#### SYMMETRY IN SYNTAX

While much has been written on asymmetric aspects of sentence structure, symmetric aspects have been largely ignored, or claimed to be non-existent. Does symmetry in syntax exist, and if it does, how do we account for it? Barbara Citko sets out to tackle these questions and offers a unified approach to a number of phenomena that have so far been studied only in isolation. Focusing on three core minimalist mechanisms, Merge, Move – and Labeling – she advances a new theory of these mechanisms, by showing that, under certain well-defined circumstances, Merge can create symmetric structures, Move can target either of two potentially moveable objects, and labels can be constructed symmetrically from the features of two objects. This book is aimed at researchers and graduate students interested in minimalist syntax, the structure of questions, relative clauses, coordination, double object constructions, and copular sentences.

BARBARA CITKO is Assistant Professor of Linguistics at the University of Washington in Seattle. Her research includes work on phrase structure, coordination, relative clauses, wh-questions and the syntax of Slavic languages.

### CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LINGUISTICS

*General Editors:* P. Austin, J. Bresnan, B. Comrie, S. Crain, W. Dressler, C. J. Ewen, R. Lass, D. Lightfoot, K. Rice, I. Roberts, S. Romaine, N. V. Smith

Symmetry in Syntax Merge, Move, and Labels

#### In this series

- 84 NOMI ERTESCHIK-SHIR: The dynamics of focus structure
- 85 JOHN COLEMAN: Phonological representations: their names, forms and powers
- 86 CHRISTINA Y. BETHIN: Slavic prosody: language change and phonological theory
- 87 BARBARA DANCYGIER: Conditionals and prediction
- 88 CLAIRE LEFEBVRE: Creole genesis and the acquisition of grammar: the case of Haitian creole
- 89 HEINZ GIEGERICH: Lexical strata in English
- 90 KEREN RICE: Morpheme order and semantic scope
- 91 APRIL MCMAHON: Lexical phonology and the history of English
- 92 MATTHEW Y. CHEN: Tone Sandhi: patterns across Chinese dialects
- 93 GREGORY T. STUMP: Inflectional morphology: a theory of paradigm structure
- 94 JOAN BYBEE: Phonology and language use
- 95 LAURIE BAUER: Morphological productivity
- 96 THOMAS ERNST: The syntax of adjuncts
- 97 ELIZABETH CLOSS TRAUGOTT AND RICHARD B. DASHER: Regularity in semantic change
- 98 MAYA HICKMANN: Children's discourse: person, space and time across languages
- 99 DIANE BLAKEMORE: Relevance and linguistic meaning: the semantics and pragmatics of discourse markers
- 100 IAN ROBERTS AND ANNA ROUSSOU: Syntactic change: a minimalist approach to grammaticalization
- 101 DONKA MINKOVA: Alliteration and sound change in early English
- 102 MARK C. BAKER: Lexical categories: verbs, nouns and adjectives
- 103 CARLOTA S. SMITH: Modes of discourse: the local structure of texts
- 104 ROCHELLE LIEBER: Morphology and lexical semantics
- 105 HOLGER DIESSEL: The acquisition of complex sentences
- 106 SHARON INKELAS AND CHERYL ZOLL: Reduplication: doubling in morphology
- 107 SUSAN EDWARDS: Fluent aphasia
- 108 BARBARA DANCYGIER AND EVE SWEETSER: Mental spaces in grammar: conditional constructions
- 109 HEW BAERMAN, DUNSTAN BROWN AND GREVILLE G. CORBETT: The syntax-morphology interface: a study of syncretism
- 110 MARCUS TOMALIN: Linguistics and the formal sciences: the origins of generative grammar
- 111 SAMUEL D. EPSTEIN AND T. DANIEL SEELY: Derivations in minimalism
- 112 PAUL DE LACY: Markedness: reduction and preservation in phonology
- 113 YEHUDA N. FALK: Subjects and their properties
- 114 P. H. MATTHEWS: Syntactic relations: a critical survey
- 115 MARK C. BAKER: The syntax of agreement and concord
- 116 GILLIAN CATRIONA RAMCHAND: Verb meaning and the lexicon: a first phase syntax
- 117 PIETER MUYSKEN: Functional categories
- 118 JUAN URIAGEREKA: Syntactic anchors: on semantic structuring
- 119 D. ROBERT LADD: Intonational phonology second edition
- 120 LEONARD H. BABBY: The syntax of argument structure
- 121 B. ELAN DRESHER: The contrastive hierarchy in phonology
- 122 DAVID ADGER, DANIEL HARBOUR AND LAUREL J. WATKINS: Mirrors and microparameters: phrase structure beyond free word order
- 123 NIINA NING ZHANG: Coordination in syntax
- 124 NEIL SMITH: Acquiring phonology
- 125 NINA TOPINTZI: Onsets: suprasegmental and prosodic behaviour
- 126 CEDRIC BOECKX, NORBERT HORNSTEIN AND JAIRO NUŇES: Control as movement
- 127 MICHAEL ISRAEL: The grammar of polarity: pragmatics, sensitivity, and the logic of scales
- 128 M. RITA MANZINI AND LEONARDO M. SAVOIA: Grammatical categories: variation in romance languages
- 129 BARBARA CITKO: Symmetry in syntax: Merge, move, and labels

