

Human Rights

The United Nations General Assembly adopted the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948. A burgeoning human rights movement followed, yielding many treaties and new international institutions and shaping the constitutions and laws of many states. Yet human rights continue to be contested politically and legally and there is substantial philosophical and theoretical debate over their foundations and implications. In this volume, distinguished philosophers, political scientists, international lawyers, environmentalists and anthropologists discuss some of the most difficult questions of human rights theory and practice: What do human rights require of the global economy? Does it make sense to secure them by force? What do they require in *jus post bellum* contexts of transitional justice? Is global climate change a human rights issue? Is there a human right to democracy? Does the human rights movement constitute moral progress? For students of political philosophy, human rights, peace studies, and international relations.

CINDY HOLDER is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Victoria. She has published extensively on cultural rights and the philosophy of international law.

DAVID REIDY is Professor of Philosophy and Adjunct Professor of Political Science at the University of Tennessee. He works mainly in political and legal philosophy and has published many articles and book chapters on issues related to the philosophical foundations of human rights and international justice.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-00306-4 - Human Rights: The Hard Questions
Edited by Cindy Holder and David Reidy
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-00306-4 - Human Rights: The Hard Questions
Edited by Cindy Holder and David Reidy
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Human Rights

The Hard Questions

Edited by CINDY HOLDER

AND

DAVID REIDY



Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-00306-4 - Human Rights: The Hard Questions
Edited by Cindy Holder and David Reidy
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University’s mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107003064

© Cambridge University Press, 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013
4th printing 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Human rights : the hard questions / edited by Cindy Holder and David Reidy.
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00306-4 – ISBN 978-0-521-17626-2 (pbk.)

1. Human rights. I. Holder, Cindy, editor of compilation.

JC571.H84 2013

323–dc23

2012048495

ISBN 978-1-107-00306-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-17626-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of figures [page viii]
List of tables [ix]
Notes on contributors [x]

Introduction [1]
CINDY HOLDER AND DAVID REIDY

PART I WHAT ARE HUMAN RIGHTS? [21]

1 Human rights and human nature [23]
CHRIS BROWN
2 Universalism and particularism in human rights [39]
NEIL WALKER
3 Are human rights universal? [59]
REX MARTIN

PART II HOW DO HUMAN RIGHTS RELATE TO GROUP
RIGHTS AND CULTURE? [77]

4 The significance of cultural differences for human rights [79]
ALISON DUNDES RENTELN
5 Groups and human rights [100]
PETER JONES
6 Entangled: family, religion and human rights [115]
AYELET SHACHAR
7 What does cultural difference require of human rights? [136]
CLAUDIO CORRADETTI

PART III WHAT DO HUMAN RIGHTS REQUIRE
OF THE GLOBAL ECONOMY? [151]

8 What do human rights require of the global economy?
Beyond a narrow legal view [153]
ADAM MCBETH

9 Universal human rights in the global political economy [174]
TONY EVANS

10 Human rights and global equal opportunity: inclusion not
provision [193]
ANN E. CUDD

PART IV HOW DO HUMAN RIGHTS RELATE TO
ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY? [209]

11 Human rights in a hostile climate [211]
STEPHEN M. GARDINER

12 A human rights approach to energy, poverty and gender
inequality [231]
GAIL KARLSSON

13 Pollution wolves in scientific sheep’s clothing: why
environmental-risk assessors and policy-makers ignore the
“hard issues” of the human rights of pollution victims [246]
KRISTIN SHRADER-FRECHETTE

PART V IS THERE A HUMAN RIGHT TO
DEMOCRACY? [269]

14 Is there a human right to democracy? [271]
HILARY CHARLESWORTH

15 The human right to democracy and its global import [285]
CAROL C. GOULD

16 An egalitarian argument for a human right to democracy [301]
THOMAS CHRISTIANO

PART VI WHAT ARE THE LIMITS OF RIGHTS
ENFORCEMENT? [327]

17 Is it ever reasonable for one state to invade another for
humanitarian reasons? The “declaratory tradition” and the UN
Charter [329]
JULIE MERTUS

18 Conflicting responsibilities to protect human rights [347]
LARRY MAY

19

Searching for the hard questions about women’s human rights [362]
MARYSIA ZALEWSKI

