

THE WTO REGIME ON GOVERNMENT PROCUREMENT: CHALLENGE AND REFORM

Originally an important but relatively obscure plurilateral instrument, the WTO Agreement on Government Procurement (GPA) is now becoming a pillar of the WTO system as a result of important developments since the Uruguay Round. This collection examines the issues and challenges that this raises for the GPA, as well as future prospects for addressing government procurement at a multilateral level.

Coverage includes:

- Issues relating to pending accessions to the GPA, particularly those of developing countries with a large state sector such as China.
- The revised (provisionally agreed) GPA text of 2006, including provisions on electronic procurement and special and differential treatment for developing countries.
- Procurement provisions in regional trade agreements and their significance for the multilateral system.

Attention is also given to emerging issues, especially those concerning environmental, social and SME policy; competition law; and the implications of the recent economic crisis.

SUE ARROWSMITH is Achilles Professor of Public Procurement Law and Policy and Director of the Public Procurement Research Group at the University of Nottingham School of Law.

ROBERT D. ANDERSON is Counsellor and Team Leader for Government Procurement in the Secretariat of the World Trade Organization, and Special Professor in the School of Law at the University of Norttingham.



THE WTO REGIME ON GOVERNMENT PROCUREMENT: CHALLENGE AND REFORM

Edited by
SUE ARROWSMITH
ROBERT D. ANDERSON





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107006645

© World Trade Organization 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The WTO regime on government procurement: challenge and reform / edited by

Sue Arrowsmith, Robert D. Anderson.

p. cm. Includes index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00664-5 (hardback)

1. Government purchasing. 2. Government purchasing – Law and legislation.

3. Foreign trade regulation. I. Arrowsmith, Sue, 1962— II. Anderson, Robert D. JF1525.P85W863 2011

352.5′3 – dc22 2011000637

ISBN 978-1-107-00664-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List of contributors page ix
Foreword by Pascal Lamy xxv
Perspective of the Chairman of the WTO Committee
on Government Procurement, Nicholas Niggli
(Switzerland) xxix
Preface xxxiii
Disclaimer xxxvi

PART I The WTO regime on government procurement 1

1 The WTO regime on government procurement: past, present and future 3

ROBERT D. ANDERSON AND SUE ARROWSMITH

PART II Expanding the scope of the Agreement on Government Procurement: accession and coverage 59

2 Forging a more global procurement market: issues concerning accessions to the Agreement on Government

Procurement 61

ROBERT D. ANDERSON AND KODJO OSEI-LAH

3 Accession to the Agreement on Government Procurement: the case of China 92

PING WANG

4 India's possible accession to the Agreement on Government Procurement: what are the pros and cons? 117

S. CHAKRAVARTHY AND KAMALA DAWAR

V



vi CONTENTS

5 The benefits for developing countries of accession to the Agreement on Government Procurement: the case of Chinese Taipei 140

CHANG-FA LO

6 The coverage negotiations under the Agreement on Government Procurement: context, mandate, process and prospects 149

ROBERT D. ANDERSON AND KODJO OSEI-LAH

- 7 Canada's sub-central government entities and the Agreement on Government Procurement: past and present 175

 DAVID COLLINS
- 8 The procurement of state trading enterprises under the WTO Agreements: a proposal for a way forward 197
 PING WANG
- 9 Addressing purchasing arrangements between public sector entities: what can the WTO learn from the EU's experience? 252

 PING WANG, ROBERTO CAVALLO PERIN AND DARIO CASALINI

PART III Revision of the procedural rules and other transparency provisions of the Agreement on Government Procurement 283

10 The Revised Agreement on Government Procurement: changes to the procedural rules and other transparency provisions 285

SUE ARROWSMITH

PART IV Developing countries in the WTO procurement regime 337

- 11 Special and differential treatment and other special measures for developing countries under the Agreement on Government Procurement: the current text and new provisions 339
- 12 Building sustainable capacity in public procurement 377
 PETER TREPTE



CONTENTS vii

13 Untying aid through the Agreement on Government Procurement: a means to encourage developing countries' accession to the Agreement and to improve aid effectiveness? 390

ANNAMARIA LA CHIMIA

PART V Economic and social development (horizontal policies) in government procurement 427

14 The national treatment and exceptions provisions of the Agreement on Government Procurement and the pursuit of horizontal policies 429

ARWEL DAVIES

15 The limited case for permitting SME procurement preferences in the Agreement on Government Procurement 444

JOHN LINARELLI

Social policies in procurement and the Agreement on Government Procurement: a perspective from South Africa 459

PHOEBE BOLTON AND GEO QUINOT

PART VI Enforcement and remedies 481

 17 Constructing a system of challenge procedures to comply with the Agreement on Government Procurement 483

XINGLIN ZHANG

18 Designing effective challenge procedures: the EU's experience with remedies 511

HANS-JOACHIM PRIESS AND PASCAL FRITON

19 The design and operation of a bid challenge mechanism: the experience of Hong Kong, China 532

HENRY GAO



viii

CONTENTS

PART VII Multilateralism and regionalism 559

20 Government procurement provisions in regional trade agreements: a stepping stone to GPA accession? 561

ROBERT D. ANDERSON, ANNA CAROLINE MÜLLER, KODJO OSEI-LAH, JOSEFITA PARDO DE LEÓN AND PHILIPPE PELLETIER

21 A case study of regionalism: the EC–CARIFORUM Economic Partnership 657

KAMALA DAWAR AND SIMON EVENETT

PART VIII Challenges and new directions 679

22 Ensuring integrity and competition in public procurement markets: a dual challenge for good governance 681

ROBERT D. ANDERSON, WILLIAM E. KOVACIC AND ANNA CAROLINE MÜLLER

23 Developing multilateral rules on government procurement: the value of soft law 719

LILI IIANG

24 Work of UNCITRAL on government procurement: purpose, objectives and complementarity with the work of the WTO 746

CAROLINE NICHOLAS

25 Global procurement law in times of crisis: new Buy American policies and options in the WTO legal system
 773
 JOHN LINARELLI

