In many societies, histories of exclusion, racism, and nationalist violence often create divisions so deep that finding a way to deal with the atrocities of the past seems nearly impossible. These societies face difficult practical questions about how to devise new state and civil-society institutions that will respond to massive or systematic violations of human rights, recognize victims, and prevent the recurrence of abuse.

*Identities in Transition: Challenges for Transitional Justice in Divided Societies* brings together a rich group of international researchers and practitioners who, for the first time, examine transitional justice through an “identity” lens. They tackle ways that transitional justice can act as a means of political learning across communities; foster citizenship, trust, and recognition; and break down harmful myths and stereotypes, as steps toward meeting the difficult challenges for transitional justice in divided societies.

Paige Arthur is Deputy Director of Institutional Development at the International Center for Transitional Justice (ICTJ), where she leads ICTJ’s initiatives in evaluating its impact, improving the effectiveness of its work, and knowledge management. Arthur was formerly ICTJ’s Deputy Director of Research. Before coming to ICTJ, she was an editor of the journal *Ethics & International Affairs*. Arthur was also the Senior Program Officer for the Ethics in a Violent World initiative at the Carnegie Council. She is the author of *Unfinished Projects: Decolonization and the Philosophy of Jean-Paul Sartre* (2010).
Identities in Transition

CHALLENGES FOR TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE
IN DIVIDED SOCIETIES

Edited by

PAIGE ARTHUR

International Center for Transitional Justice
Contents

Acknowledgments vii
Author Bios viii

Introduction: Identities in Transition 1
Paige Arthur

PART I: IDENTITY IN TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE MEASURES

1 Indigenous Peoples and Claims for Reparation: Tentative Steps in Peru and Guatemala 17
   Ruth Rubio-Marín, Claudia Paz y Paz Bailey, and Julie Guillerot

2 Truth Telling, Identities, and Power in South Africa and Guatemala 54
   Madeleine Fullard and Nicky Rousseau

3 Security System Reform and Identity in Divided Societies: Lessons from Northern Ireland 87
   Mary O’Rawe

4 Staging Violence, Staging Identities: Identity Politics in Domestic Prosecutions 118
   Christiane Wilke

5 International and Hybrid Criminal Tribunals: Reconciling or Stigmatizing? 149
   Cécile Aptel
Contents

6 Silences, Visibility, and Agency: Ethnicity, Class, and Gender in Public Memorialization
Elizabeth Jelin

PART II: IDENTITIES, TRANSITION, AND TRANSFORMATION

7 Canada and the Legacy of the Indian Residential Schools: Transitional Justice for Indigenous People in a Nontransitional Society
Courtney Jung

8 Transitional Justice and the Rights of Minorities and Indigenous Peoples
Chris Chapman

9 “Fear of the Future, Lived through the Past”: Pursuing Transitional Justice in the Wake of Ethnic Conflict
Paige Arthur

10 Transitional Justice, Federalism, and the Accommodation of Minority Nationalism
Will Kymlicka

11 History Education Reform, Transitional Justice, and the Transformation of Identities
Elizabeth A. Cole and Karen Murphy

Index
Acknowledgments

I have been wrestling with the issue of identity for many years now, but I have not done so alone. I wish to thank all of the authors in this book for their patience and dedication to a difficult project and for their insight into the ways that identities have shaped their own societies’ attempts to come to terms with the past. I would also like to thank participants in a 2008 meeting of the project who helped refine our thinking through their expert commentary: Anatole Ayissi, Seyla Benhabib, Rajeev Bhargava, Donald Horowitz, Mahmood Mamdani, and Dirk Moses.

This book would not have been possible without the help of so many colleagues at the International Center for Transitional Justice who have inspired and challenged me over the years. Special appreciation goes to my colleagues in the Research Unit, Pablo de Greiff, Roger Duthie, and Debbie Sharnak. Many interns have also provided superb assistance, including Neela Ghoshal, Maya Karwande, Alec Knight, Joanna Rice, Amy Taylor, and Megan Tierney.

At Cambridge University Press, John Berger has been a patient and supportive editor. My thanks to him.

Finally, I am deeply grateful for the support of our donors. They have understood all along how important and complex the real-world problems at the heart of this book really are. The seed money for this book was provided by the Swiss Federal Department of Foreign Affairs. A grant from the International Development Research Centre in Canada saw it through its completion.

