This is the first comprehensive exploration of ancient and modern tyranny as a central theme in the history of political thought. Waller R. Newell argues that modern tyranny and statecraft differ fundamentally from the classical understanding. Newell demonstrates a historical shift in emphasis from the classical thinkers’ stress on the virtuous character of rulers and the need for civic education to the modern emphasis on impersonal institutions and cold-blooded political method. The turning point is Machiavelli’s call for the conquest of nature. Newell traces the lines of influence from Machiavelli’s new science of politics to the rise of Atlanticist republicanism in England and America, as well as the totalitarian regimes of the twentieth century and their effects on the present. By diagnosing the varieties of tyranny from erotic voluptuaries like Nero, the steely determination of reforming conquerors like Alexander the Great and Julius Caesar, and modernizing despots such as Napoleon and Ataturk to the collectivist revolutions of the Jacobins, Bolsheviks, Nazis, and Khmer Rouge, Newell shows how tyranny is every bit as dangerous to free democratic societies today as it was in the past.

TYRANNY
A New Interpretation

WALLER R. NEWELL
Carleton University
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgments</th>
<th>page ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction: The Conquest of Eros</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Debate about Ancient and Modern Tyranny</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remarks on Method</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Is There an Ontology of Tyranny?</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Primordial and the Transcendental as Fundamental</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perspectives on Political Existence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and Imitation: Images of the Soul in Plato’s</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dialogues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Modern Point of Departure for the New Science of Politics</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hobbesian Narrowing of Machiavelli’s New</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science of Politics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Tyrant and the Statesman in Plato’s Political</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philosophy and Machiavelli’s Rejoinder</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Lover of the City</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hidden Tyrant</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hidden Founding</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paradoxes of the Tyrannical Founding</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Machiavelli and the Sophists</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Superlative Virtue, Monarchy, and Political Community</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Aristotle’s Politics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monarchy and the Political Community</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

The Claim of Superlative Virtue in the Debate about  
Justice 156
A Godlike Man in the City? 162
Monarchy, Reason, and Nature 169
Arendt on the Household and the Community 180
The Global Household 183

4. Tyranny and the Science of Ruling in Xenophon’s  
Political Thought 186
Roads to the Education of Cyrus: The Distinctiveness of  
Xenophon’s Political Thought 187
Cyrus’s Imperialistic Revolution 199
The Peloponnesian War and the Thucydidean Context 210

5. Machiavelli, Xenophon, and Xenophon’s Cyrus 228
Virtue Defined as the Mastery of Fortuna 232
Cyrus the Great in Machiavelli’s Discourses 236
Subverting the Traditional Catalogue of the Virtues 246
Machiavelli’s Rhetorical Employment of Xenophon in  
the Appeal to Antiquity 257

How Original Is Machiavelli? The Relationship of  
Virtue and Fortuna 274
Sundering Diotima’s Ladder: The City of Man, the City  
of God, and Machiavelli’s New Synthesis 296
The Three Stages of Mastering Fortuna 325

7. The Republic in Motion: Machiavelli’s Vision of the New  
Rome 345
The Classical Understanding of Imperialism as a Mode  
of Tyranny 347
Virtue, Necessity, and Choice in the Founding of Cities 351
The Cycle of Regimes 363
The Republic Perfected by Chance 383
The Rise and Fall of the New Rome 406
Interlude: Machiavelli and Religion 419
Conclusion: Tyranny Ancient and Modern 433
The Many Faces of Machiavelli 433
## CONTENTS

- The Two Corridors to Modernity (Dark and Light) 445
- The Torture of Nature? 456
- The Phenomenology of Tyranny 478
- The Transition to Totalitarianism and the Will of the People: The Limits of This Study 498

*Epilogue: The Hermeneutical Problem of Tyranny* 513

*Bibliography* 519

*Index* 537
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

As I was nearing the completion of this book, the world was being inspired by the struggle for freedom unfolding across the Arab lands. During that same period and for some time preceding it, according to Freedom House, the world’s democracies had been in retreat while tyrannical forces were on the rise. We seem to be living through an era in which expectations for freedom and the proliferation of tyranny are intensifying simultaneously. More than ever, then, it is incumbent on us to study tyranny, attempt to identify its varieties, and try to anticipate its emergence and hostility to the forces of freedom. Tyranny is generally an unpleasant subject, but one does not think about tyranny because one wants to think about unpleasant things. Rather, if one wants to think, it must be about both pleasant and unpleasant things.

This book grew out of many years of reflection, and some of the chapters (1, 3, 4, 5, and a portion of 6) contain greatly transformed and lengthened versions of earlier articles. The Introduction, Chapters 2 and 7, and the Conclusion are entirely new. None of the chapters, however, simply duplicates the content of the earlier articles, because I only arrived at the central thesis of this book through writing them. They have now been reshaped in light of that thesis, which I set forth in the Introduction. This book can be read entirely on its own, independent of my other writings. At the same time, it does draw on, and is the scholarly culmination of, my earlier books on Plato, the manly virtues, and political leadership.

Earlier versions of some of the chapters were presented at Peterhouse College Cambridge, Yale University, and the University of Toronto. I gratefully acknowledge the stimulation and the hospitality I received
on those occasions. I also have the pleasure and the honor of acknowledging the critical insight and support that I have received from many colleagues over the years. Although they share no responsibility for the book’s shortcomings, they have contributed to whatever of value readers may find in it. They include, in no special order, the following: Charles H. Fairbanks, Thomas L. Pangle, Lorraine Pangle, Clifford Orwin, Ryan Balot, Nalin Ranasinghe, Stanley Rosen, Catherine Zuckert, Barry Strauss, Paul Rahe, Robert Sibley, Steven Smith, Travis Smith, Graham Howell, Jarrett Carty, Geoffrey Kellow, Peter Ahrensdorf, Harvey C. Mansfield, Lynette Mitchell, Jeff Sikkenga, Norman Doidge, Kenneth Green, Michael Zuckert, Gregory MacIsaac, Peter Emberley, Tom Darby, Samuel Abraham, H. D. Forbes, Edward Andrew, and Gary McDowell. I also have the especially gratifying obligation to acknowledge the insights I derived from discussing the political philosophies examined in this book with students past and present, some of whom are now embarked on their own careers. Finally, I owe special thanks to my editor at Cambridge University Press, Robert Dreesen, and to the anonymous reviewers for the original proposal, who prompted me to address many important issues in advance that I had neglected.

This book is dedicated to my best friend and collaborator, my wife Jacqueline Etherington Newell.