

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00707-9 - Moral Dilemmas in Medieval Thought: From Gratian to Aquinas

M. V. Dougherty

Index

[More information](#)*Index*

- Abraham, 105, 111
 Adams, Marilyn McCord, 164, 166
 Alan of Lille, 44
 Albericus de Rosate, 55, 56, 124
 Albert the Great, 14, 121–2, 156, 158
 Alexander IV, 45, 48, 49
 Alexander of Hales
 and Franciscan theology, 47–8
 life, 45–8
 on method for theology, 46–7
 relationship to *Summa Halesiana*, 48–50
 Al-Ghazālī, 86
 Anselm of Canterbury, 46
 Aristotle, 21, 22, 43, 44, 45, 46, 87, 135, 185, 201, 202
 Armstrong, R. A., 149
 Augustine of Hippo, 39, 51, 55, 63, 71–2, 79, 86, 120, 161, 183
 Augustinus Triumphus, 160
- Backhaus, Ralph, 8
 Baldwin, John W., 38
 Bartholomaeus Brixiensis, 32
 Bartholomé de Medina, 192, 199, 201–2
 Batllori, Miquel, 88, 103
 Baylor, Michael G., 118
 Bender, Ludovico, 193
 Ben-Menahem, Hanina, 8, 172
 blasphemy, 11, 85, 94, 177–9, 181, 184, 185, 187, 188, 189, 190, 196
 Blum, Paul Richard, 102
 Boeher, Philotheus, 165
 Boethius, 14, 180, 201
 Bonaventure, 7, 41, 48, 51, 55, 156–8, 159
 Bonner, Anthony, 86, 88, 101, 102, 103, 111
 Bougerol, J. Guy, 47, 48, 49
 Bourke, Vernon J., 147
 Boyle, Leonard E., 112, 114
 Bradley, Denis J. M., 149, 151, 155
 Brady, Ignatius, 46, 48, 49
 Brundage, James A., 14, 18
- Cajetan, 192, 199
 Candelero, Massimo, 88
 canon law. *See* law
 Carolus Bovillus, 95
 Cavanaugh, T. A., 191
 Cessario, Romanus, 168, 170, 174
 Chenu, M.-D., 113
 Cicero, 22, 70, 195
 Clark, David W., 163
 Colavechio, Xavier G., 93, 118
 commands
 from civil authority, 54, 85, 104, 106, 157, 161
 from God, 19, 61, 62, 93, 104, 105, 108, 109, 118, 119, 121, 148, 151, 154, 157, 163–7, 179
 from religious superior, 19, 29, 30, 40, 69, 70, 76–8, 127, 131, 160, 181
 Conee, Earl, 4, 5
 Conrad of Constance, 129
 conscience
 and formal vs. material errors, 155
 and natural law. *See* natural law
 and papal authority, 160
 and practical syllogisms. *See* syllogism
 and synderesis. *See* synderesis
 binds in two ways, 157
 obligation to form properly, 39, 54, 81, 119, 120, 121, 162, 178, 190, 196
 Raymond Lull's rejection of contemporary views, 93
 setting aside judgments of, 39, 54, 55, 93, 120–2, 142, 148, 154, 155, 156–7, 158–63, 166, 170, 175, 184, 189
 Coolman, Boyd Taylor, 43, 44
Correctores Romani, 32
 Council of Toledo, 17, 22–7, 33, 34, 35, 36, 128, 181
 Crowe, Michael Bertram, 152
- Dante Alighieri, 14
 de Blic, J., 199, 201
 death, bodily vs. spiritual, 73

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00707-9 - Moral Dilemmas in Medieval Thought: From Gratian to Aquinas

M. V. Dougherty

Index

[More information](#)

