INDEX

affirmative action, collective rights distinguished 132-3 agents exercise of rights by 9, 115-16, 135 - 40and international relations 137 representative role of 9-10, 136-7, 140and self-determination 137 Alexy, Robert model of legal rights 70-1 norm and position as to right, importance of distinction 70 theory of rights 7 theory of rights contrasted with Coleman and Kraus 73-4 types of question relating to theory of legal rights 70 American Indians, acceptance of imposed group identity 62 analytical jurisprudence see jurisprudence Anglo-American jurisprudence and theory anti-positivist theory 15-16 in rem and in personam rights 120-1 mens rea, and collective criminal liability 159 nature of legal rights 35-6 positivist theory 2, 28, see also Hart, Herbert (H. L. A.) prominence of 14 theories of rights 67 animal rights, shift in legal status of animals 5 apartheid laws, exclusionary nature of 164

Aristotle, natural justice and legal justice distinguished 176-7 arranged marriages, and human rights 181 Austin, John, 'will theory' of rights 67 Balkan ethnic conflicts, collective criminal liability 157-9 Bauböck, Rainer, 'group-differentiated rights' 121-3 'benefit theory' of rights (Bentham) 67 Bentham, Jeremy 'benefit theory' of rights 67 'paraphrasing' method 30 Berry, Brian, classification of right-holders 119-20 Bobbio, Norberto, value collectivism 54 - 5Bodenheimer, Edgar, critique of Hart's 'paraphrasing' method 31-2 Boshammer, Susanne collective rights theories 75 ontological collectivism 45 value collectivism 49, 54 Buchanan, Allen agents 136-7 collective and individual rights 144-6 distinction between individual and collective rights 112 Burke, Edmund, individualistic concept 54 Canada

collective and individual rights 144, 152 legislation and 'paraphrasing' method 33

218

INDEX

219

chapter summaries 6-13 children's' rights, UN Convention 75 China, concept of rights 66 'choice theory of rights' (Hart) classification of rights, compared to Roman law 120-1 contrasted with human rights instruments 74 critique of 35-6 distinction between 'special' and 'general' rights 120 'interest theory' distinguished 67, 69 limitations of 76 normative-moral viewpoint 75 scope of 68 use of 30-1 'class action', collective rights as 4 'classes of subjects', and collectives 119-34 Coleman, Jules critique of Dworkin's 'interpretative' legal theory 16 foundational theory of rights 72-3 theory of rights contrasted with Alexy 73-4 'collective crime' concept (Dimitrijević) 157-9 collective criminal liability 156-62 collective duties debate as to 152-65 deprivative nature of 163-4 duty to refrain from action 163 exclusionary nature of 163-4 and 'exercising criterion' 165 legal form of 163-4 overview of debate as to 10-11 scope of analysis 162 shared responsibility distinguished 161 - 2collective entities, see also collectives classes of subjects distinguished 9 legal personality of and legal drafting 56-65 problem of construction of 6 membership of, sociological basis of 127 collective goods, meaning of 85 collective identity, legal definition of 129-31

'collective inactions', meaning of 153-4 collective legal liability of football fans 165 'collective moral autonomy thesis' (Copp) 154-7 collective moral rights, concept of 124 'collective omissions', meaning of 153 - 4collective rights, see also group rights; value collectivism affirmative action distinguished 132 - 3basis in value collectivism 151-2, 200, 201 book argument of 199 chapter summaries 6-13 genesis of 1 justification for 1-2 'class action' understanding of 4 classification of 185-8 communal exercise of 115 as concept opposed to liberal values 1 - 2Constitutional definition of 110, 138-9 definition of 112 distinctiveness of 4, 9 emergence of 4 exercise of agents, via 115-16, 135-40, see also agents by individual 116-19 individuals' ability for 8 methods of 9, 115 and 'exercising criterion' 110-19 group rights as synonym for 1 growth of debate on 1-2 guaranteed by legal instruments 128 and human rights 11 in human rights instruments 182-8, see also human rights instruments individual rights, relationship to 140-52, 160-1 inherency of 132-3 and international law 11, 147, 182-8

