Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01098-7 - An Introduction to Rights: Second Edition William A. Edmundson Index More information

Index

act consequentialism and recognitional function of moral rights, 126, see also consequentialism act utilitarianism inconsistency with "active" rights, 60-61 of Godwin, 40-41 active right defined, 41 Godwin's critique of, 41-42, see also permission; right to do wrong; right to "do as one lists" alienability in Grotius, 16 in Hobbes, 19–20 in Paley, 32 of dominion over one's body, in apologetics of slavery, 13-14 American Revolution as experimental test of the value of rights, 36 French support for, 33, see also expansionary period, first; Declaration of Independence Amistad, The, 64, 66 animal rights adumbrated by Bentham, 50 significance of, 153-154, 166 Anscombe, Elizabeth, 88 Aquinas, Thomas, 7 Aristotle as apologist for slavery, 30 expounded to rebut relativism, 10 Ashoka, Emperor, 9 assistance, right to as "positive" right, 79–80 contractualist reconstruction of, 90 in Bentham, 48 in Godwin, "passive" right to, 43-44

in Grotius, 17–18 in Paley, 32-33 in Pufendorf, 21 right to immigrate not classifiable as, 149, see also beneficence, principle of; positive rights Augustine, Saint, 16 Austin, John and choice theory, 53 and command theory of law, 52 and legal positivism, 52 and moral rights, 53 and natural rights, 53 and "right divine,", 53 and rule utilitarianism, 54-55 utilitarianism of, 53-55 autonomy and allowing costs, 148 and choice theory of moral rights, 102-104, 106 and primacy of rights against interference, 165-167 and protected-choice conception of moral rights, 165-167 Bacon, Francis, 13 "barren" legal rights in Bentham, 49 in Hohfeld, 75-76 basic structure, 153 beneficence, principle of defined, 32 Grotius's natural "law of love," 17-18, 31-33, 61 in Bentham, 48 in Burke, 37

Index

beneficence, principle of (cont.) in Butler, 32, 56 in Godwin, 60-61 in Mill, 56, 60-61 in Paley, 30-31 limited contractualist principle, 90 benefit theory, see interest theory Bentham, Jeremy and analysis of legal rights, 48-49 analytical methodology of, 44-45 and animals, 50 anticipation of Hohfeld by, 71-72 and "barren" rights, 49 and equality and property, 47-48 and interest theory of legal rights, 49 and natural rights in objective sense, 46-47 and negative critique of natural rights, 44-45 and right of liberty, 47 and right to assistance, 48 and sanction theory of duty, 49 and social contract, 47 on pleasures, 49-50, 59 bilateral permissions, see permissions Bill of Rights as amendment to Constitution, 62 anti-Federalist insistence upon, 62 and ninth amendment, 62 and successful charter of American government, 36 Board of Regents v. Roth, 67 Boston Tea Party, 27 Bowers v. Hardwick, 70 "bracketing," see protected-choice conception Brandeis, Justice, 68, 131 Buch v. Amory Manufacturing, 100 Burgesses, Virginia House of, 27 Burke, Edmund as harbinger of communitarian critique, 39 and beneficence principle, 37 and conventional nature of rights, 37-39 and critique of natural rights, 36-37 and Hume's critique of social contract theory, 37 and "real rights,", 37 and right of self-preservation, 38 and rights discerned by utility, 39 moral relativist reading of, 39 rule utilitarianism of, 39 Burlamaqui, Jean-Jacques, 164 Butler, Bishop

