PERFORMING GREEK COMEDY

Alan Hughes presents a new complete account of production methods in Greek comedy. The book summarizes contemporary research and disputes, on such topics as acting techniques, theatre buildings, masks and costumes, music and the chorus. Evidence is reinterpreted, and traditional doctrine overthrown. Comedy is presented as the pan-Hellenic, visual art of theatre, not as Athenian literature. Recent discoveries in visual evidence are used to stimulate significant historical revisions. The author has directly examined 350 vase scenes of comedy in performance and actor-figurines, in 75 collections, from Melbourne to St Petersburg. Their testimony is applied to acting techniques and costumes, and women’s participation in comedy and mime. The chapters are arranged by topic, for convenient reference by scholars and students of theatre history, literature, classics and drama. Overall, the book provides a fresh practical insight into this continually developing subject.

Alan Hughes is Professor Emeritus, University of Victoria, a theatre historian and professional who has operated his own repertory company. Published research includes Henry Irving, Shakespearean, an account of the actor-manager’s productions, and his edition of Titus Andronicus in the New Cambridge Shakespeare series. In 2006 the T.B.L. Webster Fellowship recognized his contributions to the archaeology of Greek theatre, leading to the completion of Performing Greek Comedy.
PERFORMING GREEK COMEDY

ALAN HUGHES
University of Victoria

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Contents

List of illustrations .......................... page x
Preface ..................................... xiii

1 Comedy in art, Athens and abroad ........... 1
   The evidence ..................................... 3
    Vases ............................................. 3
    Figurines ......................................... 4
   Is this evidence reliable? ................... 5
   Festival and competition ................... 7
   The profession of actor .................... 10
   Touring ......................................... 12

2 Poets of Old and Middle Comedy .......... 17
   Archaic comedy ................................ 17
   Old Comedy and festival ................... 19
    Magnes ......................................... 19
   The Sicilian connection .................... 20
    Epicharmos ................................... 20
   Mature Old Comedy ......................... 21
    Kratinos ....................................... 22
    Krates ........................................ 23
    Pherekrates .................................. 24
    Eupolis ........................................ 24
    Aristophanes .................................. 25
    Aristophanic comedy ....................... 27
    Lost Aristophanes ............................ 29
   Middle Comedy ................................ 30
    Professional theatre ....................... 30
    Navigating Middle Comedy ............... 31
    Aristophanes’ Middle Comedies .......... 32
    Decline of the chorus? ..................... 32
   Poets and types of Middle Comedy ....... 33
    Myth and tragedy upside-down .......... 33
## Contents

City comedy 34
Satire 36
The archaeological record 36
   Archaeology, uses and limitations 37
Vases, changing comic styles 37
Figurines, stage characters 38
Beyond Athens 39

3 Theatres 59
   Athens: the earliest theatre 59
      Orchestra and theatron 61
      Skene 62
   Second phase, 446–440 63
   Theatres outside Attica 65
      Lost theatres 66
   Fourth-century stages in the Greek west 69
      Taras 71
      Paestum 72
      Sicily 73
   Athens: the stone theatre 73
      Theatron and orchestra 74
      Skene 75
   Special effects 76
      Ekkyklema 76
      Mechan 77
      Skene painting 78

4 The comic chorus 81
   Early comedy in writing 82
   Early comedy in pictures 84
      Fat men 84
      Archaic choruses 85
      Presenting the chorus 87
   Enter the actor 89
   The chorus in later art 90
      Choric dance 92
      Formation and size 92
      The chorus in the Greek west 93
   Decline of the chorus? 94

5 Music in comedy 95
   The aulos 95
      Musicians at festivals 96
      Musicians and convention 97
Contents

Musical language 99
Choral music 101
The New Music 101
Song and dance 103

6 Acting, from lyric to dual consciousness 106
Beginners on stage 107
From poet to actor 108
First comic actors 109
Plot and the rising actor 110
Actors in society 112
Casting 113
How many actors? 113
Doubling opportunities 113
Nothing to do with Stanislavsky 114
Voice, speech, movement 115
Aesthetics, process 116
Believing characters 117
Transitions 118