20

Are human rights possible after conflict? Diary of a survivor [382]
EVELYN AMONY AND ERIN BAINES

PART VII ARE HUMAN RIGHTS PROGRESSIVE? [397]

21

Moral progress and human rights [399]
ALLEN BUCHANAN

22

Human rights and moral agency [418]
MARK GOODALE

23

Gender mainstreaming human rights: a progressive path for gender equality? [436]
LAURA PARISI

Afterword: rights, practice, reality and hope: hard questions about human rights [458]
CINDY HOLDER AND DAVID REIDY

Index [469]

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-00306-4 - Human Rights: The Hard Questions
Edited by Cindy Holder and David Reidy
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Figure

12.1 Selected data on time spent in wood collection [page 237]

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-00306-4 - Human Rights: The Hard Questions
Edited by Cindy Holder and David Reidy
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Table

12.1 Key issues in Kenya’s energy policy and possible gender
dimensions [page 239]

Contributors

EVELYN AMONY lives in Northern Uganda and is the leader of a women's group that conducts income-generation initiatives, works to empower women through exchange of ideas and experiences, and with the community to minimize stigma against women who have returned from Lord's Resistance Army captivity. She is the mother of four children and is currently completing her primary education.

ERIN BAINES is Assistant Professor at the Liu Institute for Global Issues, an adjunct professor in the Department of Political Science, and a faculty associate at the Institute for Gender, Race and Social Justice at the University of British Columbia. She has authored journal articles in *Security Dialogue* (2012), *African Affairs* (2010), *Third World Quarterly* (2003), the *Journal of Human Rights* (2011), the *Journal of Modern African Studies* (2009) and the *International Journal of Transitional Justice* (2007).

CHRIS BROWN is Professor of International Relations at the London School of Economics and Political Science. He is the author of numerous articles in international political theory and of *Practical Judgement in International Political Theory: Selected Essays* (2010), *Sovereignty, Rights and Justice* (2002), *International Relations Theory: New Normative Approaches* (1992), editor of *Political Restructuring in Europe: Ethical Perspectives* (1994) and co-editor (with Terry Nardin and N.J. Rengger) of *International Relations in Political Thought: Texts from the Greeks to the First World War* (2002). His textbook *Understanding International Relations* (2009) is now in its fourth and final edition and has been translated into Arabic, Turkish and Chinese.

ALLEN BUCHANAN is James B. Duke Professor of Philosophy and Professor of Law, Duke University; Visiting Research Professor, Freedom Center, University of Arizona, Tucson; and Distinguished Research Associate, Oxford Uehiro Centre for Practical Ethics, University of Oxford, UK. His work is mainly in political philosophy, philosophy of international law, and bioethics. His most recent books are *Justice and Healthcare* (2010), *Human Rights, Legitimacy and the Use of Force* (2010), *Beyond Humanity* (2011) and *Better Than Human* (2011).

HILARY CHARLESWORTH is an Australian Research Council Laureate Fellow and a professor of International Law at the Australian National University in Canberra. Her research interests are in human rights law and theories of international law.

THOMAS CHRISTIANO is Professor of Philosophy and Law at the University of Arizona and an editor of *Politics, Philosophy and Economics*. He has written *The Constitution of Equality: Democratic Authority and its Limits* (2008) and *The Rule of the Many* (1996) and many articles in moral and political philosophy on democracy, distributive justice and international institutions. He is currently working on projects on the legitimacy of international institutions, the human right to democracy and the foundations of equality as a principle of distributive justice.

CLAUDIO CORRADETTI is Teaching and Research Fellow at the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights at the University of Oslo. He has been visiting at the University of Oxford, Cornell and McGill. He is the author of *Relativism and Human Rights* (2009) and the editor of *Philosophical Dimensions of Human Rights: Some Contemporary Views* (2012).

ANN E. CUDD is University Distinguished Professor of Philosophy and Associate Dean for Humanities at the University of Kansas. Her work focuses on issues of oppression, inequality and freedom, particularly with regard to gender equity, and seeks to bring empirical economic and psychological theory to bear on normative philosophical questions. Her recent work includes *Analyzing Oppression* (2006) and *Capitalism, For and Against: A Feminist Debate*, co-authored with Nancy Holmstrom (2011).

