Scandal of Colonial Rule

In 1806 General Thomas Picton, Britain’s first governor of Trinidad, was brought to trial for the torture of a free mulatto named Louisa Calderon and for overseeing a regime of terror over the island’s slave population. James Epstein offers a fascinating account of the unfolding of this colonial drama. He shows the ways in which the trial and its investigation brought empire “home” and exposed the disjunction between a national self-image of humane governance and the brutal realities of colonial rule. He uses the trial to open up a range of issues, including colonial violence and norms of justice, the status of the British subject, imperial careering, visions of development after slavery, slave conspiracy, and the colonial archive. He reveals how Britain’s imperial regime became more authoritarian, hierarchical and militarized but also how unease about abuses of power and of the rights of colonial subjects began to grow.

Critical Perspectives on Empire

Editors
Professor Catherine Hall
*University College London*

Professor Mrinalini Sinha
*Pennsylvania State University*

Professor Kathleen Wilson
*State University of New York, Stony Brook*

Critical Perspectives on Empire is a major series of ambitious, cross-disciplinary works in the emerging field of critical imperial studies. Books in the series explore the connections, exchanges and mediations at the heart of national and global histories, the contributions of local as well as metropolitan knowledge, and the flows of people, ideas and identities facilitated by colonial contact. To that end, the series not only offers a space for outstanding scholars working at the intersection of several disciplines to bring to wider attention the impact of their work; it also takes a leading role in reconfiguring contemporary historical and critical knowledge, of the past and of ourselves.

A full list of titles published in the series can be found at:

www.cambridge.org/cpempire
Scandal of Colonial Rule

*Power and Subversion in the British Atlantic during the Age of Revolution*

James Epstein
For Sherry

“... for man always seeks a happiness far beyond that which is meted out to him. But man's greatness consists in the very fact of wanting to be better than he is. In laying duties upon himself.”

ALEJO CARPENTIER  The Kingdom of this World

“But chief, ambiguous man, he that can know More misery, and dream more joy than all... Who stands amid the ever varying world, The burden or the glory of the earth.”

P. B. SHELLEY  Queen Mab
## Contents

*List of illustrations and maps*  
*Acknowledgments*  
*Cast of characters*  
*List of abbreviations*  
*Maps*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Politics of colonial sensation</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 A gentleman’s way in the world</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 “Only answerable to God and conscience”: justice unbounded by law</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Ruling narratives</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 The radical underworld goes colonial</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 In search of free labor</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Conspiracy in the archive</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Epilogue: moving on</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Index</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

List of illustrations and maps  
page viii  
Acknowledgments  
x  
Cast of characters  
xii  
List of abbreviations  
xix  
Maps  
xxi–xxiii
Illustrations and maps

1 Statue of General Sir Thomas Picton, St. Paul's Cathedral, London.  page 16
2 Louisa Calderon on the picquet. From *The Trial of Governor T. Picton, for Inflicting the Torture on Louisa Calderon* (1806), published by B. Crosby. Courtesy Rare Book Collection, Lillian Goldman Law Library, Yale Law School. 21
3 Louisa Calderon’s torture aestheticized. From [P. F. McCallum], *Trial of Thomas Picton ... Late Governor of the Island of Trinidad for Torturing Louisa Calderon* (1806). Reproduced by permission of The Huntington Library, San Marino, California. 36
5 Title page from B. Crosby’s edition of *The Trial of Governor T. Picton* (1806). General Research Division, The New York Public Library. 39
6 “The Torture,” illustration by “Phiz” (Hablot Knight Browne). From *Chronicles of Crime; or, the New Newgate Calendar*, 2 vols. (1841), vol. I. By permission of the British Library. 43
7 Fullarton House (west front view), Troon, Ayrshire. By permission of the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland. 78
8 “Portrait of the late Author” From P. F. McCallum, *The Rival Queens, or Which is the Darling? . . . In Answer to Mrs. Clarke’s “Rival Princes”* (1810). Photo courtesy of the Newberry Library. 182
List of illustrations and maps ix