and direct application of beneficence principle, 32 and Mill, 56 charity, see beneficence, principle of choice theory contrast to interest theory, 106 of legal rights, 98-102 of moral rights, 102-107 origin of, in Austin, 53 Cicero, 7 circumstances of morality, see contractualism, Hobbesian Clarke, Samuel, 92 Cohen, G.A., 153 Cold War, 87, 140-141 Committees of Correspondence, 27 communism, original, 7 communitarianism anticipation by Marx and Dewey, 66 Burke and, 39 compliance problem, see contractualism, Hobbesian defined, 143 support for national right of self-determination, 142-143 conceptual analysis as curb against expansionary tendency, 70 Bentham's method of, 44-45 consent theory of political obligation disparaged by Bentham, 46-47 in Burke, 37 in Declaration of Independence, 25-26 in Grotius, 15, 17 in Hobbes, 18-19 in Kant, 29-30 in Locke, 22–23, 24–25 in Mill, right to liberty retained, 56-57 consent theory of property, in Pufendorf, 21 consequentialism defined, 88 difficulties attending, 88-89, 94-95, 127-128 implications for protected-permission conception, 121-127 neo-Godwinian landmarks of, 165 utilitarianism contrasted, 88 Constant, Benjamin and Godwin, 62 and rights of moderns and of ancients, 61-62 Constitution of the United States, 27-28, 62-70

constraints, see moral constraints

Index

constructed nature of rights and Burke's conventionalist account, 37-38 and cultural and historical variability, 3-5 linguistic and cultural evidence insufficient to establish, 4-6 and natural kinds, 156-157 Continental Congress, 27 Contractarianism, 93, 94 contractualism ambitions of, 89-90 anti-aggregative concern of, 88-89 characterized, 88 Hobbesian circumstances of morality, 90-91 compliance problem facing, 91, 93 consistency with utilitarianism, see Harsanyi, John difficulties involving fairness, 92-95 failure as general account of moral rights, 93-95 and rational choice theory, 89-91 and veil of ignorance, 92-93 Kantian charge of circularity, 94 reasonable and concern for the good, contrasted, 93-94 reasonable and rational, contrasted, 93-94 and principle of beneficence, 90 conventions in American constitutional jurisprudence, 70 in Burke, 37–38 and rights, 11 corrective justice, 149-150 Darwin, Charles, 156 Decalogue, 8, 61

Declaration of Independence determined inapplicable to Africans, 65–66 marked beginning of first expansionary period, 10 natural rights in, 25–26 right of revolution in, 25–26 Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen application of, 35 authorship of, 34 provisions of, 34–35 "democratic peace" hypothesis, 142 destabilization rights, 143 Dewey, John, 66 d'Herbois, Collot, 35

175

Difference Principle, 152 direct utilitarianism, see act utilitarianism disability, legal and Anti-Sedition Act, 74 in Hohfeld, 73–75 distance, moral relevance of, 124-125 distributive justice, see justice, distributive Dominicans, defense of the naturalness of property, 7 dominion alienability of, apologetics for slavery, 13-14 as property right, 6-7 human analogous to divine, according to Paul XXII, 7 in one's own body, 13 mere use and possession contrasted, 6-7 Douglass, Frederick, 64-65 Dover, Kenneth, 4-5 Dred Scott v. Sandford, 65-66, 70 "due process" clause; see also rights, fundamental duties, positive as imperfect, in Paley, 33 "positive duties are voluntary" thesis is contrary to general right to assistance, 132-133 is contrary to status-based duties, 132-133 stated, 132 duty of beneficence, see beneficence, principle of duty of noninterference, see interference duty, legal in Bentham, 48-49 in Hohfeld, 72-75, 76, see also legal rights, choice theory of Dworkin, Ronald, 117, 165, 166 "easy rescue" contractualism and, 90 duty to perform, 79-80 in Trolley Problem, 119 recognitional function of right to, 114-115 right to receive, 122-125, see also assistance, right to; rights, positive egalitarianism, 151-153 luck egalitarianism, 152–153 emotivism, 87 endowment effect, 11, 163 Enlightenment, 13 envy, 151–152 equality