220

INDEX

collective rights (cont.) justification, problem of 5-6 legal concepts applied to 18-19 legal theory approach to, superiority of 2 legal theory of basis in value collectivism 151 - 2and human rights instruments 69 interest theory, see 'interest theory' of rights (Raz) rights theories as basis for 7 starting point of 66-75 task of 64 nature of, contrasted with individual rights 45 need for comprehensive theory of 90 - 1opposing views to 44 overriding of individual rights 10, 146 - 7'paraphrasing' method applied to 38-9, 43 permanence of 132-3 recognition of distinctiveness of 9 as rights to collective goods 85 as rights to 'participatory goods' 84-98 status of, effect of invocation of right 112-13 as synonym 4 universal, see universal human rights use of term 1, 4, 22-3 whether universal, summary of debate 188-95 collectives and 'classes of subjects' 119-34, see also collective entities as right-holders, summary of debate 10 - 11'collectivity' and 'set' distinguished 124 common goods concept of 79 public goods distinguished 84 conceptual analysis distinction from legal theoretical construction 6-7 limitations of 2-3

positivist theory as 2 value of 32 'conceptualization', and development of jurisprudence 4 Constitutional definition of collective rights 110 'construction of difference' (Heinze) aim of theory 60-1 steps of theory 59-60 'contingent universality', as to freedom of expression 181 'Control Thesis' (Morauta) example of 89 meaning of 88-9 Copp, David, 'collective moral autonomy thesis' 154-7 corporate law legal personality 57 'lifting the corporate veil', 'paraphrasing' method applied to 40-3 'corporate theory' of group rights (Jones) 8, 101-3, 104-5 corporation, partnership (societas) distinguished 42 Crawford, James, classification of collective rights 185-6 criminal liability of states 156-62 cultural argument as to separate legal existence of groups 50-1 cultural pluralism, legal techniques as to 149-50 cultural practices, protection for 63-4 cultural rights classification of (Levy) 71-2 protection for 135 cultural sensitivity, and human rights 181 - 2cultural transcendence of universal human rights 170, 175-6 descriptive approach, see conceptual analysis 'differentialist egalitarianism' (Heinze) 60 Dimitrijević, Nenad, 'collective crime'

concept 157-9

INDEX

Dinstein, Yoram classification of 'collective human rights' 182-8 distinction between individual and collective rights 111-12 disabled persons' rights, UN Convention 74-5 Donnelly, Jack 'overlapping consensus' concept of universality 12, 178-80 three-tier approach to theory of universality 180 'dual standing' group rights 112 duty-holders, collectives as 10-11 Dworkin, Ronald collective rights 75-6, 196 'interpretative' legal theory 17 'semantic sting' concept 17 education and language rights, see language rights as universal human right 174-5 'encompassing groups' concept (Raz) 7 ethnocide, danger of 50-1 ethnocultural argument as to separate

legal existence of groups 51–2 'exercising criterion' and collective duties 165 and collective rights 110–19 and definition of right-holders 114 expression, freedom of, and 'contingent universality' 181

foetus, legal personality of 56–7 fiction theory (Savigny) 42 football fans, collective legal liability of 165 'foreigners', classification of minorities as 61–2 foreigners' councils (*Ausländerbeirate*), role of 61–2 foundational theory of rights (Coleman and Kraus) 72–3 Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (Council of Europe), pure theory of law applied to 24 France French Revolution and Jewish citizenship 197 Muslim National Council 140 Franck, Thomas collective criminal liability 160-1 nature of individual rights and collective rights contrasted 45 freedom of expression, 'contingent universality' 181 'general' rights (Hart), 'special' rights distinguished 120 genocide authorship of term 49-50 collective liability for 160-1 crime of, as argument for value collectivism 49-50 Germany animal rights 5 exclusionary nature of Nazi anti-Jewish laws 163-4 foreigners' councils (Ausländerbeirate) 61-2 freedom of expression, 'contingent universality' 181 jurisprudence, prominence of 14 legal methodology, role in legal culture 17-18 legal status of animals, shift in 5 Muslim ritual slaughter, constitutionality of 148-9 Nazi speech, present-day tolerance of 181 Nazism and national guilt 156-7 Nuremberg Race Laws 62-3 theories of rights 35-6, 67, 126-7 Gierke, Otto von, theory of rightholders 126-7 goods see collective goods; common goods; 'irreducible goods'

