New Frontiers in the Philosophy of Intellectual Property

Are intellectual property rights a threat to autonomy, global justice, indigenous rights, access to life-saving knowledge and medicines? The chapters in this volume examine the justification of patents, copyrights and trade marks in light of the political and moral controversy over TRIPS (the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights). Written by a distinguished international group of experts, the volume draws on the latest philosophical work on autonomy, equality, property ownership and human rights in order to explore the moral, political and economic implications of property rights in ideas. Written with an interdisciplinary audience in mind, these essays introduce readers to the latest debates in the philosophy of intellectual property, whether their interests are in the restrictions that copyright places on the reproduction of music and printed words or in the morality and legality of patenting human genes, essential medicines or traditional knowledge.

ANNABELLE LEVER is Associate Professor of Normative Political Theory in the Political Science Department at the University of Geneva. She has previously held teaching and research appointments at Harvard University, the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, the University of Rochester, the London School of Economics and, latterly, at the Institute of Science, Ethics and Innovation at Manchester University and at the Chaire Hoover, Université Catholique de Louvain.
As its economic potential has rapidly expanded, intellectual property has become a subject of front-rank legal importance. *Cambridge Intellectual Property Rights and Information Law* is a series of monograph studies of major current issues in intellectual property. Each volume contains a mix of international, European, comparative and national law, making this a highly significant series for practitioners, judges and academic researchers in many countries.

**Series editor**
William R. Cornish
Emeritus Herchel Smith Professor of Intellectual Property Law, University of Cambridge
Lionel Bently
Herchel Smith Professor of Intellectual Property Law, University of Cambridge

**Advisory editors**
François Dessemontet, Professor of Law, University of Lausanne
Paul Goldstein, Professor of Law, Stanford University
The Rt Hon. Sir Robin Jacob, Court of Appeal, England

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume
New Frontiers in the Philosophy of Intellectual Property

Edited by
Annabelle Lever
Contents

List of contributors vii
Acknowledgements ix
Table of cases xi
Table of legislation and treaties xiv

Introduction: Philosophy of intellectual property – incentives, rights and duties
ANNABELLE LEVER 1

1 Autonomy, social selves and intellectual property claims
JOHN CHRISTMAN 33

2 Corrective justice and intellectual property rights in traditional knowledge
STEPHEN R. MUNZER 58

3 Designing a successor to the patent as second best solution to the problem of optimum provision of good ideas
ALEX ROSENBERG 88

4 Ethical issues surrounding intellectual property rights
JORN SONDERHOLM 110

5 On the value of the intellectual commons
JAMES WILSON 122

6 Immorality and patents: The exclusion of inventions contrary to ordre public and morality
KATHLEEN LIDDELL 140
Contents

7 ‘The genetic code is 3.6 billion years old: it’s time for a rewrite’ – questioning the metaphors and analogies of synthetic biology and life science patenting
GRAHAM DUTFIELD 172

8 Copyright infringement as compelled speech
ABRAHAM DRASSINOWER 203

9 Public reason, communication and intellectual property
LAURA BIRON 225

10 Illegal downloading, free riding and justice
GEERT DEMUIJNCK 261

11 The virtuous p(eer): Reflections on the ethics of file sharing
DAVID LAMETTI 284

Bibliography 307
Index 329
List of contributors

LAURA BIRON Research Fellow, Queens College, Cambridge and Greenwall Fellow in bioethics and health policy, Georgetown University and Johns Hopkins University, USA

JOHN CHRISTMAN Professor of Philosophy, Political Science and Women’s Studies, Pennsylvania State University, USA

GEERT DEMUIJNCK Professor of Business Ethics, EDHEC Business School, Lille, France

ABRAHAM DRASSINOWER Associate Professor and Chair in the Legal, Ethical and Cultural Implications of Technological Innovation, University of Toronto Faculty of Law, Canada

GRAHAM DUTFIELD Professor of International Governance, School of Law, University of Leeds, UK

DAVID LAMETTI Director, Centre for Intellectual Property Policy andAssociate Professor of Law, McGill University, Canada

ANNABELLE LEVER Associate Professor of Normative Political Theory, Department of Political Science and International Relations, University of Geneva, Switzerland

KATHLEEN LIDDELL Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Law, Cambridge University, UK