222

Index

- Deman, Thomas, 200
- demons, 1, 11, 21, 28, 57, 66, 67, 177, 178–9, 181, 185, 187, 188–9, 195
- Denis the Carthusian, 162
- Descartes, René, 178
- devil. *See* demons
- divine command principle, 147–55, 157, 163
- divine command theory, 104, 109, 163, 179
- Domingo Soto, 192, 199
- Donagan, Alan, 4, 28, 71, 104, 110, 115–17, 132, 133, 134, 135–7, 138, 139, 140, 143, 145–6, 170, 176
- Doolan, Gregory, 131
- double-effect reasoning, 191
- Doucet, Victorin, 46, 49, 51
- Dougherty, M. V., 147, 180, 200
- drink, 38, 129–31, 171, 192
- Durandus of St. Pourçain, 161
- Edmund Rich, 47
- egoism, 104
- equiprobabilism, 202
- Eucharist, 57, 59, 66–7, 77, 123, 127–8, 129, 130, 131
- Evans, G. R., 163, 180
- evils
 - choosing vs. avoiding, 186–8, 190
 - intrinsic, 72, 164, 187
 - lesser. *See* lesser evil
- Finnis, John, 191, 194, 195
- Flannery, Kevin L., 151
- Fleming, Julia A., 200
- food, 58, 70, 76–8, 79, 130–1, 174, 188
- Francisco de Vitoria, 199
- Franklin, James, 200
- fraternal correction, 68–9, 79, 123, 124, 126–7
- Freppert, Lucan, 166
- Friedman, Russell L., 200
- Gabriel Biel, 162, 166
- Gallagher, David M., 155
- Gauthier, René Antoine, 112, 114
- Geach, Peter, 110, 116
- Geonget, Stéphane, 8, 28, 118, 138, 143, 172, 173
- Giles of Rome, 159
- Gilson, Étienne, 48, 50
- Glorieux, P., 113
- glossators, 8–9, 31–9
 - and principle of lesser evil, 35, 39, 80
 - claim that Gratian erred, 18, 32, 39, 40, 159, 189
 - composition of *Glossa ordinaria*, 8, 17, 31–2
 - criticism of Council of Toledo, 35
 - criticism of Gregory the Great, 36
 - denial of moral dilemmas, 33, 40, 53, 140
 - perplexitas* as epistemic, 33–5, 37, 38, 40, 66, 171, 183, 189, 198
- González, Ana Marta, 70
- Gowans, Christopher W., 2, 3, 5, 116
- Gratian, 8–9, 13–34, 40
 - and principle of lesser evil, 21, 22, 187
 - appeal to Gregory the Great, 26–7
 - appeal to the Council of Toledo, 17, 22, 24–6
 - composition of the *Decretum*, 13, 16–17
 - dispensations from the natural law, 20–1, 23–4
 - invoked by Johannes Capreolus, 181, 189
 - life, 13–14
 - on conflicts among authorities, 14–15, 18–20
 - superiority of natural law, 20
- Green, Thomas Hill, 37
- Greenspan, P. S., 3, 4, 64
- Gregory IX, 44–5
- Gregory of Rimini, 11, 176–7, 182, 184, 185, 187
- Gregory the Great, 8, 9, 17, 26–31, 33, 34, 36, 39, 40, 41, 52–3, 55, 57, 61, 69, 70, 71, 72, 73, 79, 83, 84, 146, 171, 178, 181, 182, 183, 187, 198
- Gregory XIII, 32
- Grisez, Germain, 147, 194, 195
- Guido de Baysio, 33
- Hallamaa, Olli, 167
- Hames, Harvey J., 102
- Hamesse, Jacqueline, 112
- Hannigan, E. T., 192
- Hare, R. M., 37
- Harsting, Pernille, 200
- Henry III, 47
- Henry of Ghent, 159, 168
- heresy, 1, 75–6, 119, 120, 150, 152–3
- Hill, Jr., Thomas E., 183
- Hillgarth, J. N., 87, 88, 95, 102
- Hoag, Robert W., 117
- Holopainen, Taina M., 163
- homicide, 1, 29, 30, 36, 37, 38, 53, 54, 71, 78, 79, 81, 94, 95, 96–7, 99–100, 105, 119, 120, 128–9, 132, 153, 188, 192
- Honnfelder, Ludger, 193
- Huber, Raphael M., 45, 47
- Huguccio, 38
- Humbert of Romans, 113
- Inglis, John, 6
- Innocent V. *See* Peter of Tarentaise
- intention
 - evil, 60, 125–6, 132, 142, 143, 170, 175
 - good, 174, 177, 183, 184

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00707-9 - Moral Dilemmas in Medieval Thought: From Gratian to Aquinas

M. V. Dougherty

Index

[More information](#)