221

- goods; 'irreducible goods' concept; 'participatory goods'; public goods; shared goods, meaning of; 'socially irreducible goods' concept (Taylor)
- goods not destined for individual control (*res extra commercium*) 98

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00738-3 - Collective Rights: A Legal Theory Miodrag A. Jovanović Index More information

222

INDEX

'group-differentiated rights' 119-34 group identity acceptance of imposed 62 enforced imposition of 61-2 group membership, legal definition of 62 - 3group rights basis of 78 conflicts of interest as to 135-6 'corporate theory' of 8 'dual standing' 112 'nonindividual' 112 as synonym for collective rights 1 ways of exercising 112 groups, see also right-holders collective duties, see collective duties conflicts of interest within 135-6 cultural aspect of existence of 50-1 differentiation within 133-4 distinction from other juristic persons 126-7 exercise of rights by 9 flourishing of, and individual well-being 83-4 as good worthy of criminal law protection 50 as 'irreducible right-bearing entities' 8 legal personality of, see legal personality locus standi of 199 membership of, 'persons-belonging-to' formula 64 moral standing of 98-109 objective existence of 9 recognition of distinctiveness of 59 - 60as right-holders, see right-holders rights to 'participatory goods', claims as to holding of 90-1 separate legal existence of, arguments as to 44-56 'value of groups question' 44 Hart, Herbert (H. L. A.), see also

Hart, Herbert (H. L. A.), *see also* 'choice theory of rights' (Hart); 'paraphrasing' method analytical principles distinguished 32–3

Bodenheimer's critique of 31–2 characteristics of legal language 30 connection between law and morality 172 critique of 'legal personality' 43-4 'generality' of legal theory 2-3 influence of 28 Marmor's critique of 46-7 methodological approach 29-30 Perry's critique of 48 and positivist theory 14-15 theory of law 28-9 use of conceptual analysis 32 Hartney, Michael 'legal omnipotence' 4-5 value collectivism 53, 54 value individualism 46 Heinze, Eric aim of theory 60-1 'minority' concept and 'construction of difference' 59-60 'universalist' and 'differentialist' egalitarianism 60 historical contingency of universal human rights 171-3 Hohfeld, Wesley N., distinctions of legal meaning 33, 67 holding see right-holders 'holding constraint' thesis (Réaume) basis of, questions as to 90-1 critique of 88-9 defence of 89-90 'Exercising Argument' for 89-90 outline of 87-8 homosexual marriage, as collective good 85 human rights, see also universal human rights basis in shared humanity 173 challenges to universality of 167-8 classification based on enforceability 170 and collective rights 11 and cultural sensitivity 181-2 derogation from 150 and jurisprudence 11 'political conception' of 12, 168-9, 173 - 4

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00738-3 - Collective Rights: A Legal Theory Miodrag A. Jovanović Index More information

INDEX

as synchronically universal 11-12 'thin' universality of 12 'traditional' approach to 168-9 human rights instruments collective rights in 182-8, 200-1 and collective rights theory 69 contrasted with choice theory of rights' 74 development of 182-4 guarantee of rights under 128 Hungary, statutory definition of nationality 131, 138 Ignatieff, Michael, collective and individual rights 140-1 'imputation' method forms of 21 introduction of 20-1 Kelsen's concept 131 legal personality as 'end point' of 22 limitations of 25-8 modified terminology as to 22 'organ's function' concept 22-3 in rem and in personam rights 120-1 India, minority rights legislation and 'paraphrasing' method 33 indigenous peoples claims in international law, types of 187 collective right to land 8 legal status of, and classification of collective rights 186-8 tribal constitutionalism, and legal definition of collective identity 129-31 UN Declaration on the Rights of cultural rights under 135 'paraphrasing' method applied to 34 individual rights collective rights, relationship to 8, 10, 140-52, 160-1 exercisable collectively 9 language of, use in minority rights legislation 64

