

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00369-9 - *Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies*

Edited by Paige Arthur

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## IDENTITIES IN TRANSITION

In many societies, histories of exclusion, racism, and nationalist violence often create divisions so deep that finding a way to deal with the atrocities of the past seems nearly impossible. These societies face difficult practical questions about how to devise new state and civil-society institutions that will respond to massive or systematic violations of human rights, recognize victims, and prevent the recurrence of abuse.

*Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies* brings together a rich group of international researchers and practitioners who, for the first time, examine transitional justice through an “identity” lens. They tackle ways that transitional justice can act as a means of political learning across communities; foster citizenship, trust, and recognition; and break down harmful myths and stereotypes, as steps toward meeting the difficult challenges for transitional justice in divided societies.

Paige Arthur is Deputy Director of Institutional Development at the International Center for Transitional Justice (ICTJ), where she leads ICTJ’s initiatives in evaluating its impact, improving the effectiveness of its work, and knowledge management. Arthur was formerly ICTJ’s Deputy Director of Research. Before coming to ICTJ, she was an editor of the journal *Ethics & International Affairs*. Arthur was also the Senior Program Officer for the Ethics in a Violent World initiative at the Carnegie Council. She is the author of *Unfinished Projects: Decolonization and the Philosophy of Jean-Paul Sartre* (2010).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in  
Divided Societies

Edited by Paige Arthur

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# Identities in Transition

CHALLENGES FOR TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE  
IN DIVIDED SOCIETIES

Edited by

**PAIGE ARTHUR**

*International Center for Transitional Justice*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in  
Divided Societies  
Edited by Paige Arthur  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA  
[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107003699](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107003699)

© Cambridge University Press 2011

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2011

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Identities in transition : challenges for transitional justice in divided societies / edited by Paige Arthur.  
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00369-9

1. Transitional justice – Case studies. 2. Identity politics – Case studies. 3. Indigenous people – Case studies. I. Arthur, Paige.

JC571.I325 2010

323.11 – dc22 2010031508

ISBN 978-1-107-00369-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or  
third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on  
such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in  
Divided Societies  
Edited by Paige Arthur  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page vii</i>
<i>Author Bios</i>	<i>viii</i>
<b>Introduction: Identities in Transition</b> Paige Arthur	<b>1</b>
<b>PART I: IDENTITY IN TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE MEASURES</b>	
<b>1 Indigenous Peoples and Claims for Reparation: Tentative Steps in Peru and Guatemala</b> Ruth Rubio-Marín, Claudia Paz y Paz Bailey, and Julie Guillerot	<b>17</b>
<b>2 Truth Telling, Identities, and Power in South Africa and Guatemala</b> Madeleine Fullard and Nicky Rousseau	<b>54</b>
<b>3 Security System Reform and Identity in Divided Societies: Lessons from Northern Ireland</b> Mary O’Rawe	<b>87</b>
<b>4 Staging Violence, Staging Identities: Identity Politics in Domestic Prosecutions</b> Christiane Wilke	<b>118</b>
<b>5 International and Hybrid Criminal Tribunals: Reconciling or Stigmatizing?</b> Cécile Aptel	<b>149</b>

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in  
Divided Societies  
Edited by Paige Arthur  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
6	<b>Silences, Visibility, and Agency: Ethnicity, Class, and Gender in Public Memorialization</b> Elizabeth Jelin	187
<b>PART II: IDENTITIES, TRANSITION, AND TRANSFORMATION</b>		
7	<b>Canada and the Legacy of the Indian Residential Schools: Transitional Justice for Indigenous People in a Nontransitional Society</b> Courtney Jung	217
8	<b>Transitional Justice and the Rights of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples</b> Chris Chapman	251
9	<b>“Fear of the Future, Lived through the Past”: Pursuing Transitional Justice in the Wake of Ethnic Conflict</b> Paige Arthur	271
10	<b>Transitional Justice, Federalism, and the Accommodation of Minority Nationalism</b> Will Kymlicka	303
11	<b>History Education Reform, Transitional Justice, and the Transformation of Identities</b> Elizabeth A. Cole and Karen Murphy	334
	<i>Index</i>	369