consequentialist view of, 89, 95 economic, debated as a matter of rights, 11

Index

equality (cont.) in Bentham, 47, 48 in Pufendorf, 21-22, see also Declaration of Independence; Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen expansionary periods of rights rhetoric, see first expansionary period; second expansionary period expansionary period, first consolidation following, 66–67 defined, 10 differences from second period, 11-12 ended with Reign of Terror, 10, 51 ending of, characterized generally, 10 natural moral order assumed in, 11, 156-157 residual difficulties following, 70, see also American Revolution, French Revolution expansionary period, second current, and end not known, 11 current similarities to end of first expansionary period, 10-11 defined, 10-11 differences from first expansionary period, 11-12 expansion slowed by Cold War, 140-141 inaugurated by Universal Declaration, 87 natural moral order doubted in, 11, 156-157 post-Soviet developments in, 140-141 prominence of second-generation rights in, 141 role of NGOs in, 140, 142 seeds of, 67 expansionary worry contemporary expressions of, 163 and duty against interference, 131-132 and positive duties, 131-132, see also minimalism fair treatment, right to, 93-95 fair value of political liberties, 150, 152 Feinberg, Joel, 81, 164

Fénelon, Archbishop, 40, 128–129
Filmer, Robert, 22–23
fourteenth amendment, *see* "due process" clause
Francis of Assisi, Saint, 6–7
Franciscans, denial of the naturalness of property, 6–8
French Revolution

as experimental test of the value of rights, 36
background of, 33–34
reactions to, 36

and rights of ancients, 61–62, *see also* Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen

Garrison, William Lloyd, 63-65 Gerson, Jean, 4 Glorious Revolution, 22, 24 Godwin, William and active and passive rights, 41–43 as act utilitarian, 40-41, 164 and Burke compared, 39-40 and correlativity of duty and right to assistance, 43 and critique of active rights, 41 and denial of self-ownership, 40 and interference, 121 and moral constraints, 121 and moral options, 121 and passive right to assistance, 41-43 and passive right to forbearance, 41 and philosophical anarchism, 44 and property, 43-44 and "right to do wrong,", 41 and right to revolution, 44 and "sphere of discretion,", 42-43, 56 unacknowledged influence of, 44 governments for Grotius, formed by compact, 15 for Hobbes, formed by rights transfers, 19 for Locke, bounded by consent, 23-24 for Pufendorf, 21-22 Greece, ancient recognition of rights among, disputed, 3–5, 10, 163 rights of, contrasted to those of moderns, 61 Griswold v. Connecticut, 69 Grotius, Hugo and alienability of rights enabling slavery and government alike, 16 and denial of ideal government, 16-17 and epistemology of rights, 15-16 imperfect and perfect rights in, 17-18, 21 and international law, 14 and justice as respect for rights, 15 natural "law of love" in, 17-18, 31, 32, 61 and origin of governments in compact, 15, 16 and rights extend to natural liberty and property, 15 and secular natural law, 14-15

CAMBRIDGE

and sociability, 14

Index

177

superior authority of the state in, 18 value pluralism of, 16-17 Hamilton, Alexander, 62 Hare, R. M., 88 "harm" principle, see Mill, John Stuart Harsanyi, John, 91-92, 165 Hart, H. L. A. and Bentham's anticipation of Hohfeld, 164 and descriptive theory of law, 87-88 on natural right to fair treatment, 93, 165 Hazlitt, William, 40 Hobbes, Thomas and alienability of rights, 19 and Grotius, 18-19 Hohfeldian rendering of, 93 on civil rights, 20 and retained rights, 19–20 and sovereign injustice, 19–20 state of nature a state of war, for, 19 and transition to civil society, 19 Hohfeld, Wesley Newcomb bundling of elements, 76, 82, 108, 109 expositors of, 164 jural correlatives, 73 jural opposites, 74-75 relational nature of legal advantages, 77 Hume, David, 30, 37 Ignatieff, Michael, 87, 146, 166 immigration, right to absence from Universal Declaration, 86, 147 grounds for recognizing, 148–149 immunity, legal and Anti-Sedition Act, 74 in Hohfeld, 73–75 imperialism worry described, 6 imperium, in contrast to dominion, misplaced where rights have conceptual footing, 9 regarding Eastern cultures, 9 relation to relativism worry, 131 incommensurability, see reasons, incommensurability of indirect utilitarianism, see rule utilitarianism individual judgment, right of, see sphere of discretion