nature of, contrasted with collective rights 45

223

overriding by collective rights 10, 146 - 7ways of exercising 114 individualism, see value individualism individualistic concept, origin of 54 'individualized' goods capacity to be 98 rights over 93 individuals, see also right-holders claim to right to public goods 85-6 enjoyment of goods by 86-7 exercise of rights by 9 goods not destined for control by (res extra commercium) 98 production of public goods by 87 well-being of, and group flourishing 83 - 4'interest theory' of rights (Raz) 'aggregative interests' approach 105 basis of group rights 78 'choice theory' distinguished 67, 69 claims as to 105 collective goods 85 collective rights as rights to 'participatory goods' 84-98 common goods, see common goods conditions for right-holding capacity 80-3 and 'corporate theory' of group rights 101-3, 104-5 critique of 7, 84 examples supporting 78-9 focus of 76-7 interest grounding a right, nature of 99-101, 103-4, 106-7 link between group flourishing and individual well-being 83-4 moral standing of groups and right-holding capacity 98-109 public goods and common goods distinguished 84 right-holder's well-being as basis of legal right 77-9 scope of 68-9 shared goods 85 and value collectivism 107-9

224

'interest theory' of rights (Raz) (cont.) variations of 7–8 'will theory' distinguished 67 international law, and collective rights 11, 147, 182–8, *see also* human rights instruments international relations, and role of agents 137 'interpretative' legal theory (Dworkin) 17 'irreducible goods' concept 8 'irreducible right-bearing entities', groups as 8 Islam see entries at Muslim Israel, legal definition of 'Jewishness' 128 - 9Italy, minorities protection legislation and pure theory of law 24 'Jewishness', legal definition of, see also Judaism exclusionary nature of Nazi anti-Jewish laws 163-4 French Revolution 197 Israeli Law of Return 128-9 Nuremberg Race Laws 62-3 'Jim Crow laws' (USA), definition of 'white person' 63 Jones, Peter 'corporate theory' of group rights 8, 101 - 3distinction between individual and collective rights 111 Judaism, universalism of 177, see also 'Jewishness', legal definition of judges' rights, justification of 78-9 jurisprudence, see also Anglo-American jurisprudence and theory; legal theory; Roman jurisprudence 'conceptualization' and development of 4 development of debate 14 and drafting of new legal personality 59 and emergence of new legal concept 3_{-4}

and 'paraphrasing' method 28-44

INDEX

- social science insights applied to 59-60 and universality of human rights 11 justification of new legal concepts, 'rational justification' concept (Summers) 4 Kant, Immanuel, and Kelsen's pure theory of law 19-20 Kelsen, Hans collective criminal liability 159-60
- concept of imputation 131 critique of 'legal personality' 43-4 'generality' of legal theory 2-3 nature of corporation 42 'organ's function' concept 22-3 and positivist theory 14-15 pure theory of law, see pure theory of law (Kelsen) use of 'collective rights' as term 22 - 3Kingsbury, Benedict, indigenous peoples' claims in international
- law 187
- Kis, Janos, critique of value collectivism 51

Kramer, Ernst A., 'strategic' aspect of legal methodology 58

- Kraus, Jody foundational theory of rights 72-3 theory of rights contrasted with
- Alexy 73-4 Kutz, Christopher, collective duties 155-6
- Kymlicka, Will liberal theory of minority rights 141-2, 143-4
 - minority rights legislation 69

land

as 'individualized' good 93 as 'participatory good' 8 language rights collective and individual rights 144 and 'Control Thesis' 89 as individual right 8, 95, 116-19

INDEX

225

legislation, and 'paraphrasing' method 33 and right-holding capacity 98-9 as 'socially irreducible goods' 93 - 4Larenz, Karl, critique of 'paraphrasing' method 38-9 law, connection to morality 172 Law of Return (Israel), definition of 'Jewishness' 128-9 legal concepts nature of 38-9 practical application of 18-19 legal drafting, and legal personality, see legal personality, drafting of 'legal eugenics', avoidance by legal drafters 63 legal justice, natural justice distinguished 176-7 legal language, characteristics of (Hart) 30 legal meaning, Hohfeld's distinctions of 33 legal methodology development of debate 14 and legal practice 17-18 and legal theory 14-19 option to accept or reject methodological guidelines 64-5 'strategic' aspect of (Kramer) 58 legal norms, elements of, in pure theory of law 23 legal officeholders' rights, justification of 78-9 'legal omnipotence' approach to legal theory 4-5 legal personality criteria for determining 56-7 critiques of concept of 43-4 drafting of avoidance of 'legal eugenics' 63 legal definition of group membership 61-2 methodological guidelines 58 naming and labelling of group 61 - 2option to accept or reject methodological guidelines 64-5