Index

223

- Isidore of Seville, 28
Ivo of Chartres, 22
- Jean Gerson, 45
Jephthah, 30, 137–8
Jerome, 30, 138
Johannes Capreolus, 10–11, 168–71, 173–9,
180–90, 195–7
 appeal to Gregory the Great, 181, 183
 appeal to the glossators, 189
 appropriation of Gregory of Rimini, 11,
 176–7, 182, 184, 185, 187
 criticism of Gratian, 189–90
 criticism of principle of lesser evil, 185–8, 196,
 197
 format of *Defensiones*, 169, 173–4, 183
 on goodness of the will, 174–5
 on setting aside a judgment of conscience,
 184–5
Johannes Teutonicus, 32
John Cassian, 178
John Duns Scotus, 41, 160–1, 168
John of Paris, 158
John of Rupella, 48, 50, 51
John, Helen James, 170
Johnston, Mark D., 88, 89
Jonsen, Albert R., 202
Jordan, Mark D., 6, 170
- Kaczor, Christopher, 194
Kant, Immanuel, 2, 37, 39, 104, 105, 117, 183
Kantola, Ilkka, 200, 201
Kennedy, Leonard, 166
Kerr, Fergus, 170
Kierkegaard, Søren, 105
Kirk, Kenneth E., 116
Knuutila, Simo, 167
Kuttner, Stephan, 13, 18, 19, 31, 39
- Landau, Peter, 14, 18
Landgraf, Artur Michael, 38, 42, 57, 121, 188
Langston, Douglas, 157
Latin Averroism, 87
law
 canon, 8, 13–15, 18, 22, 25, 31–2, 39, 40, 41, 54,
 69, 77, 79, 140, 182, 189, 199
 civil, 8, 14, 20, 56, 171–2
 natural. *See* natural law
 New, 119, 120
 New Natural, 194–5
 of God, 69, 93, 150–2, 154, 156, 158, 161
 Old, 119
 Roman, 7, 16, 17, 35
Leibniz, Gottfried, 8, 171–2
Lemmon, E. J., 4, 15, 16, 20
- lesser evil
 advising the, 110, 192
 and intrinsic evils, 187
 as comparative relation, 23, 24
 methods for determining, 24–5, 26, 31, 57,
 66, 83, 193
 of degree, 192
 of kind, 192
lesser evil, principle of, 185
 and avoidance of sin, 181–3
 and characteristic sense, 190–1
 and double-effect reasoning, 191–2
 and glossators, 33, 35, 39
 and Gratian, 8, 21, 198
 and Gregory of Rimini, 177, 185, 186, 187
 and Gregory the Great, 8, 27, 28, 71, 83, 109,
 181, 198
 and Jacques Maritain, 194
 and Johannes Capreolus, 11, 177, 185–7, 190
 and New Natural Law theory, 194–5
 and Peter of Poitiers, 188
 and proportionalism, 194
 and Raymond Lull, 104
 and the Council of Toledo, 22, 128, 181
 and the Glossators, 80
 and the *Summa Halesiana*, 9, 60, 61, 62–3,
 71, 74, 75, 82, 83, 84, 142, 198
 and Thomas Aquinas, 191–2, 196
 and Thomas Bradwardine, 177
 and William of Auxerre, 9, 73, 76, 82, 84, 198
 as a premise in a practical syllogism, 179
 as a rule, 73, 74
 as false, 80, 185, 189, 197
 as self-evident, 181, 185, 194
 characteristic sense, 185–7, 193, 194, 196, 197
 formulations of, 62, 73, 183
 history of, 2, 21, 22, 170, 171, 198
 modern and contemporary views, 143, 191,
 192, 193
Lohr, Charles H., 101
Louis IX, 44
Lucretius, 7
Luscombe, D. E., 19
lying, 38, 39, 71, 78–9
- MacIntyre, Alasdair, 116, 138, 140, 142, 170
Mahoney, Edward P., 169
Mahoney, John, 200, 201
Mäkinen, Virpi, 77
Mangan, Joseph, 191
Mann, William E., 134, 136–8, 140, 141
Marcus, Ruth Barcan, 4, 64
Marenbon, John, 6
Maritain, Jacques, 194
Martorell, Llabrés, 89