Paige Arthur
New York City, July 2010
Author Bios

Cécile Aptel is Jennings Randolph Senior Fellow at the United States Institute of Peace until the Summer of 2011, when she will join the Fletcher School, Tufts University, as Associate Professor of International Law. She has many years of practical experience in international criminal law and in transitional justice, and a particular interest in the protection of children in these contexts. She has considerable field experience in Africa, Europe, and the Middle East, where she worked for a range of organizations including the United Nations, the International Center for Transitional Justice, the International Criminal Tribunals for the former Yugoslavia and for Rwanda, the Court of Bosnia-Herzegovina, and the “Hariri Commission” in Lebanon. Her research focuses on international criminal law, transitional justice, and child rights.

Paige Arthur is Deputy Director for Institutional Development at the International Center for Transitional Justice, where she leads ICTJ’s initiatives in evaluating its impact, improving the effectiveness of its work, and knowledge management. From 2006 to 2009, she was Deputy Director of ICTJ’s Research Unit. Before coming to ICTJ, she was an editor of the journal Ethics & International Affairs, published by the Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs. She was also the Senior Program Officer for the Ethics in a Violent World initiative at the Carnegie Council. She holds a PhD in European history, focusing on European decolonization, from the University of California, Berkeley, and a BA in international relations from the Johns Hopkins University. Her work has been published in Human Rights Quarterly, the International Journal of Transitional Justice, Theory & Society, and Ethics & International Affairs. She is the author of Unfinished Projects: Decolonization and the Philosophy of Jean-Paul Sartre (2010).

Chris Chapman is Head of Conflict Prevention at Minority Rights Group (MRG) International and is the author/coauthor of the following: “Why a Minority Rights Approach to Conflict: The Case of Southern Sudan,” “Minority Rights:
Author Bios

Chad D. Chapman is an American conflict prevention specialist who has published on conflict prevention, displacement, and the Karamoja and Teso regions. Chapman has collaborated with the Movement for the Rights of the Griots (MRG) for nine years. Previously, he has worked on capacity building projects in Haiti and as a journalist. He has lived and worked in Guatemala as an observer/accompanier with an internally displaced community. Chapman holds a Master's degree in armed conflict and crisis management from the Open University of Catalonia.

Elizabeth A. Cole is a Senior Program Officer at the United States Institute of Peace with a focus on reconciliation and social well-being following violent conflict. She has contributed to the field of history education and reconciliation and has published extensively on the topic. Cole holds a PhD in Slavic languages and literatures from Yale University and a BA in English literature with a concentration in Asian studies from Swarthmore College. She has studied in Poland, Russia, and Germany and has lived and worked in China.

Madeleine Fullard is a South African historian and researcher at the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) in Cape Town, South Africa. Her research included archival analysis of security records of the apartheid government, studies of political violence, and analysis of amnesty applications. She was part of the team responsible for writing the TRC’s Final Report. She is now heading the Missing Persons Task Team in South Africa after the TRC.

Julie Guillerot is a consultant in ICTJ’s Reparations Unit and has worked with the Peruvian Truth and Reconciliation Commission, researching reparations and gender. Guillerot has published extensively on reparations in Peru and has contributed to the field of transitional justice. She holds a Master’s course in transitional justice at the Catholic University of Peru.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org
Author Bios

Elizabeth Jelin is Senior Researcher at Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (CONICET) and at Instituto de Desarrollo Económico y Social (IDES), both in Buenos Aires. She obtained a PhD in sociology at the University of Texas at Austin. Jelin was the Academic Director of the Program on “Collective Memories of Repression: Comparative Perspectives on Democratization Processes in Latin America’s Southern Cone” sponsored by the Social Science Research Council, New York, 1998–2002, and editor of the book series Memorias de la Represión. Jelin is the academic director of the “Núcleo de Estudios sobre Memoria” (at IDES) and a member of editorial committees and boards of a number of journals and institutions in the social sciences. Her research projects and publications deal with human rights, citizenship, social movements, gender, family, and memories of repression.

Courtney Jung is Professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto. She received her PhD from Yale University in 1998. She works primarily at the intersection of comparative politics and contemporary political theory, trying to engage normative debates about liberalism, multiculturalism, deliberation, and democratic participation through research into political organization and identity formation, mainly in South Africa and Mexico. She has been a Fulbright Scholar and a Member at the Institute for Advanced Study, and she has received grants from the Mellon Foundation and the Social Science and Humanities Research Council. She won a Choice Outstanding Title Award for her first book, Then I Was Black: South African Political Identities in Transition (2000). Her second book, The Moral Force of Indigenous Politics: Critical Liberalism and the Zapatistas (Cambridge University Press), was published in 2008.