TONY EVANS is Professor of Global Politics at the University of Winchester. He has researched and published on human rights for many years. His latest book is *Human Rights in the Global Political Economy: Critical Processes* (2011).

STEPHEN M. GARDINER is Professor of Philosophy and Ben Rabinowitz Endowed Professor of Human Dimensions of the Environment at the University of Washington, Seattle. He is the author of *A Perfect Moral Storm: The Ethical Tragedy of Climate Change* (2011), the coordinating co-editor of *Climate Ethics: Essential Readings* (2010) and the editor of *Virtue Ethics: Old and New* (2005).

MARK GOODALE is Associate Professor of Conflict Analysis and Anthropology at George Mason University and Series Editor of Stanford Studies in Human Rights. He is the author or editor of eight books, including,

most recently, *Human Rights at the Crossroads* (2012), *Mirrors of Justice: Law and Power in the Post-Cold War Era* (with K. Clarke, 2010), *Surrendering to Utopia: An Anthropology of Human Rights* (2009) and *Human Rights: An Anthropological Reader* (2009). Forthcoming books include *Neoliberalism, Interrupted: Social Change and Contested Governance in Contemporary Latin America* (with N. Postero, 2013) and *The Bolivia Reader* (with Sinclair Thomson *et al.*, 2013).

CAROL C. GOULD is Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at Hunter College and the Graduate Center of the City University of New York, where she is a member of the doctoral faculties in Philosophy and Political Science and Director of the Center for Global Ethics & Politics at the Ralph Bunche Institute. She is the editor of the *Journal of Social Philosophy*. Gould is the author of *Marx's Social Ontology* (1978); *Rethinking Democracy: Freedom and Social Cooperation in Politics, Economy, and Society* (1988, 1990); and *Globalizing Democracy and Human Rights* (2004), which won the 2009 David Easton Best Book Award from the American Political Science Association.

CINDY HOLDER is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Victoria. Her articles have appeared in journals such as *Human Rights Quarterly*, *Human Rights Review*, *Alternatives*, *Public Affairs Quarterly* and *The Monist*. Her research focuses on cultural rights and philosophical issues in international law, including the human rights of indigenous peoples and transitional mechanisms such as truth commissions and international criminal tribunals.

PETER JONES is Emeritus Professor of Political Philosophy at Newcastle University, UK. He is the author and editor of books on rights and has written on rights of various sorts, including human rights, group rights, democratic rights, welfare rights and rights of free expression. His published work has also ranged over a number of other subjects, including toleration, identity, recognition, cultural diversity, democracy, neutrality, international and global justice, and the nature of liberalism.

GAIL KARLSSON is an environmental lawyer and Senior Policy Advisor for ENERGIA, the International Network on Gender and Sustainable Energy. In addition to her work with ENERGIA, she serves as a consultant to the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Environment and Energy Group, the UNDP Gender Team, and other international organizations.

ADAM MCBETH is a Deputy Director of the Castan Centre for Human Rights Law and Associate Professor in the Law Faculty at Monash

University, Melbourne, Australia. His research focuses on the relationship between international human rights law and transnational economic activity, including responsibility for human rights in the course of trade, aid, development projects and commercial operations, and he has delivered human rights training to government and civil society representatives from Australia, Indonesia and Iraq. His recent books include *International Economic Actors and Human Rights* (2010) and *The International Law of Human Rights* (with Justine Nolan and Simon Rice, 2011).

REX MARTIN is Professor of Philosophy, Emeritus, at the University of Kansas and Honorary Professor at Cardiff University. His fields of major interest include political and legal philosophy and the history of political thought. Among his books are *A System of Rights* (1997) and *Rawls's Law of Peoples: A Realistic Utopia?* (co-editor, 2006).

LARRY MAY is W. Alton Jones Professor of Philosophy, Professor of Law, and Professor of Political Science at Vanderbilt University. He has published 27 books, 11 of which are single authored monographs, and over 100 articles. These writings have been translated into French, German, Spanish, Italian, Polish, Serbian, Japanese, Chinese and Korean. His work on legal ethics and international law has led to invitations to advise such groups as: the Indiana State Senate, the US State Department, the CIA, as well as members of the Australian High Court. His six most recent books have been published by Cambridge University Press. The most recent books have won awards in international law, philosophy and international relations.

