While much has been written on asymmetric aspects of sentence structure, symmetric aspects have been largely ignored, or claimed to be non-existent. Does symmetry in syntax exist, and if it does, how do we account for it? Barbara Citko sets out to tackle these questions and offers a unified approach to a number of phenomena that have so far been studied only in isolation. Focusing on three core minimalist mechanisms, Merge, Move – and Labeling – she advances a new theory of these mechanisms, by showing that, under certain well-defined circumstances, Merge can create symmetric structures, Move can target either of two potentially moveable objects, and labels can be constructed symmetrically from the features of two objects. This book is aimed at researchers and graduate students interested in minimalist syntax, the structure of questions, relative clauses, coordination, double object constructions, and copular sentences.

**Barbara Citko** is Assistant Professor of Linguistics at the University of Washington in Seattle. Her research includes work on phrase structure, coordination, relative clauses, wh-questions and the syntax of Slavic languages.
Symmetry in Syntax
Merge, Move, and Labels
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>Nomi Erteschk-shir</td>
<td>The dynamics of focus structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85</td>
<td>John Coleman</td>
<td>Phonological representations: their names, forms and powers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>86</td>
<td>Christina Y. Bethin</td>
<td>Slavic prosody: language change and phonological theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87</td>
<td>Barbara Dancygier</td>
<td>Conditionals and prediction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88</td>
<td>Claire Lefebvre</td>
<td>Creole genesis and the acquisition of grammar: the case of Haitian creole</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89</td>
<td>Heinz Giegerich</td>
<td>Lexical strata in English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90</td>
<td>Keren Rice</td>
<td>Morpheme order and semantic scope</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91</td>
<td>April McMahon</td>
<td>Lexical phonology and the history of English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92</td>
<td>Matthew Y. Chen</td>
<td>Tone Sandhi: patterns across Chinese dialects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93</td>
<td>Gregory T. Stump</td>
<td>Inflectional morphology: a theory of paradigm structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94</td>
<td>Joan Bybee</td>
<td>Phonology and language use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95</td>
<td>Laurie Bauer</td>
<td>Morphological productivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96</td>
<td>Thomas Ernst</td>
<td>The syntax of adjuncts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>97</td>
<td>Elizabeth Closs Traugott and Richard B. Dasher</td>
<td>Regularity in semantic change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>98</td>
<td>Maya Hickmann</td>
<td>Children’s discourse: person, space and time across languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99</td>
<td>Diane Blakemore</td>
<td>Relevance and linguistic meaning: the semantics and pragmatics of discourse markers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>Ian Roberts and Anna Roussou</td>
<td>Syntactic change: a minimalist approach to grammaticalization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101</td>
<td>Donka Minkova</td>
<td>Alliteration and sound change in early English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>102</td>
<td>Mark C. Baker</td>
<td>Lexical categories: verbs, nouns and adjectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>103</td>
<td>Carlota S. Smith</td>
<td>Modes of discourse: the local structure of texts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>104</td>
<td>Rochelle Lieber</td>
<td>Morphology and lexical semantics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>105</td>
<td>Holger Diesell</td>
<td>The acquisition of complex sentences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>106</td>
<td>Sharon Inkelas and Cheryl Zoll</td>
<td>Reduplication: doubling in morphology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>107</td>
<td>Susan Edwards</td>
<td>Fluent aphasia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>108</td>
<td>Barbara Dancygier and Eve Sweetser</td>
<td>Mental spaces in grammar: conditional constructions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>109</td>
<td>Hew Baerman, Dunstan Brown and Greville G. Corbett</td>
<td>The syntax–morphology interface: a study of syncretism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>110</td>
<td>Marcus Tomalin</td>
<td>Linguistics and the formal sciences: the origins of generative grammar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>111</td>
<td>Samuel D. Epstein and T. Daniel Seely</td>
<td>Derivations in minimalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>112</td>
<td>Paul de Lacy</td>
<td>Markedness: reduction and preservation in phonology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>113</td>
<td>Yehuda N. Falk</td>
<td>Subjects and their properties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>114</td>
<td>P. H. Matthews</td>
<td>Syntactic relations: a critical survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>115</td>
<td>Mark C. Baker</td>
<td>The syntax of agreement and concord</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>116</td>
<td>Gillian Catriona Ramchand</td>
<td>Verb meaning and the lexicon: a first phase syntax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>117</td>
<td>Pieter Muysken</td>
<td>Functional categories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>118</td>
<td>Juan Uriagereka</td>
<td>Syntactic anchors: on semantic structuring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>119</td>
<td>D. Robert Ladd</td>
<td>Intonational phonology second edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>120</td>
<td>Leonard H. Babby</td>
<td>The syntax of argument structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>121</td>
<td>B. Elan Dresher</td>
<td>The contrastive hierarchy in phonology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>122</td>
<td>David Adger, Daniel Harbour and Laurel J. Watkins</td>
<td>Mirrors and microparameters: phrase structure beyond free word order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>123</td>
<td>Nihna Ning Zhang</td>
<td>Coordination in syntax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>124</td>
<td>Neil Smith</td>
<td>Acquiring phonology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>125</td>
<td>Nina Topintzi</td>
<td>Onsets: suprasegmental and prosodic behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>126</td>
<td>Cedric Boeckx, Norbert Hornstein and Jairo Nuñes</td>
<td>Control as movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>127</td>
<td>Michael Isreal</td>
<td>The grammar of polarity: pragmatics, sensitivity, and the logic of scales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>128</td>
<td>M. Rita Manzini and Leonardo M. Savoia</td>
<td>Grammatical categories: variation in romance languages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>129</td>
<td>Barbara Citko</td>
<td>Symmetry in syntax: Merge, move, and labels</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Earlier issues not listed are also available
SYMMETRY IN SYNTAX
MERGE, MOVE, AND LABELS