Will Kymlicka is the Canada Research Chair in Political Philosophy at Queen’s University and a visiting professor in the Nationalism Studies program at the Central European University in Budapest. A noted theorist of minority rights and liberal multiculturalism, Kymlicka is the author of six books, including Liberalism, Community, and Culture (1989); Multicultural Citizenship (1995), which was awarded the Macpherson Prize by the Canadian Political Science Association and the Ralph J. Bunche Award by the American Political Science Association; and Multicultural Odysseys (2007). He is the coeditor, with Bashir Bashir, of The Politics of Reconciliation in Multicultural Societies (2008).

Karen Murphy, PhD, is the Director of International Programs for Facing History and Ourselves, an international educational and professional development NGO. Murphy oversees Facing History’s program development and implementation in countries outside the United States and Canada. Her particular focus is on countries emerging from mass violence, including Bosnia, Colombia, Northern Ireland, Rwanda, and South Africa, and she is interested in the role that educational interventions play in the development of stability and peaceful coexistence. Murphy is
also a member of Facing History’s R&D team. She has developed a Web-based module that explores transitional justice processes in Germany, Northern Ireland, Rwanda, and South Africa. Murphy has also published journal articles, presented papers, and lectured on the role of education in transitional justice. She is a member of the Technical Expert Group for the Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies, and she is codirecting a multiyear research project studying youth and civic engagement in the United States, Northern Ireland, and South Africa.

Mary O’Rawe is a barrister and Senior Lecturer in the School of Law at the University of Ulster. O’Rawe holds an LLM in human rights, emergency law, and discrimination from Queen’s University Belfast, and has extensive experience as a legal practitioner, NGO activist, and human rights consultant. She is a former Chair of the Committee on the Administration of Justice (CAJ) and cofounder of the Northern Ireland Lawyers’ Section of Amnesty International. Over the past twenty years, she has researched extensively in the field of criminal justice and human rights, with her main focus being on policing in societies in transition. She coauthored CAJ’s “Human Rights on Duty: Principles for Better Policing” and has authored several book chapters and journal articles in the area of human rights and policing. O’Rawe has worked in a strategic advisory and training role with various governmental and nongovernmental organizations such as An Garda Síochána (the Irish Police Service), the PSNI (Police Service of Northern Ireland), the Northern Ireland Human Rights Commission, and the Northern Ireland Bill of Rights Forum, among other bodies. She is currently a member of the Northern Ireland Coroners’ Panel of Counsel.

Claudia Paz y Paz Bailey is the Director of the Training Unit of the Instituto de Estudios Comparados en Ciencias Penales de Guatemala. A lawyer, she has completed her doctoral studies in criminal law and human rights and was a researcher for the Commission for Historical Clarification (Comision para el Esclarecimiento Historico) in Guatemala. She is a lecturer in the Master’s course in criminal law at the University of San Carlos in Guatemala, and she has carried out various research projects on the administration of justice in Guatemala.

Nicky Rousseau teaches in the history department at the University of the Western Cape in Cape Town, South Africa. From 1996 to 2002, she worked as a Senior Researcher at the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) and was part of the team that wrote the TRC’s seven-volume report. Since leaving the TRC, she has coauthored several articles with former TRC researcher Madeleine Fullard, with whom she is also collaborating on a longer-term writing project. She has worked as a consultant researcher to South Africa’s National Prosecuting Authority on post-TRC investigations, prosecutions, and missing persons. She is a former Rockefeller Research Fellow at the Center for the Study of Public Scholarship at Emory University in Atlanta.
Author Bios

Ruth Rubio-Marín holds a Chair in Comparative Public Law at the European University Institute in Florence, Italy. Formerly, she was Professor of Constitutional Law at the University of Seville, Spain, and a member of the faculty of the Hauser Global Law School Program at New York University. She is the author of *Immigration as a Democratic Challenge* (2000), coeditor of *The Gender of Constitutional Jurisprudence* (2004), editor of *What Happened to the Women? Gender and Reparations for Human Rights Violations* (2006), and editor of *The Gender of Reparations* (2009).

Christiane Wilke is Associate Professor in the Department of Law at Carleton University, Canada. She earned her PhD in political science at the New School for Social Research and is managing editor of the *Canadian Journal of Law and Society*. Her research on transitional justice, human rights, antiterrorism policies, international law, and ghosts is published in journals such as *Constellations, Politics & Society, Journal of Human Rights*, and *Law & Critique*. She received the 2004 Best Paper Award of the Political Theory Section of the American Political Science Association as well as a 2006 Law & Humanities Junior Scholar paper award. Her current book project examines how criminal trials for massive human rights violations construct the idea of “transition” through reconceptualizing responsibility, victimhood, and legality.