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00707-9 - Moral Dilemmas in Medieval Thought: From Gratian to Aquinas

M. V. Dougherty

Index

[More information](#)

224

Index

- Maryks, Robert Aleksander, 202
 Maurer, Armand, 163
 May, William E., 148
 McConnell, Terrance C., 4, 64, 109, 116
 McCool, Gerald A., 170
 McCormick, Richard A., 194
 McDonnell, Kevin, 163
 McNerny, Daniel, 3, 131, 138, 151
 McNerny, Ralph, 149
 Mill, John Stuart, 2, 117
 miracles, 9, 53, 129–30, 139, 158, 170, 171, 172
 Montaigne, Michel de, 172
 moral dilemma
 advice for agents in a, 2, 21–3, 25, 27, 42, 55, 81, 84, 109–10, 128, 155, 157–8, 161, 162, 166, 182, 196, 199
 as contradictory set, 2, 4, 21, 24, 25, 30, 31, 35, 36, 60, 90, 91, 96, 97, 103, 105, 106, 120, 126, 130, 161–2, 164, 173
 definition of, 3–5
 history of theorizing about, 2–3
 innocent agent, 10, 60, 81, 82, 83, 84, 115, 116, 117, 124, 127, 130, 133, 136, 138–9, 140, 141, 144, 145, 146, 153, 158, 166, 178, 188, 190, 196, 198
 medieval vs. present-day views of, 6
 prior-fault, 10, 11, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62–3, 69, 73, 81, 82, 83, 84, 107, 115, 117, 123, 124, 126, 127, 128, 131, 132, 133, 136, 139, 140, 141–2, 143, 145, 162, 169–71, 173, 176, 183, 189, 190, 195–6, 198
 strategies for dealing with a, 9, 89, 170, 171–3, 184, 186, 188
 trilemmas and tetralemmas, 3–4, 24, 97
 moral luck, 107, 108
 moral residue, 63–5, 66
 mortal sin, 37, 38, 39, 54, 57, 59, 61, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 75, 76, 79, 80, 83, 119, 123, 127
 Müller, Sigrid, 169, 174
 Mulligan, Robert W., 152
 Nagel, Thomas, 4, 16, 107
 natural law
 and usury, 72
 conflicts in, 17, 20, 21, 23, 28, 31, 38
 conflicts with conscience, 93, 108, 119, 121
 consistency of, 21, 34
 dispensations from, 20, 21, 32, 33, 39, 40, 164
 first precept of, 147, 149, 186, 196
 Ockham's view of, 163
 superiority over other laws, 19–21
 necessity, principle of extreme, 77, 78
 Noonan, Jr., John T., 13, 72
 Normore, C. G., 166
 Nussbaum, Martha C., 108
 oaths, 1, 2, 16, 22, 25, 26, 29, 30, 35, 36, 38, 39, 40, 61–3, 65, 69, 71–7, 78–9, 128–9, 137, 138, 139, 150
 Oberman, Heiko Augustinus, 165, 167
odium Dei, 163–7, 177–9, 181, 185, 187, 188
 O'Neill, John, 38, 116
 opinions
 endoxa, 201, 202
 foolish, 34, 35, 36, 38, 40, 66, 171, 183, 189, 198
 opiniones probabiles, 202
 Osborne, Jr., Thomas M., 163
 Osborne, Kenan B., 45, 47, 49
 papal authority, 14, 160, 202
 parents, obligation to, 61–3, 74, 83, 159
 Pascal, Blaise, 202
 Pelagius II, 26
 Pelzer, August, 163
 penance, 36, 60, 79, 101, 108
 Pennington, Kenneth, 32
 perjury. *See* oaths
 Perler, Dominik, 189
perplexitas
 as equivocal term, 7–8, 33–4, 51–2, 56, 58, 145, 200
 as medieval equivalent to expression “moral dilemma,” 7
 as standard subject in medieval canon law, 41
 as standard subject in medieval theology, 41–2
 etymology of, 7, 34
perplexitas facti, 56–7
perplexitas in operationibus corporalibus, 58–9
perplexitas in operationibus spiritualibus, 58
perplexitas inevitabilitas peccandi, 51, 52, 55
perplexitas intelligencie faciendorum, 51
perplexitas intelligencie Sacre Scripture, 51
perplexitas iuris, 56
perplexitas secundum quid. *See* moral dilemma, prior-fault
perplexitas simpliciter. *See* moral dilemma, innocent agent
perplexus. *See* *perplexitas*
 Peter Abelard, 19, 38, 86, 99–100, 130
 Peter Auriol, 161, 162, 168, 173
 Peter Lombard, 13, 14, 16, 18, 41, 44, 46, 92, 93, 117, 148, 156, 158, 159, 161, 162, 173, 174, 177
 Peter of Capua, 121

