CHINESE JUSTICE

This volume analyzes whether China’s thirty years of legal reform have taken root in Chinese society by examining how ordinary citizens are using the legal system in contemporary China. It is an interdisciplinary look at law in action and at legal institutions from the bottom up – that is, beginning with those at the ground level who are using and working in the legal system. It explores the emergent Chinese conception of justice – one that seeks to balance Chinese tradition, socialist legacies, and the needs of the global market. Given the political dimension of dispute resolution in creating, settling, and changing social norms, this volume contributes to a greater understanding of political and social change in China today and of the process of legal reform generally.

Margaret Y. K. Woo is Professor of Law at Northeastern University School of Law and co-director of the law school’s program on Human Rights in the Global Economy. She has written and spoken widely on U.S. procedural justice and the issue of Chinese legal reform. She was formerly a Fellow at the Bunting Institute of Radcliffe College and is a research associate with the Program on East Asian Legal Studies at Harvard Law School. Her publications include Litigating in America (2006) and East Asian Law – Universal Norms and Local Cultures (2003).

Mary E. Gallagher is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Michigan, where she is also the director of the Center for Chinese Studies. She is also a faculty associate at the Center for Comparative Political Studies at the Institute for Social Research. Gallagher is the author of Contagious Capitalism: Globalization and the Politics of Labor in China (2005) and the forthcoming The Rule of Law in China: If They Build It, Who Will Come?, which was funded by the Fulbright Association and the National Science Foundation.
Chinese Justice

CIVIL DISPUTE RESOLUTION IN CONTEMPORARY CHINA

Edited by

Margaret Y. K. Woo
Northeastern University School of Law

Mary E. Gallagher
University of Michigan, Department of Political Science
Contents

Tables and Figures .......................................................... vii
Contributors ................................................................. xi
Acknowledgments ............................................................ xiii
Abbreviations ................................................................. xv
Glossary ...................................................................... xvii

Introduction ................................................................. 1
Margaret Y. K. Woo and Mary E. Gallagher

PART I: LEGAL DEVELOPMENT AND INSTITUTIONAL TENSIONS

1 From Mediatory to Adjudicatory Justice: The Limits of Civil Justice Reform in China ...................................................... 25
Fu Hualing and Richard Cullen

2 Judicial Disciplinary Systems for Incorrectly Decided Cases: The Imperial Chinese Heritage Lives On 58
Carl Minzner

3 Legalizing the Local State: Administrative “Legality” at China’s Grassroots ................................................................. 91
Douglas B. Grob

4 Economic Development and the Development of the Legal Profession in China ...................................................... 114
Randall Peerenboom
## Contents

**PART II: **PU FA AND THE DISSEMINATION OF LAW IN THE CHINESE CONTEXT

5 The Impact of Nationalist and Maoist Legacies on Popular Trust in Legal Institutions  
*Pierre F. Landry*

6 Public Attitudes toward Official Justice in Beijing and Rural China  
*Ethan Michelson and Benjamin L. Read*

7 Users and Non-Users: Legal Experience and Its Effect on Legal Consciousness  
*Mary E. Gallagher and Yuhua Wang*

*Sida Liu*

**PART III: LAW FROM THE BOTTOM UP**

9 A Populist Threat to China’s Courts?  
*Benjamin L. Liebman*

10 Dispute Resolution and China’s Grassroots Legal Services  
*Fu Yulin*

11 The Constitution in the Courtroom: Constitutional Development and Civil Litigation in China  
*Thomas E. Kellogg*

Conclusion: Chinese Justice from the Bottom Up  
*Margaret Y. K. Woo*

Index
Tables and Figures

TABLES

1.1 When, Where, and How Shenzhen Judges Conducted Mediation

5.1 Multilevel Variance of Trust in Legal Institutions

5.2 Summary of the Evolution of Legal Institutions in 87 ILRC Counties

5.3 Ordered Probit Model of Trust in Legal Institutions

6.1 Experience-Based Assessments of Official Justice, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002)

6.2 Overlap between Experience-Based Assessments of Official Justice Outcomes and Procedures, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002)

6.3 Prevalence of Direct Experience with Official Justice, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002)

A6.1 Perceptions of the Courts

A6.2 Perceptions of the Police

7.1 Judgment of a Vignette: Work-Unit Actions Legal or Not

7.2 Reasons Provided for Saying Illegal

7.3 If You Were Mr. Chen, What Would You Do?

7.4 Use Mediation?

7.5 Use Administrative Methods?

7.6 Use Arbitration?

7.7 Use Litigation?

7.8 Which Method Would You Use First?

7.9 Which Method Is Most Effective?

7.10 Political Identity and Mobilization
Tables and Figures

8.1 Distribution of Case Types (Percentage), DALS Legal-Advice Column, 1979–2003 244
8.2 Statutes Cited More than Ten Times in the DALS Column, 1979–2003 247

