Contents

List of Figures, Tables, and Boxes  page xii
Preface  xv

1 Modelling as a Method of Enquiry  1

PART I: CHANGING THE PRACTICE OF ECONOMIC SCIENCE  1
1. From Laws to Models, From Words to Objects  1
2. The Naturalization of Modelling in Economics  6
3. Practical Reasoning Styles  14
   3.i Modelling as a Style of Reasoning  14
   3.ii Modelling as a Reasoning Style in Economics  17

PART II: MAKING MODELS, USING MODELS  19
4. Making Models to Reason With: Forms, Rules, and Resources  19
   4.i Giving Form  20
   4.ii Becoming Formal  26
   4.iii Reasoning Resources  27
6. Conclusion  37

2 Model-Making: New Recipes, Ingredients, and Integration  44
1. Ricardo, The “Modern” Economist?  44
2. Ricardo, His Economy, and the Economy of His Day  47
   2.i David Ricardo, Esq.  47
   2.ii Economics Matters, Experimental Farming Matters  51
3. Constructing Ricardo’s Numerical Model Farm and Questions of Distribution  56
   3.i The Numbers in Ricardo’s Principles and Experimental Accounts  58
   3.ii The Spade-Husbandry Debate  69
4. Ricardo’s Model Farm and Model Farming  73
# Contents

4.1 Three Model Farms in One
4.2 A Model Farm that Worked According to Ricardo's Economic Ideas
4.3 A Model of an Individual Farm in the Period
4.4 A Model Farm for the Whole Agricultural Sector
5. Model-Making: Creating New Recipes
5.1 Ingredients
5.2 Fitting Things Together: Integration and Reasoning Possibilities

Appendix 1: Numerical Argument in Ricardo's 1815 Essay

3 Imagining and Imaging: Creating a New Model World
1. Introduction
2. Acts of Translation or a New Way of World-Making?
3. Making the Mathematical Economic World in Models
4. The Artist's Space versus the Economist's Space
5. The History of the Edgeworth Box Diagram – as Told by Itself
5.1 Edgeworth's Imagination and Image
5.2 Pareto's Imagination and Images
6. The World Newly Made in the Model: Questions of Representation?
6.1 Visualization
6.2 Newness
7. Seeing the World in the Model
8. Conclusion

4 Character Making: Ideal Types, Idealization, and the Art of Caricature
1. Introduction
2. Characterizing Economic Man: Classical Economists' *Homo Economicus*
3. Concept Forming: Weber's Ideal Types and Menger's Human Economy
4. Symbolic Abstraction: Jevons' Calculating Man
5. Exaggerating Qualities: Knight's Slot-Machine Man
6. Making a Cartoon into a Role Model: Rational Economic Man
7. The Art of Caricature and Processes of Idealization
8. Model Man's CV: De-Idealization and the Changing Roles of Economic Man

5 Metaphors and Analogies: Choosing the World of the Model
1. From Metaphors to Analogical Models
2. The Newlyn-Phillips Machine
3. The Machine's Inventors: Walter Newlyn and Bill Phillips
4. Inventing the Newlyn-Phillips Machine
   
   Step 1: Phillips chooses the analogy for his supply/demand model (early 1949) 187
   
   Step 2: Newlyn designs the blueprint for a monetary circulation machine (Easter 1949) 189
   
   Step 3: Phillips and Newlyn build the prototype Machine (Summer 1949) 194
   
5. Analogical Models and New Things 200

6 Questions and Stories: Capturing the Heart of Matters 204
   
   1. Introduction 217
   
   2. Stories to Shape Model Resources: Frisch's Macro-Dynamic Scheme 218
   
   3. Questions and Stories Capturing Keynes' General Theory 221
      
      3.i Modelling Keynes' General Theory: Meade 222
      
      3.ii Reasoning with Models: The External and Internal Dynamics 225
      
      3.iii Modelling Keynes' General Theory: Samuelson 228
   
      
      4.i Modelling Keynes' General Theory: Hicks 232
      
      4.ii Demonstrations, Variety, and Fruitfulness 236
   
   5. Capturing the Heart of the Matter with Narratives 239
      
      5.i Narratives and Identity in the World of the Model 239
      
      5.ii Model Narratives and Making Sense of the Economic World 242
      
      5.iii Narrative as a Testing Bed for Models 246
   
   6. Where Next? 251

7 Model Experiments? 256
   
   1. Introduction 256
   
   2. Experiments in the World of the Model 258
      
      2.i Mangoldt and Jenkin 259
      
      2.ii Marshall 267
      
      2.iii Conceptual Work: Defining Generic Categories 270
   
   3. Models in ‘Laboratory’ Experiments 272
      
   4. Comparison: Model Experiments and Laboratory Experiments 277
      
      4.i Controls and Demonstration 277
      
      4.ii Experimental Validity and The Inference Gap 282
   
   5. Hybrids 288
      
      5.i Virtually Experiments 288
      
      5.ii The Status of Hybrids 292
   
   6. Materials Matter: Surprise versus Confoundment 293
## Contents

### 8 Simulation: Bringing a Microscope into Economics

1. The Birth of a New Technology 301
2. Simulation: Content and Context 304
3. Shubik and Simulation 307
   3.i Martin Shubik's History 307
   3.ii Models, Simulated Environments, and Simulated Behaviour 311
4. Guy Orcutt’s History and “Microsimulation” 315
5. Bringing a Microscope into Economics 320
   5.i Introducing the Analogy 322
   5.ii Matters of Scale and Kind 323
   5.iii Specimens = Models 325
6. How Do Simulations Work as Microscopes? 327
7. The Observation–Inference Problem 331
8. Conclusion 336

