Cyber Warfare and the Laws of War

The information revolution has transformed both modern societies and the way in which they conduct warfare. Cyber Warfare and the Laws of War analyses the status of computer network attacks in international law and examines their treatment under the laws of armed conflict. The first part of the book deals with the resort to force by states and discusses the threshold issues of force and armed attack by examining the permitted responses against such attacks. The second part offers a comprehensive analysis of the applicability of international humanitarian law to computer network attacks. By examining the legal framework regulating these attacks, Heather Harrison Dinniss addresses the issues associated with this method of attack in terms of the current law and explores the underlying debates which are shaping the modern laws applicable in armed conflict.

Heather Harrison Dinniss is a postdoctoral research fellow at the International Law Centre of the Swedish National Defence College. She has previously taught at the London School of Economics and Political Science and at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London. Her research focuses on the impact of modern warfare on international humanitarian law, in particular, on advanced and autonomous weapons systems and the status and use of computer network attacks in the law of armed conflict.
CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

Established in 1946, this series produces high quality scholarship in the fields of public and private international law and comparative law. Although these are distinct legal sub-disciplines, developments since 1946 confirm their interrelations.

Comparative law is increasingly used as a tool in the making of law at national, regional and international levels. Private international law is now often affected by international conventions, and the issues faced by classical conflicts rules are frequently dealt with by substantive harmonisation of law under international auspices. Mixed international arbitrations, especially those involving state economic activity, raise mixed questions of public and private international law, while in many fields (such as the protection of human rights and democratic standards, investment guarantees and international criminal law) international and national systems interact. National constitutional arrangements relating to ‘foreign affairs’, and to the implementation of international norms, are a focus of attention.

The Series welcomes works of a theoretical or interdisciplinary character, and those focusing on the new approaches to international or comparative law or conflicts of law. Studies of particular institutions or problems are equally welcome, as are translations of the best work published in other languages.

General Editors
James Crawford SC FBA Whewell Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge
John S. Bell FBA Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.
Cyber Warfare and the Laws of War

Heather Harrison Dinniss
For Marc
Thank you … for everything
Contents

Acknowledgements xi
Table of cases xiii
List of abbreviations xvi

1 The world in which we live and fight 1
  1 Computer network attacks 4
  2 Law and war in the internet age 8
  3 Societal trends generally 11
    3.1 The information revolution and digitisation 11
    3.2 Globalisation, interdependency and the changing world order 17
    3.3 The rise of the knowledge economy 20
  4 Military trends 21
    4.1 A change of purpose 23
    4.2 Network-centric warfare and effects-based operations 24
    4.3 Outsourcing and civilianisation 25
  5 Terminology and definitions 27
    5.1 New laws for old? 28
    5.2 Methodology 30
    5.3 A word about examples and hypotheticals 31
  6 Conclusion 32

PART I Jus ad bellum

2 Computer network attacks as a use of force in international law 37
  1 Force defined as armed force 40
  2 Definition of armed force 49
# CONTENTS

2.1 State actions 53
2.2 Theories of force – scholastic writings 58
3 Computer network attacks as a use of force 62
  3.1 Characteristics of computer network attacks 65
4 Conclusion 74

3 Armed attack and response in the digital age 75
  1 Armed attack 76
    1.1 Anticipatory self-defence 82
    1.2 Pinprick attacks or accumulation of events theory 93
  2 Self-defence against non-state actors 95
  3 Attribution 99
  4 Necessity and proportionality 102
  5 Countermeasures against unlawful acts 105
  6 Security Council authorisation and collective measures 109
  7 Conclusion 113

# PART II Jus in bello

4 The applicability of the laws of armed conflict to computer network attacks 117
  1 Armed conflict 118
    1.1 The requirement of armed force 122
    1.2 Intervention of the armed forces 123
  2 Application to computer network attacks 126
    2.1 Application during conventional armed conflict 127
    2.2 Computer network attack on its own 129
    2.3 Computer network attacks in support of conventional attacks 134
  3 Territory 134
  4 Conclusion 137

5 Participants in conflict: combatant status, direct participation and computer network attack 139
  1 Combatant status 140
    1.1 Requirements of combatant status 144
    1.2 Saboteurs and spies 151
  2 Direct participation by civilians 159
    2.1 Requirements of direct participation 161
    2.2 Offensive computer network attack 167
    2.3 Computer network attack system support 167
    2.4 Generic IT support 170
# 6 Targeting and precautions in attack