STEPHEN R. MUNZER Distinguished Professor of Law, UCLA Law School, USA

ALEX ROSENBERG R. Taylor Cole Professor of Philosophy, Duke University, USA
List of contributors

JORN SONDERHOLM Visiting Researcher, Department of Philosophy, The George Washington University, USA

JAMES WILSON Lecturer in Philosophy and Health, Centre for Philosophy, Justice and Health, and Comprehensive Biomedical Research Centre, UCL, UK

We are also happy to acknowledge the assistance of the following institutions which helped to fund the conference, ‘Philosophy and Intellectual Property’, which inspired this book: The Mind Association, The Society for Applied Philosophy, the Aristotelian Society, the Department of Philosophy, Logic and Scientific Method, the London School of Economics and Political Science and the Institute of Philosophy, University of London. Without their help, the conference would not have been possible and, without the conference, there would have been no book.

We would like to thank Kim Hughes, Joanna Breeze our editor, Richard Woodham and Cambridge University Press, for their willingness to publish this collection and for their help in overcoming the numerous obstacles between contract and publication. We are extremely grateful to Lynn Aitchison, our copy-editor, for bringing order to such a large and diverse text, and to Kate Mertes for creating the index.

Finally, the editor would like to thank John Harris and the Institute of Science, Ethics and Innovation, Manchester University School of Law, for appointing her to an Interdisciplinary Bioethics Research Fellowship, and for their encouragement and support of this book. The Institute is a model of interdisciplinary research and John’s love of a good argument, wide interests and support for junior colleagues gives the Institute its distinctive character and ethos. It is a wonderful place to work. Above all, thank you to my husband, Dan Grecu, who helped with this book and the conference from start to finish.
### Table of cases

#### Australia

*Milpurrurru v. Indafurn Party Ltd* (1994) 130 ALR 659 66

#### Canada

*CCH Canadian Ltd v. Law Society of Upper Canada* [2004] 1 SCR 339 207n.9, 218n.3, 291n.32  
*Cusenaire v. S. W. Imports Ltd* (1969) SCR 208 19  
*Harvard College v. Canada (Commissioner of Patents)* 2002 SCC 76 196n.d, 199n.91

#### Court of Justice of the European Union

Case C-34/10 Bristle v. Greenpeace, Opinion of the Advocate General, 10 March 2011; Judgment 18 October 2011 140, 166–9, 170–1

#### European Patent Office

Edinburgh Patent EP 06953351 (Opposition Division) 21 March 2003 147n.27  
T086/01 *Euthanasia Compositions*, 11 May 2005 148n.33, 150n.34  
T19/90 *HARVARD/Oncomouse* [1991] EPOR 525 140, 152, 154  
T0315/03 *HARVARD/Transgenic Animals* [2006] 1 OJEPO 15 147n.30, 148n.32, 149, 150n.34, 154, 162  
T0272/95 *HOWARD FLOREY/Relaxin* (Opposition Division) [1995] EPOR 541; Decision of Technical Board of Appeal 3.3.4 [1995] EPOR 357 150n.36, 152, 153, 154, 162, 201n.95  
G0001/98 *NOVARTIS/Transgenic Plant*, 20 December 1999 150n.34
xii Table of cases

T0356/93 PLANT GENETIC SYSTEMS (1993) 24 IIC 618 147n.30, 153, 154, 162
G0002/06 Wisconsin Alumni Research Foundation (WARF)/Stem Cells [2009] EPOR 15 140, 147n.27, 151n.38, 165–6

Inter-American Court of Human Rights

United Kingdom
Beloff v. Pressdram Ltd [1973] 1 All ER 241 218n.19
Hyde Park Residence Ltd v. Yelland [2000] 3 WLR 215 218n.19
Lion Laboratories Ltd v. Evans [1984] 3 WLR 539 218n.19
Millar v. Taylor (1769) 4 Burr 302 212n.14
Moreau v. St Vincent [1950] 3 DLR 713 207n.9
University of London Press Ltd v. University Tutorial Press [1916] 2 Ch 601 244n.80

