 65, 161, 164, 192–193, 335
conflict with ICC and ICJ, 56–59
definition of act of aggression, 75–76, 77, 78–79, 82, 97–98, 99–100
determination of acts of aggression arguments against role, 230–233, 288
automatic decisions, 70–71
definition, 268–270
definition of act of aggression, 99–100
effect of, 96–97, 147
effect of ‘negative determination’, 270
exclusiveness of right, 31, 205
existence of prerogative, 10, 16, 52, 208–213
and international criminal law, 214–220
non-monopoly as to, 220–229
non-referral to ICC, 54–55
omission of role, 214
primacy of right, 8, 52–53, 213
referral to ICC, 23–24, 97, 138, 154–155, 234–235, 244, 249, 254–255, 276–278
Rome Statute provisions generally, 268
State referral, 273
summary of issues, 234
SWGCA proposals as to, 16–21
enforcement powers, 55–56, 133–134
referral from ICC, 302
resolutions, 307–308, 310, 311
see also permanent members of Security Council (P5)
Understandings
absence of, 257–258
adoption of, 54, 113, 128–130
drafting of, 25, 153–154, 263–264
proposals of, 25, 127, 247–248, 312–315
provisions as to, 119–122, 276
purposes of, 282, 286–287
rejection of, 161–162
scope of, 162
status of, 97, 113–119, 120, 121–122, 161–162
United Nations see entries at UN
crime against peace, 318–320
crime of aggression, 317–320
domestic prosecutions, 312–313, 323, 326
universal jurisdiction (cont.)
ICC’s exercise of, 7–8, 234–235, 240–241, 264
identification of crimes attracting, 319–320
Princeton Principles, 318–319
use of force
distinction between levels of, 67–68
indirect use, 71
legitimate uses, 155
prohibition of
customary international law and, 38–39, 136, 226
ICJ jurisprudence, 36–38, 47
UN Charter provisions, 10, 34–40, 41, 55, 93–94, 97–98, 190–191
rules on, 55
use of term, 63, 65
see also ‘threat or use of force’

victim states
‘aggressor/victim’ dichotomy, 262
application to ICC, 125, 133–134
approach to defining aggression, 50, 68–69, 71
assistance to, 3, 139, 216
attack against aggressor, 245
consent to ICC jurisdiction, 7–8, 22–23, 234–235, 247, 248, 255, 261
danger to territory, 192–193
exclusion of non-States Parties from ICC jurisdiction, 256–257, 279, 333
non-discrimination between, 248
ratification of amendments, 260
Rome Statute provisions, 292–301
violation of territory, 85–86, 250
victims of aggression see individual victims; victim states
Rome Statute provisions, 292–301
violation of territory, 85–86, 250
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT)
amending agreements, 259, 279–280
definition of ‘manifest violation’, 127
nullum crimen sine lege principle, 154–155
status of Understandings, 113–119, 121–122
violation of, 236

‘war’
use of term, 63–64, 65–66
Working Group on the Crime of Aggression (WGCA)
approach to drafting, 185
attempted crimes provisions, 201
determination proposals, 269
replacement by SWGCA, 13
work of, 12
see also Special Working Group on the Crime of Aggression (SWGCA)