Earlier issues not listed are also available

# SYMMETRY IN SYNTAX Merge, move, and labels

BARBARA CITKO

University of Washington, Seattle



> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107005556

© Barbara Citko 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-00555-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

	Ack	nowledgements	<i>page</i> ix
	Abb	reviations	xi
1	Rati	ionale	1
	1.1	Introduction	1
	1.2	Symmetry and asymmetry	2
	1.3	Theoretical framework	4
	1.4	The proposal	9
	1.5	Disclaimer: other sources of symmetry?	9
	1.6	Organization of the book	14
2	Asy	mmetry in syntax	17
	2.1	Introduction	17
	2.2	Antisymmetry Theory	17
	2.3	Dynamic Antisymmetry Theory	20
	2.4	Asymmetry Theory	23
	2.5	Coordination	25
	2.6	Double object constructions	29
	2.7	Asymmetry in Move	35
	2.8	Asymmetry in Labeling	39
3	Sym	nmetry in Merge	43
	3.1	Introduction	43
	3.2	Symmetric Merge: Parallel Merge	44
	3.3	Constraints on symmetric Merge	46
	3.4	Feature checking in symmetric Merge structures	47
	3.5	Linearization of symmetric Merge structures	50
	3.6	Empirical support for symmetric Merge	54
		3.6.1 Across-the-board wh-questions	54
		3.6.2 Wh-questions with conjoined wh-pronouns	62
			vii

viii

Contents

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-00555-6 - Symmetry in Syntax: Merge, Move, and Labels
Barbara Citko
Frontmatter
More information

		3.6.3 Right node raising	68
		3.6.4 Gapping	77
		3.6.5 Serial verbs	92
		3.6.6 Free relatives	94
	3.7	Conclusion	107
4	Sym	nmetry in Move	109
	4.1	Introduction	109
	4.2	Symmetric and asymmetric passives	110
	4.3	Polish double object constructions	115
	4.4	Polish dative subjects	122
	4.5	Interim summary and preview	125
	4.6	Locality and symmetric passives	127
		4.6.1 Word order variation	127
		4.6.2 Movement through applicative phase edge	130
		4.6.3 Wh-movement from applicatives	135
		4.6.4 Quantifier raising from applicatives	140
	4.7	Case and symmetric passives	144
		4.7.1 Case absorption	144
		4.7.2 Lexical case and passive movement	146
		4.7.3 Dative intervention effects	148
		4.7.4 Lack of multiple datives	151
		4.7.5 Freezing and symmetric passives	154
	4.8	Conclusion	161
5	Sym	nmetric labels	163
	5.1	Introduction	163
	5.2	Arguments for (and against) eliminating labels	164
	5.3	Symmetric labels	
	5.4	Serial verb constructions	
	5.5	Small clauses	
	5.6	Comparative correlatives	
	5.7	Wh-movement in correlative clauses	190
	5.8	Conclusion	206