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies

Edited by Paige Arthur

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Acknowledgments

I have been wrestling with the issue of identity for many years now, but I have not done so alone. I wish to thank all of the authors in this book for their patience and dedication to a difficult project and for their insight into the ways that identities have shaped their own societies' attempts to come to terms with the past. I would also like to thank participants in a 2008 meeting of the project who helped refine our thinking through their expert commentary: Anatole Ayissi, Seyla Benhabib, Rajeev Bhargava, Donald Horowitz, Mahmood Mamdani, and Dirk Moses.

This book would not have been possible without the help of so many colleagues at the International Center for Transitional Justice who have inspired and challenged me over the years. Special appreciation goes to my colleagues in the Research Unit, Pablo de Greiff, Roger Duthie, and Debbie Sharnak. Many interns have also provided superb assistance, including Neela Ghoshal, Maya Karwande, Alec Knight, Joanna Rice, Amy Taylor, and Megan Tierney.

At Cambridge University Press, John Berger has been a patient and supportive editor. My thanks to him.

Finally, I am deeply grateful for the support of our donors. They have understood all along how important and complex the real-world problems at the heart of this book really are. The seed money for this book was provided by the Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs. A grant from the International Development Research Centre in Canada saw it through its completion.

*Paige Arthur*  
*New York City, July 2010*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies

Edited by Paige Arthur

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Author Bios

**Cécile Aptel** is Jennings Randolph Senior Fellow at the United States Institute of Peace until the Summer of 2011, when she will join the Fletcher School, Tufts University, as Associate Professor of International Law. She has many years of practical experience in international criminal law and in transitional justice, and a particular interest in the protection of children in these contexts. She has considerable field experience in Africa, Europe, and the Middle East, where she worked for a range of organizations including the United Nations, the International Center for Transitional Justice, the International Criminal Tribunals for the former Yugoslavia and for Rwanda, the Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, and the “Hariri Commission” in Lebanon. Her research focuses on international criminal law, transitional justice, and child rights.

**Paige Arthur** is Deputy Director for Institutional Development at the International Center for Transitional Justice, where she leads ICTJ’s initiatives in evaluating its impact, improving the effectiveness of its work, and knowledge management. From 2006 to 2009, she was Deputy Director of ICTJ’s Research Unit. Before coming to ICTJ, she was an editor of the journal *Ethics & International Affairs*, published by the Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs. She was also the Senior Program Officer for the Ethics in a Violent World initiative at the Carnegie Council. She holds a PhD in European history, focusing on European decolonization, from the University of California, Berkeley, and a BA in international relations from the Johns Hopkins University. Her work has been published in *Human Rights Quarterly*, the *International Journal of Transitional Justice*, *Theory & Society*, and *Ethics & International Affairs*. She is the author of *Unfinished Projects: Decolonization and the Philosophy of Jean-Paul Sartre* (2010).

**Chris Chapman** is Head of Conflict Prevention at Minority Rights Group (MRG) International and is the author/coauthor of the following: “Why a Minority Rights Approach to Conflict: The Case of Southern Sudan,” “Minority Rights:

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies

Edited by Paige Arthur

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Author Bios

ix

The Key to Conflict Prevention,” “Uncertain Refuge, Dangerous Return: Iraq’s Uprooted Minorities,” and “Resolving Conflicts Using Traditional Mechanisms in the Karamoja and Teso Regions of Uganda.” Chapman has been working with MRG for nine years. Previously, he worked in Haiti on capacity building for conflict resolution and human rights monitoring, and as a journalist. He also worked in Guatemala as an observer/accompanier with an internally displaced community under the provisions of the peace accords. He holds a Master’s degree in armed conflict and crisis management from the Open University of Catalonia.

