Political Consumerism

*Political Consumerism* captures the creative ways in which citizens, consumers, and political activists use the market as their arena for politics. This book theorizes, describes, analyzes, compares, and evaluates the phenomenon of political consumerism and how it attempts to use market choice to solve complex globalized problems. It investigates theoretically and empirically how and why consumers practice citizenship and have become important political actors. Dietlind Stolle and Michele Micheletti describe consumers’ engagement as an example of individualized responsibility-taking, examining how political consumerism nudges and pressures corporations to change their production practices, and how consumers emerge as a force in global affairs. Unlike other studies, it also evaluates whether and how consumer actions become effective mechanisms of global change. Stolle and Micheletti offer a candid discussion of the limitations of political consumerism as a form of participation and as a problem-solving mechanism.

Dietlind Stolle is a recognized expert on political participation, youth engagement, social capital, and diversity. She currently is the Director of the Quebec Inter-University Centre for the Study of Democratic Citizenship. Stolle is the principal investigator of the *Canadian Youth Survey* and serves as the principal investigator, co-investigator, or collaborator on eight other national and international funded projects, including the 2011 and 2015 *Canadian Election Studies*. She is also the principal investigator of the *Student Issues and Protest Survey* in Quebec. Stolle is a past co-winner of the American Political Science Association’s Award for the best paper on European politics. Her scholarly achievements have been recognized in recent invitations to serve as a senior research partner at the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Ethnic and Religious Diversity in Göttingen, Germany and on the advisory board of the Institute for the Study of Democracy in Aarau, Switzerland. At the Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin she has received the prestigious Karl W. Deutsch Professorship.

Michele Micheletti holds the Lars Hierta Chair of Political Science at Stockholm University. She was a member of the SNS Democratic Audit, the scientific boards of the Swedish Consumer Agency and the Swedish Society for Nature Conservation and the Ministry of Finance’s Expert Group for Environmental Studies. At present, she is co-coordinator of the European Consortium for Political Research (ECPR) Standing Group on Participation and Mobilization. She has contributed to several parliamentary investigations in Sweden and conducted research for and advised Swedish civic associations and political parties. Her scientific network-building activities have been instrumental in putting political consumerism on the scholarly research agenda. Her publications include *The Swedish Farmers’ Movement and Government Agricultural Policy* (1990), *Civil Society and State Relations in Sweden* (1995), *Political Virtue and Shopping: Individuals, Consumerism, and Collective Action* (2003, 2010) and co-edited books on political participation and political consumerism (*Creative Participation: Responsibility-taking in the Political World* (2010) and *Politics, Products, and Markets: Exploring Political Consumerism Past and Present* (2004)).
Political Consumerism

Global Responsibility in Action

DIETLIND STOLLE
McGill University

MICHELE MICHELETTI
Stockholm University
Contents

List of Figures ix
List of Tables xi
Acknowledgments xiii

1 Reconfiguring Political Responsibility 1
   Introduction 1
   Limits of and Challenges to the Traditional Model of Political Responsibility 2
   Reconfiguring Political Responsibility 11
   Corporations as Targets for Political Responsibility-Taking 13
   The Role of the Choice Mechanism in Solving Political Problems 19
   The Reconfiguration of Citizenship Practice 21
   Character and Outline of the Book 26

2 Reconfiguring Political Participation 31
   The Rise of Individualized Political Responsibility-Taking 31
   Political Participation in the Globalized World 33
   Individual Citizens and Political Responsibility-Taking 36
   From Citizen to Citizen-Consumer 39
   Skepticism about Political Consumerism as Political Participation 43
   Rise of Market-Based Political Action 46
   Political Action Transformed? 57

3 Who Are Political Consumers? 59
   Introduction 59
   Addressing Important Debates in the Empirical Study of Political Consumerism 60
# Contents

Socioeconomic Predictors and Inequality of Political Consumerism 60  
Political Attitudes, Values, and Practices of Political Consumers 64  
Sociodemographic Profile of Political Consumers 68  
Engendered Shopping 76  
Women and Shopping: A Historical Look 80  
Today’s Women and Shopping 81  
Political Consumers’ Political Attitudes, Norms, and Behaviors 83  
1) Political Attitudes and Behaviors of Political Consumers 84  
2) Considerations Behind Shopping Choices 87  
3) Citizenship Norms and Efficacy 89  
Conclusion 91  

4 Mapping Political Consumerism in Western Democracies 95  
With Jean-François Crépault  
Introduction 95  
National Variations in Political Consumerism 96  
Explaining Weak and Strong Political Consumerism 102  
1) Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization 104  
2) Economic Openness 106  
3) Price Premiums 108  
4) Political Consumer Infrastructure 111  
5) Political and Institutional Factors 117  
6) Social Capital 121  
7) Religion 123  
Political Consumers Across Countries 126  
Appendix 127  