BARTBARA CITKYO

University of Washington, Seattle
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acknowledgements</th>
<th>page ix</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviations</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 1 Rationale
1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Symmetry and asymmetry 2
1.3 Theoretical framework 4
1.4 The proposal 9
1.5 Disclaimer: other sources of symmetry? 9
1.6 Organization of the book 14

## 2 Asymmetry in syntax
2.1 Introduction 17
2.2 Antisymmetry Theory 17
2.3 Dynamic Antisymmetry Theory 20
2.4 Asymmetry Theory 23
2.5 Coordination 25
2.6 Double object constructions 29
2.7 Asymmetry in Move 35
2.8 Asymmetry in Labeling 39

## 3 Symmetry in Merge
3.1 Introduction 43
3.2 Symmetric Merge: Parallel Merge 44
3.3 Constraints on symmetric Merge 46
3.4 Feature checking in symmetric Merge structures 47
3.5 Linearization of symmetric Merge structures 50
3.6 Empirical support for symmetric Merge 54
3.6.1 Across-the-board wh-questions 54
3.6.2 Wh-questions with conjoined wh-pronouns 62
viii   Contents

3.6.3  Right node raising 68
3.6.4  Gapping 77
3.6.5  Serial verbs 92
3.6.6  Free relatives 94
3.7  Conclusion 107

4  Symmetry in Move 109
4.1  Introduction 109
4.2  Symmetric and asymmetric passives 110
4.3  Polish double object constructions 115
4.4  Polish dative subjects 122
4.5  Interim summary and preview 125
4.6  Locality and symmetric passives 127
  4.6.1  Word order variation 127
  4.6.2  Movement through applicative phase edge 130
  4.6.3  Wh-movement from applicatives 135
  4.6.4  Quantifier raising from applicatives 140
4.7  Case and symmetric passives 144
  4.7.1  Case absorption 144
  4.7.2  Lexical case and passive movement 146
  4.7.3  Dative intervention effects 148
  4.7.4  Lack of multiple datives 151
  4.7.5  Freezing and symmetric passives 154
4.8  Conclusion 161

5  Symmetric labels 163
5.1  Introduction 163
5.2  Arguments for (and against) eliminating labels 164
5.3  Symmetric labels 176
5.4  Serial verb constructions 178
5.5  Small clauses 182
5.6  Comparative correlatives 185
5.7  Wh-movement in correlative clauses 190
5.8  Conclusion 206

6  Conclusion 207

Notes to chapters 212
References 248
Index 268
Acknowledgements

This book is the culmination of many years of thinking, writing, re-thinking, re-writing, revising and re-revising, which involved many people, places and jobs along the way.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my friends, colleagues and students at the University of Washington, where this book was written. I would also like to thank the University of Washington’s Royalty Research Fund for the much needed (and appreciated) one-quarter teaching relief during the final stages of this project, and the serene Whiteley Center on San Juan Island for providing the necessary peace and quiet during many writing stages.