**Elizabeth A. Cole** is a Senior Program Officer at the United States Institute of Peace. Her interests are in long-term political and social reconciliation and social well-being following violent conflict or state repression, with a focus on history, history education, and education systems. She is the editor of *Teaching the Violent Past: History Education and Reconciliation* (2007); author of “Transitional Justice and the Reform of History Education,” in the *International Journal of Transitional Justice* (Vol. 1, No. 1, 2007); and coeditor, with Elazar Barkan and Kai Struve, of *Shared History–Divided Memory: Jews and Others in Soviet-Occupied Poland, 1939–1941* (2007). Cole holds a PhD in Slavic languages and literatures from Yale University and a BA in English literature with a concentration in Asian studies from Swarthmore College. She has studied in Poland, Russia, and Germany and lived and worked in China, in both Wuhan and Beijing.

**Madeleine Fullard** is a South African historian and was a Senior National Researcher at the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) in Cape Town, South Africa. Her research for the TRC included extensive archival analysis of the security records of the previous apartheid government, regional studies of political violence, studies of particular perpetrator groupings, and analysis of amnesty applications. She was part of the team responsible for writing the TRC’s Final Report. She is presently heading the Missing Persons Task Team, a government unit established in South Africa after the TRC to trace people who disappeared during political violence and recover their remains.

**Julie Guillerot** is a long-term ICTJ consultant in its Reparations Unit and Europe and Middle East/North Africa Programs. Between 2000 and 2006, she served as a researcher for the Association for Human Rights (APRODEH) in Peru. In 2003, she became a researcher for the technical team on reparations of the Peruvian Truth and Reconciliation Commission. Among other publications, she is coauthor of *Memorias de un proceso inacabado. Reparaciones en la transición peruana* (2006) and is author of “Linking Gender and Reparations in Peru: A Failed Opportunity” in Ruth Rubio-Marín, ed., *What Happened to the Women? Gender and Reparations for Human Rights Violations* (2006). She is Lecturer in the Master’s course in transitional justice at the Catholic University of Peru.



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies

Edited by Paige Arthur

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

*Author Bios*

**Elizabeth Jelin** is Senior Researcher at Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (CONICET) and at Instituto de Desarrollo Económico y Social (IDES), both in Buenos Aires. She obtained a PhD in sociology at the University of Texas at Austin. Jelin was the Academic Director of the Program on “Collective Memories of Repression: Comparative Perspectives on Democratization Processes in Latin America’s Southern Cone” sponsored by the Social Science Research Council, New York, 1998–2002, and editor of the book series *Memorias de la Represión*. Jelin is the academic director of the “Núcleo de Estudios sobre Memoria” (at IDES) and a member of editorial committees and boards of a number of journals and institutions in the social sciences. Her research projects and publications deal with human rights, citizenship, social movements, gender, family, and memories of repression.

**Courtney Jung** is Professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto. She received her PhD from Yale University in 1998. She works primarily at the intersection of comparative politics and contemporary political theory, trying to engage normative debates about liberalism, multiculturalism, deliberation, and democratic participation through research into political organization and identity formation, mainly in South Africa and Mexico. She has been a Fulbright Scholar and a Member at the Institute for Advanced Study, and she has received grants from the Mellon Foundation and the Social Science and Humanities Research Council. She won a Choice Outstanding Title Award for her first book, *Then I Was Black: South African Political Identities in Transition* (2000). Her second book, *The Moral Force of Indigenous Politics: Critical Liberalism and the Zapatistas* (Cambridge University Press), was published in 2008.

**Will Kymlicka** is the Canada Research Chair in Political Philosophy at Queen’s University and a visiting professor in the Nationalism Studies program at the Central European University in Budapest. A noted theorist of minority rights and liberal multiculturalism, Kymlicka is the author of six books, including *Liberalism, Community, and Culture* (1989); *Multicultural Citizenship* (1995), which was awarded the Macpherson Prize by the Canadian Political Science Association and the Ralph J. Bunche Award by the American Political Science Association; and *Multicultural Odysseys* (2007). He is the coeditor, with Bashir Bashir, of *The Politics of Reconciliation in Multicultural Societies* (2008).