FIGURES

1.1 Percentage of Civil Cases Concluded by Mediation (1956–2006) 43
5.1 Distribution of KMT Membership by Province, 1937 143
5.2 Scatterplots of Trust in Legal Institutions, Aggregated by County (1–4 scale) 152
5.3 Comparison of Random Effects at the Province and County Levels 155
5.4 Respondents’ Exposure to Their County of Residence 160
5.5 Mentions of Legal Institutions in the People’s Daily (1946–2006) 162
6.2 General Perceptions of the Performance of Courts and Police by Economic Development, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002) 177
6.3 Experience-Based Assessments by Competing Sources of Help, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002) 182
6.4 Incidence of Negative Experience-Based Assessments of Court Performance by Locality, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002) 183
6.5 General Perceptions of Courts, by Personal Experience, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002) 185
6.6 General Perceptions of Police by Personal Experience, Chicago (1984), Beijing (2001), and Rural China (2002) 186
6.7 General Perceptions of Official Justice, by Personal Experience, Disaggregated by Evaluations of Personal Experience, Chicago (1984) 186
6.8 General Perceptions of Courts by Personal Experience, Disaggregated by Experience-Based Assessments, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002) 187
6.9 General Perceptions of Police by Personal Experience, Disaggregated by Experience-Based Assessments, Beijing (2001) and Rural China (2002) 188
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table/Figure</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Dispute “Pyramid”</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Changes in the Average Number of Cases per Issue, 1979–2003</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Average Number of Statutes Cited per Year, 1979–2003</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contributors

Editors

Margaret Y. K. Woo Professor of Law, School of Law, Northeastern University

Mary E. Gallagher Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Michigan

Contributors

Richard Cullen Visiting Professor, Department of Law, University of Hong Kong

Fu Hualing Associate Professor and Head, Department of Law, University of Hong Kong

Fu Yulin Associate Professor of Civil Procedure and Legal Practice, School of Law, Peking University

Douglas B. Grob Assistant Professor, Department of Government and Politics, University of Maryland

Thomas E. Kellogg Program Officer and Advisor to the President, Open Society Institute

Pierre F. Landry Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, Yale University

Benjamin L. Liebman Professor of Law and Director, Center for Chinese Legal Studies, Columbia Law School
Contributors

Sida Liu Assistant Professor of Law and Sociology, Department of Sociology, University of Wisconsin

Ethan Michelson Associate Professor, Department of Sociology and Department of East Asian Languages and Cultures and Associate Professor of Sociology and Law, Maurer School of Law, Indiana University Bloomington

Carl Minzner Associate Professor of Law, Washington University in St. Louis School of Law

Randall Peerenboom Associate Fellow, Oxford University Centre for Socio-Legal Studies; Director, Oxford Foundation for Law, Justice and Society China Rule of Law Programme; and Professor of Law, La Trobe University, Melbourne

Benjamin L. Read Assistant Professor, Politics Department, University of California, Santa Cruz

Yuhua Wang Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Pennsylvania
Acknowledgments

This book is the result of a workshop generously funded by the Chiang Ching Kuo Foundation for International Scholarly Exchange and the Center for Chinese Studies at the University of Michigan. We also benefited tremendously from the wise counsel and encouragement of Merle Goldman. Professor Goldman has been an unfailing intellectual force behind the efforts of many young and women scholars, and we are truly grateful to have such a path breaker at the Fairbank Center at Harvard. Similarly, we would like to thank Professor William Alford and the Program for East Asian Legal Studies of Harvard Law School for their financial support. Under the directorship of Professor Alford, the Program on East Asian Legal Studies has been an active intellectual base for Asian scholars here and abroad. Additionally, we would like to thank Professor Elizabeth Perry and the Lam Fund, whose enthusiasm and generosity made the workshop possible. Of course, the workshop discussion greatly benefited from all those who participated as well as from the thoughtful comments by discussants Cai Yanmin, Donald Clarke, Jerome Cohen, Sally Merry, Frank Upham, and Robert Weller. Nancy Hearst provided excellent editorial expertise, as usual. Finally, we would like to acknowledge the institutional support of the Fairbank Center for Chinese Research, Harvard University, who graciously hosted the workshop.
Abbreviations