9 William Layman’s calculations for “Capital necessary to establish a Sugar Plantation and to Cultivate the Island of Trinidad,” with slaves compared with Chinese labor. National Archives, UK, CO 296/4. 209

MAPS
1 The Caribbean, 1803. page xxi
2 William Faden’s “Map of Trinidad with the Gulf of Paria,” from F. Mallet, Descriptive Account of the Island of Trinidad (1802). Photo courtesy of the Newberry Library. xxii
3 The expansion of the British Empire in India. xxiii
I first gave a paper on the trial of Thomas Picton at a gathering at the University of Houston to honor Richard Blackett, who subsequently became my colleague at Vanderbilt. In 2002, I had no idea that this would lead to years of research and the writing of a book. Historical curiosity is a strange calling.

First, I must gratefully acknowledge the generous institutional support that I have received, including a National Endowment for the Humanities fellowship at the Newberry Library during 2006–07, a Franklin Research Scholar Grant from the American Philosophical Society in 2003, an Andrew W. Mellon Foundation Fellowship at the Huntington Library in summer 2001, and two Research Scholar Grants in 2002–03 and 2005–06 from Vanderbilt University. Chapter 1 draws on an article which previously appeared in the American Historical Review; Chapter 4 is a revised version of a chapter from Unrespectable Radicals? Popular Politics in the Age of Reform, edited by Michael Davis and Paul Pickering and published by Ashgate Press; and Chapter 5 draws on chapters that appeared in Gender, Labour, War, and Empire, edited by Philippa Levine and Susan Grayzel and published by Palgrave Macmillan, and in The Peculiarities of Liberal Modernity in Imperial Britain, edited by Simon Gunn and James Vernon and published by the University of California Press. I am grateful to the presses for permission to republish these materials and to the editors for their helpful comments.

Over the years I have accumulated a substantial debt to friends and colleagues. At Vanderbilt, Richard Blackett and Jane Landers, both of whom know far more than I do about Caribbean history, sent references my way and welcomed my trespass into their waters. Members of Richard’s family greeted me with marvelous hospitality during a rainy research trip to Port of Spain. I have also learned much in my discussions with Catherine Molineux, whose own work in Atlantic history inspires admiration. Samira Sheikh kindly read Chapter 2, and suggested additional readings which helped to deepen my understanding of South Asian history. As for Peter Lake, I can hardly believe my good
luck to have an office across the hallway from his den of disarray. For their intellectual passion, encouragement, and flow of ideas on law, literature, and history, I am grateful to Colin Dayan and Jonathan Lamb, colleagues in the English department. Farther from home, many friends and colleagues have read drafts, discussed common interests, offered advice, and directed me to sources that I might otherwise have missed; these include Donna Andrew, John Beattie, Christopher Brown, Trevor Burnard, Kit Candlin, Leon Fink, Jenna Gibbs, Iain McCalman, Richard Price, Nick Rogers, Sonya Rose, James Vernon, Dror Wahrman, and Martin Wiener. It is a distinct pleasure to thank Bridget Brereton for sharing her unrivaled knowledge of Trinidad’s history, and for generously reading and commenting on parts of this book. I have acknowledged more specific debts in my notes.

I feel most fortunate to have Catherine Hall, Mrinalini Sinha, and Kathleen Wilson as series editors. Beyond reading the manuscript and offering their generous comments, their own scholarship has influenced the way in which I, and many others, conceive the project of imperial history. Michael Watson helped to shape the final version of this book; it has been a pleasure to work with him, and with Chloe Howell at Cambridge University Press. I am hugely grateful to Philippa Levine, friend of long standing, who read the entire manuscript with unfailing candor couched in praise. Finally, I dedicate this book to Sherry Baird, who believed in this project when I had my doubts, and supported me throughout.
Cast of characters

ADDINGTON, HENRY, first Viscount Sidmouth (1757–1844), prime minister. Addington was speaker of the House of Commons from 1789 to 1801. He took over as prime minister from William Pitt in 1801; his ministry fell from power in 1804, and Pitt again formed a ministry. Addington oversaw the peace negotiations with France in 1801, and took an active role in plans for Trinidad. In 1805 he was elevated to the peerage as Viscount Sidmouth. As home secretary under Lord Liverpool, from 1812 to 1822, he won popular radicals’ hatred for the state repression of the post-war years.