individualism not assumed by Hohfeld, 81-82 of rights, 66 inflationary worry, 131-132 infringement defined, 119-120 relation to defeasibility threshold, 119-120 and sanction, contrasted, 136-137 interests, aggregation of rights as guard against, 118, see also thresholds; contractualism interference and allowing costs, compared, 147-148 duty against, correlative to right, in Pufendorf, duty against, not attended by expansionary worry, 131 duty against, primacy not guaranteed by Hohfeld, 131 duty that state of affairs obtain, compared, 77 failure to render assistance distinguished, 122-122 Godwin's conception of, 42, 121 and imposing costs, compared, 135-137 moral and legal, contrasted, 78-80 as moral concept defined in terms of standing and proportionality norms, 138 nature of, 78-80 primacy over, by appeal to general/special rights distinction, 132, 134 protected-choice conception must explain, 111-112 right against, 66-67 right to be let alone, compared, 68 with wrongs-without-a-right, 137 interest theory in Bentham, of legal rights, 49 complex relation to choice theory, 52-53 conceptual implications of, 97-98 expansive tendency, regarding moral rights, 106 fecundity of, regarding legal rights, 98, 106 and reductive worry, 53, 55 intuition and differing orders of utility, 59 in fundamental rights jurisprudence, 70 in Grotius, 15-16 Kant's rejection of, 28 rejected by Bentham, 46 rejected by Paley, 30

Index

Jay, John, 62 Jefferson, Thomas author of Declaration of Independence, 25, 27 complexity of, 65-66 influence on the Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen, 34 John XXII, Pope, and declaration of the naturalness of property, 7 instice as respect for rights, in Grotius, 15 as respect for rights, in Mill, 58 distributive, explosiveness in international context, 147 distributive, increasingly debated as a matter of rights, 11 sovereign incapable of, for Hobbes, 20 Justinian, Code of, 10 Kant, Immanuel anticipation of United Nations, 28 categorical imperative in, 29 ethical focus on rational beings, 29, 159 formation of civil society in, 29 on property rights, 29 reason as basis of morality in, 28-29 rejection of intuition, 28 rejection of utilitarianism, 28 rejects right of revolution, 29-30 Lafayette, Marquis de escape from the guillotine, 35, see also Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen "law of love," see beneficence, principle of Lawrence v. Texas, 70 Lee Kuan Yew, charge of human rights imperialism by, 9, 163 legal positivism, and Austin's "command" theory, 52 leveling-down objection, 151-152 liability, legal, in Hohfeld, 73, 74 liberty, right to (or of) in Bentham, 47 in Godwin, 42 in Mill, 56–57, 60 in Sidgwick, 66-67 in U.S. constitutional jurisprudence, 67-68, 69, see also natural liberty Lochner v. New York, 67-68, 69, 86 Locke, John and consensual origin of government, 23 and East India Company, 22

and Hobbes, 23 and "natural executive right" to punish, 23 and retained rights, 23 and right of revolution, 25 theory of property as basis for excluding immigrants, 149 as example of special duty created by beneficiary's act, 133-134 as original appropriation by admixture of labor, 23, 43, 133 doubts about, 134 logical positivism, 87 Lord Mansfield, 26 "love, law of," see Grotiussee also beneficence, principle of MacIntyre, Alasdair, on the modernity of rights, 4, 5, 163 Maine, Henry Sumner, 4 majority rights, 82 Marx, Karl, 66, 164 Marxism, 87-88 Mazzolini, Silvestro, 14, 24 metaethics, 87, see also expansionary period, first, natural moral order assumed in; expansionary period, second, natural moral order doubted in; minimalism, metaethical concerns of Mill, John Stuart and "active" rights, 60-61 and defeasibility of rights, 59 derives right to liberty from utilitarian principle, 57 disparate interpretations of, 164 and "harm" principle, 56 and higher and lower utilities, 59 and majority tyranny, 55-56 and right to liberty, 56-57, 60 unacknowledged debt to Godwin, 56 minimalism ambiguity of, 153-154 characterized, 144 metaethical concerns of, 144-145 pragmatic concerns of, 145 and right of national self-determination, 147 and right to decent economic minimum, 145 and "supraminimalism" toward right to exclude immigrants, 148-149, see also expansionary worry Molina, Luis de, 14