ALL Administrative Litigation Law
ARL Administrative Reconsideration Law
ARR Administrative Reconsideration Regulation
BPC basic people’s court
CASS Chinese Academy of Social Sciences
CCP Chinese Communist Party
DALS Democracy and the Legal System (Minzhu yu fazhi)
FZB legal affairs office (fazhi bangongshi)
HLM hierarchical linear modeling
HPC higher people’s court
ICS individual case supervision
ILCR Institutionalization of Legal Reforms
IPC intermediate people’s court
KMT Guomindang (Kuomintang)
LAO legislative affairs office
LPC local people’s congress
MoJ Ministry of Justice
NPC National People’s Congress
PLC Political-Legal Committee
PRC People’s Republic of China
PSB Public Security Bureau
PSU primary sampling unit
SFT local justice department (sifa ting)
SOE state-owned enterprise
SPC Supreme People’s Court
SPP Supreme People’s Procuratorate
Glossary

*bangong bumen*  
operational department of government

*baogao qingkuang*  
reporting

*bei'an (review)*  
各案  
file the case record (for review)

*bijiao xinren*  
比较信任  
somewhat trust

*butai xinren*  
不太信任  
somewhat distrust

*chouxiang xingzheng xingwei*  
抽象行政行为  
abstract administrative acts

*dang de zuzhibu*  
党的组织部  
Party Organization Department

*dang zhengban*  
党政办  
party political office
Glossary

dang zhibu
党的领导
party branch

diaocha yanjiu, tiaojie wei zhu, jiu di jiejue
调查研究，调解为主，就地解决
investigate and research, taking mediation as the principal method, and solving disputes where they arise

diaopan jiehe, anjie liaoshi
调解结合，案结了事
combine adjudication and mediation; resolve the dispute and conclude the litigation

difang zhengfu
地方政府
local government

diji chengshi
地级城市
prefectural level city

fazhi bangongshi or fazhiban
法制办公室 or 法创办
legal affairs office

fazhichu
法制处
legal affairs section

fazhiyuan
法制员
legal affairs officer

feichang xinren
非常信任
trust a great deal

feinongye hukou
非农业户口
urban registration

fugaimiande
覆盖面积
overlay
Glossary

fu xianzhang
deputy county head

fuyi keyi jiejue xinfang de bu fangbian
reconsideration can solve many of the inconveniences of xinfang (petition)

gao deng fayuan
high court

gao deng fayuan fenyuan
divisional courts of high court

gongan sifa
public security and justice

gongshang
Industry and Commerce (Bureau)

guizhang
administrative rules

guoshui and dishui
national and real estate tax

hai you kongbaidian
bare patches

be li
be reasonable (a rule)

jiandu
supervise, inspect, review
Glossary

**jiaoda de shi**
大城市的
large cities

**jiguan**
籍贯
native place

**jingji hetong zhongcai weiyuanhui**
经济合同仲裁委员会
economic contract arbitration committees

**jishu jiandu**
技术监督
Technical Supervision (Bureau)

**nengdiao zediao, dangpan zepan, diaopan jiehe, anjie liaoshi**
能调的调，当判则判，调判结合，案结事了
mediate cases that can be mediated, adjudicate cases that should be adjudicated, combine mediation with adjudication to resolve the dispute and conclude the litigation

**paichu**
派出
sent out (an individual)

**pu fa**
普法
(legal) awareness

**renda fagui chu**
人大法规处
legislative affairs office of the people’s congress

**shefa**
涉法
law related

**shizhang or xianzhang**
市长 or 县长
head (of a city or a county)
Glossary

shuofa
說法
an explanation

sifa bu
司法部
Ministry of Justice

sifa jiguan
司法机关
legal organs

sifasuo
司法所
local justice office

sifa ting
司法厅
local justice departments

sifa weimin
司法为民
legality serving the people

wanguan buxinren
完全不信任
completely distrust

xian
縣
county

xianshi gongzheng
縣失公正
manifest lack of fairness

xianzhi
縣志
County gazetteer

xinfang
信访
petition

xingzheng fuyi
行政复议
administrative reconsideration
xxii

Glossary

xingzheng fuyi fa
Administrative Reconsideration Law

xingzheng fuyi weiyuanhui
Administrative Reconsideration Committee

xingzheng shenpan ting
administrative trial court

yantaobui
研讨会
seminar/discussion group

yifa banshi
do things according to law

yifa xingzheng
administrate according to law

yikao qunzhong, diaocha yanjiu, iaojie weizhu, jiudi jiejue,
rely on the masses, investigate and research, take mediation as the principal method, solve disputes where they arise

yizhi
一致
consistency

you fazhi yishi de guanyuan
those officials with a sense of acting according to the law

zhengfa wei
政法委
Political and Legal Affairs Committee (of the CCP)

zhengfazu
政法组
political and legal committee
**Glossary**

zhengfu bangong huiyi  
政府办公会议  
government working conference

zhengfu changwei bui [fu]buizhang  
政府常委会(副)会长  
chairman (or vice chairman) of the standing committee of the government

zhengfu xinxi gongkai  
政府信息公开  
open government information

zhineng bumen  
职能部门  
administrative department

zhuren  
主任  
head (of the local FZB)