26 Procurement in times of crisis: lessons from US government procurement in three episodes of 'crisis' in the twenty-first century 803

IOSHUA I. SCHWARTZ

Index 830



CONTRIBUTORS

MR ROBERT D. ANDERSON is Counsellor in the Intellectual Property Division of the Secretariat of the World Trade Organization (WTO) in Geneva, Switzerland, where he heads the Secretariat team supporting the work of the WTO Committee on Government Procurement and the renegotiation of the plurilateral Agreement on Government Procurement. He also has advisory responsibilities regarding international competition policy issues. He travels extensively to the developing regions of the world to present technical assistance workshops and seminars on government procurement and competition policy. Prior to joining the WTO in 1997, Robert held various positions in the Canadian Competition Bureau where he gained experience in: (i) competition policy advocacy and legislative reform; (ii) competition law enforcement and case analysis; and (iii) international dimensions of competition law and policy. Earlier in his career, he worked at the Economic Council of Canada and the Saskatchewan Department of Finance.

In addition to being co-editor of this volume with Professor Sue Arrowsmith, Robert is co-editor (with Professor Nancy Gallini of the University of British Columbia) of Competition Policy and Intellectual Property Rights in the Knowledge-based Economy (Industry Canada Research Series, 1998). He is the author/co-author of articles published in the Journal of International Economic Law, the Public Procurement Law Review, the Antitrust Law Journal, the Swiss Review of International Economic Relations ('Aussenwirtschaft') and the Canadian Competition Record, in addition to chapters in numerous edited volumes. He holds degrees in economics and law from the University of British Columbia and Osgoode Hall Law School, respectively. He is a Special Professor in the School of Law of the University of Nottingham, is also on the part-time faculty of the World Trade Institute in Berne, Switzerland and has acted as a guest speaker in post-graduate programmes of the George Washington University in Washington, DC.



x

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-00664-5 - The WTO Regime on Government Procurement: Challenge and Reform Edited by Sue Arrowsmith and Robert D. Anderson Frontmatter More information

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

PROFESSOR SUE ARROWSMITH is Achilles Professor of Public Procurement Law and Policy and Director of the Public Procurement Research Group (PPRG) in the School of Law, University of Nottingham, where she is also Director of the innovative new Executive Programme in Public Procurement Law and Policy (LL M/Diploma/Certificate).

Her numerous publications on procurement have been extensively cited by courts and in legislative texts in North America, Asia and Africa, as well as throughout Europe. Her recent authored books include *The Law of Public and Utilities Procurement* (2nd edn 2005); (with Linarelli and Wallace) *Regulating Public Procurement: National and International Perspectives* (2000); and *Government Procurement in the WTO* (2003). She is also co-editor and co-author of *Social and Environmental Policies in EC Procurement: New Directives and New Directions* (Cambridge University Press, 2009) and *Public Procurement Regulation in the 21st Century: Reform of the UNCITRAL Model Law on Procurement* (2009). In 1992 she launched the first international academic journal on public procurement, *Public Procurement Law Review*, which she still edits, and also launched the conferences 'Public Procurement: Global Revolution' back in 1996.

She has been involved in procurement law reform for many years as a member (since 1997) of the European Commission's Advisory Committee for the Opening Up of Public Procurement; as a member of the UNCITRAL Experts Group on Procurement; and as a consultant and trainer for many bodies, including the UK Office of Government Commerce, WTO, European Commission, OECD, EU, European Central Bank, ILO and the Law Commission of England and Wales. She is Project Leader of the European Commission-funded Asia Link project for developing a global academic network on public procurement regulation as well as of the global Procurement Law Academic Network (PLAN) launched under the auspices of that project.

In 2007 she was awarded the CIPS Swinbank Medal for her contribution to thought innovation in purchasing and supply.

PROFESSOR PHOEBE BOLTON is Professor of Law at Stellenbosch University, South Africa and the author of a number of publications in the area of government contracts, supply chain management and government procurement. She is, moreover, the author of *The Law of Government Procurement in South Africa* (2007). The book is the first comprehensive and structured analysis of the law on government contracts and government



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

хi

procurement in South Africa and the only major African legal text on procurement regulation.

Phoebe's work has been cited in international and local books and articles as well as court decisions in South Africa. She is the recipient of numerous academic awards, including the CODESRIA prize for the best doctoral thesis produced in Africa in 2006, the Andrew Mellon Foundation Fellowship, the Abe Bailey Travel Bursary, the DAAD in-country Scholarship and the DAAD Scholarship for Young Academics and Scientists. Funding from the National Research Foundation is currently enabling her to continue her research in the area of public procurement regulation. A British Academy Grant further funds a project in collaboration with the PPRG at the University of Nottingham to raise the academic profile of public procurement regulation in Africa.

Phoebe regularly gives legal opinions to government departments and private sector bidders and frequently presents papers on different aspects of government contracts, procurement and supply chain management.

DR DARIO CASALINI is Assistant Professor of Public Law at the Faculty of Economics, University of Turin (Italy), where he teaches public law for economists and EU public procurement law. He is a lawyer at the Bar of Turin and was visiting researcher at King's College London in 2008–9.

He has taken part in several research projects focused on European public procurement law and has published various articles on the issues arising in the national implementation of EU procurement law, including a book on the notion of body governed by public law and in-house provision (*L'organismo di diritto pubblico e l'organizzazione in house*, 2003). He has presented papers at international conferences and his research interests lie in the area of public and administrative law, public procurement, public utilities, national health services, public service and public ownership across European national legal systems.

PROFESSOR ROBERTO CAVALLO PERIN is Full Professor of Administrative Law at the Faculty of Political Sciences, University of Turin (Italy) and a lawyer at the Bar of Turin, as well as former Deputy Director of the University of Turin.