Moore, G. E., 88

Index

179

moral constraints defined. 121 moral options contrasted, 125-126 and neo-Godwin assault on moral options, 125-126 rule-consequentialist support for, 126-127 moral options centrality of, to protected-permission conception of rights, 109, 125-126 defended by invoking agent-relative reasons, 128-129 defended by invoking exclusionary reasons, 129-130 defined, 109 and Godwin, 121 lack of rule-consequentialist support for, 127 and moral constraints contrasted, 125-126 need to be located in wider account of morality, 129-130 and undermining by neo-Godwinians, 121-126 moral progress ambiguity of "expanding circle" metaphor, 154 not matched by metaethical progress, 144-145 and rights, 3–4 and subjective rights, 14 moral sense, see intuition moral skepticism and the law of nations, 14 and reaction-constraining function of rights, 112-114 and second expansionary period, 11, see also metaethics Morally Relevant Differences, Principle of application to "easy rescue" duty, 122-125 stated, 122 narcissism worry, 3 natural law in Grotius, 14-15 and isomorphism of moral and legal rights, 105 in Locke, 23, see also natural liberty, natural rights natural liberty in Grotius, 15 in Kant, 29 in Locke, 23 in Pufendorf, 22 natural rights as human rights, 34, 66, 155-156 as modern invention, 4-5 in Austin, as divinely ordained moral rights, 53

Bentham's critique of, 45-48 Burke's critique of, 36-39 and conflict, in Hobbes's state of nature, 19, 20 in Declaration of Independence, 25-26 foundational position in American constitutional history, 64 Godwin's critique of, 40, 41-42 in Grotius, 14-15 in Locke, 22-25 Marx's critique of, 66 and natural differences, 155 not controlling, in Dred Scott v. Sandford, 65-66 negative duties, see negative rights Nietzsche, Friedrich, 61, 92 ninth amendment, see Bill of Rights noninterference, see interference "no-right,", 73-75 moral, 81-82 "no threshold" view, see thresholds Nozick, Robert, 150, 165 options, see permissions Paine, Thomas, 39-40, 41, 97 Paley, William and alienability of rights, 32 and correlativity of rights and duties, 31 and God's beneficence and utilitarian principle, 30-31 and imperfect right to assistance, 32-33 and negative rights as perfect, 33 on pleasures and happiness, 31, 60-61 and positive rights as imperfect, 32-33 principle of beneficence in, 30-33 and property, 33 rejection of intuition by, 30 rule utilitarianism of, 32 and sanction theory of duty, 31 and slavery as contrary to duty rather than right, 32 utilitarianism of, 30-31 permissions as "active" rights, in Godwin, 41, 96 as Hohfeldian privileges, 73 do not entail claim rights, 75 in rem, 75 moral, not entailed by moral "no-rights,", 81 not entailed by claim rights, 75 options as bilateral, 96 rights as, xi