**Karen Murphy**, PhD, is the Director of International Programs for Facing History and Ourselves, an international educational and professional development NGO. Murphy oversees Facing History’s program development and implementation in countries outside the United States and Canada. Her particular focus is on countries emerging from mass violence, including Bosnia, Colombia, Northern Ireland, Rwanda, and South Africa, and she is interested in the role that educational interventions play in the development of stability and peaceful coexistence. Murphy is

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00369-9 - *Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies*

Edited by Paige Arthur

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Author Bios*

xi

also a member of Facing History's R&D team. She has developed a Web-based module that explores transitional justice processes in Germany, Northern Ireland, Rwanda, and South Africa. Murphy has also published journal articles, presented papers, and lectured on the role of education in transitional justice. She is a member of the Technical Expert Group for the Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies, and she is codirecting a multiyear research project studying youth and civic engagement in the United States, Northern Ireland, and South Africa.

**Mary O'Rawe** is a barrister and Senior Lecturer in the School of Law at the University of Ulster. O'Rawe holds an LLM in human rights, emergency law, and discrimination from Queen's University Belfast, and has extensive experience as a legal practitioner, NGO activist, and human rights consultant. She is a former Chair of the Committee on the Administration of Justice (CAJ) and cofounder of the Northern Ireland Lawyers' Section of Amnesty International. Over the past twenty years, she has researched extensively in the field of criminal justice and human rights, with her main focus being on policing in societies in transition. She coauthored CAJ's "Human Rights on Duty: Principles for Better Policing" and has authored several book chapters and journal articles in the area of human rights and policing. O'Rawe has worked in a strategic advisory and training role with various governmental and nongovernmental organizations such as An Garda Síochána (the Irish Police Service), the PSNI (Police Service of Northern Ireland), the Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission, and the Northern Ireland Bill of Rights Forum, among other bodies. She is currently a member of the Northern Ireland Coroners' Panel of Counsel.

**Claudia Paz y Paz Bailey** is the Director of the Training Unit of the Instituto de Estudios Comparados en Ciencias Penales de Guatemala. A lawyer, she has completed her doctoral studies in criminal law and human rights and was a researcher for the Commission for Historical Clarification (Comisión para el Esclarecimiento Histórico) in Guatemala. She is a lecturer in the Master's course in criminal law at the University of San Carlos in Guatemala, and she has carried out various research projects on the administration of justice in Guatemala.

**Nicky Rousseau** teaches in the history department at the University of the Western Cape in Cape Town, South Africa. From 1996 to 2002, she worked as a Senior Researcher at the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) and was part of the team that wrote the TRC's seven-volume report. Since leaving the TRC, she has coauthored several articles with former TRC researcher Madeleine Fullard, with whom she is also collaborating on a longer-term writing project. She has worked as a consultant researcher to South Africa's National Prosecuting Authority on post-TRC investigations, prosecutions, and missing persons. She is a former Rockefeller Research Fellow at the Center for the Study of Public Scholarship at Emory University in Atlanta.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-00369-9 - Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies

Edited by Paige Arthur

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

**Ruth Rubio-Marín** holds a Chair in Comparative Public Law at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy. Formerly, she was Professor of Constitutional Law at the University of Seville, Spain, and a member of the faculty of the Hauser Global Law School Program at New York University. She is the author of *Immigration as a Democratic Challenge* (2000), coeditor of *The Gender of Constitutional Jurisprudence* (2004), editor of *What Happened to the Women? Gender and Reparations for Human Rights Violations* (2006), and editor of *The Gender of Reparations* (2009).

**Christiane Wilke** is Associate Professor in the Department of Law at Carleton University, Canada. She earned her PhD in political science at the New School for Social Research and is managing editor of the *Canadian Journal of Law and Society*. Her research on transitional justice, human rights, antiterrorism policies, international law, and ghosts is published in journals such as *Constellations*, *Politics & Society*, *Journal of Human Rights*, and *Law & Critique*. She received the 2004 Best Paper Award of the Political Theory Section of the American Political Science Association as well as a 2006 Law & Humanities Junior Scholar paper award. Her current book project examines how criminal trials for massive human rights violations construct the idea of “transition” through reconceptualizing responsibility, victimhood, and legality.