

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-107-00693-5 — Examining Critical Perspectives on Human Rights

Edited by Rob Dickinson , Elena Katselli , Colin Murray , Ole W. Pedersen

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

EXAMINING CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON HUMAN RIGHTS

Examining Critical Perspectives on Human Rights sets out a practical and theoretical overview of the future of human rights within the United Kingdom and beyond at this key juncture in the human rights project. A number of internationally renowned scholars respond to David Kennedy's contribution 'The International Human Rights Movement: Still Part of the Problem?' from a range of different perspectives. With its combination of the theory and practice of international and domestic human rights, this collection is of relevance to all scholars and practitioners with an interest in human rights.

ROB DICKINSON, ELENA KATSELLI, COLIN MURRAY and OLE W. PEDERSEN are lecturers at Newcastle Law School.

EXAMINING CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES ON HUMAN RIGHTS

Edited by

ROB DICKINSON, ELENA KATSELLI,
COLIN MURRAY and OLE W. PEDERSEN



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-107-00693-5 — Examining Critical Perspectives on Human Rights

Edited by Rob Dickinson, Elena Katselli, Colin Murray, Ole W. Pedersen

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107006935

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

First paperback edition 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Examining critical perspectives on human rights / [edited by]

Robert Dickinson. . . [et al.].

p. cm.

ISBN 978-1-107-00693-5 (Hardback)

1. Human rights. 2. Human rights—Great Britain. I. Dickinson, Robert, 1952–
K3240.E964 2012
341.4'8—dc23
2011029385

ISBN 978-1-107-00693-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-47104-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

Notes on contributors vii
Acknowledgements x

PART I Introduction 1

1 Examining critical perspectives on human rights: an introduction 3
 OLE W. PEDERSEN & C. R. G. MURRAY

2 The international human rights regime: still part of the problem? 19
 DAVID KENNEDY

PART II Domestic human rights perspectives 35

3 What is the point of human rights law? 37
 K. D. EWING

4 If you cannot change the rules of the game, adapt to them: United Kingdom responses to the restrictions set by Article 3 ECHR on ‘national security’ deportations 61
 DAVID BONNER

5 The right to security – securing rights or securitising rights? 87
 LIORA LAZARUS

6 Of fortresses and caltrops: national security and competing models of rights protection 107
 C. R. G. MURRAY

vi	CONTENTS
	PART III International human rights law perspectives 129
7	The rule of law and the role of human rights in contemporary international law 131
	ELENA KATSELLI
8	The construction of the constitutional essentials of democratic politics by the European Court of Human Rights following <i>Sejdić and Finci</i> 153
	STEVEN WHEATLEY
9	Universal human rights: a challenge too far 175
	ROB DICKINSON
	PART IV Theoretical perspectives on human rights 191
10	The reality and hyper-reality of human rights: public consciousness and the mass media 193
	ERIC HEINZE
11	Human rights and the struggle for change: a study in self-critical legal thought 217
	CHRISTINE BELL
12	Lawfare and the international human rights movement 247
	RICHARD MULLENDER
	<i>Index</i> 279

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

PROFESSOR CHRISTINE BELL Christine Bell holds a Chair in Constitutional Law at the University of Edinburgh, was formerly Director of the Transitional Justice Institute at the University of Ulster and was a founder member of the Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission, established under the 1998 Belfast Agreement. Her research focuses on the role of human rights in transitional societies and her writings have been awarded the American Society of International Law's Francis Deake Prize, and include the influential *On the Law of Peace: Peace Agreements and the Lex Pacificatoria* (2008) awarded the Hart Socio-legal Book Prize.

PROFESSOR DAVID BONNER David Bonner has taught at the University of Leicester since 1974 and was appointed to a Chair in 2004. A renowned authority on civil liberties, human rights and counter-terrorism law, with publications covering conflicts from the Northern Ireland 'troubles' to the 'war on terror', his latest monograph, *Executive Measures, Terrorism and National Security* (2007) provides a detailed and well received contribution to the security debate.

DR ROB DICKINSON Robert Dickinson was appointed to a lectureship in Newcastle Law School in 2008 following the successful completion of his Ph.D. thesis, 'Self-Determination, Minority Rights and Oppression: A Chinese-Tibetan Perspective'. He is currently engaged in research focusing on self-determination and human rights arising out of this study.

PROFESSOR KEITH EWING Keith Ewing, Professor of Public Law at King's College London, is an academic working in the fields of public law and labour law. At the forefront of the bill of rights debate within the United Kingdom, his writings include his recent *Bonfire of the Liberties: New Labour, Human Rights and the Rule of Law* (2010), examining New Labour's assault on civil liberties.

PROFESSOR ERIC HEINZE Eric Heinze has been a member of the Queen Mary School of Law, University of London, since 1995, with his research focusing on human rights and legal theory. His research has centred on the theoretical underpinnings of the human rights project, including his trio of monographs *The Logic of Liberal Rights* (2003), *The Logic of Equality* (2003) and *The Logic of Constitutional Rights* (2005).