BARHAM, JOSEPH FOSTER, II (1750–1832), planter and politician. Barham was an absentee owner who inherited Jamaican plantations from his father. He entered Parliament in 1793, and over his thirty-year parliamentary career supported slave abolition. He proposed importing Chinese or Indian free labor to the West Indies, and offered to use one of his own Jamaican plantations for a free-labor experiment. Barham was later to grow disillusioned with the prospects for moral improvement of blacks, maintaining that they would work only under coercion.

BEGORRAT, SAINT HILAIRE (1759–1851), planter. Born in Martinique of a merchant family and educated in Paris, Begorrat moved to Trinidad in 1784, settling in the valley of Diego Martin, where he established a coffee plantation. He later began cultivating sugar at his Reunion plantation, becoming one of the island’s largest and most prominent planters. Following the British capture of the island, Governor Picton relied heavily on Begorrat’s advice. As well as being a member of the cabildo and governor’s appointed council, Begorrat drew up Trinidad’s new slave code in 1801 and presided over the poisoning commissions that sentenced slaves to death. As alcalde, he instigated Louisa Calderon’s torture.

CALDERON, LOUISA [LUISA] (1786/88–1825), free woman of color. Calderon was baptized at Port of Spain, the daughter of Maria
del Rosario Calderon, a free woman of color who had migrated from the eastern coast of Venezuela to Trinidad. Tortured in 1801, on Governor Picton's order, accused of being an accomplice to a burglary, she had her case against Picton first tried at King's Bench in 1806 and then retried in 1808; she gave testimony at both trials. Her case became a cause célèbre. She returned in 1808 to Port of Spain, where she died in poverty.

DOWDING, WILLIAM, trader and advocate of the rights of free coloreds. Born into a prosperous free-colored family in Barbados, he went to England for education and served in the British Royal Navy. During the 1790s, he was in touch with free persons of color throughout parts of the British West Indies. Before arriving in Trinidad in 1800, he had been banished from Grenada, St. Vincent, and Martinique. He sued Picton in King's Bench for financial loses arising from his banishment from Trinidad, and his subsequent imprisonment. After he was freed by Fullarton, Hislop again banished him from the island in 1803.

DRAPER, EDWARD ALURED (1776–1841), military officer. Draper entered military service in the 1790s, rising to the rank of colonel; he acted as military secretary to Lieutenant-General William Grinfield, commander of the armed forces in the West Indies in 1803. A staunch defender of Picton, in 1806 he published An Address to the British Public, on the Case of Brigadier-General Picton. In 1810 he was sued in King's Bench and found guilty of having libeled Fullarton. In 1812 Draper moved to Mauritius, where he held various civil posts, married a Mauritian woman, and founded the Mauritius Turf Club.

DUNDAS, HENRY, first Viscount Melville (1742–1811), politician. Dundas entered Parliament in 1774; he established control over Scotland's electoral system, and eventually formed a partnership with William Pitt. He had a strong interest in empire, and played an important role in shaping policy in India. He held key posts in Pitt's first ministry (1783–1801), including that of secretary of war with responsibility for the colonies, in which capacity he commended Picton for bringing order to Trinidad. He viewed war with France as largely economic, strongly supported war in the West Indies, and opposed slave abolition. In 1802 he was elevated to the peerage, and in 1805, as Viscount Melville, became the last British minister to be impeached by the Commons.