United States
Application of Malcolm E. Bergy, John H. Coats and Vedpal S. Malik. Application of Ananda M. Chakrabarty, decided 29 March 1979, as amended 19 April 1979 596 F.2d 952 (Fed. Cir. 1979) 196n.a
Association for Molecular Pathology v. US Patent and Trademark Office No. 09 Civ, 4515 2010 WL 1233416 (SDNY 29 Mar. 2010) 201n.96
AV v. iParadigms LLC 562 F.3d 630 (4th Cir. 2009) 218n.19, 221n.25
Baker v. Selden 101 US 99 (1879) 19, 206, 209–12, 221
Dairy Queen Inc. v. Wood 369 US 469 (1962) 75n.36
Dallas Cowboy Cheerleaders Inc. v. Pussycat Cinema Ltd 604 F.2d 200 (1979) 248n.92
Table of cases xiii


*Juicy Whip Inc. v. Orange Bang Inc.* 185 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 1999) 145

*Kelly v. Arriba Software Corp.* 336 F.3d 811 (9th Cir. 2003) 221n.24

*Lovell v. Lewis* 15 F.Cas. 1018 (CCD Mass. 1817) 145

*Mattel Inc. v. Walking Mountain Productions Co.* 353 F.3d 792 (9th Cir. 2003) 249

*Nichols v. Universal Pictures Corp. et al.* 45 F.2d 119 (2d Cir. 1930) 208n.9, 289n.17


*Sheldon v. Metro-Goldwyn Pictures Corp.* 81 F.2d 49 (2d Cir. 1936) 208n.10


*Tiffany & Co. v. Tiffany Productions Inc.* 188 NE 30 (NY 1933) 248n.90

*West Virginia State Board of Education v. Barnette* 319 US 624 (1943) 21n.42

**World Trade Organization**

Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS), negotiated in the 1986 Uruguay Round under the auspices of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade 99, 110, 116, 142
### Table of legislation and treaties

**Africa**
- Constitution of Angola
  - Art. 10 75n.38
- Constitution of Botswana
  - s. 8(1) 75n.38
- Constitution of the Republic of Namibia
  - Art. 16 75n.38
- Constitution of South Africa
  - s. 25 75n.38
- Copyright Law, PNDCL No. 690 (17 May 2005) (Ghana) 73n.33

**Australia**
- Patents Act 1990 (Cth)
  - s. 18(2) 144n.12

**Canada**
- Civil Code of Quebec, SQ 1991, c. 64
  - Art. 6 303n.70
  - Art. 985 294n.42
- Copyright Act 1985 RSC c. C-42
  - s. 3(1) 206n.6
  - s. 5(1) 207n.7
- Patent Act 1985 RSC c. P-4
  - s. 2 198n.89, 207n.8
Table of legislation and treaties

Europe

Code de la propriété intellectuelle (France)
Art. L122–5 276n.48, 278n.55
Art. 53(2) 131n.20, 140, 143, 145–6, 148, 149, 150, 151, 155, 156–64, 164n.66, 325
Art. 6 143n.6, 145n.25, 155, 164nn.66, 67, 166
EPC Implementing Regulations to the European Patent Convention
Rule 28(a)–(d) (formerly numbered 23d(a)–(d)) 143n.8, 164nn.66, 67
Loi no. 2009–669 of 12 June 2009

Latin America

Law No. 27811, Introducing a Protection Regime for the Collective Knowledge of Indigenous Peoples Derived from Biological Resources, El Peruano, Diario Oficial, 10 Aug. 2002 (Peru) 74n.34

United Kingdom

An Act for the Encouragement of Learning by Vesting the Copies of Printed Books in the Authors of Purchasers of such Copies, During the Times therein mentioned, 1710, 8 Anne c.19 290
Patents Act 1977
s. 14(3) 257n.115
s. 48A 160n.61
ss. 55–58 160n.60
s. 60(5) 160n.62
Statute of Monopolies 1624 142, 169
Trade Marks Act 1994
s. 10(3) 247–8
United States

Constitution
- Amendment V 75n.38
- Amendment XIV, s. 1 75n.38
- Article I, s. 8, cl. 8 290n.20

Copyright Act 1790 290, 291, 293
Copyright Act 2000 17 USC s. 107 276, 291


Lanham (Trademark) Act 15 USC § 1051 et seq., ch. 540, 60 stat. 427 248

Organization of American States, American Convention on Human Rights, 22 Nov. 1969
- Art. 21 75n.37

Patent Code 35 USC
- § 101 144n.16, 145, 198n.89
- § 112 145