He has been leading several research projects mainly regarding public services, local authorities, public procurement law and civil servants' ethics. His recent authored books include *Al servizio della Nazione. Etica e statuto dei funzionari pubblici* (2009) and *Commentario breve al testo*



xii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

unico sulle autonomie locali (2006). He has presented conference papers at various conferences and has taught university modules on public contracts law, public service, judicial review and local authorities' autonomy in several universities across Italy.

He is Deputy General Editor of the leading Italian review on administrative law, *Diritto amministrativo*, a member of the editorial board of *Diritto processuale amministrativo* and was among the promoters of the establishment, in 2010, of the worldwide network IUS PUBLICUM among the leading reviews of public and administrative law. He has nearly twenty years' experience of advising on public procurement law and between 2001 and 2006 he was a member of the Committee for the High Surveillance and Guarantee for the Winter Olympic Games of Turin. He is a member of the Italian Association of Administrative Law Professors, of the Italian Association of Administrative Procedure Law Professors and of the Italian Association of City Planning Law.

DR S. CHAKRAVARTHY is a civil servant by profession, being a member of the Indian Administrative Service. He has a masters degree in mathematics and statistics. After joining the government, he obtained a doctorate degree in management from the Indian Institute of Technology, Delhi. Subsequently he secured a law degree from Delhi University. In addition, he has certificates in public administration and public enterprises from the University of Manchester, UK and Harvard University, USA. His experience as a civil servant in India over four decades (1961–2002) has been essentially in the areas of industries, commerce, management of state-owned enterprises, corporate law implementation and competition law enforcement. Competition policy, industrial development and export promotion have been central to his specialization. Competition law enforcement and management, international trade and dealing with WTO issues with a strong emphasis on consumer and public interest have been his focus area in the past decade. Among the top assignments he has held are Special Chief Secretary to Government and member of the Monopolies and Restrictive Trade Practices Commission. As a member of the Company Law Board and of the Monopolies and Restrictive Trade Practices Commission, he has around ten years' experience as adjudicator. Presently, he is an advisor/consultant on competition policy and law.

He was a member of the High Level Committee on Competition Policy and Law, appointed by the Government of India, and also a member of



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xiii

the Drafting Committee of the Indian Competition Law, 2002. He has toured extensively, having visited more than thirty countries throughout the world and, in particular, Asia, Africa and Europe, participating in competition policy and law conferences.

His publications and contributions at conferences are in the areas of the interface between trade policies and competition policy, IPRs and competition law, mergers and amalgamations, cartels, etc. He is a Consultant to the World Bank, African Development Bank and the Competition Commission of India.

MR DAVID COLLINS is a senior lecturer at the City Law School of City University London where he teaches contracts, international economic law, world trade law and international investment law. David previously practised commercial litigation in Toronto, Canada and was a prosecutor for the Attorney General of Ontario. He is a fellow of the Institute for Globalization and International Regulation at Maastricht University and a current development editor for the *Manchester Journal of International Economic Law*. David has been a visiting fellow of the Institute of International Economic Law of Georgetown University and of the World Trade Institute of the University of Berne, a visiting scholar at the University of Sydney and a visiting professor at the ESADE Law School in Barcelona. A qualified lawyer in England, Ontario and New York, he has also been a consultant for several leading Canadian law firms and for the World Bank. David holds a BA and a JD from the University of Toronto and an MSc and a BCL from the University of Oxford.

DR ARWEL DAVIES is Senior Lecturer in Law at Swansea University School of Law.

KAMALA DAWAR is a policy analyst and lecturer in international trade law and development policy. She undertakes research and training on international trade and development-related issues for intergovernmental institutions including the WTO, World Bank, ITC-ILO, UNCTAD, OSCE, the European Commission and public interest organizations such as Consumers International and GTZ. She has published several articles in the area of competition, government procurement, consumer policy and international development. She holds advanced degrees from the London School of Economics and the University of Amsterdam School of Law in governance and in international and European trade law.



xiv

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

PROFESSOR SIMON EVENETT is Professor in the Department of Economics, at the University of St Gallen.

MR PASCAL FRITON is an associate of the international law firm Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer LLP and works in the firm's Berlin office. He specializes in public procurement law as well as trade law. He joined Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer in 2008. Pascal completed his legal education at the Humboldt University of Berlin, Germany, and holds a master of laws degree (LLM) from the University of Durham, UK.

He has recently published on several public procurement topics, in particular on issues regarding the criteria for qualitative selection, especially the concept of self-cleaning (e.g. together with Sue Arrowsmith and Hans-Joachim Priess, 'Self-cleaning as a Defence to Exclusions for Misconduct: An Emerging Concept in EC Public Procurement Law?', *Public Procurement Law Review*, 18 (2009), 257).

PROFESSOR HENRY GAO is a tenured law professor at Singapore Management University, and an associate of the Centre for International Law at the National University of Singapore. With law degrees from three continents, he started his career as the first Chinese lawyer at the WTO Secretariat. Before moving to Singapore in late 2007, he taught law at Hong Kong University, where he was also the Deputy Director of the East Asian International Economic Law and Policy Programme.

A leading scholar on China and the WTO, Henry is the editor of *China's Participation in the WTO* (2005) and has published many articles in prestigious international journals, including the *Journal of International Economic Law* and the *Journal of World Trade*.

A frequent adviser to Asian governments, Henry has also been a consultant to the WTO, World Bank, Asian Development Bank and APEC. As the Academic Coordinator to the first Asia–Pacific Regional Trade Policy Course officially sponsored by the WTO, he helped the WTO to establish this flagship training programme in the region and has also been instrumental in building similar training programmes in China, Singapore and Thailand. In 2009, when the WTO established the WTO Chairs Programme to promote research, teaching and training activities on WTO issues in leading universities around the world, Henry was invited to join the international Advisory Board. Among the twenty-plus distinguished members of the Board, Henry is the only non-governmental representative from Asia. Henry is the first Asian faculty member on the Master in International Economic Law and Policy (IELPO) programme



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

XV

in Barcelona, and the only Chinese faculty member at the Academy of International Trade and Investment Law in Macau. His current research focuses on the interaction between China's trade policy and WTO rules, as well as WTO dispute settlement, trade in services and free trade agreements.