Index

Perry, Michael, 156, 166 philosophical anarchism, 44 Plato, 16 pluralism, of values in Grotius, 16-17, see also reasons, incommensurability of positive rights, see rights, positive 'positive duties are voluntary" thesis, 132 powers, legal in Bentham, 49–50 in Hohfeld, 71-74 and trust relationship, 71-72, 74 privacy, right to; see also fundamental rights privilege, see permissions prohibitions, rights as, xi proportionality norms, see standing and proportionality norms protected-choice conception of moral rights allows right to do wrong, 110-112 as best rendering of moral rights, 160 and "bracketing" substantive moral issues, 165 defined, 110 and explaining the force of wrongness, 111 implicate standing and proportionality norms, 138-139 independence of moral options, 125-126 must offer account of interference, 111 narrows range of permissible sanctions, 137 protected-permission conception contrasted, 110, 112-113 serves reaction-constraining function, 113-114 protected-permission conception of moral rights defined, 108-109 dependence on moral options, 125-126 illustrated, 109, 110-111 incompatible with "right to do wrong,", 109 protected-choice conception contrasted, 110, 112-113 serves recognitional function, 113-114 Pufendorf, Samuel as architect of European welfare state, 22 on correlativity of rights and duties, 21 on government, 22 on perfect and imperfect rights, 21 property rights founded upon consent, 21 on rights as moral, not ordinary natural, powers, 20-21 on sociability and equality, 21-22 punish, right to, 23

Rawls, John, 150, 152-153

contractualism and, 88, 94, 165 and method of avoidance, 144 and minimalist approach to international human rights, 144–145 Raz, Joseph, 163, 165 reaction-constraining function of rights defined, 113 made salient if moral options denied, 125-126 moral scepticism and, 113-114 and standing and proportionality norms, 139 reasons agent-neutral defined, 128 favored by consequentialism, 128 agent-relative defined. 128 foundational for contractualism, 128 ignored by consequentialism, 128 importance for commonsense morality, 128 in defense of moral options, 128-129 exclusionary defined, 129 illuminate agent-relative reasons, 129 in defense of moral options, 129 for action, and rights, 110 incommensurability of agent-neutral and agent-relative reasons, 128-130 exclusionary reasons and, 129-130 redescription approach bolsters "rights as trumps,", 119-120 contrasted to "threshold view,", 120 defined, 120, see also thresholds reductive worry defined, 6 dismissed as valetudinarian, 156 palliated by choice and interest theories, 53 raised by utilitarianism, 55 Reign of Terror characterized, 35 ended first expansionary period, 10, 51, see also Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen relativism worry and Bentham, 45 and Burke, 39 fed by historical and cultural variability, 131 reconsidered, 161 and subjective rights, 9 responsibilities, their relation to rights, 160 revolution, right of

Index

and African slaves, 63 in Bentham, 47-48 in Burke, 37-38 in Declaration of Independence, 27 in Godwin, 44 in Grotius, 16-17 in Locke, 25 Kant's denial of, 29-30 right, objective defined, 7-8 in Bentham, 46, 47 irrelevant connotations, 8 subjective right contrasted, 8-9 "right to be let alone,", 68, 131, see also right to privacy; interference, right against "right to do as one lists,", 109, see also right, active "right to do wrong" denied by Godwin, 41 embraced by protected-choice conception, 108-109, 110 lacks recognitional function, 113 non-entailment of permission by claim right, 76 rejected by protected-permission conception, 108-109 right of individual judgment, compared, 42, see also right, active rights, abortion recognitional or reaction-constraining function of, 113 rights, absolute, see thresholds; trumps, rights as rights and duties, correlativity of as essential to robust conception of rights, 131 and duty of noninterference, 79-80 in Austin, 52 in Godwin, 43 in Hohfeld, see legal rights, in Hohfeld in Paley, 31 in Pufendorf, 21 and mutual entailment, contrasted, 80 rights, civil alienability of, in Paley, 32 extended at sovereign's pleasure, in Hobbes, 20 in U.S., following Civil War, 67 rights, claim as right in Hohfeld's "strictest sense,", 73, 74 defined, 73 do not entail permissions, 76 in personam, 75 in rem, 75 not entailed by permissions, 76