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The principle of distinction</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Legitimate military objectives</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Nature, location, purpose or use</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Effective contribution to military action</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Definite military advantage</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Dual-use technology</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Protection of civilian objects</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Attacks and operations</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Indiscriminate attacks</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Proportionality</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Knock-on effects</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Dual-use systems</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Precautions in attack</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Verification of military objectives</td>
<td>211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Choice of weapons</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Choice of targets</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Precautions against the effects of attacks</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# 7 Measures of special protection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The environment</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Additional Protocol I</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>ENMOD Convention</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Other protections</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cultural property</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>The legal framework</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Attacks on, and damage to, digital works</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Theft, pillage or misappropriation of digital works</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Installations containing dangerous forces</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Objects indispensable to the survival of the civilian population</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Hospitals and other medical units</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Location and access to medical databases</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Hospital ships</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Non-defended localities and demilitarised zones</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Non-defended localities</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Demilitarised zones</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONTENTS

8 Means and methods of warfare 250
  1 Law of weaponry 251
    1.1 General principles 252
    1.2 Explicit prohibitions of weapons 258
    1.3 Article 36 obligations 260
  2 Perfidy and ruses of war 261
    2.1 Ruses of war 261
    2.2 Perfidy 263
    2.3 Misuse of protected symbols and emblems 264
  3 Destruction and seizure of property 265
    3.1 Booty 270
    3.2 Occupied territory 272
    3.3 Pillage and plunder 274
    3.4 Enemy-owned property on the territory of a belligerent 276
  4 Conclusion 277

Concluding remarks 279

Appendix 1 Selected computer network attack examples 281
Appendix 2 Glossary of selected computing terms 293
Bibliography 297
Index 321
Acknowledgements

The writing of a Ph.D. thesis and the task of turning it into a book necessarily requires assistance from many individuals and there are a number of people who have helped me both in the formation of my ideas and in the writing of this book. First and most importantly, my thanks go to my Ph.D. supervisor, Christopher Greenwood, for his insightful comments and suggestions, and for keeping me focused on the danger of being too technical at the expense of the law. Special thanks are also due to Christine Chinkin, my supervisor during Chris’s sabbatical, who also commented on a draft of the manuscript. Her perceptive insights form the basis of my methodology section, a contribution for which I am profoundly grateful. I am indebted to Michael Schmitt and Chaloka Beyani for examining the original thesis and particularly to Mike, who has offered numerous comments and suggestions for this subsequent published edition. He has been a supportive and encouraging mentor, always willing to discuss ideas and offer advice.

Although the media seems full of new reports of cyber warfare (some worthy of the title, many not), at the time that the original thesis was written there were very few examples in the public domain of computer network attacks. My thanks are also due to those specialists in information technology and network design who patiently reviewed my hypothetical examples and advised on the feasibility of particular computer network attack scenarios, in particular Andy Batchelor, Karon James and Michelle Ellis. I am grateful for their assistance, and the fault for any errors or inaccuracies remains entirely mine. Special mention must also go to Andrew Ladley of Victoria University of Wellington, for his encouragement to continue postgraduate study and for the stories of his adventures that proved so inspirational. I would also like to thank all of my colleagues in the law department of the London School of Economics and Political Science; it is often remarked that the drafting of a Ph.D. thesis can be a lonely experience and I am
grateful to all my friends for making sure that this was not the case, and for making my time at the LSE so rewarding both personally and academically.

The thesis on which this book is based was funded in part by the generous Freyberg Scholarship provided by the New Zealand Defence Force and the Research Studentships of the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Finally, and most importantly, I would like to thank my family. My parents for their support and encouragement throughout this process; my mother, Ann Dinniss, who painstakingly proofread the original manuscript, and my father, David Dinniss, who sadly did not live to see it completed. Above all, my thanks go to my wonderful husband Marc; without his support, patience, sense of humour, and steadfast belief, the thesis and this subsequent book would not have happened. This book is dedicated to him.
Table of cases