DR LILI JIANG is a visiting scholar at the Public Procurement Research Group, School of Law, University of Nottingham.

MR WILLIAM E. KOVACIC has served on the Federal Trade Commission since January 2006, and served as Chairman from March 2008 until March 2009. He has also served, since January 2009 as Vice-Chair for Outreach of the International Competition Network. Before he became a Commissioner, William was the FTC's General Counsel from 2001 through 2004, and also worked for the Commission from 1979 until 1983, initially in the Bureau of Competition's Planning Office and later as an attorney adviser to former Commissioner George W. Douglas.

William was the E. K. Gubin Professor of Government Contracts Law at George Washington University Law School, where he began teaching in 1999. He had taught at the George Mason University School of Law since 1986, after practising antitrust and government contracts law for three years at Bryan Cave's Washington, DC, office. Earlier in his career, he spent one year on the majority staff of the US Senate Judiciary Committee's Antitrust and Monopoly Subcommittee.

Beginning in 1992, William was an adviser on antitrust and consumer protection issues to the governments of Armenia, Benin, Egypt, El Salvador, Georgia, Guyana, Indonesia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia, Morocco, Nepal, Panama, Russia, Ukraine, Vietnam and Zimbabwe.

He received a bachelor degree from Princeton University in 1974 and a law degree from Columbia University in 1978.

DR ANNAMARIA LA CHIMIA read law at the University of Rome 'La Sapienza' in Italy and then moved to England for her graduate studies. She obtained an LL M (in international commercial law) and a Ph.D. at the University of Nottingham, School of Law. She has been a lecturer in law at the School of Law of the University of Nottingham since September 2006. She is Head (and founder) of the Humanitarian and Development Procurement Unit of the Public Procurement Research Group (PPRG). She is also a visiting professor at the Law School, University LUISS Guido Carli di Roma for the academic year 2009–10 (spring semester). Since



xvi

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

June 2004 Annamaria has also taught on the masters degree programme on human development and food security at the Universita' degli Studi di Roma Tre.

Prior to joining the School of Law, she worked as a lawyer in Italy where she qualified as a barrister and solicitor in 2002 and became member of the Italian bar. She has acted as expert adviser to the European Commission (DG Trade and DG Development) and has collaborated as consultant with the NGO ActionAid and the Commonwealth Secretariat. She has also participated in a SIGMA project on the review of the Romanian domestic public procurement legislation.

Her main research interests lie in the area of international development, international trade law and European law (especially external relations, public procurement and internal market).

She has recently been awarded a research grant by the British Academy to carry out a research project on 'food aid on both sides of the Atlantic: a comparative study of EU and US food aid projects'.

She has published extensively in international and European law reviews, and in edited collections. She is currently writing a book that will be published in 2011.

PROFESSOR JOHN LINARELLI is Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law at the University of La Verne College of Law, in Ontario, California, USA, where he has been on the faculty since 2002. He previously held full-time appointments as Senior Lecturer in Law at the University of East Anglia Law School and Lecturer in Law at the University of Wales Aberystwyth. He practised public procurement law in the United States for a number of years in several Washington, DC law firms, including Dickstein Shapiro LLP and Spriggs & Hollingsworth. He has served as Director of Procurement Programmes for the International Law Institute and as an adviser to various international organizations. While in practice, John taught US government contracts law at the Catholic University of America Columbus School of Law and international procurement courses at Georgetown University Law Center. He has written extensively on international economic law, law and globalization, and legal issues affecting developing states. He served as co-chair on the symposium, 'What Makes States Successful, Afghanistan and the Future of State Building', held in April 2010, which received widespread global attention with its focus on developing practical strategies for assisting states transitioning from conflict. He is co-author, with Professors Sue Arrowsmith and Don Wallace Ir of Regulating Public Procurement: National and International



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xvii

Perspectives (2000). He was lead author on Small and Medium Size Enterprises and Export-Led Growth: Are There Roles for Public Procurement Programmes? (1999). He is on the editorial board of the Public Procurement Law Review. His recent work focuses on bringing theories of global justice in contact with international economic law. He is co-editing, with Frank Garcia and Chi Carmody, Global Justice and International Economic Law: Opportunities and Challenges, to be published by Cambridge University Press.

PROFESSOR CHANG-FA LO is Chair Professor and Lifetime Distinguished Professor at National Taiwan University. He is also the Director of the Asian Center for WTO and International Health Law and Policy of the NTU College of Law. In his capacity as the Director, he launched two English journals: Asian Journal of WTO and International Health Law and Policy and Contemporary Asia Arbitration Journal in 2006 and 2008 respectively; the former has been included in the SSCI list. He was the Dean of the College and was the Director of the Center for Ethics, Law and Society in Biomedicine and Technology at NTU. He received his SJD from Harvard University Law School. He has served as a commissioner at the Fair Trade Commission, which is in charge of the competition law in Chinese Taipei; as a commissioner at the International Trade Commission, which is responsible for the decision of the injury aspect of antidumping measures; and also as a legal adviser to the government of Chinese Taipei for the GATT/WTO accession negotiations.

He was appointed as National Chair Professor by the Ministry of Education for three years and has received other important academic awards. He was a visiting professor at Tokyo University Faculty of Law. He was appointed in 2006 by the Director General of the WTO for a trade dispute on tyres between the EC and Brazil as a panellist. In 2008 he was also appointed by the WTO as a member of the Permanent Group of Experts under the Subsidies Agreement. He teaches WTO law, government procurement law and competition law, among others. He is the author of twelve books; the most recent ones are *A Commentary on the International Health Regulations* (2005), and *A New Charter for Global Health Matters* and *WTO-Plus in Free Trade Agreements*, both published in 2010.