7 Technique and style of acting comedy 146
Physical characterization 146
The evidence 149
Attitude, gesture 151
Types of gesture 154
Emblems 154
Affective gestures 155
Manipulators 156
Acting women 157
The maiden 158
The wife 160
The crone 160
Problems of interpretation 162
Helping the sick 162
Mistaken identity 163
Terracotta husbandmen 164

8 The masks of comedy 166
What masks were like 166
Significance of the mask 168
Spiritual or practical? 168
Mask and metatheatre 170
Actor and mask 170
Symbolism 171
How masks were made
Origins
Fabric and plaster
Wood
Mask types

9 Costumes of Old and Middle Comedy
Choruses
Archaic
Later choruses
The actor’s undercostume
Outer costume: evidence
The comic costume controversy
Evidence in two media
Women’s costume
Tunics
Outerwear: cloaks, headgear
Shoes
Men’s costume
Tunics
Cloaks
Shoes
Headgear
Development and transition

10 Comedy and women
Imaginary women
Protagonist roles: Lysistrata, Praxagora
Deities
Real women
Women in the audience
Poets
Design and production
Women performing
Musicians
Women on stage
Mutes

11 New Comedy
Canonical poets
Fame and fortune
New theatres
Orchestra
Logeion
The detached chorus
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hellenistic theatres</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costumes, masks</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying mask types</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epilogue</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Catalogue of objects discussed</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vases</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terracottas</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other media</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Notes</strong></td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Glossary</strong></td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bibliography</strong></td>
<td>292</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Index</strong></td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Illustrations

1 Lucanian skyphos fragment, Dolon Painter, Metaponto 29062
2 Early Sicilian actor-figurine, Siracusa 23001
3 Apulian Gnathia kalix krater, Compiègne Painter, Geneva
4 Attic terracotta figurine, Amsterdam 881
5 Orchestra and skene, Theatre of Dionysos, Athens 446–440
6 Apulian bell krater, Reckoning Painter, St Petersburg B1661
7 Reconstruction of a stage in Taras
8 Apulian kalix krater, Varrese Painter, Naples 11833
9 Apulian Gnathia fragments, Konnakis Group, Würzburg R4696, R4701
10 Paestan kalix krater, Asteas, Berlin F3044
11 Skene, Theatre of Dionysos, c.325
12 Aphrodisias, logeion of the Hellenistic theatre
13 Reconstruction of the mechane
14 Attic black-figured cup, Komast Group, Paris E742
15 Attic black-figured amphora, Swing Painter, Christchurch 41–57
16 Attic lekythos, Gela Painter, London 1842.7–28.979 (B658)
17 Archaic dolphin-rider c.486
18 Attic oinochoe from Cyrenaica, Nikias Painter, Paris N3408 (M9)
19 Apulian oinochoe, unattributed, whereabouts unknown
20 Lucanian volute krater, Karneia Painter, Taranto 8263
21 Attic lebes, Painter of the Athens Dinos, Athens 13027
22 Apulian kalix krater, Suckling-Salting Group, Rome private collection 52
23 Paestan bell krater by Asteas, Salerno Pct812
24 Attic black-figured skyphos, Heron Group, Boston 20.18
25 Profiles, phaulos and ideal
### List of illustrations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Illustration Description</th>
<th>Location/Artist</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26 Apulian oinochoe, unattributed, Toronto</td>
<td>972.182.1</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27 Apulian bell krater, Jason Painter, Copenhagen</td>
<td></td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28 Attic terracotta figurine, London 1879.3–6.5</td>
<td></td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29 Attic terracotta figurine, London 1842.7–28.752</td>
<td></td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 Attic terracotta figurines, Berlin TC8405</td>
<td></td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31 Corinthian terracotta figurine, London 1867.2–5.22</td>
<td></td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 Apulian oinochoe, unattributed, whereabouts unknown</td>
<td></td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33 Apulian Gnathia situla, Konnakis Group, Malibu 96.AE.118</td>
<td></td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34 Apulian bell krater, Iris Painter, St Petersburg Б299</td>
<td></td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 Attic terracotta figurine, St Petersburg Г1432</td>
<td></td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 Attic oinochoe, near Felton Painter, Geneva private collection</td>
<td></td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37 Apulian bell krater, Adolphseck Painter, Malibu 96.AE.238</td>
<td></td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38 Hand gestures used in comedy</td>
<td></td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39 Sicilian kalyx krater, Manfria Group, Messina 11039</td>
<td></td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40 Boiotian terracotta figurine, Copenhagen 4718</td>
<td></td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41a–d Attic figurines a) Heidelberg TK47 b) St Petersburg Б166 c) St Petersburg Π1874.34 d) British Columbia private collection</td>
<td></td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42 Apulian oinochoe, Truro Painter, Sydney NM75.2</td>
<td></td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43 Attic terracotta figurine, Paris N4878</td>
<td></td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44 Apulian oinochoe, unattributed, Göttingen H582a</td>
<td></td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45 Sicilian kalyx krater, Manfria Group, Lentini 2B</td>
<td></td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46 Boiotian terracotta figurine, Paris CA239</td>
<td></td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47 Apulian Gnathia oinochoe, unattributed, British Columbia private collection</td>
<td></td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 Apulian bell krater, Cotugno Painter, Malibu 96.AE.113</td>
<td></td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49 Apulian Gnathia pelike, unattributed, Berlin F3444</td>
<td></td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 Paestan kotyle, Asteas, Oxford AN1945.43</td>
<td></td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51 Attic terracotta figurine, Tarquinia RC1764</td>
<td></td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52 New Comedy scene, relief, Naples 6687</td>
<td></td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53 Marble relief, Vatican 9985</td>
<td></td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54 Mosaic from Pompeii, Dioskourides, Naples 9985</td>
<td></td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55 Mosaic from Pompeii, Dioskourides, Naples 9987</td>
<td></td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The need for a book like this one became apparent shortly after I was appointed as the theatre historian in a university Department of Theatre. Qualified for the job only because I had written a book about the theatre in nineteenth-century London, I was expected to teach the history of theatre from Greeks to Grotowski. This was, and still is, the normal state of affairs wherever there are broad studies of classical or western literature and drama, history of the theatre, ancient or western art. Few instructors in any of these disciplines command the leisure to master the current state of knowledge in a succession of fields of study which are no more than contiguous with their own. Three or four weeks are allocated to the Greeks; then one must get on to the Romans, Middle Ages, Renaissance. Teaching theatre history, my students and I needed a book which would summarize the state of contemporary research on the performance practice of Greek theatre, arranged systematically by topic. Since nothing of the sort was available, I was obliged to turn to the relevant chapters of Bieber’s obsolete *History of the Greek and Roman Theatre*, first published in 1939. For many instructors and students, it remains the last resort.