5 The Organizational Setting for Political Consumerism 135  
Introduction 135  
Labeling Schemes for Political Consumer Choice 137  
Organic Food Activism and Labeling Schemes for Agricultural Production 137  
Fairtrade Labels for Global Social Justice 143  
Eco-Labeling for Environmental Consumer Choice 146  
Labeling Schemes for Forest and Marine Stewardship Certification 149  
Anti-Sweatshop Political Consumer Activism 153  
Socially Responsible Investing to Push for Corporate Social Responsibility 159  
Organizational Setting for Farm Animal Activism 160  
Lifestyle Political Consumerism 163  
Common Developments and Trends 165
Contents

6 Discursive Political Consumerism
   Introduction 170
   Discursive Turn in Political Consumerism 170
   Antibranding as Discursive Political Consumer Activism 171
   Popular Brands and Political Consumerism 175
   The Case of the Nike E-mail Exchange 179
      Investigating Culture Jamming as Individualized Responsibility-Taking 181
      Who Took Part in the Continued NEE Culture Jam? 182
      The NEE’s Political Messages 184
      The NEE’s Mobilizing Potential 187
      Long-Term Impact of the NEE 190
      The Effectiveness of Targeting the Nike Iconic Brand 193
   Concluding Remarks 202

7 Does Political Consumerism Matter? Effectiveness and Limits of Political Consumer Action Repertoires
   With Jean-François Crépault
   Introduction 204
   Doubting Effectiveness 205
      Consumers Are More Self-Interested than Other-Regarding 205
      Political Consumerism Goes Against Core Market Principles 206
      Political Consumerism Is Neoliberalism-Friendly 207
      Political Consumerism Is a Northern Project with a Northern Agenda 209
      Political Consumerism Has Limited Reach 209
   Determining Effectiveness 210
      How Effective Is Political Consumerism to Date? 211
      Political Consumer Activist Effects on Consumers 212
      Political Consumer Activist Effects on Corporations 214
         1) Is There a Rise in CSR? 216
         2) Rise in Corporate Partnerships with NGOs 218
         3) The Effects of Consumer Boycotts 219
         4) Rise of Ethical Business 222
         5) The Adoption of Ethical Lines by Major Retailers 223
      The Case of Procter & Gamble 227
      The Case of Clas Ohlson 228
   Pushing Government into Political Consumerism 229
   Political Consumerism – Real-Life Problem Solver? 233
      Effects on Wages 233
      Child Labor 234
      Benefits of Fairtrade for the Farmers in Southern Cooperatives 236
   Challenges of Fairtrade Production 239
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contents</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fairtrade Markets in the North Are Stagnant</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problems with FLO Governance and Monitoring</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Fairtrade Model Does Not Address Structural Problems Faced by the South</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessing Effectiveness on Balance</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Political Consumerism’s Scope and Challenges</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Introduction</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 Difficulties in the Practice of Political Consumerism</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.1 Access/Visibility of the Product or Firm in the Supply Commodity Chain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.2 Substitution/Availability of Alternatives</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.3 Complexity of Production</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.4 Complexity and Scale of Political Consumer Causes</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3 The Maturing of Political Consumerism in the 2000s</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.1 Labeling Schemes of the 2000s</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.2 Buycotts in the 2000s</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.3 Discursive Political Consumerism in the 2000s</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.4 Lifestyle Politics in the 2000s</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4 Role of Multi-Stakeholders and Government</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5 Theoretical Implications of Studying Political Consumerism</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.1 The Discussion about Defining Political Participation</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.2 The Effectiveness of Political Participation</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6 Future Research in Political Consumerism</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6.1 Rarely Studied Cases of Political Consumerism</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6.2 Political Consumerism in Developing Countries</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6.3 Role of the Internet and Social Media for Political Consumerism</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6.4 New Methodological Approaches in Political Consumerism</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.7 The Future of Political Consumerism in a Nutshell</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### List of Figures

2.1 Buycotting .......................... page 52
2.2 Rise in Fair Trade Coffee Sales ........... 54
2.3 Rise in Global Organic Food Sales .......... 55
3.1 Gender Gap in Boycotting ................. 77
3.2 Gender Gaps Over Time .................. 78
3.3 Gender Gap in Buycotting ................. 79
3.4 Frequency of Shopping .................. 82
3.5 Values and Orientations of Political Consumers .. 87
6.1 Rise and Effect of Anti-Sweatshop Activism against Nike .... 194
List of Tables

2.1 Longitudinal Data on Boycotting, 1974–2010  page 50
3.1 Bivariate Results for Political Consumerism in Percentages  69
3.2 Individual-Level Model – Baseline  74
3.3 Individual-Level Model – Trust and Participation  86
3.4 The Socioeconomic and Attitudinal Correlates of Political Consumerism in Sweden  90
4.1 The Cross-National Spread of Political Consumerism  97
4.2 Consumption and Market Share of Labeled Products  99
4.3 The Role of Socioeconomic Resources and Postmodernization for Political Consumerism  104
4.4 Does Economic Openness Foster Political Consumerism?  107
4.5 Do Price Premiums Discourage Political Consumerism?  111
4.6 The International Spread of Market-Based Political Consumer Labeling Schemes  113
4.7 Conducive Political Consumer Infrastructure?  115
4.8 Political and Institutional Factors that Promote Political Consumerism  120
4.9 Social Capital as a Resource for Political Consumerism  122
4.10 Religiosity and Political Consumerism  124
4.11 Religion and Political Consumerism  125
6.1 Who Are the Discursive Political Consumers?  183
6.2 Themes Addressed in E-mail Responses to the Nike E-mail Exchange (percentages)  186
6.3 The NEE’s Political Mobilization Effects  188
6.4 Direct Effects of the NEE  191
Acknowledgments