MS ANNA CAROLINE MÜLLER is Associate Lawyer at Clifford Chance Frankfurt. She advises on national and international commercial arbitration and litigation matters. Previously, she was part of the



xviii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

government procurement team of the WTO's Intellectual Property Division. In 2008–9 she successfully completed the German bar training programme with seats in New York (German Mission to the United Nations), London (Clifford Chance) and Frankfurt (Clifford Chance). She obtained full legal qualification in 2010 and holds a law degree and an LLM in intellectual property law (University of Düsseldorf) as well as a Diplome d'Études Approfondies in international relations from the Graduate Institute of International Studies, Geneva. Her research is focused on international economic law with recent publications in the field of government procurement.

MS CAROLINE NICHOLAS is the Secretary to the United Nations Commission on International Trade Law (UNCITRAL) Working Group on Procurement, which is organizing the revision of UNCITRAL's 1994 Model Law on Procurement of Goods, Construction and Services. She has over twenty years' experience in various aspects of commercial law, and private and public international law, ranging from advising liquidators in major international insolvencies, to advising on claims of the Kuwaiti Government arising from Iraq's 1990 invasion and occupation of Kuwait at the United Nations Compensation Commission and working as an internal fraud investigator in the United Nations. A member of the editorial board of the Public Procurement Law Review and regular contributor to the PPLR and other journals, and regular presenter at international procurement conferences, she is bringing the work of UNCITRAL in modernizing procurement to a wide audience. She works with the main international players in procurement and procurement reform (such as the WTO, the World Bank and regional development banks, the OECD, IDLO, and regional trade organizations, such as COMESA) to promote harmonization in procurement rules and to support international trade and development.

MR KWADWO (KODJO) OSEI-LAH has been Counsellor at the World Trade Organization since 2002, where his responsibilities cover technical and professional support to the WTO's work on government procurement, and related technical cooperation and capacity building. A procurement specialist by profession, Kodjo's experience covers procurement operations, consultancy, project management, technical cooperation and capacity building, and trade-related aspects of government procurement. As Counsellor at the WTO and together with his WTO Secretariat team colleagues, Kodjo assists the WTO Committee on Government



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xix

Procurement in the administration of the Agreement on Government Procurement and the ongoing negotiations in that Agreement. In addition, he is responsible with team colleagues for the WTO Secretariat's technical cooperation activities in the area of government procurement.

Prior to joining the WTO, Kodjo held the position of Project Director for several years at Crown Agents, a UK-based international development consultancy firm. In this role his responsibilities covered the provision of procurement consultancy services in client- and donor-funded projects and programmes, including those funded by the World Bank. His specific areas of focus included policy, strategy, reviews, reform, audits and value for money improvement in public procurement. Kodjo was also previously for several years a London-based representative and procurement manager for a Ghanaian mining group - the then State Gold Mining Corporation (SGMC). His early professional career was as a mining engineer within the SGMC group in Ghana, with responsibilities variously covering mine production and planning, project management and procurement planning. Kodjo has a mining degree, is a corporate member of the UK's Chartered Institute of Purchasing and Supply, and has an MBA from Birmingham University, UK, specializing in strategic procurement management.

MRS JOSEFITA PARDO DE LEÓN IS Legal Affairs Officer in the Accessions Division of the World Trade Organization, where she serves as Secretary and Co-Secretary for several Working Parties. She has also worked in the Intellectual Property Division, the Institute for Training and Technical Cooperation and the Agriculture and Commodities Division in the WTO Secretariat. Before joining the WTO in 2004, she held various positions in the Ministry of Economic Affairs and the private sector in her home country, Guatemala.

Josefita holds a degree in international relations and a masters degree in international law and economics. She has published in several areas, focusing on trade liberalization, export diversification and their links to growth and welfare.

MR PHILIPPE PELLETIER is a licensed attorney in Quebec, Canada, and currently Junior Legal Affairs Officer in the Intellectual Property Division of the World Trade Organization's Secretariat. He works with the Secretariat team supporting the work of the WTO Committee on Government Procurement and the negotiations under the Agreement on Government Procurement. He also formerly interned in the Intellectual Property



xx

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Division of the WTO, where he assisted and contributed to the Division's work in the areas of intellectual property and government procurement. Previously, he interned in the World Intellectual Property Organization's International Registration Systems Legal Service (Sector of Trademarks, Industrial Designs and Geographical Indications), where he assisted with the management of the three legal systems of international registration (the Madrid System, the Hague System and the Lisbon Agreement). He also held a postgraduate teaching assistant position in the areas of business law and securities regulation at the Faculty of Law of the University Laval, Canada. Philippe is a graduate of the University Laval. He holds a law degree and he is completing an LL M specializing in international trade law and intellectual property law. He has studied international law at the University of Gothenburg, School of Business, Economics and Law, in Sweden; Austral Universidad, Facultad de Derecho, in Argentina; and at the Université Toulouse 1 Capitole, in France.

DR HANS-JOACHIM PRIESS has been a partner of the international law firm Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer LLP since 1994 and works in the firm's Berlin office. He specializes in German, European and international public procurement law as well as international, customs and trade law (including WTO law). He heads the firm's public procurement working group, which comprises sixteen partners and about fifty other lawyers in eleven locations in Europe. Hans-Joachim has advised and represented clients across Europe, including governments, on public procurement legislation. He was a member of an expert group of the German Federal Ministry of Economics and Labour tasked with the advancing of public procurement law. He has represented many clients before the German procurement review bodies and the Court of Justice of the European Union. In May 2009 he was appointed a board member of forum vergabe e.V., Germany's most important professional association in the field of public procurement law.

Hans-Joachim received his legal education at the universities of Kiel (Dr iur, 1988) and Freiburg im Breisgau, Germany, and Lausanne, Switzerland, and at the Indiana University School of Law (LLM, 1984) and Harvard Law School, US. He worked in Brussels from 1990 to 2000, including from 1991 onwards at Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer's offices.

He publishes widely on general EU, trade and procurement law. He is the author of, *inter alia*, *Handbuch des europäischen Vergaberechts* (3rd edn 2005), joint editor and author of *Beck'scher Kommentar zur VOB/A*



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xxi

(2001), joint editor and author of WTO Handbuch (2003), and joint editor and author of the Beck'sches Formularbuch Vergaberecht (2004).

