Reproductive Donation

Reproductive donation is the most contentious area of assisted reproduction. Even within Europe there are wide variations in what is permitted in each country. This multidisciplinary book takes a fresh look at the practices of egg, sperm and embryo donation and surrogacy, bringing together ethical analysis and empirical research. New evidence is offered on aspects of assisted reproduction and the families these create, including non-traditional types. One of the key issues addressed is should children be told of their donor origin? If they do learn the identity of their donor, what kinds of relationships may be forged between families, the donor and other donor sibling families? Should donation involve a gift relationship? Is intra-familial donation too close for comfort? How should we understand the growing trend for ‘reproductive tourism’? This lively and informed discussion offers new insights into reproductive donation and the resulting donor families.

**Martin Richards** is Emeritus Professor of Family Research in the University of Cambridge Centre for Family Research, which he founded, and directed until 2005. His research concerns the psychosocial aspects of new reproductive and genetic technologies and the social and ethical issues that deployment of new technologies may raise. He publishes widely in academic journals. His books include: *The Troubled Helix: Social and Psychological Implications of the New Human Genetics*, edited with Theresa Marteau (1996); *The Limits of Consent: a Socio-Ethical Approach*, edited with John McMillan et al. (2009); *Regulating Autonomy: Sex, Reproduction and Families*, edited with Shelley Day-Slater et al. (2009); and *Birthrights or Rites*, edited with Fatemeh Ebtehaj et al. (2011).

**Guido Pennings** is Professor of Ethics and Bioethics at Ghent University where he is also the Director of the Bioethics Institute Ghent (BIG). He mainly publishes on ethical problems associated with medically assisted reproduction and genetics including sex selection, gamete donation, stem cell research, fertility preservation and preimplantation genetic diagnosis. In addition, he is Affiliate Lecturer in the Faculty of Politics, Psychology, Sociology and International Studies at Cambridge University and Guest Professor on ‘Ethics in Reproductive Medicine’ at the Faculty of Medicine and Pharmaceutical Sciences of the Free University Brussels.

**John B. Appleby** is currently a Wellcome Trust PhD student in Bioethics at the Centre for Family Research and a member of Corpus Christi College at the University of Cambridge.
Reproductive Donation

Practice, Policy and Bioethics

Edited by

Martin Richards
Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge

Guido Pennings
Bioethics Institute Ghent, Ghent University

John B. Appleby
Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of contributors</th>
<th>page vii</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARTIN RICHARDS, GUIDO PENNINGS AND JOHN B. APPLEBY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 The biology of donation</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MARTIN H. JOHNSON</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Ethics for reproductive donation</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROBERT KLITZMAN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Parenthood – whose right is it anyway?</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANJA KARNEIN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Reproductive donation: global perspectives and cultural diversity</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZEYNEP B. GÜRTIN AND EFFY VAYENA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 UK and US perspectives on the regulation of gamete donation</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THERESA GLENNON</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Gamete and embryo donation: a legal view from Spain</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YOLANDA GARCÍA-RUIZ AND DIANA GUERRA-DIAZ</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 The legal and ethical regulation of transnational donation</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GUIDO PENNINGS AND ZEYNEP B. GÜRTIN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 Balancing ethical criteria for the recruitment of gamete donors</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GUIDO PENNINGS, EFFY VAYENA AND KAMAL AHUJA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

10 Challenges in intra-family donation
   EFFY VAYENA AND SUSAN GOLOMBOK........168

11 ARTs and the single parent
   SUSANNA GRAHAM AND ANDREA BRAVERMAN....189

12 Reproductive donation and justice for gay
   and lesbian couples
   JOHN B. APPLEBY, SARAH JENNINGS
   AND HELEN STATHAM......................211

13 Is disclosure in the best interests of children
   conceived by donation?
   JOHN B. APPLEBY, LUCY BLAKE AND
   TABITHA FREEMAN.........................231

14 Identifiable donors and siblings: implications
   for the future
   TABITHA FREEMAN, JOHN B. APPLEBY
   AND VASANTI JADVA........................250

15 Ethical issues in embryo donation
   FIONA MACCALLUM AND HEATHER WIDDOWS....270

16 Reproduction through surrogacy: the UK and
   US experience
   ANDREA BRAVERMAN, POLLY CASEY
   AND VASANTI JADVA.......................289

17 Some conclusions regarding the interaction of
   normative and descriptive elements in
   reproductive donation
   GUIDO PENNINGS.........................308

Index...........................................311
Contributors

KAMAL AHUJA The London Women’s Clinic
JOHN B. APPLEBY Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
LUCY BLAKE Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
ANDREA BRAVERMAN Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, Robert Wood Johnson Medical School
POLLY CASEY Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
TABITHA FREEMAN Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
YOLANDA GARCÍA-RUIZ Facultad de Derecho, Universidad de Valencia
THERESA GLENNON Beasley School of Law, Temple University
SUSAN GOLOMBOK Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
SUSANNA GRAHAM Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
DIANA GUERRA-DIAZ Instituto Valenciano de Infertilidad (IVI) Barcelona
ZEYNEP B. GÜRTIN Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
VASANTI JADVA Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
SARAH JENNINGS Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge
List of contributors

MARTIN H. JOHNSON Department of Physiology, Development and Neuroscience, University of Cambridge

ANJA KARNEIN Institute for Political Science, Goethe-Universität Frankfurt

ROBERT KLITZMAN Columbia University College of Physicians and Surgeons

FIONA MACCALLUM Department of Psychology, University of Warwick

GUIDO PENNINGS Bioethics Institute Ghent (BIG), Ghent University

MARTIN RICHARDS Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge

HELEN STATHAM Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge

EFFY VAYENA Institute of Biomedical Ethics, University of Zurich

HEATHER WIDDOWS Department of Philosophy, University of Birmingham
Acknowledgements

This book grew from a workshop that was supported by a Wellcome Trust Biomedical Ethics Enhancement Award to Professor Susan Golombok and others in the Centre for Family Research, University of Cambridge. We are grateful to the Wellcome Trust for making this project possible.

The editors would like to express their thanks for the assistance of a number people, not least to the authors of the chapters for their forbearance and compliance with editorial demands, and to Abby Scott, Hita Hirons, Jill Brown and Frances Murton for all their work. The grant holders of the Wellcome Enhancement Award who played a vital role in the planning of the project are Susan Golombok, Tabitha Freeman, Vasanti Jadva, Helen Statham and Zeynep B. Gürtin. And our thanks to the discussants for their contributions to our workshop, Irenée Daly, John Parsons and Wannes Van Hoof.