FULLARTON, MARIANNE HAMILTON (1764–1838). The eldest daughter of George, fifth Lord Reay, chief of the McKay clan, and Elizabeth Fairlie, she married William Fullarton in 1792, and accompanied her husband, together with her unmarried sister, Georgina, to Trinidad. She played an active role in Fullarton's political life, and in public correspondence defended her husband's reputation following his death, as well as her own personal reputation.
FULLARTON, WILLIAM (1754–1808), politician, military officer, writer, colonial official. As the only son of William Fullarton, in 1758 he inherited a large estate in Ayrshire at his father's death. He attended Edinburgh University, after which he went on the grand tour, entered the Inns of Court, and then joined the diplomatic service. He was elected to Parliament in 1779; he was named to occasional rank as lieutenant-colonel in 1780, and fought from 1781 to 1784 in the second Mysore war, where he commanded the southern army. In 1787 he returned to Parliament. He and his wife, Marianne, resided at Fullarton House near Troon. Fullarton wrote extensively on government and military reform in India; he also gained a reputation for his writings and experiments on agricultural improvement. In 1802 he was appointed first commissioner of the government of Trinidad, where he clashed with the former governor, Thomas Picton, against whom he brought criminal charges. His determined pursuit of Picton dominated his final years.

GLOSTER, ARCHIBALD (b. 1762), lawyer and planter. Gloster was born in Antigua. He later moved to St. Vincent, where he was attorney general, a position that he subsequently held at Trinidad. As Trinidad's attorney general, he advised the British government on legal and constitutional issues. He supported Picton, gave testimony in 1806 at his trial, and wrote pseudonymously for the *Anti-Jacobin Review*. In 1810 he was appointed chief justice in Grenada. His brother, John Gloster, was among the planters most active in detecting the slave conspiracy of Christmas 1805.

HISLOP, SIR THOMAS (1764–1843), military officer and colonial governor. Born into a military family, Hislop served widely. He was the military commander of Demerara, Berbice, and Essequibo from their capture in 1796 until their restoration to the Dutch in 1802. He was appointed lieutenant-governor (subsequently governor) of Trinidad in 1803, a post he left in 1811. He presided over the investigation of Trinidad's 1805 Christmas conspiracy, and the trial of those thought to have been involved. As commander-in-chief of the army of the Deccan during the third Anglo-Maratha war, Lieutenant-General Sir Thomas Hislop slaughtered a garrison of 300 Marathas in 1818 for their commander's refusal to surrender the fort of Talnar.

HOBART, ROBERT, fourth Earl of Buckinghamshire (1760–1816), politician. Hobart served as a military officer in North America (1778–83) and in Ireland, after which he held various government positions in Ireland. As a member of the Irish Parliament and the Privy Council, he defended the protestant ascendancy. From 1794 to 1798, he served as governor of Madras. On his return to Britain, he sat in the
Lords, and in 1801 Addington named him to his cabinet as secretary for war and the colonies. He promptly appointed his brother-in-law, John Sullivan, as chief secretary; he secured Fullarton’s appointment as first commissioner of Trinidad’s government, also naming his stepson, George Adderley, provost-marshal. As an abolitionist, he took particular interest in schemes to bring free labor to Trinidad. In 1804 the new town of Hobart in Van Diemen’s Island was named for him.

HOOD, SIR SAMUEL (1762–1814), naval officer. Hood entered the Royal Navy in 1776; he fought in the West Indies and North America, being given promotions from his cousin, Lord Samuel Hood; he later served under Admiral Lord Nelson. In March 1803, Commodore Hood arrived at Trinidad to assume his appointment as third commissioner, in charge of naval affairs; he sided with Picton against Fullarton. After his short stay at Trinidad, he assumed command of the Leeward Islands station. In 1805 his right elbow was shattered by a musket ball and his arm was amputated. He stood as the Tory candidate and a naval hero at the Westminster election of 1806; denounced by Fullarton at the hustings for his complicity in Picton’s crimes, Hood topped the poll. In 1809 he was created a baronet in recognition of his naval service.