181

rights, conflicts of in Hobbes, 19 and specification, 118 rights, defeasibility of, see thresholdssee also Godwin, Austin, Mill rights, "first generation" defined, 86 priority vis-a-vis second generation, 140-141 rights, force of moral, 108, see also thresholds rights, fundamental; see also "due process" clause constrain majority will, 68 give legal effect to moral rights, 69 history, tradition and, 69-70 how determined, 68-69 need not be textual, 69 rights, gay, 113, 114 rights, general contrasted with special rights, 132 defined, 132 rights, group in Hohfeld, 81–82 minimalism's indulgence toward, 147, see also self-determination, national right of third-generation rights as 143 rights, human alleged modern invention of, 4-5 alleged religious presupposition of, 155-156 ambiguous scope of, 153-154 as individualist and cosmopolitan, rather than nationalist, 149 as moral rights, 155 concept of, and restrictions of genomic manipulation, 158 general inalienability of, 161 imperialism charge against, 9 in Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen, 34 in Universal Declaration, 85-87 and natural rights, 66, 155-156 recognitional function of, 158 restriction to specimens of homo sapiens questioned, 153-157 retiring the expression as objectionably speciesist, 154 rights, imperfect in Godwin, 43 in Grotius, 17-18, 43 in Paley, 32-33 in Pufendorf, 21 rights to assistance as, 81, see also perfect rights

Index

rights, legal Bentham's analysis of, 48-49, 71 Hohfeld's analysis of, 71-76, see also choice theory; interest theory rights, "manifesto" defined, 81 second-generation rights as, 145 third-generation rights as, 143 rights, moral as protected choices, 160 and convention, 70 and fundamental rights jurisprudence, 68 have both reaction-constraining and recognitional purposes, 161 Hohfeldian nature of, 76-77, 82 and intuition, 70 inalienability of, 161 value of, 161-162 rights, negative as perfect, in Paley, 33 in classical liberal view, 79 not fundamental, for Hohfeld, 134 reaction-constraining function typical of, 114-115 rights, "passive" defined, in Godwin, 41 to assistance, 43 against interference, 41-42, 43, see also interference; assistance, right to rights, perfect in Godwin, 43 in Grotius, 17–18, 43 in Pufendorf, 21, see also rights, imperfect rights, positive defined, 79 recognitional or reaction-constraining function of, 114-115 relation to standing and proportionality norms, 139 rights, property in Aquinas, 7 in Bentham, 47 in Godwin, 43-44 in Locke, by original acquisition, 23 in Paley, 33 in Pufendorf, by mutual consent, 21 Locke's "provisos,", 23, 134, 149, see also Locke, theory of property rights, "real" in Burke, 37 in Pufendorf, 20

rights, recognitional function of defined, 113 illustrated by gay rights, 113 indirectly served by act-consequentialism, 126 not served by protected-choice conception, 113 not served by rights to do wrong, 113 of human rights, 158 reaction-constraining function contrasted, 114 served by protected-permission conception, 113 rights, special actions triggering, 133 defined, 132 right, subjective ambiguous evidence of in Buddhist tradition, 9-10 assumed to mark emergence of modern rights concept, 9 captures less than full modern concept, 9-10 and choice and interest theories, 53 defined, 8 essential reference to right-holder, 8 in Bentham, 47, 49 in Grotius, 15 involvement in the apologetics of slavery, 13 irrelevant connotations of, 8-9 no guarantee of moral progress, 13 not assumed to exhaust the modern rights concept, 9-10 objective right contrasted, 7-8 relativism worry extends beyond emergence of, 9 rights, third-generation as group rights, 143 as manifesto rights, 143 as objective rather than subjective rights, 143-144 defined, 143 rights, universality of assumption of, 3 history of rights discourse and, 3-5 practical importance of, 3-4 undermined by relativism worry, 3, 6, 131, see also relativism worry rights in "strictest sense," see rights, claim Roe v. Wade, 69-70 Rousseau, Jean-Jacques influence in Europe, 30 and the philosophes, 33-34 rule consequentialism and moral constraints, 126-127