This book has been in the making for about ten years. It grew out of the common interests of both authors in the role of collective action and civil society and the recognition that citizens do not only vote at election time to express their political opinions or influence politics. This common scientific curiosity grew into two research projects, “Political Consumption: Politics in a New Era and Arena” and “Sustainable Citizenship: Opportunities and Barriers for Citizen Involvement in Sustainable Development,” both funded by the Swedish Research Council (Vetenskapsrådet). Over the years, parts of this book were presented at conferences organized by the European Consortium of Political Research (ECPR), the American Political Science Association, the Swedish Political Science Association, and the Karlstad Seminar on Studying Political Action. We have also presented our research in many different settings, including the 2001 and 2005 International Seminars on Political Consumerism; the workshop on Gender and Social Capital at the University of Manitoba; and various talks in Canada, England, Finland, Germany, the Netherlands, Norway, and Switzerland. We have also been asked to participate in the U.K. research program Cultures of Consumption’s workshop “Citizenship and Consumption: Agency, Norms, Mediations, and Spaces” and to give keynote speeches for the Sciences Po Paris conference “Towards Sustainable Consumption”; the Fourth National Brazilian Consumer Studies Meeting “New Directions for Consumer Society”; the Third German Environmental Sociological Summit; the Milano International Conference “Ethical Fashion”; two University of Madison–Wisconsin–organized events on the politics of consumption and the consumption of politics; the European Society for Agricultural and Food Ethics; and the symposium “Shopping for Human Rights” organized at Bergamo University, Italy, by fellow political consumerism researcher Francesca Forno. Our home universities, and particularly the Statistics Speaker series at
McGill University and the Higher Research Seminar series at Stockholm University, have graciously hosted us.

Several people have been very helpful over the last years in this long-term endeavor. We want particularly to thank Åsa Nilsson, research administrator at SOM Institute at the University of Gothenburg, Sweden, for generously offering her time and giving good constructive comments on our surveys. Daniel Berlin from the University of Gothenburg was in charge of the 2009 national survey “Consumption and Societal Issues.” Jonas Peretti gave us exclusive access to the 3,600 e-mails he received in the context of the Nike e-mail exchange; the e-mails became original research material for Chapter 6. Barbara Hobson at Stockholm University shared her ideas and feedback on this particular dataset. Matthew Wright, a McGill student at the time, spent uncountable hours coding the entire e-mail exchange. Laura Nishikawa, who was also a student at McGill, was in charge of the thoughtful discourse analysis in the Nike e-mail exchange. Cesi Cruz (McGill) designed the online survey of the participants of the Nike e-mail exchange. The design of the cross-national comparison of the political and economic factors behind political consumerism at the individual level was triggered by a paper authored by Mariona Ferrer-Fons (University of Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona) for an ECPR workshop in 2004.

Jen Brea contributed with outstanding fieldwork on the garment industry in Lesotho. Most of all we would like to thank Jean-François Crépault, who was also a student at McGill University, for his excellent work on collecting the cross-national data presented in Chapter 4, as well as ideas for developing the analyses in Chapters 4 and 7. His research assistance went far beyond the task at hand, which explains why he is included as a co-author in these two chapters.

Seventeen additional research assistants have helped over the years with research on various aspects of political consumerism. We are particularly grateful for the work by current or former McGill students Yale Hertzman, Olga Redko, Maria Surilas, Michael Kideckel, Joëlle Roy, Mike Robichaud, Kairlyn Shannon, Rossana Tudo, Joe Heywood, Sheelagh Gough, Marc Trussler, and Arnav Manchanda. In some cases, the contributions of the research assistants are included in special footnotes in this book.

Many colleagues at home and abroad have offered valuable comments on our keynote speeches, work-in-progress conference papers, and chapter drafts as well as on drafts of the survey questions. Among the scholars offering their thoughts and collegial support are Lance W. Bennett, André Blais, Mario Diani, Andreas Follesdal, Aina Gallego Dobón, Corinne Gendron, Elisa-

beth Gidengil, Edgar Grande, James L. Guth, Boris Holzer, Marc Hooghe, Kay Lehman Scholzman, Anders Lidström, Andrew S. McFarland, Therese O’Toole, Roberta Sassatelli, Alexandra Segerberg, Dhavan Shah, Kate Soper, Jan Teorell, Mette Kirkegaard (nee Tobiasen), Frank Trentmann, Jan W. van Deth, Ariadne Vromen, and Alan Warde.