Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00860-1 - The Connected Self: The Ethics and Governance of the Genetic Individual Heather Widdows Index More information

Index

Alder Hey case genetic information legislation following, 34 - 5anonymisation meaning of, 43-5 promise of, 43, 76-7 see also confidentiality assessment of goods and harms collective groups, 160-1 conclusions as to, 161-2 conflicting claims of individuals and groups, 147-51 corporate groups, 157-60 human rights framework, 156-7 types of communities and associated goods, 151-5 autonomy see individualism benefit sharing agreements, 58, 164, 167-9, 175 Canavan disease case, 105-6, 107-8, 121, 171 combining with other models, 164, 165-6 conclusions as to, 123 development of, 104-9 group focus, 169-70 identification of communities, 153, 154 model of groups, 158 overview, 102-4 public support for, 143 shared patenting, 110-11, 120, 171 shareholder model contrasted, 132 strengths application to future generations, 112-14 flexibility, 114, 137 overview, 124 recognition of connected persons' rights and interests, 111-12 reduced possibility of inducement, 114 - 16trust model compared, 138, 139, 144-5

types, 109-10 use of, 148-9 weaknesses commodification concerns, 120-2 complexity, 116-17 tension between global and local claims, 117-20 biobanks and benefit sharing, 108, 112-13 and broad (or blanket) consent, 79-80 broad type, 71-2 deCODE database failure, 84-6 and 'dignitary interests', 58-9 future-orientated nature of, 73-5 and informed consent, 71-3 limitations of informed consent, 80-1 population size needed for research, 97 power imbalances leading to exploitation, 100 and property in the body, 35-6, 129 protection of patient identity, 45, 84, 88-9 as resource for research, 75-6 as transitory community, 152-3 and trust model application to future generations, 137 collapse into broad consent, 139-40 inclusiveness, 136-7 mass withdrawal, 137, 139, 140-4 overview, 124-5 property in the body, 129, 137-8 UK Biobank model withdrawal by participants, 76-9 bioethical framework choice model see choice model 'communal turn' see 'communal turn' in bioethics development of individual model analytical approach, 18, 28-9 in doctor/patient relationship, 18-20 ease of application, 22 methodology of principlism, 18

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00860-1 - The Connected Self: The Ethics and Governance of the Genetic Individual Heather Widdows Index More information

Index

individual choice model see confidentiality; informed consent individualist assumptions, 15 narrow individual model, 16-18 see also ethical toolbox bodily material see genetic material broad (or blanket) consent as alternative to informed consent, 79-80 collapse back into by trust model, 139-40 and shareholder model, 131-2 and trust model, 124-5 and UK Biobank trust model, 134-6, 141 - 2Canada biobanks, 71-2 Canavan disease case benefit sharing, 105-6, 107-8, 121, 171 case examples Alder Hey, 34-5 Canavan disease case, 105-6, 107-8, 121, 171 Hagahai tribe, 57-8, 60, 158-9 Havasupai tribe, 59, 66 Moore v. Regents of the University of California, 56-7, 171 PXE case, 110-11, 120, 171 Tuskegee case, 99-100, 148-9 Virginia Commonwealth University case, 83-4 choice model alternative models see benefit sharing; trust model and benefit sharing, 112 continuance and future research, 174 ease of application, 22 failure of, 62-3, 179 fear of paternalism inhibiting criticism of, 70-1fear of the group, 68 group consent compared, 95 individualist assumptions, 24-3 limits of, 24-6 'one-stop-shop' ethics, 168 potential for exploitation, 114-15 principlism and, 22 protection compared to ethical toolbox, 176 - 7protection compared to group models, 146-7, 148-9, 169-70 and shared nature of genetic information, 36 - 7trust model contrasted, 131

