PRACTICE AND
THEORY IN COMPARATIVE LAW

What does doing comparative law involve? Too often, explicit methodological discussions in comparative law remain limited to the level of pure theory, neglecting to test out critiques and recommendations on concrete issues. This book bridges this gap between theory and practice in comparative legal studies. Essays by both established and younger comparative lawyers reflect on the methodological challenges arising in their own work and in work in their area. Taken together, they offer clear recommendations for, and critical reflection on, a wide range of innovative comparative research projects.

MAURICE ADAMS is Professor of General Jurisprudence at Tilburg University, the Netherlands, and Professor of Comparative Law at the University of Antwerp, Belgium.

JACCO BOMHOFF is Lecturer in Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science.
PRACTICE AND THEOREY IN COMPARATIVE LAW

Edited by
MAURICE ADAMS AND JACCO BOMHOFF
CONTENTS

List of contributors page vii
Acknowledgments ix

1 Comparing law: practice and theory 1
MAURICE ADAMS AND JACCO BOMHOFF

2 Reflections on comparative law methodology – getting inside contract law 22
CATHERINE VALCKE

3 Reasoning with previous decisions 49
JAN KOMÁREK

4 Comparing legal argument 74
JACCO BOMHOFF

5 In search of system neutrality: methodological issues in the drafting of European contract law rules 96
GERHARD DANNEMANN

6 Comparative law and global regulatory convergence: the example of competition law 120
DAVID J. GERBER

7 Reflections on comparative method in European constitutional law 143
MONICA CLAES AND MAARTJE DE VISSE

8 Rethinking methods in European private law 170
JAN M. SMITS
vi

CONTENTS

9  Transnational comparisons: theory and practice of comparative law as a critique of global governance 186
   PEER ZUMBANSEN

10 Comparative constitutional compliance: notes towards a research agenda 212
   FREDERICK SCHAUER

11 Quantitative methods for comparative constitutional law 230
   ANNE MEUWES AND MILA VERSTEEG

12 Comparisons in private patrimonial law: towards a bottom-up approach using (cross-cultural) behavioural economics 258
   JULIE DE CONINCK

13 Against ‘comparative method’: explaining similarities and differences 279
   MAURICE ADAMS AND JOHN GRIFFITHS

14 Comparative law as an act of modesty: a pragmatic and realistic approach to comparative legal scholarship 302
   KOEN LEMMENS

Index 327
CONTRIBUTORS

MAURICE ADAMS is Professor of General Jurisprudence at the Law School of Tilburg University (the Netherlands), and part-time Professor of Comparative Law at the University of Antwerp (Belgium)

JACCO BOMHOFF is Lecturer at the Department of Law of the London School of Economics and Political Science (UK)

MONICA CLAES is Professor of European and Comparative Constitutional Law at the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University (The Netherlands)

JULIE DE CONINCK was postdoctoral researcher at the Faculty of Law of Leuven University (KU Leuven) and Lecturer at the University of Antwerp (both in Belgium)

GERHARD DANNEMANN is Chair for English Law, British Economy and Politics, Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin (Germany)

DAVID J. GERBER is Distinguished Professor of Law at Chicago-Kent College of Law (USA)

JOHN GRIFFITHS is Emeritus Professor of Sociology of Law at Groningen University (The Netherlands)

JAN KOMAREK is Lecturer in EU Law at the European Institute and the Department of Law of the London School of Economics and Political Science (UK)

KOEN LEMMENS is Professor of Human Rights Law at the Faculty of Law of Leuven University (KU Leuven, Belgium)
CONTRIBUTORS

ANNE MEUWSE is Associate Professor in Public Law at the Law School of Tilburg University (The Netherlands)

FREDERICK SCHAUER is David and Mary Harrison Distinguished Professor of Law, University of Virginia School of Law (USA)

JAN M. SMITS is Chair of European Private Law at the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University and Research Chair of Comparative Legal Studies at the University of Helsinki (Finland)

CATHERINE VALCKE is Professor at the University of Toronto Faculty of Law (Canada)

MILA VERSTEEG is Associate Professor at the University of Virginia School of Law (USA)

MAARTJE DE VISSER is Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University (The Netherlands)

PEER ZUMBANSEN is Professor of Law and Canada Research Chair in Transnational Economic Governance and Legal Theory at Osgoode Hall Law School of York University (Canada), and the founding Director of the Critical Research Laboratory in Law & Society
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This volume was made possible by a major grant from the Royal Netherlands Academy of Sciences in Amsterdam. This support made it possible to bring the contributors together in Amsterdam, in early 2010, in the inspiring surroundings of the Academy. The vast majority of the chapters were presented and debated there for the first time. The Royal Academy’s support is gratefully acknowledged. Wessel Wijtvliet, a research student at Tilburg University, provided invaluable assistance during the editing process. Finally, the editors of Cambridge University Press, of whom we mention Nienke van Schaverbeke in particular, were of great patience and help during the entire period that work on this volume took place.