That was why I conceived the notion of writing a book that would supersede Bieber. I am an historian of the theatre, not a classicist. It may be asked, where I found the temerity to write about Greeks. I approach the subject pragmatically, as a working theatre not unlike others. I examine it as a composite art, in which the text is only one component. For costume, masks, music, theatre buildings and equipment, acting style, I turn to the visual sources provided by archaeology. And to interpret what I see, I refer to a lifetime of experience in the living theatre and a working knowledge of how things are done, and made.

Research on eighteenth-century acting showed me that pictures are more reliable evidence than texts. While descriptions of style degenerate into assertions that the acting of the writer’s time is ‘more natural’ than that of the previous generation, painters are fellow-artists, sympathetic and
observant. Eighteenth-century artists faithfully document actors, costumes, stage sets, theatres and audiences of their time. When I turned to the Greek theatre, however, there seemed to be little equivalent evidence.

Tragedy dominated the reading list, in which comedy was represented only by *Frogs*, which is about tragedy. In practice, ‘Greek theatre’ seemed to mean ‘Athenian tragedy in the fifth century’, for which surviving material evidence is inadequate. There was not one statue of a tragic actor, but some lively terracotta figurines seemed to be comic actors, masked and indecently costumed; and a handful of pots and fragments offered blurred and broken glimpses of comedy.

The breakthrough came in 1986, at my Faculty Club. Since nobody wanted to be seen lunching with the acting Dean, lest they be suspected of currying favour, I was free to look through a new issue of *Phoenix*. Thus I read Eric Csapo’s account of a vase in Würzburg, with a detailed picture of a performance of a scene in Aristophanes. Yet the vase had been painted in Italy, in the fourth century. It was ‘new’ evidence, because its relevance had not hitherto been understood.