201

see also confidentiality; group consent; informed consent collective groups assessment of goods and harms, 160-1 collective interest as public good, 160-1 corporate groups distinguished, 147, 156-7, 158, 160-1 protection of individual from, 69-71 and shareholder model, 131-2 see also group goods commodification benefit sharing issues, 120-2 concerns as to, 171-2 and exploitation, 128 see also property in the body common good as foundation for individual goods, 69 'communal turn' in bioethics analytical approach, 88 continuing development, 100-1 emergence of models, 91-2 group consent see group consent introduction to, 88 progress of, 88-91 communities identification in benefit sharing model, 153, 154 see also collective groups; corporate groups; group consent; group goods concepts of the self see pictures of the self confidentiality continued dominance, 90 and deCODE biobank failure, 84-6 and deCODE database failure, 84-6 emphasis on individual, 88-9 failure as to bioethical framework, 81-2, 86 - 7and failure of individual choice model, 89 family covenant and, 94-5, 96 guarantee of, 53 and identifying nature of genetic material, 84 promise of, 43, 45, 51, 76-7 protection by biobanks, 45, 84, 88-9 question of, 180-1 and shared nature of genetic material, 82-4 see also anonymisation connected others benefit sharing and, 111-14 ethical toolbox and, 167-9 informed consent and, 64-5 trust model and, 137 connected self

claims of, 3-4

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00860-1 - The Connected Self: The Ethics and Governance of the Genetic Individual Heather Widdows Index More information

202 Index

connected self (cont.) genetic self as claim of, 1-3, 30-1, 61 role of genetic information recognition by ethical toolbox, 165-7 structure of, 4-5 see also 'communal turn' in bioethics; connected others; group goods consent see broad (or blanket) consent; informed consent corporate groups assessment of goods and harms, 157-60 collective groups distinguished, 147, 156-7, 158, 160-1 goods as public goods, 159 data see genetic information deCODE database confidentiality issues in failure of, 84–6 dignity 'dignitary harms', 58-9 'dignitary interests', 58-9 protection of, 54-5 respect for, 19-20, 103 disease control programmes as public goods, 17 doctor/patient relationship development of individualist bioethical framework, 18-20 environmental ethics and individual goods, 16 ethical frameworks see bioethical framework ethical toolbox advantages control without property rights, 170-2 long-term effect, 167-9 overview, 164 promotion of social capital and public goods, 172-3 recognition of all goods and harms, 169 - 70recognition of connected genetic self, 165 - 7conclusions as to, 177-8 disadvantages analytical approach to, 174 complexity, 174-6 individual subordinate to group, 176-7 paternalism, 176 future for use of, 179-81 introduction to, 146-7 step 1 see assessment of goods and harms

step 2 see protection of goods Ethics and Governance Council (EGC), 134-6, 139, 168 Ethics and Governance Framework (EGF), 134-6, 139, 168 exceptionalism genetic exceptionalism and genetic information, 53-5 exploitation avoidance by benefit sharing, 115-16, 118 commodification and, 128 concerns as to, 95 ethical frameworks and, 6, 7 ethical toolbox protection from, 169-70, 179 failure of protection by individual model, 88, 98-9, 150-1, 176 and fear of paternalism, 26-7 group consent issues, 99-100 ignoring of issue of, 60 informed consent as protection from, 80, 114-15 nullification through choice, 26 perception of, 91, 107-8, 141-2, 143, 172 potential for, 23-4, 91, 114-15, 176-7 power imbalances leading to, 100 Tuskegee case, 99-100, 148-9 see also inducement family covenants confidentiality and, 94-5, 96 family groups extent of sharing, 56-7 group consent, 94-5 feminism pictures of the self, 7-11 future generations see connected others genetic exceptionalism case for, 33-4 and genetic information, 53 question of, 41 genetic information Alder Hey case, 34-5 anonymisation, 43-5 and confidentiality see confidentiality extent of sharing, 56-60 Hagahai tribe case, 57-8, 60, 158-9 Havasupai tribe case, 59, 66 as identifying information anonymisation, 43-5 issue of, 43 possibilities of identification, 45-53 and individualism

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00860-1 - The Connected Self: The Ethics and Governance of the Genetic Individual Heather Widdows Index