potential problem areas 57-8 protection for religious and cultural practices 63-4 role of jurisprudence in 59 social science insights applied to 59-60 in terms of individual rights 64 theory and practice distinguished 58-9 as 'end point' of 'imputation' method 22 problem of construction of 6 legal positivism, see positivist theory legal practice application of legal concepts 18-19 distinction from legal theory 15 and legal methodology 17-18 and legal personality, see legal personality, drafting of and legal theory 14-19 legal theory distinguished 58-9 legal rights classification of, analytical approach to 71-2 'has a legal right', 'paraphrasing' method applied to phrase 30 - 1norm and position as to, importance of distinction 70 right-holder's well-being as basis of 77-9 theory of, types of questions relating to 70, 72-3 legal status, transition from *object* to subject 5 legal theory, see also jurisprudence; positivist theory approach to collective rights, superiority of 2 of collective rights, see collective rights conceptual analysis, see conceptual analysis distinction from conceptual analysis 6 - 7distinction from legal practice 15 emergence of new concept 3-4 'generality' of 2–3

226

INDEX

legal theory (cont.) justification of new concepts 4 'legal omnipotence' approach 4-5 and legal personality, see legal personality, drafting of and legal practice and methodology 14 - 19legal practice distinguished 58-9 and liability law 13 'purification' of, see pure theory of law (Kelsen) value collectivism as basis for 151-2 Lemkin, Raphaël, authorship of 'genocide' 49-50 Levy, Jacob T., cultural rights classification 71-2 liability law, legal theory applied to 13 liberal theory of minority rights (Kymlicka) 141-2, 143-4 liberal values collective rights as concept opposed to 1-2 universalism of 177 'lifting the corporate veil', 'paraphrasing' method applied to 40-3 Locke, John, individualistic concept 54 locus standi of groups 199 MacCormick, Neil, critique of Hart's 'choice theory' 35-6 Margalit, Avishai, value collectivism 53 Marmor, Andrei collective and individual rights 142 - 3'common goods' 87 critique of value collectivism 46-7, 48 May, Larry, collective duties 153-4 Members of Parliament, justification of rights of 78-9

mens rea, and collective criminal liability 159

Miller, David, 'group-differentiated rights' 123–4 Miller, Seumas critique of 'collective moral autonomy thesis' 155 definition of collective rights 112 'millet system' (Muslim religious tolerance) 178 minorities classification as 'foreigners' 61 - 2nationality provisions 198 'minority' concept (Heinze) 59-60 minority rights, see also indigenous peoples basis of obligation to protect 124 - 5as collective rights 200-1 exercise of 114 instruments, see human rights instruments language rights, see language rights liberal theory of 141-2, 143-4 pure theory of law applied to legislation 23-6 use of language of individual rights in legislation 64 Mitnick, Eric J., 'group-differentiated rights' 120 moral responsibility of groups see collective duties moral standing of groups, and rightholding capacity 98-109 morality, connection to law 172 Morauta, James 'Control Thesis', see 'Control Thesis' (Morauta) critique of 'holding constraint' thesis 89-90 distinction between individual and collective rights 110-11 exercise of rights 114 Muslim challenge to universal human rights 167-8, 177-8 Muslim Council (France) 140 Muslim religious toleration 178 Muslim ritual slaughter, constitutionality 148-9

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00738-3 - Collective Rights: A Legal Theory Miodrag A. Jovanović Index More information