### 9 Model Situations, Typical Cases, and Exemplary Narratives

1. Introduction 344
2. War Games 345
3. The Exemplary Narrative 348
   3.i The Prisoner's Dilemma: Collaborate or Defect? 348
   3.ii The Economists' Dilemma: Individual Rationality or Invisible Hand? 351
4. The Commentator’s Dilemma: Fitting Together Situations, Narratives, and Cases 357
   4.i Reasoning about Situations 357
   4.ii Explanatory Depth: The Roles of Narratives 361
   4.iii Explanatory Breadth: Taxonomies, Kinds, and Cases 368
5. Conclusion 372

### 10 From the World in the Model to the Model in the World

1. Introduction 378
   2.i Model Worlds and Working Objects 380
   2.ii Small Worlds, Miniature Worlds, Compressed Worlds? 384
3. The Work of Working Objects 387
   3.i Materials for Describing and Theorizing 387
   3.ii “Abstract Typical Representations” and Model Inductions 389
4. Modelling: The New Way of Practising Economics 393
   4.i Assumptions in Practices 394
   4.ii Network of Models 396
   4.iii Community Matters 399
Contents

xi

5. Models in the World 400
   5.i Models: New Instruments for Acting in the World 400
   5.ii Seeing Small Worlds in the Big World 405

Index 413

Colour plate section appears between pages 126 and 127
Figures, Tables, and Boxes

Figures

1.1 Quesnay’s Tableau Économique (1767)  page 4
1.2 The Prehistory of Models  7
1.3 First-Generation Models  9
1.4 Second-Generation Models  11
1.5 Models: The Variety of Forms  22
1.6 The Reasoning Resources in Models  29
1.7 The Phillips-Newlyn Hydraulic Machine  35
2.1 Gatcomb Park, Country Home of David Ricardo  49
2.2 Ricardo’s Model Farm Showing His Laws of Distribution  67
2.3 Newspaper Report of a Farming Experiment with Spade Husbandry  71
2.4 Ricardo’s Table from His 1815 Essay  85
3.1 Humphrey’s Modern Version of the Edgeworth Box  92
3.2 The Artist’s Edgeworth Box by Koen Engelen  99
3.3 The Artist’s vs the Modern Economist’s Version of the Box  104
3.4 Historical Sequence of Original Box Diagrams Part I  110
3.5 Historical Sequence of Original Box Diagrams Part II  119
3.6 Matching the Modern Economist’s Diagrams to the Original Box Diagrams  124
4.1 Menger’s Consumption Schedule  143
4.2 Jevons’ Utility Curve (1871)  147
4.3 Philipon’s Art of Caricature (1834)  161
5.1 Walter Newlyn Demonstrating the Prototype Machine 1950  177
5.2 Drawing of the Mark II Machine  179
5.3 Cartoon of the Machine from Punch, 1953, by Rowland Emett  182
5.4 Bill Phillips’ Undergraduate Essay Diagrams and the Inspiration from Boulding, 1948/9  190
Figures, Tables, and Boxes  xiii

5.5 Bill Phillips’ Undergraduate Monetary-Circulation Diagram, 1948/9  193
5.6 Walter Newlyn’s Blueprint Design for the Machine, May 1949  197
5.7 Bill Phillips (left) and Walter Newlyn (right) Complete the First Tank of the Machine, Summer 1949  202
5.8 Irving Fisher’s Arithmetical, Mechanical, and Accounting Versions of His Monetary Balance  205
6.1 Samuelson’s Arithmetic Simulation  229
6.2 Samuelson’s Model Solution Graph  231
6.3 Hicks’ IS-LL “Little Apparatus”  235
7.1 Mangoldt’s Supply and Demand Model Experiments  260
7.2 Mangoldt’s Model Experiment for Complementary Goods  263
7.3 & 7.4 Fleeming Jenkin’s Supply and Demand Curve Experiments  265
7.5 Marshall’s Diagrammatic Model Experiments  269
7.6 Chamberlin’s “Real-Model” Experimental Results  274
7.7 Smith’s First Classroom Experimental Results with the Market Model  276
8.1 Shubik’s 1960 Bibliography: Subject Map for “Simulation” and “Gaming”  305
8.2 Shubik’s 1960 Bibliography: Subject Map for “Monte Carlo” and “Systems”  306
8.3 Martin Shubik’s Experiences of Simulation  311
8.4 Guy Orcutt’s New Micro-Simulation Recipe  319
8.5 Slutsky’s Random Shock Simulation  332
9.1 Game Theory in Tosca  346

Tables

Table 7.1 Model Experiments and Laboratory Experiments  279
Table 7.2 Model Experiments, Laboratory Experiments, and Inferential Scope  283

Box

Box 9.1 Koertge’s Schema  358