Many similar scenes were known, but they had been dismissed because they were thought to show crude Italian farces known as *phlyakes*. Now it seemed likely that many represented fourth-century performances of Athenian comedy, or something similar. And indeed, so it proved. More scenes have come to light, and their relevance to comedy has become widely accepted.

As far as possible, I have examined the primary material evidence, the vases and figurines, rather than photographs. This practice avoids mistakes, when smudged paint is interpreted as horns on a mask, a mysterious pyramid turns out to be cracks in the fabric, or an incised inscription is overlooked. I have never examined a comedy vase without learning something new. For research of this kind, a good deal of travel is required: I have visited 75 museums and private collections, and studied 350 artifacts.

This book deals only with comedy, for which vase painters used a highly realistic technique; tragic subjects were idealized. Most of the vases were painted in the Greek cities of southern Italy and Sicily, in the fourth century BCE. No doubt many of the comedies were written in Athens, but some may have been composed in Syrakousai or Taras, cities with a native dramatic tradition.

The Würzburg scene was painted many years after Aristophanes wrote the comedy it represents, and vases twenty years apart have scenes from the same comedy: evidently these were either local or touring performances of
Preface

old plays. By the fourth century, Athenian comedy was performed everywhere Greek-speakers lived; it had truly become ‘Greek theatre’. Encouraged by the acknowledged relevance of phlyax scenes to ‘legitimate’ comedy, I have taken into account associated pictures from some of the same workshops, to extend the meaning of ‘theatre’ beyond the three official genres of the Athenian festivals. These feature performers in dramatic entertainments like the ‘mime’ described by Xenophon. These too may be termed Greek theatre; and its performers extend those boundaries farther still, because many are women.

Colleagues, curators, students and friends have assisted and advised me in the twenty-five years since I began the research leading to this book. I have accumulated a continuing debt to Sarah Stanton of Cambridge University Press, for concealing her consternation when an author she knew as a Shakespearean proposed a book about Greek comedy, and persevering in her faith that I would somehow bring it to a conclusion.

Richard Green, the master of this discipline, has been unfailing with advice and encouragement. I owe an equal debt to Grigoris Sifakis, for his wisdom and guidance as I ventured upon ground sometimes reserved for Classicists, and for helping me to win a T.B.L. Webster Fellowship, for which I am grateful to Michael Edwards and the Institute of Classical Studies. Jeffrey Rusten has been most generous with his assistance, and Eric Csapo encouraged me to press on, and to add New Comedy to my topics.

My research has been supported by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, ICS and the University of London. The University of Victoria provided preliminary faculty research grants, which brought me the aid of research assistants Éreca Hassell, Sylvia Díaz-Denz and Don DeMille.

This work has benefited from the generosity of private collectors Guido and Giovanna Malaguzzi Valeri, William Knight Zewadski, Alessandro Ragusa, Leonardo and Paula Mustilli, and George Ortiz, all of whom have graciously permitted me to examine and publish their treasures; and of James Ede, who provided me with two antiquities which illustrate this book.

Curators and superintendents of public collections have admitted me to the close examination of the unique artifacts which are the foundation of this book, and granted permission to publish them. Amongst the most helpful have been Giuseppe Andreassi and Teresa Cinquantoquattro, Puglia; Elena Lattanzi, Calabria; Amalia Curcio, Siracusa; Elio Galasso,
Preface

Benevento; Antonio De Siena, Metaponto; Maurizio Sannibale, Vaticano; and Francesco Valenti, Lentini. In Athens, Nikolaos Kaltsas and Irini Papageorgiou; Mary Louise Hart in Malibu, Elena Ananich in St Petersburg and Ursula Kästner in Berlin. In the midst of a devastating earthquake, Penelope Minchin-Garvin in Christchurch far exceeded the call of duty.

I owe two of the illustrations to the talents of my daughter Katie. And the debt I owe to my wife Mary cannot be adequately acknowledged here. She has lived with Greek pots as long as she has lived with me. She accompanied every research trip, to Caltanissetta where the lights went out, and into the roof at Naples where she discovered a picture of one of the women whose acrobatic feats are exceeded only by Mary's feats of patience.

Finally, please note that dates are BCE, and approximate, unless otherwise indicated.