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00707-9 - Moral Dilemmas in Medieval Thought: From Gratian to Aquinas

M. V. Dougherty

Index

[More information](#)

Index

225

- Peter of Poitiers, 121, 188
 Peter of Tarentaise, 158
 Pinckaers, Servais, 168, 200
 Plato, 2, 21, 70, 72
 Porphyry, 44
 Porter, Jean, 33
potentia absoluta, 164, 166–7, 179, 189
potentia ordinata, 164
 Potts, Timothy C., 155, 157
 Power, M. Susan, 194
 prayer
 petitionary, 9, 24, 25, 52, 55, 56, 66, 89, 92, 93,
 94, 97–9, 101, 104, 106, 108, 109–11, 130,
 139, 158, 199
 worship, 54, 106, 153
 Pre-Socratic philosophy, 135, 185
 Principe, Walter Henry, 43, 44, 50
 principle of excluded middle, 162
 Pring-Mill, R. D. F., 101
 probabiliorism, 202
 probabilism, 11, 202
 promises. *See* oaths
 proportionalism, 193, 194–5
 providence, divine, 9, 58, 101, 107, 108,
 110
 Rabelais, François, 172
 Raymond Lull, 9–10, 85–111
 and dictates of conscience, 9, 90–1, 92–3,
 108
 and divine commands, 101–5, 108, 109
 and divine intervention, 9, 55–6, 89, 93–4,
 98, 101, 104, 105, 107, 108, 111, 139, 158,
 170, 171, 199
 and moral luck, 107–8
 and petitionary prayer, 9, 89, 92, 93, 94,
 97–9, 101, 104, 106, 108, 109–11, 139, 158,
 199
 and principle of lesser evil, 104
 apologetic aims, 9, 86, 94, 95, 101–3,
 106
 authorship of *Vita coetanea*, 86–8
 contrasted with Bonaventure, 158
 contrasted with Thomas Aquinas, 130, 139,
 171
 encounter with Saracen slave, 94–101, 107,
 108
 the *Art*, 86, 101–4, 105, 106
 Raymond of Peñafort, 56, 94, 123, 125,
 182–3
 Reboiras, Fernando Domínguez, 88
 restitution, 131–2, 192
 Ribaillier, Jean, 43, 44
 Richard of Middleton, 158–9, 190
 Richard Rufus, 48
 Robert Grosseteste, 47
 Robert Holcot, 166
 Roger Bacon, 46, 47, 48, 50
 Roger Roseth, 167
 Rosemann, Philipp W., 163
 Rufinus, 38
 sacrilege, 59, 61, 91, 92, 127
 Santurri, Edmund N., 3, 4, 104, 116, 133–4,
 140–1, 142
 scandal, 30, 45, 57, 59, 60–1, 66–70, 76, 125
 Schenk, Richard, 42, 82, 118
 Schüssler, Rudolf, 200
 secrets, 1, 29, 38, 66–7, 78–9
 self-evident propositions, 10, 147–53, 167, 180–1,
 184–6, 194–5, 196
 sex
 adultery, 1, 29, 36, 78, 79, 128–9, 164, 192
 fornication, 59, 60, 68–9, 75, 81, 119–20, 123,
 132, 144–5, 151–2, 160, 192
 marital, 37, 38, 40, 65–6, 74–5
 Shanley, Brian, 155, 170
 Shogimen, Takashi, 119
 simony, 29, 30, 31, 36, 59–61, 62, 69, 70, 74, 82,
 83, 139, 142
 Sinnott-Armstrong, Walter, 3, 116
 Smith, Lesley, 17
 St. Pierre, Jules A., 43
 Statman, Daniel, 3, 5
 stealing. *See* theft
 Stephen of Provins, 45
 Stone, M. W. F., 200
 Suárez, Francisco, 162, 164–5, 179
 suicide, 98, 100, 101, 107, 129, 130, 195
Summa antiquitate et tempore, 18
Summa Halesiana, 9, 42, 48–50, 51–2, 55–63,
 66–7, 69–75, 78–84
 and principle of lesser evil, 83, 171, 187
 appeal to Gregory the Great, 55, 57, 69–70,
 71–2, 79, 83, 84
 dependence on *Summa aurea*, 51
 disputed authorship of, 45–6, 48–50
 on corporeal vs. spiritual perplexity, 42, 58–9,
 118, 199
 on setting aside a judgment of conscience, 55,
 93, 121, 158
 on three senses of *perplexitas*, 51–2
Summa Parisiensis, 18
 swearing. *See* oaths
 syllogism
 practical, 122, 151–5, 167, 179
 theoretical, 135–6
 Symon of Alteis, 45
 synderesis, 10, 122, 147–54, 167, 179, 181, 184,
 185