INDEX

227

'nation', 'paraphrasing' method applied to 43 national laws, see also entries for specific countries, e.g. Canada collective and individual rights 151 nationality, statutory definition of 131, 138 native Americans (USA), acceptance of imposed group identity 62 natural justice, legal justice distinguished 176-7 natural law theory individualistic concept 54 and positivist theory 14-15 Nazism, see Germany Newman, Dwight G., 'group-differentiated rights' 124 'nonindividual' group rights 112 Nuremberg Race Laws (Germany), definition of Jewishness 62-3 Offe, Claus, foreigners' councils (Ausländerbeirate) 61-2 'one drop rule' (USA), definition of white person' 63 ontological collectivism 45 ontological individualism 45 'organ's function' concept (Kelsen), and 'imputation' method 22-3 'overlapping consensus' concept of universality (Donnelly) 12, 178-80 'paraphrasing' method and analytical jurisprudence 28-44 applied to collective rights 38-9, 43 applied to 'nation' 43 examples of 33-5 limitations of 37-8 possibility of different results from using 36-7 quality of results, reasons for 38-9 use of 30 'participatory goods'

claims as to holding of rights to 90–1 collective rights as rights to 84–98 and collective rights concept 90–1

critique of concept of 7-8 individual aspects of 87-8 individuals' ability to have rights over 8 particularism, as opposite to universalism 176-7 partnership (societas), corporation distinguished 42 Perry, Stephen R., critique of Hart 48 'persons-belonging-to' formula 64 Pogge, Thomas 'group-differentiated rights' 121-3 'group-statistical rights' 132 Poland, nationality of minorities 198 'political conception' of human rights (Raz) 12, 168-9, 173-4 'politics of recognition' (Taylor) 149 positivist theory and Alexy's 'legal-doctrinal questions' 73 as 'conceptual analysis' 2 dominance of 14-15 and natural law theory 14-15 'separation thesis' 73 Poulter, Sebastian, collective and individual rights 149-50 public goods aspects of 86-7 common goods distinguished 84 enjoyment by individual 86-7 individual production of 87 individual's claim to right to 85-6 terminology of 87 types of 87 pure theory of law (Kelsen) application to minorities protection legislation (examples) 23-6 basis in Kantian philosophy 19-20 elements of legal norms 23 'imputation', see 'imputation' method 'purification' of legal theory 2, 19

race laws, and legal definition of groups 62–3 'rational justification' (Summers) 4

Rawls, John, 'overlapping consensus' concept 178–9

228

INDEX

Raz, Joseph 'encompassing groups' concept 7 'interest theory' of rights 7 nature of legal concepts 38-9 'political conception' of human rights 12 universality of human rights 11, 168-75 value collectivism 8, 53 Realist Theory, nature of corporation 42 Réaume, Denise collective and individual rights 142-3, 146-7 distinction between individual and collective rights 110 'holding constraint' thesis, see 'holding constraint' thesis (Réaume) individuals and public goods 85-6 'participatory goods' 7-8, 87-8, 91-3 Reine Rechtslehre, see pure theory of law (Kelsen) religious freedom, universalism of 177-8 religious practices, protection for 63-4, 148-9, 149-50 representatives see agents res extra commercium (goods not destined for control by individuals) 98 right-holders broad and narrow classes distinguished 124-5 capacity to be conditions for 80-3 and moral standing of groups 98-109 categories of 5 classification of 119-34 definition of, and 'exercising criterion' 114 'encompassing groups' concept (Raz) 7 'holding constraint' thesis, see 'holding constraint' thesis (Réaume) legal personality of, see legal

egal personality of, *see* legal personality

nature of 125-6 possible holders of status of 83 well-being of, as basis of legal right 77 - 9rights approaches to defining nature of 9 'choice theory' (Hart) 30-1 collective nature of 199-201 definition by method of exercising 9 features of 79 'has a legal right', 'paraphrasing' method applied to 30-1 in rem and in personam 120-1 interest grounding a right, nature of 99-101, 103-4, 106-7 as social-cultural development, see right-holders theoretical approaches 7, 66-75 theories of, see also 'choice theory of rights' (Hart); 'interest theory' of rights (Raz) as basis for legal theory of collective rights 7 origins of 67 'you have a right', 'paraphrasing' method applied to 30 Roman jurisprudence classification of rights, compared to Hart's 'choice theory' 120-1 'conceptualization' and development of 4 goods not destined for individual control (res extra commercium) 98 origins of rights 66 partnership (societas), concept of 42 Savigny, Carl Friedrich von, fiction theory 42

self-determination agents' role in 137 as collective good 85 communal exercise of right 115 conditions to be right-holder 81–3 development of 197–9