Conclusion	207
Notes to chapters	212
References	248
Index	268

# Acknowledgements

This book is the culmination of many years of thinking, writing, rethinking, re-writing, revising and re-revising, which involved many people, places and jobs along the way.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my friends, colleagues and students at the University of Washington, where this book was written. I would also like to thank the University of Washington's Royalty Research Fund for the much needed (and appreciated) one-quarter teaching relief during the final stages of this project, and the serene Whiteley Center on San Juan Island for providing the necessary peace and quiet during many writing stages.

Some of the ideas presented here were incubated and developed when I was a graduate student at Stony Brook University, a visiting student at MIT and a lecturer at the University of Utah, the University of Connecticut and Brandeis University, and I thank all of these departments for their support, hospitality and stimulating intellectual atmosphere. In particular, I would like to thank (in alphabetical order) the following people whose ideas inspired me, whose comments motivated me, and whose encouragement kept me going: Klaus Abels, Edith Aldridge, John Bailyn, Željko Bošković, Marcel den Dikken, Kat Dziwirek, Daniel Finer, Steven Franks, Martina Gračanin-Yüksek, Stephanie Harves, Julia Herschensohn, Sabine Iatridou, Ray Jackendoff, Brad Larson, Richard Larson, David Lightfoot, Terje Lohndal, Jairo Nunes, Asya Pereltsvaig, David Pesetsky, Dafina Rațiu, Henk van Riemsdijk, Catherine Rudin and Karen Zagona. Thank you all! This book would not have been possible without your feedback and support. I would also like to thank Andrew Winnard, Sarah Green and Elizabeth Davey at Cambridge University Press for their assistance throughout the entire process, two anonymous reviewers for raising many important points and forcing me to be more precise about some of the crucial claims, and Jill Lake for a wonderful job copyediting the manuscript.

#### x Acknowledgements

Material related to this project was presented at the following conferences: FASL 18 at Cornell University, Ways of Structure Building in Vitoria-Gasteiz, GLOW 31 Workshop on Linearization in Newcastle, 83rd and 84th Annual LSA Meetings, NELS 39 at Cornell University and NELS 33 and 40 at MIT, and at colloquia at the University of Victoria, British Columbia, University of Calgary and the University of Washington. I thank the audiences at these events for useful feedback. Portions of the discussion of *Parallel Merge* and across-the-board whquestions in Chapter 3 draw on my dissertation and research findings published in *Linguistic Inquiry*, and the discussion of labels and comparative correlatives in Chapter 5 builds on a paper published in *Lingua*.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my husband, Randy Collins, for more than I can express (in a second language), and Icarus (our Solomon Island eclectus parrot) for providing joy and distraction throughout the entire process.

I dedicate this book to the memory of my parents, Krystyna and Stanisław Citko.

# Abbreviations

ACC	accusative
APPL	applicative
ASP	aspect
CL	clitic
CPR	comparative
DAT	dative
DEF	definite
DEM	demonstrative
EPP	Extended Projection Principle
EXP	expletive
FEM	feminine
FOC	focus
FUT	future
FV	final vowel
GEN	genitive
HAB	habitual
IMPERF	imperfective (aspect)
INDEF	indefinite
INF	infinitive
INSTR	instrumental
LOC	locative
MASC	masculine
NACT	non-active
NEG	negative
NEUT	neuter
NML	nominalizer
NOM	nominative
OA	object agreement
OB	object
PASS	passive

### xii Abbreviations

PAST	past (tense)
1 451	
PERF	perfective (aspect)
PL	plural
POSS	possessive
PRES	present
PROG	progressive
REFL	reflexive
REL	relative
SA	subject agreement
SA SE	subject agreement se (reflexive marker)
SE	se (reflexive marker)
SE SG	se (reflexive marker) singular
SE SG SP	se (reflexive marker) singular subject prefix