DR ELENA KATSELLI PROUKAKI Elena Katselli was appointed a lecturer in Newcastle Law School in 2005 and her research focuses (among other things) on international human rights law. Her writings include *The Problem of Enforcement in International Law: Countermeasures, the Non-Injured State and the Idea of International Community* (2009).

PROFESSOR DAVID KENNEDY David Kennedy returned to Harvard Law School in the autumn of 2009 to lead its new Institute for Global Law and Policy. He is acknowledged to be one of the leading figures in the Critical Legal Studies movement and is the author of *The Dark Sides of Virtue: Reassessing International Humanitarianism* (2004).

DR LIORA LAZARUS Liora Lazarus, Lecturer in Human Rights Law at the University of Oxford, is an established authority upon prisoners' rights, with works including *Contrasting Prisoners' Rights* (2004). Alongside her academic work, she has written public reports on aspects of human rights for the UK Ministry of Justice and the European Parliament. Her current research focuses on how the law shapes notions of security, and will culminate in the book *Juridifying Security*.

MR RICHARD MULLENDER Richard Mullender is a Reader in Law at Newcastle Law School. He has written a number of essays on human rights, including 'Hate Speech and Pornography in Canada: a Qualified Deontological Response to a Consequentialist Argument' (2007) 20 *Canadian Journal of Law and Jurisprudence* 241, 'Hegel, Human Rights, and Particularism' (2003) 30 *Journal of Law & Society* 554, and 'Tort Law, Human Rights, and Common Law Culture' (2003) 23 *Oxford Journal of Legal Studies* 301. He is also a contributor to *Religion and Human Rights* (2010) and to the forthcoming interdisciplinary *Handbook of Human Rights*.

MR COLIN MURRAY Colin Murray was appointed to a lectureship in Newcastle Law School in 2007. His current research is focused on the fields of national security law, legal history and public law with articles

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

ix

including 'In the Shadow of Lord Haw-Haw: Guantánamo Bay, Diplomatic Protection and Allegiance' [2011] *Public Law* 115.

DR OLE W. PEDERSEN Appointed to a lectureship in Newcastle Law School in 2008, Dr Pedersen's research focuses on issues of climate change and human rights. He has rapidly established a reputation as an authority on the relationship between human rights and environmental rights, with articles including 'European Environmental Human Rights and Environmental Rights: A Long Time Coming?' (2008) 21 *Georgetown International Environmental Law Review* 73.

PROFESSOR STEVEN WHEATLEY Steven Wheatley is Professor of International Law in the Law School at the University of Leeds. His research is focused on the relevance of democratic legitimacy for the exercise of political authority through law. A particular interest is the position of indigenous peoples and minorities, whose status as democratic minorities undermines arguments for any majority-rule based concept of democracy. Steven has published numerous articles in this area and is the author of *The Democratic Legitimacy of International Law, Studies In International Law* (2010) and *Democracy, Minorities and International Law* (Cambridge, 2005). He is a member of the Minority Rights Group (International) Expert Panel on Minorities Litigation and of the International Law Association International Research Committee on Indigenous Peoples.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This collection of papers is the outcome of a seminar series titled ‘Human Rights in Retreat’ which took place in November and December 2009 at Newcastle Law School and a symposium in January 2010 also hosted at Newcastle Law School titled ‘Human Rights – Drop of Liberation or Fig Leaf of Legitimation?’, both taking place during Colin Murray’s tenure as Director of the Newcastle Human Rights Research Group. The symposium was generously supported by a grant from the *Modern Law Review* Seminar Fund, without which it is unlikely that the event would have been such a success. The willing engagement of the attendees and speakers at all of these events helped to make them very fruitful fora for the exchange of ideas. Each section of this collection has been edited by one of the team of editors, with Ole Pedersen assuming responsibility for the introduction, Colin Murray overseeing the ‘Domestic Perspectives’ section and Elena Katselli and Rob Dickinson handling the ‘International Law Perspectives’ and ‘Theoretical Perspectives’ sections respectively.

In addition, the editors wish to acknowledge the helpful assistance received from academic colleagues at Newcastle Law School in running the seminar series and the symposium. In particular the hard work and advice of Richard Mullender is gratefully acknowledged, as well as the assistance of Professors Ian Ward and Rhona Smith (Northumbria University) in taking the time to chair symposium panels. A special ‘thank you’ is reserved for Samantha Ryan, who in her time at Newcastle Law School played an important role in the Human Rights Research Group and provided much of the initial impetus behind this project. None of the above events would have run smoothly without the dedicated assistance of the administrative staff of Newcastle Law School, particularly Suzanne Johnson and Gemma Hayton who oversaw the project budget and arranged all room bookings.

Finally, this project has benefited from the dedicated guidance of Nienke van Schaverbeke. We would like to express our warm appreciation

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

xi

to her and to all the team from Cambridge University Press, in particular Richard Woodham, for supporting this project from its inception and despite any delays and setbacks that followed, and especially for undertaking the task of indexing the collection.

The Editors