More information

Index

genetic exceptionalism, 53 genetic self as individual self, 40 personalised medicine, 40-3 introduction to, 31-4 ownership see property in the body as shared information, 36-40 value of, 34-6 Virginia Commonwealth University case, 83-4 genetic material and confidentiality see confidentiality introduction to, 31 ownership see property in the body value of, 34 genetic self as connected self see connected self gift model enhancement of social capital, 172 and mass withdrawal, 144 trust model development from, 125-31, 136 - 7goods recognition by ethical toolbox, 169-70 see also assessment of goods and harms; group goods; individual goods; public goods; social capital group consent collapse back into, 116-17 collapse back into individual choice, 96 exploitation issues, 99-100 failures common with individual consent, 98-9 family groups, 94-5 introduction of, 92 problems of, 95, 102 protection of vulnerable members, 98 question of who consents for the group, 96 - 7in research, 92-4 usefulness of, 164 group goods assessment of goods and harms, 157-61 balancing with individual goods, 1, 150-1, 180-1 balancing with public goods, 154-5 collective group goods, 161 conflicting claims with individual goods, 1,159-60convergence with individual goods, 160, 161 as corporate goods, 159 destruction of, 156 informed consent and, 65-71 lack of protection by current ethical model, 3-4, 17, 159-60

203

and paternalism, 176 protection by group consent, 97, 148-9, 150 - 1recognition of, 58, 60, 65 risk types associated with, 66 see also public goods groups see collective groups; corporate groups Hagahai tribe case sharing of genetic information, 57-8, 60, 158-9 harms see assessment of goods and harms; group goods; individual goods Havasupai tribe case sharing of genetic information, 59, 66 Human Genome Diversity Project see North American Regional Committee of the Human Genome Diversity Project Human Genome Project statement on benefit sharing, 103-4, 109-10, 111, 112, 115, 117-21, 122, 153 - 4statement on consent, 90-1 human rights assessment of goods and harms, 156-7 benefit sharing and, 103 potential abuse of, 59 human tissue see genetic material Hunter, Kathryn stakeholder model, 132-4 Iceland deCODE database failure, 84-6 identity identification by genetic information see genetic information indigenous groups see Hagahai tribe case; Havasupai tribe case individual choice see choice model; informed consent individual goods assessment of goods and harms, 160-1 balancing with group goods, 1, 150-1, 180 - 1balancing with public goods, 28 common good as foundation for, 69 conflicting claims with group goods, 1, 147-51, 159-60 convergence with group goods, 160, 161 and environmental ethics, 16 individual well being and public goods, 163 overemphasis on, 16

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00860-1 - The Connected Self: The Ethics and Governance of the Genetic Individual Heather Widdows Index More information

204 Index

individual goods (cont.) subordination to group goods, 176-7 individual self pictures of see pictures of the self separate self, 7-8 individualism in bioethical framework see choice model; confidentiality; informed consent and genetic information see genetic information and paternalism, 26-8 inducement improper, 103 protection from, 169-70, 179 reduced possibility under benefit sharing, 114-16, 118 use of, 100 see also exploitation information see genetic information informed consent analytical approach to, 62 and biobanking, 71-3 broad (or blanket) consent as alternative, 79 - 80collapse back into by group consent, 96 and connected others, 64-5 failure as to bioethical framework, 62-4, 86 - 7failures common with group consent, 98-9 and group goods, 65-71 limitations of, 80-1 see also group consent

Laurie, Graeme stakeholder model, 132–4

Moore v. Regents of the University of California property in the body issue, 56-7, 171

national ethics committees use of, 168–9 North American Regional Committee of the Human Genome Diversity Project statement on consent, 90–1, 92–3, 97