Some of the ideas presented here were incubated and developed when I was a graduate student at Stony Brook University, a visiting student at MIT and a lecturer at the University of Utah, the University of Connecticut and Brandeis University, and I thank all of these departments for their support, hospitality and stimulating intellectual atmosphere. In particular, I would like to thank (in alphabetical order) the following people whose ideas inspired me, whose comments motivated me, and whose encouragement kept me going: Klaus Abels, Edith Aldridge, John Bailyn, Željko Bošković, Marcel den Dikken, Kat Dziwirek, Daniel Finer, Steven Franks, Martina Gračanin-Yüksek, Stephanie Harves, Julia Herschensohn, Sabine Iatridou, Ray Jackendoff, Brad Larson, Richard Larson, David Lightfoot, Terje Lohndal, Jairo Nunes, Asya Pereltsvaig, David Pesetsky, Dafina Raţiu, Henk van Riemsdijk, Catherine Rudin and Karen Zagona. Thank you all! This book would not have been possible without your feedback and support. I would also like to thank Andrew Winnard, Sarah Green and Elizabeth Davey at Cambridge University Press for their assistance throughout the entire process, two anonymous reviewers for raising many important points and forcing me to be more precise about some of the crucial claims, and Jill Lake for a wonderful job copyediting the manuscript.
Acknowledgements

Material related to this project was presented at the following conferences: FASL 18 at Cornell University, Ways of Structure Building in Vitoria-Gasteiz, GLOW 31 Workshop on Linearization in Newcastle, 83rd and 84th Annual LSA Meetings, NELS 39 at Cornell University and NELS 33 and 40 at MIT, and at colloquia at the University of Victoria, British Columbia, University of Calgary and the University of Washington. I thank the audiences at these events for useful feedback. Portions of the discussion of Parallel Merge and across-the-board wh-questions in Chapter 3 draw on my dissertation and research findings published in Linguistic Inquiry, and the discussion of labels and comparative correlatives in Chapter 5 builds on a paper published in Lingua.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my husband, Randy Collins, for more than I can express (in a second language), and Icarus (our Solomon Island eclectus parrot) for providing joy and distraction throughout the entire process.

I dedicate this book to the memory of my parents, Krystyna and Stanisław Citko.
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACC</td>
<td>accusative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPL</td>
<td>applicative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASP</td>
<td>aspect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CL</td>
<td>clitic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPR</td>
<td>comparative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAT</td>
<td>dative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEF</td>
<td>definite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEM</td>
<td>demonstrative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPP</td>
<td>Extended Projection Principle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXP</td>
<td>expletive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEM</td>
<td>feminine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FOC</td>
<td>focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FUT</td>
<td>future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FV</td>
<td>final vowel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEN</td>
<td>genitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAB</td>
<td>habitual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMPERF</td>
<td>imperfective (aspect)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INDEF</td>
<td>indefinite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INF</td>
<td>infinitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INSTR</td>
<td>instrumental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOC</td>
<td>locative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MASC</td>
<td>masculine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACT</td>
<td>non-active</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEG</td>
<td>negative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEUT</td>
<td>neuter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NML</td>
<td>nominalizer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOM</td>
<td>nominative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OA</td>
<td>object agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OB</td>
<td>object</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PASS</td>
<td>passive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PAST</td>
<td>past (tense)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PERF</td>
<td>perfective (aspect)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PL</td>
<td>plural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POSS</td>
<td>possessive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRES</td>
<td>present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROG</td>
<td>progressive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFL</td>
<td>reflexive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REL</td>
<td>relative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>subject agreement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE</td>
<td>se (reflexive marker)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SG</td>
<td>singular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SP</td>
<td>subject prefix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUBJ</td>
<td>subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAL</td>
<td>value</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>