PROFESSOR GEO QUINOT is a professor in the Department of Public Law in the Faculty of Law, Stellenbosch University, South Africa. He mainly teaches administrative and constitutional law, but is also involved in the development of, and teaching in, new undergraduate and postgraduate courses on public procurement regulation at the Stellenbosch Law Faculty. He regularly instructs public administrators at Stellenbosch University's School of Public Management and Planning and in the University of Cape Town's Professional Development Project. His research focuses on general administrative law, including a particular focus on the regulation of state commercial activity. He is the author of various articles in academic journals, mostly in the field of administrative law, chapters in books, and two recent books, Administrative Law Cases and Materials (2008) and State Commercial Activity: A Legal Framework (2009). He is the editor of the Stellenbosch Law Review. Geo is currently involved in a British Academy funded project on public procurement regulation in Southern Africa as lead African partner in partnership with the Public Procurement Research Group at the University of Nottingham, with Sue Arrowsmith as project leader. Geo is also an advocate of the High Court of South Africa and engages in public interest litigation and advises organs of state on administrative law and public procurement matters. He studied law at the University of Stellenbosch, where he obtained his doctorate in 2007 on a dissertation focusing on government contracting, and at the University of Virginia School of Law in the United States as a Fulbright fellow.

PROFESSOR JOSHUA I. SCHWARTZ iS E. K. Gubin Professor of Government Contracts Law and Co-Director of the Government Procurement Law LL M Program, George Washington University.

DR PETER TREPTE is a practising barrister with Littleton Chambers in London and Counsel to Grayston & Company in Brussels. He is a special professor with the Public Procurement Research Group, University of Nottingham.

In the case of regulated procurement, he advises and represents public and private sector clients on issues of EC procurement rules as well as on the application of the WTO Agreement on Government Procurement and the effect on the procurement rules of the EC's preferential trade arrangements. At the international level, he has extensive and wide geographical



xxii

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

experience in Central and Eastern Europe, Asia, Africa and Latin America of drafting national laws and implementing rules and regulations in the field of public procurement; assessing and benchmarking national procurement systems; drafting standard bidding and contract documents and guidance; developing appropriate procurement regulatory and institutional frameworks and dispute resolution mechanisms; and the design and implementation of public and private sector procurement capacity development programmes. He was one of three dispute panellists in the procurement dispute between the US and South Korea under the WTO's Government Procurement Agreement.

Peter is a fellow of the Chartered Institute of Arbitrators and a member of the Chartered Institute of Purchasing and Supply. He has lectured and published widely on EC matters with particular reference to public procurement and the utilities and is the author of *Public Procurement in the EU* (2nd edn, 2007), 'The Government Procurement Agreement', in Macrory, Appleton and Plummer, *The World Trade Organization: Legal, Economic and Political Analysis* (2005) and *Regulating Procurement* (2004).

DR PING WANG is a lecturer in law at the University of Nottingham's School of Law. He first read law in Beijing, and then obtained an LLM and a Ph.D. at Nottingham. He is currently working in the field of public procurement law, international trade law, European law and Chinese law. His main research interests include the WTO Government Procurement Agreement, comparative EC and Chinese competition law and intellectual property law, the reform of Chinese public procurement law, and the regulation of state enterprises in the international trade regime.

He is the Deputy Director of the Public Procurement Research Group.

DR XINGLIN ZHANG is currently an associate professor at the law school of Dongbei University of Finance and Economics (in Dalian, China). She first read law at Nankai University before qualifying as a lawyer in Tianjin, China. She earned her first LLM degree (in international economic law) from Renmin University of China in 1994 and her second LLM degree (in international, commercial and European law) from the University of Sheffield in 2003. She obtained a Ph.D. degree (in public procurement law) in 2009 from the University of Nottingham.

Her main teaching and research interests are in public procurement law, international economic law and Chinese economic law. Her publications include 'Supplier Review as a Mechanism for Securing Compliance with



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xxiii

Government Procurement Rules: A Critical Perspective' (*Public Procurement Law Review*, 5 (2007), 325–51) and 'Forum for Review by Suppliers in Public Procurement: An Analysis and Assessment of the Models in International Instruments' (*Public Procurement Law Review*, 5 (2009), 201–26). She is also a PRC-qualified lawyer, specializing in government procurement and international business law.



FOREWORD

PASCAL LAMY

Director-General, World Trade Organization

Government procurement is gaining ground as part of world trade, and as part of the work of the World Trade Organization (WTO). During, and in the aftermath of, the world economic crisis, much attention has focused on public infrastructure investment and on government policies that potentially limit the rights of foreign suppliers to bid on related contracts. Such policies were a key focus of my 2009 end-of-year Overview of Developments in the International Trading Environment. In that overview, I noted that 'buy national' and other restrictive government procurement measures

raise concerns for trade and the international trading system in three main ways. First, they can exclude foreign suppliers from markets in which they could otherwise hope to compete, either by reserving the market completely for domestic suppliers or by introducing administrative complexities that make procurement procedures less easily accessible for foreign suppliers. Second, paradoxically, in some cases they may even raise the costs or impede the operations of domestic companies in the countries implementing the relevant measures, if such companies experience difficulties in sourcing domestically and cannot easily obtain waivers for purchases abroad. Third, as in other economic sectors, the implementation of discriminatory government procurement measures in one country may engender pressures for the adoption of similar measures by other countries.¹

Fortunately, while restrictive government policies relating to public procurement remain a concern for the global trading system and continuing vigilance is warranted, the world has so far avoided a rush to the wholesale adoption of such measures. This is no doubt due, in substantial measure, to the guarantees of non-discrimination and related commitments embodied in the (plurilateral) WTO Agreement on Government Procurement (GPA) in addition to the assurances incorporated

XXV

¹ Overview of Developments in the International Trading Environment: Annual Report by the Director-General (WT/TPR/OV/12 of 18 November 2009), paragraph 140.



xxvi

FOREWORD BY PASCAL LAMY

in the pledges of the G-20 Leaders and the good sense of governments worldwide that have sought to avoid a repeat of the mutually destructive proliferation of trade barriers that unnecessarily prolonged and deepened the depression of the 1930s.