'one-stop-shop' ethics choice model, 168 ownership see property in the body

Papua New Guinea Hagahai tribe case, 60, 158–9 patents shared patenting, 110–11, 120, 171 paternalism

and bioethical framework, 70-1, 101, 149 and ethical toolbox, 176 patient dignity see dignity patient/doctor relationship development of individualist bioethical framework, 18-20 patient identity see confidentiality personalised medicine and genetic information, 40 pictures of the self in feminism, 8 problem of false, 6, 13-14 in virtue ethics, 11-13 principlism development of individualist bioethical framework, 20-2 ease of application, 22 privacy see anonymisation; confidentiality property in the body avoidance by ethical toolbox, 170-2 avoidance by new ethical models, 111 and benefit sharing, 120-2 and biobanks, 35-6, 129 debate as to, 35-6 endorsement of, 172 Moore v. Regents of the University of California, 56-7, 171 see also commodification protection of goods ethical toolbox method, 163-4 introduction to, 163 public goods balancing with group goods, 154-5 balancing with individual goods, 28, 68, 70 - 1and benefit sharing, 122 and biobanks, 166-7, 168-9 as collective interest, 160-1 conflict with scientific good, 143-4, 151 conflicting claims with individual goods, 1, 36-7disease control programmes as, 17 and ethical toolbox, 167, 169-70, 172-3, 174, 175, 179, 180-1 future consideration for, 166 and individual well being, 163 lack of protection by current ethical model, 26-7, 88 of membership, 152-3 promotion by ethical toolbox, 172-3 promotion by trust model, 137-8 public as right holder, 159-60 recognition of, 1, 2

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00860-1 - The Connected Self: The Ethics and Governance of the Genetic Individual Heather Widdows Index More information

Index

and shareholder model, 133 tension between global and local claims, 117 - 20and trust model, 125-6, 137-8 see also group goods PXE case shared patenting, 110-11, 120, 171 self see connected self; genetic self; identity; individual self; individualism; pictures of the self; separate self self-determination see individualism separate self pictures of, 7-8 shareholder model benefit sharing contrasted, 132 overview, 131-2 social capital promotion by ethical toolbox, 172-3 promotion by trust model, 137-8 stakeholder model overview, 132-4 theories of the self see pictures of the self Titmuss, Richard gift model, 125-31 trust model benefit sharing compared, 138, 139, 144-5 conclusions as to, 144-5 development from gift models, 125-31, 136 - 7introduction to, 124 overview, 124-5 shareholder model, 131-2 stakeholder model, 132-4 strengths application to future generations, 137 inclusiveness, 136-7 promotion of social capital and public goods, 137-8 UK Biobank model see UK Biobank versions, 131 weaknesses collapse back into broad consent, 139 - 40mass withdrawal, 140-4 Tuskegee case exploitation, 99-100, 148-9 UK Biobank adoption of broad consent, 136-7 aim of, 151

205

and collective interest, 160-1 guarantee of anonymity, 76-7 inadvertent identification, 77, 78-9, 85-6 and informed consent, 75 long-term focus, 74-5 mass withdrawal from, 139, 141-4 national scope, 71-2 and trust model, 125-6, 134-6, 139, 168 withdrawal from participation, 76 UNESCO declarations as to benefit sharing, 103 United Kingdom Alder Hey case, 34-5 biobanks, 74-5 broad consent, 79 ethical guidance, 18-20 extent of sharing of information, 56-7 genetic exceptionalism debate, 54-5 genetic information legislation, 32-3 national ethics committee, 168-9 sale of anonymised data, 35 see also UK Biobank United States breast cancer research, 39 Canavan disease case, 105-6, 107-8, 121, 171 disease control programmes, 17-18 drug products labelling, 41-2 extent of sharing of information, 56-7 first 'Code of Ethics', 18-19 genetic information legislation, 32-3 Havasupai tribe case, 59, 66 Moore v. Regents of the University of California, 56-7, 171 principlism, 20-1 PXE case, 110-11, 120, 171 Tuskegee case, 99–100, 148–9 Virginia Commonwealth University case, 83-4 Virginia Commonwealth University case sharing of genetic information, 83-4 virtue ethics pictures of the self, 7-8, 11-13 Winickoff, David

shareholder model, 131–2 withdrawal from participation biobanks, 76–9 gift model, 144 trust model, 137, 139, 140–4 World Health Organisation statement on genetic information, 20–1

collection of material by, 56-7