LAYMAN, WILLIAM (1768–1828), naval officer. In 1802 Captain Layman outlined the most ambitious plan for bringing Chinese workers to Trinidad in order to substitute free labor for that of slaves. In 1807 he published his plan under the title *Outline of a Plan for Better Cultivation, Security, & Defence of the British West Indies Being the Original Suggestion for Providing an Effective Substitute for the African Slave Trade*. By that time, however, he had fallen out of favor. A protégé of Admiral Lord Nelson, he was held responsible for losing a ship with secret dispatches for the admiral off the Spanish coast in 1805; although he remained in the navy, he lost his seniority and was never given command of another ship. In 1813 he published a pamphlet dealing with the supply of timber for the navy.

MACARTNEY, GEORGE, EARL MACARTNEY (1737–1806), diplomat and colonial governor. Born in Ireland of Scottish descent, he was first appointed British envoy to Russia and in 1767 ambassador. Having married the daughter of the former prime minister, Lord Bute, he became chief secretary in Ireland; in 1775 he was appointed governor of Madras (a post worth £15,000 p.a.), he fell out with Governor-General Warren Hastings. During the second Mysore war (1780–84), he became Fullarton’s friend and patron, a role he continued to play. In 1792 Macartney headed Britain’s unsuccessful...
embassy to Peking, with the goal of opening trade with China. In 1796 he accepted the governorship of the Cape.

McCALLUM, PIERRE FRANC (d. 1810), journalist and traveler. Born probably in Glenorchy in Scotland, McCallum went abroad at an early age (perhaps as a sailor), and subsequently worked as a Grub Street journalist in London before heading for North America. In 1802 he sailed to Saint-Domingue as a supercargo on a merchant vessel, and claimed to have made cause with Toussaint Louverture, leader of the Haitian revolution. He arrived at Trinidad early in 1803, allying himself closely with Fullarton and British inhabitants who demanded constitutional reform. His book *Travels in Trinidad* (1805) records the history of British rule on the island; he also published a version of Picton’s trial at King’s Bench. Back in London, he acted as ghostwriter for Mary Anne Clarke, the Duke of York’s former mistress, and before his death he published *Le livre rouge, or, a New and Extraordinary Red Book*, cataloguing Old Corruption’s burden on British taxpayers.

PICTON, SIR THOMAS (1758–1815), army officer and colonial governor. Picton was born into a large family from Pembrokeshire’s minor gentry. He entered the military at a young age, joining the regiment of his uncle, Colonel William Picton, in 1773 at Gibraltar; in 1783 he was placed on half pay, and he retired to Wales for the next eleven years. In 1794 he sailed to the West Indies, and found a position under Lieutenant-General Sir John Vaughan as his aide-de-camp, a position he then held under General Sir Ralph Abercromby, who placed him in command of Trinidad following the island’s capture. He was named civil governor in 1801 and promoted to brigadier-general, but was replaced the following year by a three-man commission in which he was retained as second commissioner. News of his brutal methods had reached London; moreover, as a strong advocate of slavery, he was out of step with government plans. He departed from Trinidad in June 1803, leaving his mistress, Rosette Smith, and four children. As first commissioner of Trinidad, Fullarton brought capital charges against Picton before the Privy Council; after more than three years, he was released from all charges and respited his £40,000 bail. Although he was found guilty at King’s Bench in 1806 of having illegally tortured Calderon, after a second trial and a special verdict, the case was allowed to drop. Restored to favor and recruited by Wellington for the Peninsular campaign, he distinguished himself as a stern disciplinarian and military commander. He was knighted and in 1813 returned to Parliament as a military hero. Picton died leading a charge at the battle of Waterloo. His military achievements were commemorated by monuments erected at St. Paul’s and later Carmarthen.
SANDERSON, JOHN, lawyer, sometimes referred to as “doctor.” Sanderson was the principal leader, together with the merchants Thomas Higham and John Shaw, of the British opposition to Picton, demanding the introduction of British law and constitutional rights to Trinidad. Said to have been a member of the London Corresponding Society, in 1807 he authored the anonymously published book *A Political Account of the Island of Trinidad*, and in the same year authored the tract *Emancipation in Disguise* (a work usually ascribed to James Stephen). He continued the constitutional campaign, and in 1812 published *An Appeal to the Imperial Parliament upon the Claims of the Ceded Colony of Trinidad*.