In the future, public procurement and related international trade disciplines are likely to be even more important for global economic growth and development than they are at present. Past estimates have indicated that overall government procurement spending accounts for as much as 15–20 per cent of GDP, on average, worldwide, though much of this is not yet covered by current international disciplines. Moreover, infrastructure investment and other public procurement in emerging market economies in Africa, Asia and Latin America is likely to be a major driving force of economic growth in the years to come.

This situation calls for a deepening and broadening of international trade disciplines to ensure that, as far as possible, public infrastructure investment and other aspects of government procurement are carried out in a transparent and non-discriminatory manner that maximizes value for money for governments and taxpayers. Equally important, the disciplines themselves need to be continually updated to reflect developments in procurement methodologies and to ensure the maximum degree of flexibility for Parties consistent with an open international trading regime. Most of all, the membership of the GPA needs to be broadened to encompass emerging actors in this field.

As detailed in this informative book, efforts are under way to address each of these challenges. Ongoing negotiations between the Parties aim to extend coverage and eliminate remaining discriminatory measures. Provisional agreement has been reached on a revised and improved GPA text.² With regard to the membership of the Agreement, as detailed in relevant chapters of the book, work on the accessions of several developing countries is intensifying. Crucially, work on the accession of China is proceeding well, with strong, positive engagement by both China itself and the existing Parties. These developments presage a significant expansion of the membership of the Agreement in the years to come.

On a number of occasions in the recent past I have referred to the concept of *governance*. The idea of governance recognizes that the mere opening of markets – however desirable – is not, by itself, enough to ensure good economic performance. Rather, appropriate laws and institutions

² GPA/W/297 of 11 December 2006, available at http://docsonline.wto.org/ DDFDocuments/t/PLURI/GPA/W297.doc.



FOREWORD BY PASCAL LAMY

xxvii

are also needed, for example to enforce competition, address spillovers such as environmental degradation and ensure the availability of accurate information for consumers.

The GPA is a paradigm example of a trade opening instrument that recognizes the need for governance mechanisms – in this case, the procedural rules of the Agreement that ensure fair and transparent contracting practices and the domestic review or appeal mechanisms that the Agreement requires Parties to put in place. In addition, the revised GPA text contains a new and explicit requirement that procurement be carried out in a manner that avoids conflicts of interest and prevents corrupt practices. This is a significant innovation in WTO rules. Perhaps the treatment of this issue in the revised GPA text will inform broader debates on the role and future of the multilateral trading system.

The foregoing are but some of the aspects of procurement policy and its treatment in the WTO that are addressed in this book. It is clear, from this ambitious survey of developments and emerging challenges, that the WTO Agreement on Government Procurement is in the process of taking on substantially increased importance within the multilateral trading system and as an underpinning of good policy in this sector. Policy issues in this area merit in-depth consideration in the international community not only by responsible government officials but also by businesses, nongovernmental organizations and their respective advisers. This book is a serious contribution to such discussion. Academics and students will also welcome it. I congratulate both the editors of this volume and the authors responsible for the individual chapters, and look forward to the enriched debate that the essays in the volume are likely to spawn.



PERSPECTIVE OF THE CHAIRMAN OF THE WTO COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENT PROCUREMENT, NICHOLAS NIGGLI (SWITZERLAND)

I believe that, in the coming decade, the WTO Agreement on Government Procurement (GPA) will undergo a transition from being an important but relatively obscure plurilateral treaty to becoming a central pillar of the multilateral trading system. This reflects a confluence of factors, including: (i) the growing membership of the Agreement, and the prospect of accession to it by a broad range of developing, transition and other economies in the coming years; (ii) the prospect of a gradual broadening, over time, of the extent of Parties' procurements that are actually covered by the Agreement, in addition to an updating of the Agreement itself to enhance its flexibility, user-friendliness and relevance, for example, to developing countries; and (iii) the role that public infrastructure investment will undoubtedly continue to play as an underpinning of growth in the aftermath of the economic crisis, and the critical importance of such spending being undertaken on the basis of principles of fair and open competition to maximize value for taxpayers.

While the third factor noted above is largely exogenous to the work of the WTO Committee on Government Procurement, the first and second fall directly within its remit, and have been the focus of intensified effort by Parties to the Agreement, in addition to myself as Chairman, and with the support of the Secretariat, in the past few years. On the accession front, already there have been important achievements, and much more is in the offing. As detailed elsewhere in this volume, the accession of Chinese Taipei, as the forty-first WTO Member covered by the Agreement, took effect on 15 July 2009. By the end of 2009, nine other WTO Members (Albania, Armenia, China, Georgia, Jordan, the Kyrgyz Republic, Moldova, Oman and Panama) had applied for accession to the Agreement and submitted relevant documentation. Work on the accession of Armenia is well advanced, and is expected to be completed before the end of 2010. Work on the accession of Jordan is also intensifying, and it is my fond hope that it, too, will become a member of the GPA family by late 2010/early 2011. Most significantly, work on the accession

xxix



XXX PERSPECTIVE OF THE CHAIRMAN, NICHOLAS NIGGLI

of China is proceeding well, with full engagement by both China itself and the existing Parties, and I have every confidence that this, too, will come to fruition in due course. These accessions represent, in many ways, the future of the GPA.