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00707-9 - Moral Dilemmas in Medieval Thought: From Gratian to Aquinas

M. V. Dougherty

Index

[More information](#)

226

Index

- theft, 1, 75, 76, 100, 119, 120, 160, 164, 175, 192
 Thomas À Kempis, 22
 Thomas Aquinas, 10–11, 43, 112–46, 147–55, 167, 168, 175–6
 and principle of lesser evil, 191–2, 196–7
 and the Divine Command Principle, 147–55
 as interpreted by Alan Donagan, 115–17, 132–6
 denies existence of perplexity *simpliciter*, 138–9, 145
 on setting aside a judgment of conscience, 120–2, 155
 question of irresolvable prior-fault moral dilemmas, 142–3, 169–70, 195–7
 status of *Quodlibet XII*, 112–14, 144–5
 Thomas de Vio. *See* Cajetan
 Thomas Le Myésier, 87, 95, 100
 Thomas of Strasbourg, 162
 Thomism
 and irresolvable prior-fault moral dilemmas, 11, 171, 173, 176, 195–6
 and principle of lesser evil, 173, 191–5
 as a philosophical and theological system, 11, 104, 145, 154–5, 168, 170, 173
 Thompson, John L., 30
 Torrell, Jean-Pierre, 114, 134, 139
 Toulmin, Stephen, 202
 Tugwell, Simon, 112
 Tuninetti, Luca, 147

 Urban, Linwood, 166
 usury, 72–5, 76, 77, 82
 utilitarianism, 63, 117

 Van de Wiel, Constant, 18
 Vecchio, Silvana, 51
 Vega, Amador, 85, 88, 100
 venial sin, 37, 38, 39, 79, 80, 83
 virtue
 as a mean, 22
 as protection from moral dilemmas, 62
 development of, 6, 28

 von Wright, Georg Henrik, 116
 vows. *See* oaths

 Wadding, Luke, 103
 Walter of Bruges, 159
 Walter of Château-Thierry, 120
 Wass, Meldon C., 49, 50
 Weber, Hubert Philipp, 46, 47
 Weigand, Rudolf, 31
 Weisheipl, James A., 114
 Westberg, Daniel, 151
 White, Kevin, 112, 174
 will
 and conformity to law, 201
 and conscience, 119
 and evil, 186
 and goodness, 174–5, 184
 freedom of, 6, 119, 144, 145, 201
 Lombard's discussion of, 92, 174
 William of Auxerre, 9, 42, 43–5, 50–4, 58–69, 70–8, 80–4
 and moral residue arguments, 63–6
 and principle of lesser evil, 73–4, 75, 82, 83, 171, 187
 appeal to Gregory the Great, 52–3, 84
 life, 43–5
 on corporeal vs. spiritual perplexity, 42, 58–9, 118, 199
 on setting aside a judgment of conscience, 54, 93, 121, 158
 on three senses of *perplexitas*, 51–2
 William of Militona, 49
 William of Ockham, 163–7, 179
 Williams, Bernard, 3, 64, 107
 Winroth, Anders, 16–17
 Wippel, John F., 112
 Wood, Rega, 166

 Xenophon, 70

 Zimmerman, Michael J., 116
 Zimmermann, Reinhard, 8