JULIE MERTUS is a Professor and Co-Director of the MA program in Ethics, Peace and Global Affairs at American University. She has over 20 years of experience working for a wide range of non-governmental and governmental human rights organizations in the human rights field. She is the author of numerous books including *Bait and Switch: Human Rights and U.S. Foreign Policy* (2004), which was named human rights book of the year in 2005 by the American Political Science Association Human Rights Section. Her most recent books, *Human Rights Matters* (2009) and *The United Nations and Human Rights* (2005) are required reading on many syllabi throughout the country and her book on Kosovo – *Kosovo: How Myths and Truths Started a War* (1999) – has been influential in Washington, DC policy circles. Professor Mertus has also published in law journals and leading multidisciplinary journals such as: *Ethics and International Affairs*, *Global Governance*, *International Studies Perspectives*, *International Feminist Journal of Politics* and *The Harvard International Review*. As a practitioner

she has worked as a field researcher, lawyer, advocate, consultant political analyst and trainer.

LAURA PARISI is Associate Professor of Women’s Studies at the University of Victoria, Canada. Her articles have appeared in journals such as *Politics and Gender*, *Journal of Human Rights* and *Canadian Foreign Policy*. Her current research focuses on the gender mainstreaming practices of human rights and development non-governmental organizations.

DAVID REIDY is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Tennessee. He works in political and legal philosophy and has in recent years published widely on the political philosophy of John Rawls and on issues of human rights and global justice, his essays appearing in many journals and anthologies. He is also the editor or co-editor of numerous books and the author of *On the Philosophy of Law* (2006). He has twice been awarded the American Philosophical Association’s Berger Prize for his work in the philosophy of law.

ALISON DUNDES RENTELN is Professor of Political Science, with joint appointments in Anthropology, Law and Public Policy, at the University of Southern California where she teaches law and public policy with an emphasis on international law and human rights. She has authored or edited *The Cultural Defense* (2005), *Multicultural Jurisprudence: Comparative Perspectives on the Cultural Defense* (co-edited with Marie-Claire Foblets, 2009), and *Cultural Law: International, National, and Indigenous* (co-authored with James Nafziger and Robert Paterson, 2010). She has worked with the United Nations on the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. She served on several California civil rights commissions and the California committee of Human Rights Watch.

AYELET SHACHAR is Professor of Law, Political Science and Global Affairs at the University of Toronto, where she holds the Canada Research Chair in Citizenship and Multiculturalism. She has published and lectured widely on citizenship theory, immigration law, multiculturalism, cultural diversity and women’s rights, family law and religion in comparative perspective, highly skilled migration, and global inequality. Shachar is the author of *Multicultural Jurisdictions: Cultural Differences and Women’s Rights* (2001) and *The Birthright Lottery: Citizenship and Global Inequality* (2009), and the recipient of several research and excellence awards. She has held visiting professor positions at Stanford Law School and Harvard Law School. Her work has also proven influential in the real world, intervening in actual public policy and legislative debates.

KRISTIN SHRADER-FRECHETTE is O'Neill Professor, Biological Sciences Department and Philosophy Department, University of Notre Dame, USA. Author of nearly 400 articles and 15 books, including *Taking Action, Saving Lives* (2007) and *What Will Work: Fighting Climate Change with Renewable Energy* (2011), Shrader-Frechette has held membership on many US National Academy of Sciences boards/committees, government, and UN committees. The first woman president of three international scholarly/scientific organizations, she works mainly on ethical/methodological issues in science and public health and quantitative risk assessment. Her research, funded by the US National Science Foundation for 28 years, has been translated into 13 languages. In 2004 Shrader-Frechette became the third American to win the World Technology Award in Ethics. In 2007, *Catholic Digest* named her one of 12 "Heroes for the US and the World" for her global, *pro bono* environmental-justice work with minority/poor communities.

NEIL WALKER is the Regius Professor of Public Law and the Law of Nature and Nations at the University of Edinburgh. He was previously Professor of European Law at the European University Institute in Florence between 2000 and 2008. He has published widely on questions of national and transnational constitutional theory, and also on the relationship between law and security.

MARYSIA ZALEWSKI is Professor and Head of School of Social Science at the University of Aberdeen. She has published widely on feminist theory, gender and international relations and masculinities. Her monograph *Feminist International Relations: Exquisite Corpse* will be published in 2013.