Nawar v. Minister of Defence et al. (1985) 39(3) Piskei Din 449, Israel Supreme Court. 268, 270, 271, 272
The Caroline Case (1837) 29 BFSP 1137–1138. 84–5, 87, 92, 102
Case Concerning Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Uganda) (2005), International Court of Justice. 40, 95, 97, 99, 102
Case Concerning Military and Paramilitary Activities in and against Nicaragua (Nicaragua v. United States of America) (Merits) (1986) ICJ 14, International Court of Justice. 40, 46–8, 50, 52, 60, 66, 76–9, 85, 94, 96, 103, 105–6, 151
Case Concerning Oil Platforms (Islamic Republic of Iran v. United States of America) (2003), International Court of Justice. 77, 79–80, 95, 102–3, 106
Case Concerning the Gabcikovo-Nagymoros Project (1997) ICJ Reports 3, International Court of Justice. 107
Case Concerning the United States Diplomatic and Consular Staff in Tehran (United States v. Iran) (1980) 74 AJIL 746, International Court of Justice. 52
Cession of Vessels and Tugs for Navigation on the Danube Case (1921) 1 RIAA 97. 271
Corfu Channel Case (UK v. Albania) (Merits) (1949) ICJ Reports 4, International Court of Justice. 47, 71
Cuba Submarine Telegraph Co. (1923) 6 RIAA 118. 273
Eastern Extension, Australasia and China Telegraph Co. Claim (1923) 6 RIAA 112. 273
xiv  TABLE OF CASES

Ex p Quirin et al. (1942) 317 US 1, Supreme Court of the United States. 152–3
Finding of the International Commission of Inquiry Organized under Article 9 of the Convention for the Pacific Settlement of International Disputes, of July 29, 1899 (the Dogger Bank Incident) (1905) 2 AJIL 931–936, The International Commission of Inquiry between Great Britain and Russia arising out of the North Sea incident. 120, 133
Re Flesche (1949) 16 International Law Reports 266, Holland, Special Court of Cassation. 157, 159
Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in Occupied Palestinian Territory (2004) ICJ 136, International Court of Justice. 40, 85, 97, 99
Legality of the Use by a State of Nuclear Weapons in Armed Conflicts (1996) ICJ 26, International Court of Justice. 86
The Lotus (1927) Series A No. 10, Permanent Court of International Justice. 155
Osman Bin Haji Mohamed Ali and Another v. the Public Prosecutor (1969) 1 AC 430, Privy Council (Malaysia). 144, 152–3
Partial Award, Loss of Property in Ethiopia Owned by Non-Residents, Eritrea’s Claim 24 between the State of Eritrea and the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (2005), Eritrea Ethiopia Claims Commission. 276
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Jurisdiction</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prosecutor v. Jean-Paul Akayesu</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>ICTR</td>
<td>Case No. ICTR-96–4-T, International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>124, 150, 159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>202, 209, 218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosecutor v. Moinina Fofana and Allieu Kondewa (Decision on Preliminary Motion Based on Lack of Jurisdiction (Child Recruitment))</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>SCSL</td>
<td>Case No. SCSL-04–14-T, Special Court for Sierra Leone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosecutor v. Norman (Decision on Preliminary Motion Based on Lack of Jurisdiction (Child Recruitment))</td>
<td>2004</td>
<td>SCSL</td>
<td>Case No. SCSL-04–14-AR72(E)-131, Special Court for Sierra Leone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prosecutor v. Zejnil Delalic et al. (Celebici)</td>
<td>1998</td>
<td>ICTY</td>
<td>Case No. IT-96–21-T, International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Public Committee against Torture in Israel et al. v. the Government of Israel et al.</td>
<td>2007</td>
<td>Supreme Court of Israel</td>
<td>46 ILM 375, Supreme Court of Israel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Prosecutor v. Koi et al.</td>
<td>1968</td>
<td>Privy Council</td>
<td>AC 829, Privy Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>144, 150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R v. Boden</td>
<td>2002</td>
<td>QCA</td>
<td>QCA 164, Court of Appeal of the Supreme Court of Queensland (Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>221–2, 243, 285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R v. Wilkinson</td>
<td>1999</td>
<td>NZLR</td>
<td>403, Court of Appeal (New Zealand)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rivard v. United States</td>
<td>1967</td>
<td>5th Circuit</td>
<td>375 F. 2d 882, United States Court of Appeals, 5th Circuit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>156, 158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trial of Alfred Felix Alwyn Krupp von Bohlen und Halbach and Eleven Others (Krupp Trial)</td>
<td>1948</td>
<td>United States Military Tribunal, Nuremberg</td>
<td>X Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals 69, United States Military Tribunal, Nuremberg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>236, 238, 265–7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trial of Alois and Anna Bommer and Their Daughters</td>
<td>1947</td>
<td>United States Military Tribunal, Nuremberg</td>
<td>IX Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals 62, Permanent Military Court at Metz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>274–5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trial of Carl Krauch and Twenty-Two Others (I.G. Farben Trial)</td>
<td>1948</td>
<td>United States Military Tribunal, Nuremberg</td>
<td>IX Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals 1, United States Military Tribunal, Nuremberg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trial of Friedrich Flick and Five Others (Flick Trial)</td>
<td>1947</td>
<td>United States Military Tribunal, Nuremberg</td>
<td>IX Law Reports of Trials of War Criminals 1, United States Military Tribunal, Nuremberg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>233, 275</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of abbreviations