CAMBRIDGE

Index

183

and moral options, 127, see also consequentialism rule utilitarianism advantages over act utilitarianism, 57-58 of Austin, 54-55 of Burke, 39 of Mill, 57–58, 60–61 of Paley, 32 and possibility of "active" rights, 60-61 sanction theory of duty in Bentham, 49 in Paley, 31 scope of moral rights, 108, 158-159 Scotus, Duns defense of natural propertylessness, 6-7 role as conceptual innovator, 4 "second generation" rights defined, 86 priority vis-à-vis first generation, 140-141 self-determination, national right of, 142 communitarian support for, 143 and rise of NGOs, 142 self-ownership Godwin's denial of, 40 in Locke, not absolute, 24, see also alienability self-preservation, right of in Burke, 38 in Godwin, 41-42 in Hobbes, 18-19 in Locke, 23 in Mill, 59, 60 Sen, Amartya and Eastern rights traditions, 9, 163 and economic importance of first-generation rights, 142 Sharp, Granville, 26 Sherman's march through Georgia, 67 side constraints, 38, 165 Sidgwick, Henry on the right of freedom from interference, 66-67 on utilities, 59 Singapore economic prosperity of, 141-142 Western perception of, 9 slavery Aristotle on, 30 Grotius on 16 in Hobbes's state of nature, 19 Paley on, 30, 32

role of rights in apologetics of, 13-14 trade, 14, 22, 27 in United States, 26-28 social contract, see consent theory, see also contractualism Somerset v. Stewart, 26-27 sphere of discretion in Godwin, right of individual judgment in, 42-43 in Mill, as aspect of right to liberty, 56 Spooner, Lysander, 65 standing and proportionality norms defined, 138 interference defined in terms of, 138-139 and positive rights, 139 and protected-choice conception of moral rights, 138-139 and reaction-constraining function, 139 state of nature in Locke, 23-24 in Pufendorf, 20–21 sociable, in Grotius, 14-15 a state of war, in Hobbes, 18-19, see also circumstances of morality substance of moral rights, 108 sufficientarianism, 152 supraminimalism, see minimalism Taylor, Thomas, 40 Thirty Years War, 14, 20, 155 Thomson, Judith, 93, 164 "threshold" view, see thresholds thresholds and concept of rights infringement, 119-120 and countervailing non-right considerations, 110 and defeasibility, 120 problem, 118 superiority of "threshold" view, 119-120 "tragedy of the commons,", 126, 165-166 trickle-down objection, 151-152 Trolley Problem, 117-118, 119, 165, see also trumps, rights as trumps, rights as as distinctly modern idea, 9-10 explained, 117 and specification of rights, 118 and Trolley Problem, 117-118, 119 Tuck, Richard, 14, 163

Unger, Roberto, 143

Index

United Nations founding of, 85 Kant's anticipation of, 28 Universal Declaration of Human Rights inaugurated second expansionary period, 10-11 major provisions of, 85-97 regarded as source of law, 155 utilitarianism and approaches to moral rights, 51-52, 77 as a species of consequentialism, 88 as dominant theory in nineteenth-century England, 51 of Austin, 52-55 as reconstruction of commonsense morality, 51 Kant's basis for rejecting, 28 of Burke, 39 of Godwin, 40-41, 164 of Mill, 55, 56-59

of Paley, 30–32 *see als*o act utilitarianism, rule utilitarianism

vacation, human right to, with pay and minimalist concern, 144 in Universal Declaration, 86

William of Ockham disputed role as conceptual innovator, 4 rebuttal to John XXII, 7 Williams, Bernard, 88, 165 will theory, *see* choice theory Westphalia, Treaty of, 20, 155 Wollstonecraft, Mary rebuttal to Burke, 40 and women's rights, 40, 41 women's rights, 40, 69, 113 World War II, 10–11, 85, 146