INDEX

229

possible right-holders 83 scope of right 7 'semantic sting' concept (Dworkin) 17 Sen, Amartya, definition of universal value 12 'separation thesis' in positivist theory 73 Serbia constitutional definition of collective rights 110, 138-9 minority rights legislation and 'paraphrasing' method 34 'set' and 'collectivity' distinguished 124 shared goods, meaning of 85 shared moral responsibility, collective duties distinguished 161-2 Shaw, Malcolm N., collective rights and international law 147 Sieghart, Paul, classification of collective rights 185 Sikhs, group rights of 119-20 Smith, Anthony, cultural argument for value collectivism 50-1 social contract theory, and value collectivism 55-6 social sciences, insights applied to jurisprudence 59-60 'socially irreducible goods' concept (Taylor) 8, 93-4 sociological basis of group membership 127 South Africa, exclusionary nature of Apartheid laws 164 sovereignty, limitation by universal human rights 170-1 'special' rights (Hart), 'general' rights distinguished 120 statehood, debate over conditions for acquiring 57 states, criminal liability of 156-62 status, transition from *object* to subject 5 subjective rights see legal rights Summers, Robert C., 'rational justification' concept 4 Sweden, collective and individual rights 152 Switzerland, language rights 151

'synchronically universal' human rights (Raz) 169–70

Tamir, Yeal critique of collective rights 44 critique of 'interest theory' 99-101, 103-4, 106-7 Taylor, Charles collective and individual rights 144 'politics of recognition' 149 'socially irreducible goods' concept 8,93-4 Tesón, Fernando R, case against collective rights 196 Thornberry, Patrick, cultural argument for value collectivism 50 tribal constitutionalism collective and individual rights 148 - 9and legal definition of collective identity 129-31 UK, see also Anglo-American jurisprudence and theory cultural pluralism 149-50 group rights of Sikhs 119-20 'lifting the corporate veil', history of concept of 40-1 minorities protection legislation, pure theory of law applied to 24 UN, human rights instruments, see human rights instruments USA, see also Anglo-American jurisprudence and theory collective and individual rights 148 freedom of expression, 'contingent universality' 181 native Americans, acceptance of imposed group identity 62 race laws in southern states 63 tribal constitutionalism 148-9 universal human rights challenges to universality 167-8 claim to universality 11-12 collective rights as 11, 13, 188-95 cultural transcendence of 170, 175-6

230

INDEX

universal human rights (cont.) debate as to universality 166-82 factual and normative claims distinguished 176 historical contingency of 171-3 jurisprudence and 11 as minimally universal 179-80 scope of analysis 166-8 as sovereignty-limiting measures 170-1 synchronical universality 169-70 'thin' universality 12 western viewpoint, predominance of 177 universal value definition of 12 'overlapping consensus' concept (Donnelly) 12 universalism, particularism as opposite 176 - 7universalist claims, in scope and in aspiration distinguished 177 'universalist egalitarianism' (Heinze) 60 universality 'contingent universality' 181 three-tier approach to theory of 180 value collectivism argument for 46

'argument from function' 48 case for 44-56 collective rights grounded in 151-2, 200, 201 concept of 6 defence of, strategies for 53-4 defensibility of 49 and 'interest theory' 107-9 as preferred value standpoint 47-8 refutation of, strategies for 49-53 and social contract theory 55-6 summary of argument as to 56 and value individualism 144-6 value individualism concept of 46, 141-2 and 'interest theory' of rights 7 limitations of 6 and value collectivism 144-6 'value of groups question' 44-5 values, definition of universal value 12 Waldron, Jeremy 'communal goods' 87 'participatory goods' 91-3 Walzer, Michael, theory of goods 92 'white person', definition by 'Jim Crow laws' 63

'will theory' of rights, 'interest theory' distinguished 67