Apart from the foregoing accessions on which work has already commenced and is, in some cases, well advanced, five other WTO Members (Croatia, the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Mongolia, Saudi Arabia and Ukraine) have provisions in their respective WTO Accession Protocols which call for them to seek GPA accession in due course. It is noteworthy, also, that India has recently become an observer in the Committee on Government Procurement – a position which enables it to better assess its potential interests vis-à-vis the Agreement.¹ Indeed, my sense from my extensive personal contacts with diverse WTO delegations is that a good number of Members of diverse sizes and levels of development from all regions of the world are actively looking at the possibility of seeking GPA accession. This is, in part, spurred by the pending accession processes of China and the other acceding Parties I have mentioned. In many cases, it has also been facilitated by Members' participation in bilateral trade agreements containing government procurement chapters that are largely modelled on the GPA.²

Currently, the ongoing negotiations to expand the coverage of the Agreement and renew the Agreement itself are, if anything, an even more pressing item of business for the Committee than the pending accessions, if only because there is now a real prospect of wrapping up the negotiations, and this is essential to unlocking the future. As is explained in detail in relevant chapters of this book, the negotiations have a threefold purpose: (i) to improve and update the Agreement in the light, *inter alia*, of developments in information technology and procurement methods; (ii) to extend the coverage of the Agreement; and (iii) to eliminate remaining discriminatory measures. Work on renewing the text of the Agreement was largely completed in December 2006; however, under the terms of the agreement struck at that time, the revised text cannot come into force until a mutually satisfactory outcome has also been achieved in the

¹ In addition to India, twenty-two other WTO Members, including two developed countries (Australia and New Zealand) in addition to countries from all regions of the developing world, are observers to the Agreement.

² See the pathbreaking analysis in Robert D. Anderson, Anna Caroline Müller, Kodjo Osei-Lah, Josefita Pardo De León and Philippe Pelletier, 'Government Procurement Provisions in Regional Trade Agreements: A Stepping Stone to GPA Accession?' in this volume, chapter 20.



PERSPECTIVE OF THE CHAIRMAN, NICHOLAS NIGGLI

negotiations to extend the Agreement's coverage. Since having the revised text in place is tremendously important to facilitate the pending accessions, currently a major push is on to wrap up the coverage negotiations and thereby permit the revised text to come into force. The Parties can now see the summit (i.e. the conclusion of the negotiations), but have still to climb it. The final metres are always the hardest.

In this context, and as described elsewhere in this volume, I have put forward a 'Roadmap' for conclusion of all aspects of the current GPA negotiations (covering both the text and the coverage aspects) by the middle of 2011. The Roadmap encompasses four main elements, namely: (i) the coverage negotiations; (ii) remaining work to be done on the text of the Agreement, particularly its Final Provisions; (iii) the process for bringing the revised Agreement into force, and in particular the issue of whether it will be treated as a new WTO Agreement or simply as an amendment to the existing one; and (iv) the future work programme of the Committee. The overriding purpose of the Roadmap is to ensure that all the issues before the Committee in the negotiations receive due attention, in parallel fashion, throughout the year, to facilitate bringing them all together and wrapping up the negotiations by the end of the year or very shortly thereafter. The initial reception given to the Roadmap has been overwhelmingly positive: all GPA Parties have pledged their full and unconditional support. They have also expressed the view that, currently, there is a window of opportunity to conclude the negotiations which will not remain open forever. Thus, it is my hope that, when this book appears in print, the negotiations will have been concluded or will be very close indeed to being concluded, and the revised text will be in the process of coming into force.

The challenges and processes outlined above are plumbed in depth in this excellent and timely volume. In addition, the book delves into historical aspects of the treatment of government procurement in the World Trade Organization and into a range of other issues that are not a principal focus of the current negotiations but that will be important in the future. These include issues concerning the interface of government procurement and the GPA with environmental sustainability and social concerns, in addition to more technical matters such as the evolution of the Agreement in relation to newer contracting practices.

As Chairman of the WTO Committee on Government Procurement, I have benefited tremendously from a close partnership with the WTO Secretariat team supporting the Committee, which is very ably led by one of the co-editors of this book, Robert Anderson. I have also enjoyed

xxxi



XXXII PERSPECTIVE OF THE CHAIRMAN, NICHOLAS NIGGLI

meeting and benefited greatly from the advice of leading academics in the field, among whom the other co-editor, Professor Sue Arrowsmith, is particularly eminent. I have formed the conviction that there is a great need to foster public awareness of, and scholarly debate on, the objectives and modalities of the Agreement on Government Procurement and related negotiating issues, challenges and priorities, in addition to the future potential of the Agreement, which I have hinted at above. For these reasons, I am pleased and honoured to have been invited by the editors to contribute this Chairman's Perspective on the Agreement, and to give my full support to the publication of this book. Needless to say, the perspectives developed herein are the sole responsibility of the authors, and are without prejudice to the interests of Parties to the Agreement or to the prerogatives of the Chairman.



PREFACE

This book grew out of our sense that the World Trade Organization (WTO) regime on government procurement – currently consisting principally of the plurilateral Agreement on Government Procurement (GPA) - is undergoing a far-reaching transition from constituting an important but relatively obscure element of the WTO to becoming a cornerstone of the international trading system. This change is occurring first and foremost as a result of the pending accession to the Agreement of important developing and transition economies such as China, Jordan and Armenia but also as a result of the ongoing effort to modernize the Agreement which is nearing completion and of increased interest in government procurement as a dimension of world trade in light of the recent economic crisis. There is, in our view, a critical need for informed discussion and reflection on these developments in the international community and among international legal scholars, practitioners and students. There is, of course, already a significant body of literature on the GPA as it emerged from the Uruguay Round and on other aspects of the WTO's procurement work, in particular on transparency, and we do not seek to replicate this here. Rather, the aim of the present volume is to explain, and to explore, the most recent developments concerning the WTO regime for government procurement, and to stimulate debate on the challenges that they pose.

Many persons contributed to the production of this book or otherwise provided necessary support. Early versions of some of the papers incorporated in the volume were presented at the conference *Public Procurement – Global Revolution III*, held at the University of Nottingham in June 2006. Subsequent versions and additional papers in the volume were presented at a Symposium held at the WTO in Geneva in February 2010 and at the conference *Public Procurement – Global Revolution IV* in Nottingham in April 2010. We are grateful to all those who made presentations at, or assisted in the organization of, these events.

xxxiii