SMITH, ROSETTE, proprietor. A French-creole-speaking free woman of color, Smith became the mistress of Governor Picton, enjoying lucrative perks due to their relationship. She and Picton had four children together. Widely disliked, particularly by Trinidad’s British inhabitants who resented her influence, she continued to prosper after Picton’s departure, as a moderate-size slave owner in her own right.

STEPHEN, JAMES (1758–1832), lawyer and abolitionist. Stephen’s conversion to the anti-slavery cause occurred at Barbados in late 1783, when he was attending a trial of four slaves for murder who were sentenced to be burnt alive. He and his family settled in St. Kitts, returning permanently to London in 1794; from 1789 he worked closely with William Wilberforce and emerged as a key abolitionist leader. He helped orchestrate the legislation for the 1807 abolition of the slave trade. In *Crisis of the Sugar Colonies* (1803), he argued against developing Trinidad as a slave colony. He urged the government to maintain Trinidad’s status as a crown colony, in order to keep power out of the hands of planters; in 1811 he spoke in Parliament against introducing British law and constitutional guarantees to Trinidad. In 1812 he drafted the slave registration order for Trinidad, a measure designed to check the illegal traffic in slaves. In 1810 he represented Picton at King’s Bench in argument on the special guilty verdict against the former governor.

SULLIVAN, JOHN (1749–1839), East India Company servant and politician. Born in Ireland, he took advantage of family connections to join the East India Company as a writer at age sixteen. He advanced rapidly, and served as resident at the court of Tanjore during the second Mysore war (1780–84), in which position he worked closely with Fullarton. In 1789 Sullivan married Lord Hobart’s sister, Henrietta Anne Barbara. From 1790 to 1797, he sat in the Commons for the “rotten” borough of Old Sarum. Although Sullivan and Fullarton fell on opposite sides in the Hastings controversy, they maintained a friendship which connected Fullarton to Hobart. From 1801 to 1804, Sullivan served under his brother-in-law as under-secretary for war and the colonies and again cooperated with Fullarton on setting colonial policy for Trinidad.
Abbreviations

Since I have provided full references to the sources used in this study, I have dispensed with a bibliography or list of further reading. The place of publication is London unless otherwise indicated.

Manuscript collections

Add. Ms(s). British Library, London, Additional Manuscript(s)
Bucks. CRO County Record Office, Centre for Buckinghamshire Studies, Aylesbury
NAM National Army Museum, London (microfilm)
NAS National Archives of Scotland, Edinburgh
NLS National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh
NLW National Library of Wales, Aberystwyth

Public Record Office, National Archives, London

Adm Admiralty papers
BT Board of Trade papers
CO Colonial Office papers
KB King’s Bench papers
PC Privy Council papers
PRO Public Record Office
WO War Office papers

Contemporary newspapers and journals

AJR Anti-Jacobin Review
AR Annual Register
MC Morning Chronicle
xx List of abbreviations

**Academic journals**

AHR American Historical Review  
EHR English Historical Review  
HF Historical Journal  
HWJ History Workshop Journal  
IHR International History Review  
JBS Journal of British Studies  
JCS Journal of Caribbean Studies  
JICH Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History  
JMH Journal of Modern History  
JSH Journal of Social History  
P&P Past and Present  
S&A Slavery and Abolition  
SH Social History  
TRHS Transactions of the Royal Historical Society  
WMQ William and Mary Quarterly, 3rd series

**Printed and on-line sources**

Parl. Debates Parliamentary Debates, from the Year 1803 to the Present Time, 1st series (1803–)  
TTHS Trinidad and Tobago Historical Publications, Trinidad and Tobago Historical Society (1935–51), series of documents collected in 4 vols., copy in the British Library, London
Map 2 William Faden’s “Map of Trinidad with the Gulf of Paria,” from F. Mallet, *Descriptive Account of Trinidad* (1802).
Map 3 The expansion of the British Empire in India.