ADIL
Annual Digest and Reports of Public International Law Cases

Additional Protocol I
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I), 8 June 1977

also API

Additional Protocol II
Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II), 8 June 1977

also APII

AFJ Log.
Air Force Journal of Logistics

AFL Rev.
Air Force Law Review

AJIL
American Journal of International Law

Am. U. L. Rev.
American University Law Review

ASIL Proc.
American Society of International Law Proceedings

BFSP
British and Foreign State Papers.

BMJ
British Medical Journal

BU Int’l L. J.
Boston University International Law Journal

BU J. Sci. & Tech. L.
Boston University Journal of Science and Technology

BYBIL
British Yearbook of International Law

Case W. Res. J. Int’l L.
Case Western Reserve Journal of International Law

Chi. J. Int’l L.
Chinese Journal of International Law

CNA
Computer Network Attack

Col. J. Trans. L.
Columbia Journal of Transnational Law

Conventional
Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Treaty
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Weapons Which May Be Deemed to Be Excessively Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate Effects, 10 October 1980

CPU  
central processing unit

DCS  
distributed control system

DDoS  
distributed denial of service

EJIL  
European Journal of International Law

EMP  
electromagnetic pulse

ENMOD  
Convention on the Prohibition of Military or Any Other Hostile Use of Environmental Modification Techniques, 10 December 1976

FRY  
Federal Republic of Yugoslavia

Geneva Convention I  
Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Sick and Wounded in Armed Forces in the Field of August 12, 1949

Geneva Convention II  
Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea of August 12, 1949

Geneva Convention III  
Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War of August 12, 1949

Geneva Convention IV  
Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War of August 12, 1949

GJIA  
Georgetown Journal of International Affairs

GovExec  
Government Executive

Hague Convention 1899  
Hague Convention Concerning the Laws and Customs of War on Land

Hague Regulations  
Regulations Annexed to the 1907 Hague Convention IV Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land

Harv. Int’l L.J.  
Harvard International Law Journal

Hous. J. Int’l L.  
Houston Journal of International Law

HPCR  
Harvard Program on Humanitarian Policy and Conflict Research

IAEA  
International Atomic Energy Agency

ICBL  
International Campaign to Ban Landmines

ICJ  
International Court of Justice
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ICRC       International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR       International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY       International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IFF        Identification Friend or Foe
IMF        International Monetary Fund
IO         Information Operations
IP Address Internet Protocol Address
IRRC       International Review of the Red Cross
Israel Y.B. Hum. Rts Israeli Yearbook of Human Rights
IW         Information Warfare
J. Legal Stud. Journal of Legal Studies
JCSL       Journal of Conflict and Security Law
JSTARS     Joint Surveillance Target Attack Radar System
Keesings   Keesings Record of World Events
LOAC       Laws of Armed Conflict
Mil. L. Rev. Military Law Review
NIL Rev.   Netherlands International Law Review
NZLR       New Zealand Law Reports
OAS        Organization of American States
OAU        Organisation of African Unity
Ottawa Convention Convention on the Prohibition of the Use, Stockpiling, Production and Transfer of Anti-Personnel Mines and on Their Destruction.
PMC        Private Military Company
RIAA       Reports of International Arbitral Awards
SCADA      Supervisory Control and Data Acquisition
SCSL       Special Court for Sierra Leone
Tex. L. Rev. Texas Law Review
Tulsa J. Comp. & Int’l L. Tulsa Journal of Comparative & International Law
UAV        Unmanned Aerial Vehicle
UN         United Nations
UNCIO      Documents of the United Nations Conference on International Organisation

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org
**LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS**  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNTS</td>
<td>United Nations Treaty Series</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN Y. B. Int’l L. Comm’n</td>
<td>United Nations Yearbook of the International Law Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>URL</td>
<td>Universal Resource Locator (a web address)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States (of America)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vand. J Transnat’l L.</td>
<td>Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yale J. Int’l L.</td>
<td>Yale Journal of International Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZaöRV</td>
<td>Zeitschrift für ausländisches öffentliches Recht und Völkerrecht</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>